

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of	)	
Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc. for	)	Case No. 08-0606-GA-AAM
Authority to Defer Environmental	)	
Investigation and Remediation Costs.	)	

---

**ANNUAL DEFERRAL REPORT OF  
COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.**

---

On May 19, 2008, Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc. ("Columbia") filed its Application in this docket, requesting authority to defer on its books environmental investigation and remediation costs. By Entry dated September 24, 2008, the Commission approved the Application. Paragraph 11 of said Entry provides:

Prior to their deferral on its books, we require Columbia to make an annual filing in this docket detailing the costs incurred in the prior 12-month period covered by the deferrals and the total amount deferred to date.

Pursuant to Paragraph 11 of the September 24, 2008 Entry, Columbia provides the following information. The costs Columbia incurred for the twelve-month period of December 2021 through November 2022,<sup>1</sup> and which Columbia proposes to defer, are \$393,019.66, which is fully offset by the (\$860,587) from Joint Stipulation and Recommendation from Case Nos. 21-0637-GA-AIR, *et al.*<sup>2</sup> These costs are comprised of expenses incurred in the continued remediation of sites in Toledo, Fremont, Fostoria, Athens, Portsmouth, Lorain, Elyria, and Columbus, Ohio. Columbia's projects and costs are described in the following attachments:

---

<sup>1</sup> Columbia currently has a rate case pending in Case No. 21-0637-GA-AIR, *et al.* In that proceeding, Columbia is requesting recovery of the deferred environmental expenses for the period of January 2008 through March 2021. Columbia filed a Joint Stipulation and Recommendation in Case No. 21-0637-GA-AIR, *et al.*, on October 31, 2022, which provides for certain treatment of the environmental remediation expense. Columbia proposes to file an amended Annual Report once the Commission issues an Opinion and Order opining on the Joint Stipulation and Recommendation.

<sup>2</sup> All sites have incurred at least \$25,000 of cost which Columbia has recognized as expense and is not including in this deferral.

Attachment 1 — Toledo (Swan Creek) project description  
Attachment 2 — Toledo cost detail  
Attachment 3 — Fremont project description  
Attachment 4 — Fremont cost detail  
Attachment 5 — Fostoria (Crocker Street) project description  
Attachment 6 — Fostoria (Crocker Street) cost detail  
Attachment 7 — Athens project description  
Attachment 8 — Athens cost detail  
Attachment 9 — Portsmouth project description  
Attachment 10 — Portsmouth cost detail  
Attachment 11 — Lorain project description  
Attachment 12 — Lorain cost detail  
Attachment 13 — Elyria project description  
Attachment 14 — Elyria cost detail  
Attachment 15 — Columbus I project description  
Attachment 16 — Columbus I cost detail  
Attachment 17 — Columbus II project description  
Attachment 18 — Columbus II cost detail  
Attachment 19 — Fostoria II (Wood Street) project description  
Attachment 20 — Fostoria II (Wood Street) cost detail  
Attachment 21 — Toledo II project description  
Attachment 22 — Toledo II cost detail  
Attachment 23 — Toledo I (Land) project description  
Attachment 24 — Toledo I (Land) cost detail

Additionally, Columbia has included in this report, as Attachment 25, a schedule showing the amounts deferred by year for all projects, and the total amount deferred to date.

Respectfully submitted by,

**COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.**

/s/ John R. Ryan

John R. Ryan (Counsel of Record)

Joseph M. Clark, Asst. Gen. Counsel  
(0080711)

John R. Ryan, Senior Counsel (0090607)

P.O. Box 117

290 W. Nationwide Blvd.

Columbus, Ohio 43216-0117

Telephone: (614) 285-2220

E-mail: johnryan@nisource.com

josephclark@nisource.com

(Willing to accept service by e-mail)

Attorneys for

**COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.**

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio's e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document on the parties referenced on the service list of the docket card who have electronically subscribed to the case. In addition, the undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing document is also being served via electronic mail on the 9th day of December, 2022 upon the parties listed below.

/s/ John R. Ryan

By: John R. Ryan

**Attorney for  
COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.**

Larry S. Sauer  
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel  
65 East State Street, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-4203  
[larry.sauer@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:larry.sauer@occ.ohio.gov)

## **ATTACHMENT 1**

## **Toledo (Swan Creek)**

Description: The former Toledo Gas Light and Coke Company site located at 333 South Erie Street, Toledo, was owned and operated by Columbia as a Service Center until it sold the property and building in March 2011. The site is in the process of being remediated in accordance with Ohio's VAP regulations by the new property owner, River Road Redevelopment H, LLC ("R3II"). While the site was originally entered into the VAP with Columbia as the remedial applicant, after purchasing the property, R3II is now the remedial applicant. The Ohio EPA issued a Covenant Not to Sue for the site on November 10, 2014.

The former MGP property, located at 333 South Erie Street, Toledo, is adjacent to Swan Creek. The indemnification with R3I1 does not cover remediation of Swan Creek. Columbia will manage any sediment investigation and remediation under a future regulatory scenario. Sediments have been subject to a preliminary ecological assessment and limited sampling which indicated some areas of MGP related impacts. The state and federal regulatory agencies have expressed interest in the status of Swan Creek as a tributary to the Maumee River which is an identified Area of Concern under the Federal Great Lakes Legacy Act. There is a documented history of multiple parties discharging to the creek. Additional sediment investigation will be necessary since the extent of impacts and responsibility for those impacts have yet to be determined.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, there were no additional activities performed except the annual cost modeling evaluation.

During the twelve-month period ending November 2022, Columbia met with representatives of the OEPA and USEPA, at their request, to learn about future cleanup efforts of Swan Creek and reviewed the Swan Creek Site Characterization Report completed by the USEPA. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia for this site from April 2021 through November 2022 were \$3,781.36. Attachment 2 sets forth a detailed description of \$1,599.70 of these expenses incurred during December 2021 through November 2022.

## **ATTACHMENT 2**

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc  
Summary of Environmental Expenses  
December 2021 through November 2022

Attachment 2

Site	Filing Date Range	Date	Vendor Name	AP Voucher ID	Invoice ID	Total
Toledo I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-04	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00196035	9003999	120.82
Toledo I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00197949	9004830	184.86
Toledo I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00200814	9005713	446.98
Toledo I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00203933	9006590	210.49
Toledo I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00206375	9007476	152.47
Toledo I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	APPLIED GEOLOGY & ENVIRONMENTAL	00209561	217010	842.42
Toledo I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00209348	9008504	154.14
Toledo I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00211062	9009421	69.48
<b>2021 Total</b>	<b>Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021 Total</b>					<b>2,181.66</b>
Toledo I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2021-12	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00217830	9011744	19.49
Toledo I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00225614	9014473	26.07
Toledo I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	ENVIRONMENTAL STANDARDS INC	00227348	96172	128.29
Toledo I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075332	9018454	532.81
Toledo I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075331	9018393	259.00
Toledo I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00076327	9019766	294.02
Toledo I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	J0077204	9020523	194.93
Toledo I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248167	9022551	49.72
Toledo I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248166	9021541	95.37
<b>2022 Total</b>	<b>Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022 Total</b>					<b>1,599.70</b>
<b>Toledo I</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>					<b><u>3,781.36</u></b>



## **ATTACHMENT 3**

## **Fremont**

Description: An MGP operated at the Site from about 1873 to 1904 on two parcels at Justice and Knapp Streets, Fremont, Sandusky County, Ohio. The MGP Property was owned by a predecessor of Columbia from 1863 to 1929. The Holder Property was owned by a predecessor of Columbia from 1901 to 1935. A Phase I Assessment for the site was completed in 2011.

A Phase II assessment was started in 2012 and is ongoing. Columbia has conducted multiple sampling events at the Site between August 2012 and October 2018 including three soil sampling events, two phases of Tar Green Optical Screening Tool ("TarGOST®") investigation to identify and delineate dense non-aqueous phase ("DNAPL") impacts at the Site, multiple groundwater sampling events and multiple vapor/air sampling events.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, Columbia met with the property owner to discuss proposed remedial work and the Remedial Action Plan and Risk management Plan documents were drafted. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

During the twelve-month period ending November 2022, Columbia met with the property owner to discuss proposed remedial work and continued work in preparation for remediation in 2023. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized and costs were incurred to monitor the site through a third-party monitoring system, Terradex.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia for this site from April 2021 through November 2022 were \$63,339.52. Attachment 4 sets forth a detailed description of \$49,211.33 of these expenses incurred during December 2021 through November 2022.

## **ATTACHMENT 4**

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc  
Summary of Environmental Expenses  
December 2021 through November 2022

Attachment 4

Site	Filing Date Range	Date	Vendor Name	AP Voucher ID	Invoice ID	Total
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-04	ATC GROUP SERVICES LLC	01067917	2341153	2,025.00
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-04	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00196035	9003999	120.82
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01068458	1198565	761.95
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01068459	1198566	295.99
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01068460	1198567	219.65
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00197949	9004830	184.85
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00200814	9005713	446.99
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-06	TERRADEX INC	01084121	202103542-15731	1,020.00
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00203933	9006590	210.49
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-07	TERRADEX INC	01121031	202106215-15731	1,020.00
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-08	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01135493	2021086	1,518.75
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00206375	9007476	152.47
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	APPLIED GEOLOGY & ENVIRONMENTAL	00209561	217010	842.42
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01150477	11985610	149.36
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01150618	2021100	3,236.77
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00209348	9008504	154.14
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-10	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01163753	11985611	566.56
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00211062	9009421	69.48
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-11	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01180059	2021131	112.50
Fremont	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-11	TERRADEX INC	01180166	202109524-15731	1,020.00
<b>2021 Total</b>	<b>Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021</b>	<b>Total</b>				<b>14,128.19</b>
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-12	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	00216826	11985612	701.23
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-12	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01193989	2021146	56.25
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-12	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00217830	9011744	19.49
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-01	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01209427	2021163	225.00
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-01	TERRADEX INC	01209681	202112113-15731	1,020.00
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-02	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01223716	2022185	225.00
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01250422	2022210	337.50
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00225614	9014473	26.07
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	ENVIRONMENTAL STANDARDS INC	00227348	96172	128.29
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-04	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	00230972	1198568REV	149.36
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-04	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	00230945	11985614	4,744.31
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-04	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	00230973	1198569REV	74.68
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-04	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01252015	2022237	112.50
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-05	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	00234071	11985615	8,178.02
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-05	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01266186	2022256	506.25
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	00236671	11985613	2,955.80
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01280861	2022267	2,202.50
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075332	9018454	532.81
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075331	9018393	258.99
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-07	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	00237925	11985617	1,738.91
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-07	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	00237235	11985616	1,269.56
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-07	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01296252	2022296	225.00
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-07	OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION	J1280860	1489320	7,632.63
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00076327	9019766	294.02
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	00243297	11985618	2,761.73
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	00245782	11985619	4,949.59
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01324094	2022335	168.75
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	J0077204	9020523	194.92
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	TERRADEX INC	01324592	202203229-15731	1,020.00
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION	01324164	372003003002	1,187.63
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	00248613	119856-20	1,424.10
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01352323	2022373	112.50
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248167	9022551	49.72
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248166	9021541	95.37
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-11	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	00249311	11985620	1,424.10
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-11	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01354138	2022387	168.75
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-11	TERRADEX INC	01367951	202209121-15731	1,020.00
Fremont	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-11	TERRADEX INC	01354201	202206518-15731	1,020.00
<b>2022 Total</b>	<b>Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022</b>	<b>Total</b>				<b>49,211.33</b>

<b>Fremont</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>63,339.52</b>
----------------	--------------------	------------------

## **ATTACHMENT 5**

## **Fostoria I (Crocker St.)**

Description: Columbia authorized a history consulting firm to research corporate successors to the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century entities known to have been associated with two former MGPs located in Fostoria, Ohio. Columbia has reviewed its corporate history and has determined it is a successor to entities that owned or operated the former MGP on Crocker Street. Columbia conducted a Phase I Property Assessment at that MGP property in conformance with Ohio's VAP regulations. In addition, Columbia performed a historic evaluation to confirm site ownership, past operating practices and availability of historic information to aid in site evaluation.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, an environmental restrictive covenant (ERC) was presented to the current property owner and was recorded in 2021 with No Further Action documentation by the VAP Certified Professional. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

During the twelve-month period ending November 2022, there were no additional activities performed except for finalizing of the annual site cost model.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia for this site from April 2021 through November 2022 were \$21,073.10. Attachment 6 sets forth a detailed description of \$3,419.68 of these expenses incurred during December 2021 through November 2022.

## **ATTACHMENT 6**

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc  
Summary of Environmental Expenses  
December 2021 through November 2022

Attachment 6

Site	Filing Date Range	Date	Vendor Name	AP Voucher ID	Invoice ID	Total
Fostoria I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-04	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00196035	9003999	120.82
Fostoria I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-05	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00197949	9004830	184.85
Fostoria I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-05	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	01068383	9004847	3,430.51
Fostoria I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-05	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	01068384	9004848	2,403.24
Fostoria I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00200814	9005713	446.99
Fostoria I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	01083083	9005721	7,955.81
Fostoria I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00203933	9006590	210.49
Fostoria I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	01120723	9006572	1,682.20
Fostoria I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00206375	9007476	152.47
Fostoria I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-09	APPLIED GEOLOGY & ENVIRONMENTAL	00209561	217010	842.42
Fostoria I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00209348	9008504	154.14
Fostoria I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00211062	9009421	69.48
<b>2021 Total</b>	<b>Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021 Total</b>					<b>17,653.42</b>
Fostoria I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-12	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00217830	9011744	19.49
Fostoria I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-03	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00225614	9014473	26.07
Fostoria I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-03	ENVIRONMENTAL STANDARDS INC	00227348	96172	128.29
Fostoria I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-03	TESTAMERICA LABORATORIES INC	J1223797	2400023641	1,820.00
Fostoria I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075332	9018454	532.81
Fostoria I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075331	9018393	258.99
Fostoria I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00076327	9019766	294.02
Fostoria I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	J0077204	9020523	194.92
Fostoria I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248167	9022551	49.72
Fostoria I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248166	9021541	95.37
<b>2022 Total</b>	<b>Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022 Total</b>					<b>3,419.68</b>
<b>Fostoria I</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>					<b>21,073.10</b>



## **ATTACHMENT 7**

## Athens

Description: The former Athens MGP (The Athens Gas Light Company and The Athens Gas Light and Electric Company) operated from about 1872 until about 1898. Historic Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps indicated the MGP structures included two gas holders, retort and purification buildings, and materials storage. Columbia has reviewed its corporate history and has determined that it is a successor to entities that owned and/or operated the Athens MGP.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, Columbia conducted additional groundwater sampling event in early 2021. The Remedial Alternatives Evaluation was completed in 2021. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

During the twelve-month period ending November 2022, Columbia met with the current property owner(s) to review the remediation plan and to negotiate access. It is expected remediation will take place in the summer of 2024. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized and costs were incurred to monitor the site through a third-party monitoring system, Terradex.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia for this site from April 2021 through November 2022 were \$66,548.19. Attachment 8 sets forth a detailed description of \$14,805.95 of these expenses incurred during December 2021 through November 2022.

## **ATTACHMENT 8**

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc  
Summary of Environmental Expenses  
December 2021 through November 2022

Attachment 8

Site	Filing Date Range	Date	Vendor Name	AP Voucher ID	Invoice ID	Total
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-04	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00196035	9003999	120.82
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01082595	10777721	12,458.45
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	COR05ZBA1	10777720	24,000.69
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00197949	9004830	184.85
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	PACE ANALYTICAL SERVICES LLC	01068706	2150158201	1,880.00
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00200814	9005713	446.99
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-06	TERRADEX INC	01084118	202103542-11587	450.00
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00203933	9006590	210.49
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-07	TERRADEX INC	01121028	202106215-11587	450.00
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-08	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01135692	10777723	5,968.74
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-08	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01135959	10777722	2,483.76
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00206375	9007476	152.47
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	APPLIED GEOLOGY & ENVIRONMENTAL	00209561	217010	842.42
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01150476	10777724	224.04
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00209348	9008504	154.14
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-10	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01163752	10777725	821.48
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00211062	9009421	69.50
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-11	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01180075	10777726	373.40
Athens	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-11	TERRADEX INC	01180164	202109524-11587	450.00
<b>2021 Total</b>	<b>Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021 Total</b>					<b>51,742.24</b>
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2021-12	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00217830	9011744	19.49
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-01	TERRADEX INC	01209679	202112113-11587	450.00
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00225614	9014473	26.07
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	ENVIRONMENTAL STANDARDS INC	00227348	96172	128.29
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-05	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01267955	10777727	567.68
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075332	9018454	532.82
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075331	9018393	258.99
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-07	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01296260	10777728	454.44
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-08	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01310832	10777729	1,109.19
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-08	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01310806	2022318	1,708.75
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00076327	9019766	294.01
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01338154	10777730	1,582.28
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01324095	2022348	5,261.25
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01338155	2022300A	316.50
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	J0077204	9020523	194.92
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	TERRADEX INC	01324590	202203229-11587	450.00
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	BURNS & MCDONNELL ENGINEERING CO INC	01352332	10777731	293.68
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01352322	2022360	112.50
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248167	9022551	49.72
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248166	9021541	95.37
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-11	TERRADEX INC	01367921	20220912111587	450.00
Athens	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-11	TERRADEX INC	01354199	202206518-11587	450.00
<b>2022 Total</b>	<b>Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022 Total</b>					<b>14,805.95</b>
<b>Athens</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>					<b><u>66,548.19</u></b>

## **ATTACHMENT 9**

## **Portsmouth**

Description: The former Portsmouth MGP operated in the vicinity of West Second, Madison and Jefferson Streets in Portsmouth between 1884 and 1905. Historical Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps indicated that MGP structures included three gas holders, retort and purifications buildings and materials storage. Columbia has reviewed its corporate history and has determined it is a successor to entities that owned and operated the MGP.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, the No Further Action (NFA) documentation by the VAP Certified Professional was completed. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

During the twelve-month period ending November 2022, there were no additional activities performed except for finalizing of the annual site cost model.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia for this site from April 2021 through November 2022 were \$5,982.29. Attachment 10 sets forth a detailed description of \$1,599.70 of these expenses incurred during December 2021 through November 2022.

## **ATTACHMENT 10**

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc  
Summary of Environmental Expenses  
December 2021 through November 2022

Attachment 10

Site	Filing Date Range	Date	Vendor Name	AP Voucher ID	Invoice ID	Total
Portsmouth	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-04	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00196035	9003999	120.82
Portsmouth	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-05	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00197949	9004830	184.86
Portsmouth	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00200814	9005713	446.99
Portsmouth	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00203933	9006590	210.49
Portsmouth	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	01120724	9006574	1,358.50
Portsmouth	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00206375	9007476	152.47
Portsmouth	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-09	APPLIED GEOLOGY & ENVIRONMENTAL	00209561	217010	842.42
Portsmouth	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-09	APPLIED GEOLOGY & ENVIRONMENTAL	COR09ZBA2	217010	842.42
Portsmouth	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00209348	9008504	154.14
Portsmouth	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00211062	9009421	69.48
<b>2021 Total</b>	<b>Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021</b>	<b>Total</b>				<b>4,382.59</b>
Portsmouth	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-12	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00217830	9011744	19.49
Portsmouth	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-03	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00225614	9014473	26.07
Portsmouth	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-03	ENVIRONMENTAL STANDARDS INC	00227348	96172	128.29
Portsmouth	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075332	9018454	532.81
Portsmouth	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075331	9018393	259.00
Portsmouth	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00076327	9019766	294.02
Portsmouth	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	J0077204	9020523	194.93
Portsmouth	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248167	9022551	49.72
Portsmouth	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248166	9021541	95.37
<b>2022 Total</b>	<b>Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022</b>	<b>Total</b>				<b>1,599.70</b>
<b>Portsmouth</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>					<b>5,982.29</b>



## **ATTACHMENT 11**

## **Lorain**

Description: Columbia authorized a history consultant firm to research corporate successors to the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century entities known to have been associated with the former MGP Site located in Lorain, Ohio. In addition, Columbia asked that this review include a confirmation of site ownership, past operating practices, and available historic information to aid in future site evaluation. Columbia has reviewed its corporate history and has determined that it is a successor to entities that owned and/or operated the Lorain MGP.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, Columbia continued to pursue access to conduct investigations consistent with Ohio VAP. Access has not been granted. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

During the twelve-month period ending November 2022, Columbia continued to pursue access to conduct investigations consistent with Ohio VAP. Access has not been granted. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia for this site from April 2021 through November 2022 were \$4,793.96. Attachment 12 sets forth a detailed description of \$2,442.22 of these expenses incurred during December 2021 through November 2022.

## **ATTACHMENT 12**

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc  
Summary of Environmental Expenses  
December 2021 through November 2022

Attachment 12

Site	Filing Date Range	Date	Vendor Name	AP Voucher ID	Invoice ID	Total
Lorain	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-04	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00196035	9003999	120.82
Lorain	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-05	AECOM TECHNICAL SERVICES INC	01082468	2000497014	255.00
Lorain	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-05	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00197949	9004830	184.85
Lorain	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00200814	9005713	446.99
Lorain	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00203933	9006590	210.49
Lorain	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-08	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01148940	2021084	112.50
Lorain	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00206375	9007476	152.47
Lorain	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-09	AECOM TECHNICAL SERVICES INC	01150488	2000530958	645.00
Lorain	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00209348	9008504	154.14
Lorain	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00211062	9009421	69.48
<b>2021 Total</b>	<b>Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021</b>	<b>Total</b>				<b>2,351.74</b>
Lorain	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2021-12	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00217830	9011744	19.49
Lorain	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-03	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00225614	9014473	26.08
Lorain	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-03	ENVIRONMENTAL STANDARDS INC	00227348	96172	128.29
Lorain	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-04	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01265104	2022219	337.50
Lorain	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075332	9018454	532.81
Lorain	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075331	9018393	259.00
Lorain	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-08	AECOM TECHNICAL SERVICES INC	00240928	2000653135	505.00
Lorain	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00076327	9019766	294.02
Lorain	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	J0077204	9020523	194.93
Lorain	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248167	9022551	49.72
Lorain	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 20	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248166	9021541	95.38
<b>2022 Total</b>	<b>Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022</b>	<b>Total</b>				<b>2,442.22</b>
<b>Lorain</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>					<b><u>4,793.96</u></b>

## **ATTACHMENT 13**

## Elyria

Description: The former Elyria MGP operated from 1878 to 1902 on Maple Street (renamed Locust Street) in Elyria, Ohio, on property that was subsequently used by others for solvent recovery operations and which is now designated as a Superfund site. Companies that contributed used solvents in those operations and are now working to remediate the site under the direction of U.S. EPA (“USEPA”) and Ohio EPA. Columbia has reviewed its corporate history and has determined it is a successor to an entity that owned and operated the MGP.

The Elyria MGP occupied a property with a long history of commercial and industrial uses which started with the MGP (for over 20 years) and ended with solvent recovery operations (also for over 20 years), but also included the other industrial uses summarized below for relatively brief periods:

- I.T.S Rubber Company for shoe manufacturing (rubber heels of shoes);
- Standard Oil facility;
- Sinclair refining facility;
- Coal Yard;
- Concrete Facility;
- Heat and Stove Facility;
- Machine shop;
- Foundry; and
- Ice company.

The waste solvent reclamation activities at the site were operated by Obitts Chemical Company (1960 to 1974) and then Chemical Recovery Systems (“CRS”) (1974 to 1982). These facilities processed petroleum solvents, chlorinated solvents, and related petroleum wastes and marketed them for reuse. USEPA filed a lawsuit against CRS in 1981, requiring the owners to abate environmental issues that had been identified at the site. CRS completed a limited soils removal effort under USEPA Order and then filed for bankruptcy in 1982.

USEPA subsequently ordered CRS to conduct additional environmental remediation in 1983 that included additional soil excavation and erection of a site security fence. In the 1980’s little happened at the fence site. Ohio EPA, USEPA and other agencies conducted assessments of site conditions during the 1990s and ultimately added the site to the Superfund list and negotiated an Administrative Order with a number of potentially responsible parties (“PRPs” or “Settling Parties”) that had contracted historically with the former CRS to dispose of or recycle spent solvents in 2002. Since 2002, these Settling Parties have conducted remedial

investigation and reviewed remedial options for the site in a Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act ("CERCLA")-type program with USEPA and Ohio EPA oversight.<sup>3</sup>

Studies completed by the Settling Parties identified impacts that resembled those from former MGP operations mixed with their solvent reclamation releases. A historic evaluation was conducted in which they identified Columbia as a successor to the MGP operator. They contacted Columbia and asked that Columbia become a participating member of the Settling Parties cleaning up the site.

The contamination identified at the site has impacted ground water in fractured bedrock beneath the site, and thus remediation to traditional USEPA clean-up standards was not considered to be possible within a 30 year time frame. The Settling Parties proposed a technical impracticability ("TI") waiver for site cleanup, which would allow contaminants under the site to remain without removal (at a substantially lower cost). USEPA has requested further investigation before it will decide whether to grant the requested TI waiver. That investigation work is expected to continue through 2020 and perhaps beyond.

In October of 2018, the USEPA issued Columbia a General Notice Letter for the CRS Site indicating that it may be responsible under CERCLA, USEPA encouraged Columbia to communicate/work with the PRPs conducting work at the site.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, Columbia continued negotiation of a USEPA Removal Order to allow work to complete an investigation of the former manufactured gas plant facilities. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

During the twelve-month period ending November 2022, Columbia continued negotiation of a USEPA Removal Order to allow work to complete an investigation of the former manufactured gas plant facilities. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized. It is anticipated the Order and Field Sampling Plan will be finalized in early 2023 to allow the investigation of the MGP to be implemented in 2023.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia for this site from April 2021 through November 2022 were \$26,864.79. Attachment 14 sets forth a

---

<sup>3</sup> CERCLA is commonly known as the federal Superfund Law for clean up at the site.

detailed description of \$7,182.49 of these expenses incurred during December 2021 through November 2022.



## **ATTACHMENT 14**

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc  
Summary of Environmental Expenses  
December 2021 through November 2022

Attachment 14

Site	Filing Date Range	Date	Vendor Name	AP Voucher ID	Invoice ID	Total
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-04	GEI CONSULTANTS INC	01054626	3087528	368.00
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-04	GEI CONSULTANTS INC	COR04ZBA1	3087529	1,928.50
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-04	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00196035	9003999	120.82
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	GEI CONSULTANTS INC	01082445	3089113	920.00
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	GEI CONSULTANTS INC	01082446	3089114	4,970.55
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00197949	9004830	184.86
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-06	GEI CONSULTANTS INC	01084426	3091637	3,190.25
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00200814	9005713	446.99
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-07	GEI CONSULTANTS INC	01121685	3092484	3,053.50
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00203933	9006590	210.49
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-08	GEI CONSULTANTS INC	01136400	3094227	3,568.75
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00206375	9007476	152.47
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	GEI CONSULTANTS INC	01150621	3096224	343.50
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00209348	9008504	154.14
Elyria	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00211062	9009421	69.48
<b>2021 Total</b>	<b>Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021 Total</b>					<b>19,682.30</b>
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2021-12	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00217830	9011744	19.49
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00225614	9014473	26.07
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	ENVIRONMENTAL STANDARDS INC	00227348	96172	128.29
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-04	GEI CONSULTANTS INC	01252050	3107305	187.75
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-05	GEI CONSULTANTS INC	01267933	3109516	1,545.26
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-05	GEI CONSULTANTS INC	01267932	3098927	184.00
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	GEI CONSULTANTS INC	01280865	3110705	1,001.40
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075332	9018454	532.81
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075331	9018393	258.99
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-07	GEI CONSULTANTS INC	01296254	3112479	2,332.26
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-08	GEI CONSULTANTS INC	01323018	3115111	332.13
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00076327	9019766	294.01
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	J0077204	9020523	194.93
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248167	9022551	49.72
Elyria	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248166	9021541	95.38
<b>2022 Total</b>	<b>Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022 Total</b>					<b>7,182.49</b>
<b>Elyria</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>					<b>26,864.79</b>

## **ATTACHMENT 15**

## **Columbus I**

Description: The former Columbus I manufactured gas plant operated from 1846 to 1904 on property bounded by West Spring, North Front, West Long and Marconi Streets in downtown Columbus. The western 50% of the parcel was formerly used for parking, however this property was recently purchased and the parking garage closed and demolished. Redevelopment of this parcel is planned, but the schedule is unknown. The northeast quarter of the property is occupied by the Bureau of Workers Compensation and the southeast quarter is the Michael B. Coleman Governmental Center.

Columbia authorized a history consultant firm to research corporate successors to the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century entities known to have been associated with the former MGP Site located in Columbus, Ohio. Columbia confirmed site ownership, past operating practices, and available historic information to aid in future site evaluation. Columbia reviewed its corporate history and has determined that it is a successor to entities that owned and/or operated the Columbus I MGP.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, there were no additional activities performed except for finalizing the site cost model.

During the twelve-month period ending November 2022, there were no additional activities performed except for finalizing the site cost model.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia for this site from April 2021 through November 2022 were \$16,048.36. Attachment 16 sets forth a detailed description of \$14,709.11 of these expenses incurred during December 2021 through November 2022.

## **ATTACHMENT 16**

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc  
Summary of Environmental Expenses  
December 2021 through November 2022

Attachment 16

Site	Filing Date Range	Date	Vendor Name	AP Voucher ID	Invoice ID	Total
Columbus I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-04	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00196035	9003999	120.82
Columbus I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00197949	9004830	184.85
Columbus I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00200814	9005713	446.99
Columbus I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00203933	9006590	210.49
Columbus I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00206375	9007476	152.47
Columbus I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00209348	9008504	154.15
Columbus I	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00211062	9009421	69.48
<b>2021 Total</b>	<b>Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021 Total</b>					<b>1,339.25</b>
Columbus I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2021-12	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00217830	9011744	19.49
Columbus I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00225614	9014473	26.07
Columbus I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	ENVIRONMENTAL STANDARDS INC	00227348	96172	128.29
Columbus I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075332	9018454	532.81
Columbus I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075331	9018393	258.99
Columbus I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	01296257	9019407	9,175.82
Columbus I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00076327	9019766	294.01
Columbus I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	01323022	9020513	3,933.61
Columbus I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	J0077204	9020523	194.93
Columbus I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248167	9022551	49.72
Columbus I	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248166	9021541	95.37
<b>2022 Total</b>	<b>Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022 Total</b>					<b>14,709.11</b>
<b>Columbus I</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>					<b><u>16,048.36</u></b>

## **ATTACHMENT 17**

## **Columbus II**

Description: The former Columbus II manufactured gas plant operated from 1846 to 1901 on property located near I-670 and Goodale Street in downtown Columbus, Ohio.

Columbia engaged a history consultant firm to research corporate successors to the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century entities known to have been associated with the former MGP Site. Columbia confirmed site ownership, reviewed past operating practices, and reviewed available historic information to aid in future site evaluation. Columbia reviewed its corporate history and determined that it is a successor to entities that owned and/or operated the Columbus II MGP.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, there were no additional activities performed except for finalizing the site cost model.

During the twelve-month period ending November 2022, there were no additional activities performed except for finalizing the site cost model.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia for this site from April 2021 through November 2022 were \$2,938.94. Attachment 18 sets forth a detailed description of \$1,599.69 of these expenses incurred during December 2021 through November 2022.



## **ATTACHMENT 18**

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc  
Summary of Environmental Expenses  
December 2021 through November 2022

Attachment 18

Site	Filing Date Range	Date	Vendor Name	AP Voucher ID	Invoice ID	Total
Columbus II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-04	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00196035	9003999	120.82
Columbus II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00197949	9004830	184.86
Columbus II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00200814	9005713	446.99
Columbus II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00203933	9006590	210.49
Columbus II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00206375	9007476	152.47
Columbus II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00209348	9008504	154.14
Columbus II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00211062	9009421	69.48
<b>2021 Total</b>	<b>Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021</b>	<b>Total</b>				<b>1,339.25</b>
Columbus II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2021-12	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00217830	9011744	19.50
Columbus II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00225614	9014473	26.07
Columbus II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	ENVIRONMENTAL STANDARDS INC	00227348	96172	128.29
Columbus II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075332	9018454	532.81
Columbus II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075331	9018393	259.00
Columbus II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00076327	9019766	294.01
Columbus II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	J0077204	9020523	194.92
Columbus II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248167	9022551	49.72
Columbus II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248166	9021541	95.37
<b>2022 Total</b>	<b>Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022</b>	<b>Total</b>				<b>1,599.69</b>
<b>Columbus II</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>					<b><u>2,938.94</u></b>

## **ATTACHMENT 19**

## **Fostoria II (Wood Street)**

Description: The former Fostoria II manufactured gas plant operated from approximately 1887 to 1901 on property located at 209 N. Wood Street in downtown Fostoria, Ohio. Columbia authorized a history consultant firm to research corporate successors to the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century entities known to have been associated with the former MGP Site. In addition, Columbia asked that this review include a confirmation of site ownership, past operating practices, and available historic information to aid in future site evaluation. Columbia determined it is a successor to entities that owned and/or operated the Fostoria II MGP.

Columbia began the process of conducting a Phase I and II project assessment in conformance with Ohio's VAP.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, Columbia began negotiating access with the current owner(s) of the former MGP parcel prior to the completion of a Phase I. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

During the twelve-month period ending November 2022, Columbia continued to negotiate access with the current owner of the former MGP parcel to complete the Phase I. To date, access has not been given. The annual cost modeling report was also finalized.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia for this site from April 2021 through November 2022 were \$14,621.96. Attachment 20 sets forth a detailed description of \$3,442.58 of these expenses incurred during December 2021 through November 2022.

## **ATTACHMENT 20**

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc  
Summary of Environmental Expenses  
December 2021 through November 2022

Attachment 20

Site	Filing Date Range	Date	Vendor Name	AP Voucher ID	Invoice ID	Total
Fostoria II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-04	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00196035	9003999	120.82
Fostoria II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00197949	9004830	184.85
Fostoria II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00200814	9005713	446.99
Fostoria II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00203933	9006590	210.49
Fostoria II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-08	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01135492	2021085	900.00
Fostoria II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00206375	9007476	152.47
Fostoria II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01150617	2021099	3,590.38
Fostoria II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00209348	9008504	154.14
Fostoria II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	01150474	9008473	1,206.54
Fostoria II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-10	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01163734	2021115	1,237.50
Fostoria II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00211062	9009421	69.48
Fostoria II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	01163883	9009414	424.27
Fostoria II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-11	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01180058	2021130	675.00
Fostoria II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-11	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	01180073	9010766	1,806.45
<b>2021 Total</b>	<b>Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021 Total</b>					<b>11,179.38</b>
Fostoria II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2021-12	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01193988	2021145	56.25
Fostoria II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2021-12	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00217830	9011744	19.49
Fostoria II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-02	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01223715	2022184	168.75
Fostoria II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00225614	9014473	26.07
Fostoria II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	ENVIRONMENTAL STANDARDS INC	00227348	96172	128.29
Fostoria II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-04	ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGIES & COMMUNICATI	01252014	2022218	112.50
Fostoria II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075332	9018454	532.81
Fostoria II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075331	9018393	259.00
Fostoria II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	01296256	9019401	1,505.38
Fostoria II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00076327	9019766	294.02
Fostoria II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	J0077204	9020523	194.93
Fostoria II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248167	9022551	49.72
Fostoria II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248166	9021541	95.37
<b>2022 Total</b>	<b>Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022 Total</b>					<b>3,442.58</b>
<b>Fostoria II</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>					<b>14,621.96</b>

## **ATTACHMENT 21**

## **Toledo II**

Description: The former Toledo II MGP operated in the vicinity of West Central Avenue and Interstate 75 in Toledo, Lucas County, Ohio. The site is currently owned by the City of Toledo, and occupied by the Division of Streets, Bridges and Harbor.

The former MGP operated on the site from 1918 to 1945 under the Atlas Chemical Company (1918-1928) and the Ohio Fuel Gas Company (1928-1945). Both Atlas Chemical and the Ohio Fuel Gas companies were, ultimately, subsidiaries of Columbia, confirming that Columbia Gas is a successor to entities that owned and/or operated the Toledo II MGP.

The Ohio Fuel Gas Company abandoned operations at the Central Avenue plant in 1945 and eventually sold the property in 1951. Ownership of the property changed several times between 1951 and 1973 when purchased by the City of Toledo. According to Sanborn Insurance Fire Maps, the various former MGP structures were razed by the different owners during the period of 1952-1976.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, there were no additional activities performed except for finalizing of the annual site cost model.

During the twelve-month period ending November 2022, there were no additional activities performed except for finalizing of the annual site cost model.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia for this site from April 2021 through November 2022 were \$2,938.91. Attachment 22 sets forth a detailed description of \$1,599.67 of these expenses incurred during December 2021 through November 2022.



## **ATTACHMENT 22**

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc  
Summary of Environmental Expenses  
December 2021 through November 2022

Attachment 22

Site	Filing Date Range	Date	Vendor Name	AP Voucher ID	Invoice ID	Total
Toledo II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-04	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00196035	9003999	120.82
Toledo II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-05	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00197949	9004830	184.85
Toledo II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00200814	9005713	446.99
Toledo II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-07	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00203933	9006590	210.49
Toledo II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00206375	9007476	152.47
Toledo II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00209348	9008504	154.14
Toledo II	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00211062	9009421	69.48
<b>2021 Total</b>	<b>Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021 Total</b>					<b>1,339.24</b>
Toledo II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2021-12	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00217830	9011744	19.49
Toledo II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00225614	9014473	26.07
Toledo II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-03	ENVIRONMENTAL STANDARDS INC	00227348	96172	128.29
Toledo II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075332	9018454	532.81
Toledo II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-06	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00075331	9018393	258.99
Toledo II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-08	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00076327	9019766	294.01
Toledo II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	J0077204	9020523	194.92
Toledo II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248167	9022551	49.72
Toledo II	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	00248166	9021541	95.37
<b>2022 Total</b>	<b>Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022 Total</b>					<b>1,599.67</b>
<b>Toledo II</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>					<b><u>2,938.91</u></b>

## **ATTACHMENT 23**

## **Toledo I (Land)**

Description: The former Toledo Gas Light and Coke Company site located at 333 South Erie Street, Toledo, was owned and operated by Columbia as a Service Center until it sold the property and building in March 2011. The site is being remediated in accordance with Ohio's VAP regulations by the new property owner, River Road Redevelopment H, LLC ("R3II"). While the site was originally entered into the VAP with Columbia as the remedial applicant, after purchasing the property, R3II is now the remedial applicant. The Ohio EPA issued a Covenant Not to Sue (CNTS) for the site on November 10, 2014. Note, that continued Operation and Maintenance (O&M) of a groundwater pump and treatment system were a stipulation of receiving the CNTS.

During the twelve-month period ending November 2022, Columbia, per implementation of Section 6.5 of the Remediation Agreement, paid R3II to manage the ongoing O&M of the groundwater pump and treat system. The annual cost modeling report was also finalized.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia for this site from April 2021 through November 2022 were \$346,407.54. Attachment 24 sets forth a detailed description of \$291,407.54 of these expenses incurred during December 2021 through November 2022.

## **ATTACHMENT 24**

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc  
Summary of Environmental Expenses  
December 2021 through November 2022

Attachment 24

Site	Filing Date Range	Date	Vendor Name	AP Voucher ID	Invoice ID	Total
Toledo I Land	Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021	2021-10	RIVER ROAD REDEVELOPMENT II LLC	01165888	6	55,000.00
<b>2021 Total</b>	<b>Apr. 2021 - Nov. 2021 Total</b>					<b>55,000.00</b>
Toledo I Land	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	01325041	9021470	7,969.83
Toledo I Land	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	RIVER ROAD REDEVELOPMENT II LLC	01324078	20221	126,800.00
Toledo I Land	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-09	RIVER ROAD REDEVELOPMENT II LLC	01323653	20222	136,300.00
Toledo I Land	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-10	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	01352328	9022547	14,669.48
Toledo I Land	Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	2022-11	HALEY & ALDRICH INC	01367831	9023613	5,668.23
<b>2022 Total</b>	<b>Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022 Total</b>					<b>291,407.54</b>
<b>Toledo I Land</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>					<b><u>346,407.54</u></b>

## **ATTACHMENT 25**

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc.  
Summary of Environmental Remediation Expenses  
December 2021 through November 2022

Accounting Period	(Swan Creek) Toledo I \$	Fremont \$	Fostoria I \$	Athens \$	Portsmouth \$	Lorain \$	Elyria \$	Columbus I \$	Columbus II \$	Fostoria II \$	Toledo II \$	(Land) Toledo I	Total \$
Prior Reporting Periods	2,181.66	14,128.19	17,653.42	51,742.24	4,382.59	2,351.74	19,682.30	1,339.25	1,339.25	11,179.38	1,339.24	55,000.00	182,319.26
Dec. 2021 - Nov. 2022	1,599.70	49,211.33	3,419.68	14,805.95	1,599.70	2,442.22	7,182.49	14,709.11	1,599.69	3,442.58	1,599.67	291,407.54	393,019.66
Total	3,781.36	63,339.52	21,073.10	66,548.19	5,982.29	4,793.96	26,864.79	16,048.36	2,938.94	14,621.96	2,938.91	346,407.54	575,338.92
Joint Stipulation and Recommendation Case No. 21-0637-GA-AIR													(860,587.00)
<b>Net Deferred Environmental Remediation Expenses</b>													<b><u>(285,248.08)</u></b>

**Note:** All sites have incurred at least \$25,000 of cost for which Columbia has recognized as expense and is properly not included in this deferral.



**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities  
Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**12/9/2022 2:00:25 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 08-0606-GA-AAM**

Summary: Annual Report of Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc. electronically filed by Ms.  
Melissa L. Thompson on behalf of Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc.