

In the Matter of the OVEC Generation : Case No. 21-477-EL-RDR  
Purchase Rider Audits Required by R.C.  
4928.148 for Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., The :  
Dayton Power and Light Company, and AEP  
Ohio :

Pursuant to Ohio Adm.Code 4901-1-24(D), The Dayton Power and Light Company d/b/a AES Ohio ("AES Ohio") moves for entry of a Protective Order to exempt from public disclosure certain information that is confidential, proprietary, and competitively sensitive trade secret information. R.C. 1333.61(D). The information at issue is Confidential Information relating to financial and investment projections and data contained in the testimony and exhibits of David Crusey.

This information is maintained as confidential by AES Ohio and OVEC, and constitutes proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret material, the public disclosure of which would subject AES Ohio and OVEC to an unfair competitive disadvantage.

Pursuant to the October 20, 2021 Entry in *In the Matter of the Proper Procedures and Process for the Commission's Operations and Proceedings During the Declared State of Emergency and Related Matters*, Pub. Util. Comm. No. 20-591-AU-UNC, unredacted copies of the Direct Testimony of David Crusey and supporting exhibits will be filed with the Commission electronically under seal. AES Ohio will further provide an unredacted copy to any party who enters into a protective agreement with AES Ohio in this proceeding.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Christopher C. Hollon

Christopher C. Hollon (0086480)

AES OHIO

1065 Woodman Drive

Dayton, OH 45432

Telephone: (937) 259-7358

Telecopier: (937) 259-7178

Email: christopher.hollon@aes.com

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)

(Counsel of Record)

Melissa L. Watt (0092305)

FARUKI PLL

110 North Main Street, Suite 1600

Dayton, OH 45402

Telephone: (937) 227-3747

Telecopier: (937) 227-3717

Email: jsharkey@ficlaw.com

mwatt@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for AES Ohio

(willing to accept service via e-mail)

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION OF THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT  
COMPANY D/B/A AES OHIO FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Pursuant to Ohio Adm.Code 4901-1-24(D), The Dayton Power and Light Company d/b/a AES Ohio ("AES Ohio") moves for entry of a Protective Order to exempt from public disclosure certain information as confidential, proprietary, and competitively sensitive trade secret information. Specifically, AES Ohio requests that certain confidential information relating to financial and investment projections and data contained in the direct testimony and exhibits of David Crusey in this proceeding be exempt from public disclosure as confidential, proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret information ("Confidential Information"). The testimony of those witnesses demonstrates that the information is confidential, contains trade secrets, that AES Ohio and OVEC would be prejudiced if the information was released publicly, and that it is maintained as confidential by AES Ohio and OVEC. The Confidential Information contains confidential financial information, forecasts, and investment information.

Section 4901-1-24(D) of the Ohio Administrative Code provides that the Commission may issue an order which is necessary to protect the confidentiality of information contained in documents filed with the Commission's Docketing Division to the extent that state or federal law prohibits the release of the information, and where non-disclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code. *Accord:* R.C. 4905.07 (providing that "[e]xcept as provided in section 149.43 of the Revised Code and as consistent with the purposes of Title XLIX [49] of the Revised Code, all facts and information in the possession of the public utilities commission shall be public").

The release of trade secret information by the Commission is prohibited by state law. *In the Matter of the Joint Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for*

*Integration of an Energy Efficiency or Peak-Demand Reduction Program with Honda of Am. Mfg., Inc.*, Pub. Util. Comm. No. 10-2205-EL-EEC, 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1313, at \*3 (Dec. 7, 2011) (Finding and Order) ("Section 149.43, Revised Code, specifies that the term 'public records' excludes information which, under state or federal law, may not be released. The Ohio Supreme Court has clarified that the 'state or federal law' exemption is intended to cover trade secrets.") (citing *State ex rel. Besser v. Ohio State Univ.*, 89 Ohio St.3d 396, 399, 732 N.E.2d 373 (2000)). The definition of a "trade secret" includes "any business information or plans [and] financial information." R.C. 1333.61(D).

"A company's determination of its costs, overhead, and volume of sales, and particularly its calculation of profit margins on customers' purchases may be the kind of information that the trade-secret statute seeks to protect." *Kenker Box Co. v. Riemeier Lumber Co.*, 1st Dist. Hamilton Nos. C-990803 and C-990824, 2000 Ohio App. LEXIS 6198, at \*10 (Dec. 29, 2000). *Accord: Alpha Benefits Agency, Inc. v. King Ins. Agency, Inc.*, 134 Ohio App.3d 673, 683, 731 N.E.2d 1209 (8th Dist.1999) (holding that trial court should have ordered plaintiff to produce its "profitability information" to defendant subject to a protective order); *Vanguard Transp. Sys. v. Edwards Transfer & Storage Co. Gen. Commodities Div.*, 109 Ohio App.3d 786, 789-90, 673 N.E.2d 182 (10th Dist.1996) (affirming trial court order that held that various information including "corporate financial information" constituted a trade secret).

This definition reflects the state policy favoring the protection of trade secrets such as the information that is the subject of this Motion. The Commission has issued protective orders in numerous prior proceedings to prevent the public disclosure of trade secrets. *E.g., In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. for an Increase in Electric Distribution Rates*, Pub. Util. Comm. No. 17-32-EL-AIR, *et al.*, 2018 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1268, at \*93 (Dec.

19, 2018) (Opinion and Order), ¶ 161-163 ("we note that the Commission has previously granted protective treatment for portions of briefs filed under seal and testimony containing sensitive data, including information that appears to reveal matters relating to competitive business information"); *In the Matter of the Application of Midwest Utility Consultants, Inc. for Certification as a Competitive Retail Natural Gas Aggregator/Broker*, Pub. Util. Comm. No. 09-893-GA-AGG, 2012 Ohio PUC LEXIS 103 (Jan. 30, 2012) (Entry) (forecasted financial statements were trade secrets and granted protective treatment); *In the Matter of the Application of the Ohio Power Co. and Columbus S. Power Co. for Authority to Merge and Related Approvals, et al.*, Pub. Util. Comm. No. 10-2376-EL-UNC, *et al.*, 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1325, at \*22-23 (Dec. 14, 2011) (Opinion and Order) (forecasted fuel expenditures were trade secrets and granted protective treatment); *In the Matter of the Joint Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Integration of an Energy Efficiency or Peak-Demand Reduction Program with Honda of Am. Mfg., Inc.*, Pub. Util. Comm. No. 10-2205-EL-EEC, 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1313, at \*2-5 (Dec. 7, 2011) (Finding and Order) (release of trade secrets prohibited by state law). *Accord: Ohio Consumers' Counsel v. Pub. Util. Comm.*, 121 Ohio St.3d 362, 2009-Ohio-604, 904 N.E.2d 853, ¶ 8.

Here, the Confidential Information constitutes "business information or plans, [and] financial information" that is confidential, proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret information under R.C. 1333.61(D). AES Ohio and OVEC maintain the Confidential Information subject to reasonable efforts to keep its secrecy, and the Confidential Information derives independent economic value from not being generally known to other persons who could obtain economic value from its disclosure or use.

The Commission (and its Staff) will have full access to the Confidential Information in order to fulfill its statutory obligations. For these foregoing reasons, AES Ohio requests that the Commission issue a Protective Order that permits the Confidential Information to be designated as confidential and to remain under seal.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Christopher C. Hollon

Christopher C. Hollon (0086480)

AES OHIO

1065 Woodman Drive

Dayton, OH 45432

Telephone: (937) 259-7358

Telecopier: (937) 259-7178

Email: christopher.hollon@aes.com

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)

(Counsel of Record)

Melissa L. Watt (0092305)

FARUKI PLL

110 North Main Street, Suite 1600

Dayton, OH 45402

Telephone: (937) 227-3747

Telecopier: (937) 227-3717

Email: jsharkey@ficlaw.com

mwatt@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for AES Ohio

(willing to accept service via e-mail)

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of the foregoing Motion of The Dayton Power and Light Company d/b/a AES Ohio for a Protective Order has been served via electronic mail upon the following counsel of record, this 3rd day of October, 2023:

Kimberly W. Bojko, Esq.  
(Counsel of Record)  
Emma Y. Easley, Esq.  
CARPENTER LIPPS LLP  
280 North High Street, Suite 1300  
Columbus, OH 43215  
bojko@carpenterlipps.com  
easley@carpenterlipps.com

*Counsel for the Ohio Manufacturers' Association  
Energy Group*

Angela Paul Whitfield, Esq.  
CARPENTER LIPPS LLP  
280 North High Street, Suite 1300  
Columbus, OH 43215  
paul@carpenterlipps.com

*Counsel for The Kroger Co.*

Karin Nordstrom, Esq.  
Chris Tavenor, Esq.  
1145 Chesapeake Avenue, Suite I  
Columbus, OH 43212-3449  
knordstrom@theOEC.org  
ctavenor@theOEC.org

*Counsel for the Ohio Environmental Council*

John Finnigan, Esq.  
(Counsel of Record)  
William J. Michael, Esq.  
Assistant Consumers' Counsel  
OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS'  
COUNSEL  
65 East State Street, Suite 700  
Columbus, OH 43215  
john.finnigan@occ.ohio.gov  
william.michael@occ.ohio.gov

*Counsel for Office of The Ohio Consumers' Counsel*

David F. Proano, Esq.  
(Counsel of Record)  
BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP  
127 Public Square, Suite 2000  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
dproano@bakerlaw.com

Ali I. Haque, Esq.  
Erika D. Prouty, Esq.  
Paul M.M. Willison, Esq.  
BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP  
200 Civic Center Drive, Suite 1200  
Columbus, OH 43215  
ahaque@bakerlaw.com  
eprouthy@bakerlaw.com  
pwillison@bakerlaw.com

*Counsel for Ohio Energy Leadership Council*

Thomas G. Lindgren, Esq.  
Assistant Attorney General  
Public Utilities Section  
30 East Broad Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-3414  
Thomas.lindgren@ohioago.gov

*Counsel for Staff of the Public Utilities Commission  
of Ohio*

Steven T. Nourse, Esq.  
AMERICAN ELECTRIC POWER SERVICE  
CORPORATION  
1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
stnourse@aep.com

*Counsel for Ohio Power Company*

Trent Dougherty, Esq.  
HUBAY DOUGHERTY  
1391 Grandview Avenue, #12460  
Columbus, OH 43212  
trent@hubaydougherty.com

*Counsel for Citizens' Utility Board of Ohio and the  
Union of Concerned Scientists*

Robert Dove, Esq.  
KEGLER BROWN HILL + RITTER CO.,  
L.P.A.  
65 East State Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, OH 43215-4295  
rdove@keglerbrown.com

*Counsel for Sierra Club*

Rocco O. D'Ascenzo, Esq.  
Jeanne W. Kingery, Esq.  
Larisa M. Vaysman, Esq.  
Elyse H. Akhbari, Esq.  
DUKE ENERGY BUSINESS SERVICES  
LLC  
139 East Fourth Street, 1303-Main  
Cincinnati, OH 45201-0960  
Rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com  
Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com  
Larisa.vaysman@duke-energy.com  
Elyse.akhbari@duke-energy.com

*Counsel for Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.*

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey  
Jeffrey S. Sharkey



**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities  
Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**10/3/2023 2:14:00 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 21-0477-EL-RDR**

Summary: Motion of The Dayton Power and Light Company d/b/a AES Ohio for a Protective Order electronically filed by Mr. Jeffrey S. Sharkey on behalf of The Dayton Power and Light Company.