

BEFORE

THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Regulation of the)	
Purchased Gas Adjustment Clauses)	
Contained within the Rate Schedules of)	Case No. 21-218- GA-GCR
Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., and Related Matters.)	

In the Matter of the Audit of the)	
Uncollectible Expense Rider of Duke)	Case No. 21-318- GA-UEX
Energy Ohio, Inc., and Related Matters.)	

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. for Approval of an)	
Adjustment to its Interim and Temporary)	Case No. 21-418- GA-PIP
PIPP Plan Rider Case.)	

STIPULATION AND RECOMMENDATION

Rule 4901-1-30, Ohio Administrative Code, provides that any two or more parties to a proceeding may enter into a written stipulation covering the issues presented in such a proceeding. The purpose of this document is to set forth the understanding and agreement of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., (Duke Energy Ohio or Company), Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Commission Staff), and IGS Energy (IGS) (collectively, the Signatory Parties) and to recommend that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Commission) approve and adopt this Stipulation and Recommendation (Stipulation), which resolves all of the issues raised by Parties in these cases relative to the rate schedules of Duke Energy Ohio and related matters. This Stipulation is supported by adequate data and information.

The Stipulation represents a just and reasonable resolution of the issues raised in these proceedings, benefiting consumers, violates no regulatory principle or precedent, and is the

product of bargaining among knowledgeable and capable Parties in a cooperative process, encouraged by this Commission and undertaken by the Parties, representing a wide range of interests, to resolve the aforementioned issues. Although this Stipulation is not binding on the Commission, it is entitled to careful consideration by the Commission. For purposes of resolving all issues raised by this proceeding, the Parties stipulate, agree, and recommend as set forth below.

Except for purposes of enforcement of the terms of this Stipulation, neither this Stipulation, nor the information and data contained therein or attached, shall be cited as precedent in any future proceeding for or against any Party or the Commission itself. This Stipulation is a reasonable compromise involving a balancing of competing positions and it does not necessarily reflect the position that one or more of the Parties would have taken if these issues had been fully litigated.

This Stipulation is expressly conditioned upon its adoption by the Commission in its entirety and without material modification. Should the Commission reject or materially modify all or any part of this Stipulation, the Parties shall have the right, within thirty days of issuance of the Commission's Order, to file an application for rehearing. Should the Commission, in issuing an entry on rehearing, not adopt the Stipulation in its entirety and without material modification, any Party may withdraw from the Stipulation. Such withdrawal shall be accomplished by filing a notice with the Commission, including service to all Parties, in the docket within thirty days of the Commission's entry on rehearing. Other Parties to this Stipulation agree to not oppose the withdrawal from the Stipulation by any other Party.

Prior to the filing of such a notice, the Party wishing to withdraw agrees to work in good faith with the other Parties to achieve an outcome that substantially satisfies the intent of the

Stipulation and, if a new agreement is reached that includes the Party wishing to withdraw, then the new agreement shall be filed for Commission review and approval. If the discussions to achieve an outcome that substantially satisfies the intent of the Stipulation are unsuccessful in reaching a new agreement that includes all signatory Parties to the present Stipulation, and a Party files a notice to withdraw from the Stipulation, then the Commission will convene an evidentiary hearing such that the withdrawing Party will be afforded the opportunity to contest the Stipulation by presenting evidence through witnesses and cross-examination, presenting rebuttal testimony, and briefing all issues that the Commission shall decide based upon the record and briefs as if the withdrawing Party had never executed the Stipulation. Some or all of the Parties may submit a new agreement to the Commission for approval if the discussions achieve an outcome they believe substantially satisfies the intent of the present Stipulation.

The Signatory Parties fully support this Stipulation in its entirety and urge the Commission to accept and approve the terms herein.

This Stipulation is the product of an open process in which all Parties were represented by able counsel and technical experts. The Stipulation represents a comprehensive compromise of issues raised by Parties with diverse interests. Only parties to the proceeding, Duke Energy Ohio, and the Staff¹, have signed the Stipulation and adopted it as a reasonable resolution of all issues. The Signatory Parties believe that the Stipulation that they are recommending for Commission adoption presents a fair and reasonable result.

The Signatory Parties agree that the settlement, as a package, benefits consumers and is in the public interest. The Signatory Parties agree that the settlement does not violate any important regulatory principle or practice.

¹ Staff is a party for the purpose of entering into this Stipulation pursuant to O.A.C. 4901-1-10(C).

WHEREAS, all of the related issues and concerns raised by the Parties have been addressed in the substantive provisions of this Stipulation, and reflect, as a result of such discussions and compromises by the Parties, an overall reasonable resolution of all such issues;

WHEREAS, this Stipulation is the product of the discussions and negotiations of the Parties and is not intended to reflect the views or proposals that any individual Party may have advanced acting unilaterally;

WHEREAS, this Stipulation represents an accommodation of the diverse interests represented by the Parties and is entitled to careful consideration by the Commission;

WHEREAS, this Stipulation represents a serious compromise of complex issues and involves substantial benefits for consumers that would not otherwise have been achievable; and

WHEREAS, the Parties believe that the agreements herein represent a fair and reasonable solution to the issues raised in this matter;

NOW, THEREFORE, the Parties stipulate, agree, and recommend that the Commission make the following findings and issue its Opinion and Order in these proceedings approving this Stipulation in accordance with the following:

1. A financial audit of Duke Energy Ohio's Gas Cost Recovery (GCR) rates for the twelve-month period ended August 30, 2021, was conducted by Deloitte & Touche LLP in accordance with the objectives outlined in O.A.C. 4901:1-14-07.
2. The Independent Accountants' Report on the Uniform Purchased Gas Adjustment for the 12-Month Period Ended August 30, 2021, prepared by Deloitte & Touche LLP, (GCR Report) was filed with the Commission in Case No. 21-218-GA-GCR, on November 12, 2021, and shall be admitted into the record in this proceeding and identified as Commission-Ordered Exhibit 1.

3. The GCR rates for the twelve-month period ending August 27, 2020, were accurately computed and fairly determined by the Company in accordance with the provisions of O.A.C. Chapter 4901:1-14 and related appendices of the Ohio Administrative Code, were, and the costs reflected in the GCR rates were properly incurred.
4. Duke Energy Ohio's GCR rates were accurately applied to customer bills during the audit period.
5. The Independent Accountants' Report on Applying Agreed-Upon Procedures detailing a review by Deloitte & Touche LLP, (UEX Report) was filed with the Commission in Case No. 21-318-GA-UEX, on November 12, 2021, in relation to the uncollectible expense recovery mechanism for the 12-month period ended March 31, 2021. The UEX Report shall be admitted into the record in this proceeding and identified as Commission-Ordered Exhibit 2.
6. The Independent Accountants' Report on Applying Agreed-Upon Procedures detailing a review by Deloitte & Touche LLP, (PIP Report) was filed with the Commission in Case No. 21-418-GA-PIP, on November 12, 2021, in relation to the percentage of income plan recovery mechanism for the 12-month period ended March 31, 2021. The PIP Report shall be admitted into the record in this proceeding and identified as Commission-Ordered Exhibit 3.
7. Any findings in the UEX Report and the PIP Report, are reasonable and should be adopted by the Commission. The next audit or review will verify that the Company implemented any recommendations made in the present audit or review.
8. A management performance audit of Duke Energy Ohio's gas procurement practices and policies for the audit period September 2018 through August 2021 was performed by

Exeter Associates, Inc. (Exeter Report) and filed with the Commission on December 17, 2021, in Case No. 21-218-GA-GCR.

9. In its discussion of firm balancing services and charges, the Exeter Report notes certain impacts of changes in the rates for storage service from Columbia Gas Transmission (Columbia). As described in the Exeter Report, due to the dates and contents of filings with the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (FERC), the dates of actions by the FERC, the dates and contents of filings with the Commission, and the dates of actions by the Commission, GCR customers were overcharged by approximately \$1,342,000 (Exeter Report, pp. 74-76). The Parties agree, after further calculation, that the resultant overcharge equaled \$3,309,402.99. Therefore, the Parties agree that \$3,309,402.99 will be charged to the Contract Commitment Cost Recovery Rider (Rider CCCR) and credited to the GCR.²
10. The Signatory Parties also agree that if the settlement in Case No. 21-903-GA-EXM is not approved by the time of its next Rider FBS and Rider EFBS update filing, Duke Energy Ohio shall propose the following change to Tariff Sheet No. 50.16: “Duke Energy Ohio relies upon several interstate pipelines to provide EFBS/FBS balancing service to CRNGS Suppliers. Refunds issued by an interstate pipeline utilized to provide EFBS/FBS service shall be returned to CRNG suppliers and GCR customers on a pro rata basis.”
11. All other conclusions and recommendations in the Exeter Report are incorporated herein and are agreed to be reasonable and appropriate. This Stipulation shall be identified as

² IGS notes that, in the prior audit period, there was a time when retail suppliers paid higher than cost-based Columbia Gas Transmission rates for balancing services during certain months, and no refund was provided to retail suppliers or their customers. Therefore, the credit and collection mechanism described herein represents a departure from prior utility practices. In light of consideration of the Stipulation as a package, however, IGS agrees not to oppose this provision.

Joint Exhibit 1 and shall be admitted into evidence in this proceeding. The Signatory Parties also agree that testimony in support of this Stipulation is unnecessary and that cross-examination of any such testimony, if required, is hereby waived.

The undersigned hereby stipulate and agree and each represents that he or she is authorized to enter into this Stipulation and Recommendation this 14th day of March, 2024.

DUKE ENERGY OHIO, INC.

By: /s/ Elyse H. Akhbari
Elyse H. Akhbari
Duke Energy Business Services LLC
139 E. Fourth Street, 1303 Main
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
Attorney for Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.

STAFF OF THE PUBLIC UTILITIES
COMMISSION OF OHIO

By: /s/ Amy Botschner O'Brien (*Per Email Authorization on March 8, 2024)
Amy Botschner O'Brien
Office of the Ohio Attorney General
30 East Broad Street, 16th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Attorney for Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

IGS ENERGY

By: /s/ Joseph Olikar (*Per Email Authorization on March 14, 2024)
Joseph Olikar
6100 Emerald Parkway
Dublin, Ohio 43016
Attorney for IGS Energy

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was delivered via U.S. mail (postage prepaid), personal, or electronic mail delivery on this the 14th day of March, 2024, to the following:

/s/ Elyse H. Akhbari

Elyse H. Akhbari

Amy Botschner O'Brien
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Ohio Attorney General
30 East Broad Street, 16th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Amy.Botschner.Obrien@OhioAGO.gov
Attorney for Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

Joseph Olikier
6100 Emerald Parkway
Dublin, Ohio 43016
Joe.Olikier@IGS.com
Attorney for IGS Energy

William Michael
65 East State Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
William.Michael@occ.ohio.gov
Attorney for the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities
Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

3/14/2024 3:25:31 PM

in

Case No(s). 21-0218-GA-GCR, 21-0318-GA-UEX, 21-0418-GA-PIP

Summary: Stipulation Stipulation and Recommendation electronically filed by Mrs. Tammy M. Meyer on behalf of Duke Energy Ohio Inc. and D'Ascenzo, Rocco and Akhbari, Elyse Hanson.