



## Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

---

December 20, 2023

Tanowa Troupe, Secretary  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
180 East Broad Street, 11th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

RE: *In the Matter of the OVEC Generation Purchase Rider Audits Required by R.C. 4928.148 for Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., the Dayton Power and Light Company, and AEP Ohio, Case No. 21-477-EL-RDR*

Dear Ms. Troupe:

London Economics International LLC prepared an Audit Report of Duke, as filed in this docket on December 17, 2021. The Audit Report contains "Figure 9" at page 26, which was redacted.

Per the terms of OCC's Protective Agreement with Duke, I sent a letter on October 16, 2023 to Jeanne W. Kingery, counsel for Duke, notifying her of OCC's intent to use Figure 9 publicly. Duke took no action within the time period provided in the Protective Agreement to limit OCC's public use of this document. Accordingly, OCC is entitled to use this document publicly.

I have attached a copy of my October 16, 2023 letter to Ms. Kingery along with an unredacted version of Figure 9 from the Audit Report. Please file this letter and attachments in the docket of this case. Thank you for your consideration in this matter.

Very truly yours,

*/s/ John Finnigan*

John Finnigan (0018689)  
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

cc: All Parties of Record & Attorney Examiners



## Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

---

October 16, 2023

VIA EMAIL

Ms. Jeanne W. Kingery, Esq.  
Duke Energy Business Services LLC  
139 East Fourth Street, 1303-Main  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Re: PUCO Case No. 21-477-EL-RDR

Dear Ms. Kingery:

OCC received the following document from the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio under a Public Records Request dated June 2, 2023:

Unredacted Audit of the Legacy Generation Resource Rider of Duke Energy Ohio Final Report prepared by London Economics International LLC and dated December 15, 2021.

The PUCO provided the document subject to the protective agreement, indicating that Duke Energy Ohio has marked portions of this document as confidential from the public.

OCC and Duke Energy Ohio signed a Protective Agreement in the above-referenced case. The Protective Agreement was signed so that Duke Energy Ohio could more promptly share with OCC information and documents that Duke Energy Ohio deemed confidential as "Protected Materials."

Under paragraph 9 of the Protective Agreement, this email is notice that OCC intends to include, utilize, refer to, or copy the following material from the above-referenced document (that Duke Energy Ohio claims to be confidential) in the public domain:

Page 26, Figure 9. Reconciliation of journal entries and rider charge

This OCC email message will result in the above-referenced material becoming unprotected (non-confidential) unless Duke Energy Ohio files within the five-business-day timeline of the Protective Agreement (paragraph 9) to seek a ruling that the material is confidential.

By sending this email, OCC does not waive any rights including its right to identify additional discovery responses marked "CONFIDENTIAL" and to seek disclosure of any such documents in the public domain.

Best regards,

*/s/ John Finnigan*

John Finnigan

**Figure 9. Reconciliation of journal entries and rider charge**

Accounting month	A	Actual B	C	Estimated		
	Total OVEC charges (net of capacity trades)	PJM settlements	Total actuals (A+B)	D OVEC charges	E PJM Settlements	F Total estimated (D+E)
January 2020	\$92,376.90	\$2,647,693.49	\$2,740,070.39	(\$5,129,204.13)	(\$376,617.25)	(\$5,505,821.38)
February 2020	(\$9,669,999.94)	\$1,827,493.53	(\$7,842,506.41)	\$7,204,112.12	\$24,360.42	\$7,228,472.54
March 2020	(\$4,142,031.14)	\$1,578,728.01	(\$2,563,303.13)	\$259,979.54	(\$98,223.04)	\$161,756.50
April 2020	(\$4,483,924.01)	\$1,352,189.45	(\$3,131,734.56)	(\$29,099.42)	(\$440,367.11)	(\$469,466.53)
May 2020	(\$4,152,289.08)	\$804,058.59	(\$3,348,230.49)	\$140,851.16	\$285,187.11	\$426,038.27
June 2020	(\$3,879,031.91)	\$1,455,747.37	(\$2,423,284.54)	(\$291,434.62)	\$325,232.05	\$33,797.43
July 2020	(\$4,099,297.40)	\$2,478,896.41	(\$1,620,400.99)	(\$507,334.97)	(\$55,749.57)	(\$563,084.54)
August 2020	(\$4,610,713.41)	\$1,941,528.79	(\$2,669,184.62)	\$119,731.68	\$219,473.16	\$339,204.84
September 2020	(\$4,511,525.49)	\$1,978,066.56	(\$2,533,458.93)	\$561,972.07	(\$469,460.49)	\$92,511.58
October 2020	(\$4,276,130.48)	\$1,114,360.97	(\$3,161,769.51)	(\$10,997.78)	\$536,431.84	\$525,434.06
November 2020	(\$4,356,297.83)	\$2,239,167.22	(\$2,117,130.61)	\$2,032,751.14	(\$363,355.64)	\$1,669,395.50
December 2020	(\$4,588,176.91)	\$2,806,505.11	(\$1,781,671.80)	(\$4,259,304.54)	\$2,828.98	(\$4,256,475.56)
Total	(\$52,677,040.70)	\$22,224,435.50	(\$30,452,605.20)	\$92,022.25	(\$410,259.54)	(\$318,237.29)

Accounting month	G	H	I	J	K	J + K
	FES transactions	Broker fees	Adjustment to Actual OVEC net gains and losses*	Grand total (C+F+G+H-I)	Actual OVEC LGR net (gains) losses	Reconciliation
January 2020	(\$166,965.25)	\$0.00	\$0.00	(\$2,932,716.24)	\$2,932,716.24	\$0.00
February 2020	\$91,917.84	\$0.00	\$0.00	(\$522,116.03)	\$522,116.03	\$0.00
March 2020	(\$20,407.35)	\$0.00	\$0.00	(\$2,421,953.98)	\$2,421,953.98	\$0.00
April 2020	(\$15,392.68)	\$0.00	\$0.00	(\$3,616,593.77)	\$3,616,593.77	\$0.00
May 2020	(\$12,802.56)	(\$8,220.00)	\$0.00	(\$2,943,214.78)	\$2,943,214.78	\$0.00
June 2020	\$0.00	(\$4,110.00)	\$0.00	(\$2,393,597.11)	\$2,393,597.11	\$0.00
July 2020	\$0.00	(\$4,110.00)	\$0.00	(\$2,187,595.53)	\$2,187,595.53	\$0.00
August 2020	\$0.00	(\$4,110.00)	\$0.00	(\$2,334,089.78)	\$2,334,089.78	\$0.00
September 2020	\$0.00	(\$4,110.00)	(\$956,971.58)	(\$1,488,085.77)	\$1,488,085.77	\$0.00
October 2020	\$0.00	(\$4,110.00)	\$0.00	(\$2,640,445.45)	\$2,640,445.45	\$0.00
November 2020	\$0.00	(\$4,110.00)	\$0.00	(\$451,845.11)	\$451,845.11	\$0.00
December 2020	\$0.00	(\$4,110.00)	\$0.00	(\$6,042,257.36)	\$6,042,257.36	\$0.00
Total	(\$123,650.00)	(\$36,990.00)		(\$29,974,510.91)	\$29,974,510.91	\$0.00

Source: Columns A-G, LEI DR 01-053 Confidential Attachment E tab "acct mo total"; Column H, LEI DR 01-053 Confidential Attachment E tab "broker fees," Column K, LEI DR 01-053 CONF Attachment B tab "Costs and Revenues", Actual OVEC net (gains) and loss (Column Q)."

\*Includes two parts: (1) one-time reversal of FE reserve, and a one-time recovery of broker fees. See LEI DR-01-053 CONF Attachment B, tab "Adjustments."

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities  
Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on  
12/20/2023 4:35:48 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 21-0477-EL-RDR**

Summary: Correspondence Correspondence by Office of the Ohio Consumers'  
Counsel electronically filed by Alana M. Noward on behalf of Finnigan, John.