

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Duke)
Energy Ohio, Inc., for Approval of a General)
Exemption of Certain Natural Gas) Case No. 21-903-GA-EXM
Commodity Sales Services or Ancillary)
Services.)

In the Matter of the Application of Duke) Case No. 21-904-GA-ATA
Energy Ohio, Inc. for Tariff Approval.)

In the Matter of the Application of Duke)
Energy Ohio, Inc., for Approval to Change) Case No. 21-905-GA-AAM
Accounting Methods.)

**DIRECT TESTIMONY
OF
MICHAEL P. HAUGH**

On Behalf of
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
65 East State Street, Suite 700
Columbus, Ohio 43215

September 7, 2022

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
I. OVERVIEW	1
II. PURPOSE OF TESTIMONY	4
III. STANDARD SERVICE OFFER AUCTIONS	6
IV. BILLING SYSTEM CHANGES	9
V. CONCLUSION.....	11

LIST OF ATTACHMENTS

Attachment MPH-1	Previous Testimony of Michael P. Haugh
Attachment MPH-2	AEP Ohio Shadow Billing Data
Attachment MPH-3	Duke Ohio Gas Shadow Billing Data
Attachment MPH-4	Columbia Gas of Ohio Shadow Billing Data

1 **I. OVERVIEW**

2

3 ***Q1. PLEASE STATE YOUR NAME, TITLE, AND BUSINESS ADDRESS.***

4 ***A1.*** My name is Michael P. Haugh. I am the Director of Analytical Services for
5 Markets and Competitive Services at the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
6 ("OCC"). My business address at OCC is 65 East State Street, Suite 700,
7 Columbus, Ohio 43215.

8

9 ***Q2. PLEASE BRIEFLY SUMMARIZE YOUR EDUCATION AND***
10 ***PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE.***

11

12 ***A2.*** I have a Bachelor of Science in Business Administration from the Ohio State
13 University with a major in Finance. I have also attended the Institute of Public
14 Utilities Advanced Regulatory Studies at Michigan State University. I have over
15 20 years working in the energy industry with experience in wholesale and retail
16 energy trading, risk management, natural gas purchasing and scheduling, and
17 regulatory affairs. I started with Enron Energy Services in 1995 as an Energy
18 Trader and then moved on to American Electric Power Energy Services in 1998
19 where I worked in Risk Management and Wholesale Energy Trading. In January
20 2004 I went to work for MidAmerican Energy Services as a Senior Product
21 Manager. In October of 2004 I began work as a Senior Regulatory Analyst with
22 the OCC. I left the OCC in September 2007 and joined Integrys Energy Services
23 as a Regulatory Affairs Analyst. I joined Just Energy in 2009 and held the
24 position of Manager of Regulatory Affairs before becoming Manager of Market

*Direct Testimony of Michael P. Haugh
On Behalf of the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
PUCO Case No. 21-903-GA-EXM, et al.*

1 Relations in 2011. I was re-hired at the OCC in June 2014 as the Assistant
2 Director of Analytical Services where I worked until May 2018. I then worked for
3 Genie Energy as the Director of Energy Affairs until December of 2018. I was an
4 independent consultant from January 2019 until I took my current position in July
5 2021.

6

7 **Q3. HAVE YOU PREVIOUSLY SUBMITTED TESTIMONY IN UTILITY CASES**
8 **BEFORE REGULATORY COMMISSIONS?**

9

10 **A3.** Yes, I have testified before the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“PUCO”)
11 and the Michigan Public Service Commission. The complete list of cases in which
12 I have testified is attached as Attachment MPH-1.

13

14 **Q4. DO YOU HAVE ANY EXPERIENCE IN THE OHIO NATURAL GAS**
15 **STANDARD SERVICE OFFER AUCTION PROCESS?**

16

17 **A4.** Yes, I participated in the stakeholder processes in the PUCO cases that started the
18 Dominion East Ohio (“DEO”), Vectren Energy Delivery of Ohio (now
19 CenterPoint Energy Ohio) and Columbia Gas Standard Service Offer (“SSO”)
20 auctions.¹ I filed testimony in the DEO SSO auction case. I have observed the
21 PUCO approved natural gas auctions in person. I have also participated in many
22 ongoing stakeholder meetings regarding the SSO and Standard Choice Offer

¹ *In the Matter of the Application of the East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio for Approval of a Plan to Restructure its Commodity Service Function*, PUCO Case No. 05-474-GA-ATA. *In the Matter of the Application of Columbia Gas of Ohio for Approval of a General Exemption of Certain Natural Gas Commodity Sales Service or Ancillary Services*, PUCO Case No. 08-1344-GA-EXM. *In the Matter of the Application of Vectren Energy Delivery of Ohio for Approval of a General Exemption of Certain Natural Gas Commodity Sales Service or Ancillary Services*, PUCO Case No. 07-1285-GA-EXM.

*Direct Testimony of Michael P. Haugh
On Behalf of the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
PUCO Case No. 21-903-GA-EXM, et al.*

1 (“SCO”) for all of the Ohio natural gas utilities. I have suggested in the past that
2 Duke Energy Ohio (“Duke”) switch from its traditional Gas Cost Recovery
3 (“GCR”) procurement process to a SSO process.²

4

5 Along with observing and participating in the auctions and related meetings while
6 working for the OCC, I also participated in them while employed with two energy
7 marketers. While at both Integrys Energy Services and Just Energy, I worked with
8 the Gas Supply Departments on certification and bidding strategy. This gave me a
9 perspective of what goes into bidding on these auctions and what is expected if
10 tranches are won.

11

12 ***Q5. WHAT IS THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN SSO AND SCO AUCTIONS?***

13 ***A5.*** All of the Ohio natural gas utilities started with SSO auctions. With the SSO
14 auction the utility will auction off a portion of its load called a tranche. These
15 tranches are all equal sized and represent a portion of sales volume. Each SSO
16 supplier tranche has the same delivery requirement. After the SSO auction is
17 complete, customers’ bills look virtually identical to their bills under the GCR
18 procurement process.

² *In the Matter of the Regulation of the Purchased Gas Adjustment Clauses Contained within the Rate Schedules of Duke Energy Ohio Inc., and Related Matters* (“Duke GCR Audit Case”), PUCO Case No. 18-218-GA-GCR, Direct Testimony of Michael P. Haugh at pages 2-3 (filed September 3, 2019).

*Direct Testimony of Michael P. Haugh
On Behalf of the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
PUCO Case No. 21-903-GA-EXM, et al.*

1 A SCO procurement process consists of auctioning off equal blocks of actual
2 customers, not a portion of the total load. Instead of suppliers having an equal
3 tranche of natural gas to be delivered, the supplier has a portion of specific
4 customers they are required to serve. Another difference is that the SCO
5 supplier's name appears on the customer's bill thus creating a retail relationship
6 between the supplier and that consumer. However, being served on the utility's
7 standard offer, can lead to customer confusion about who is supplying their gas.
8 Under the SCO auction, a supplier has been randomly assigned to the customer
9 and the customer is being served under the terms decided via the utility's
10 competitive auction just like the SSO auction.

11
12 **II. PURPOSE OF TESTIMONY**

13
14 ***Q6. WHAT IS THE PURPOSE OF YOUR TESTIMONY IN THIS***
15 ***PROCEEDING?***

16
17 ***A6.*** I am supporting Duke's Application to procure their customers' natural gas
18 supply through a SSO auction as opposed to their traditional GCR procurement
19 process. This is the best and simplest auction process. Through a SSO auction
20 process consumers will see minimal changes compared to the GCR process. In
21 fact, most customers will not notice any changes, except hopefully lower
22 commodity charges, and reduced responsibility for the risk of rising commodity
23 prices during the term of the SSO.

*Direct Testimony of Michael P. Haugh
On Behalf of the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
PUCO Case No. 21-903-GA-EXM, et al.*

1 **Q7. PLEASE SUMMARIZE YOUR RECOMMENDATIONS.**

2 **A7.** I recommend the PUCO approve Duke's Application. I support Duke procuring
3 consumers' natural gas supply through a SSO auction process. Additionally, I
4 support the inclusion of the Price to Compare information on customers natural
5 gas bills.

6

7 **Q8. PLEASE PROVIDE SOME BACKGROUND ON WHY THIS APPLICATION**
8 **WAS FILED.**

9

10 **A8.** In 2019, I testified in the Duke GCR Audit Case that Duke should procure its
11 consumers' natural gas through a competitive auction to help lower consumers'
12 natural gas charges.³ The PUCO did not agree with my recommendation in that
13 case.⁴ But through a global settlement of 18 cases that were before the PUCO,
14 along with settling cases involving Duke's manufactured gas plants and return of
15 money to consumers resulting from the 2017 Tax Cut and Job Act, Duke agreed
16 to transition from a GCR procurement process to a SSO auction process.⁵ On
17 August 31, 2021. Duke filed, in the present case, a Notice of Intent to file an
18 application to implement a wholesale auction process. This auction process was
19 specifically stated to be "an SSO (not a standard choice offer) to transition away
20 from its GCR process."⁶ Duke conducted stakeholder meetings to solicit input

³ *Id.* at pages 8-9.

⁴ Duke GCR Audit Case, Opinion and Order at pages 22-23, (December 18, 2019).

⁵ *In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., for an Adjustment to Rider MGP Rates* ("Global Settlement"), PUCO Case No. 14-375-GA-RDR, et al. Stipulation and Recommendation filed August 31, 2021.

⁶ *Id.* at page 16.

1 regarding the SSO auction process. The PUCO approved the Stipulation and
2 Recommendation on April 20, 2022. Duke filed the Application to change its
3 procurement process in the present case on April 27, 2022.

4
5 **III. STANDARD SERVICE OFFER AUCTIONS**

6
7 ***Q9. WHY WAS THE STANDARD SERVICE OFFER AUCTION PROCESS***
8 ***CHOSEN BY DUKE?***
9

10 ***A9.*** As I stated above, this was part of the Stipulation and Recommendation in the
11 Global Settlement it specifically stated Duke would transition to a SSO process.
12 This was an agreed upon term of the stipulating parties.

13
14 ***Q10. DO YOU BELIEVE A SSO AUCTION IS BETTER FOR CONSUMERS***
15 ***THAN A SCO AUCTION?***
16

17 ***A10.*** Yes, for a few reasons. First, with a SSO auction consumers will see minimal
18 changes to their bills. This is important because as Duke Witness Amy Spiller
19 stated one of the goals of this transition is to “enable a smooth transition for
20 customers.”⁷ In this application Duke has proposed some changes to their current
21 bill format. Adding a gas marketer’s name (as would be the case under a SCO
22 auction) could create customer confusion.

⁷ Direct Testimony of Amy B. Spiller at page 10.

*Direct Testimony of Michael P. Haugh
On Behalf of the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
PUCO Case No. 21-903-GA-EXM, et al.*

1 Second, the SCO auction requires a supplier to also be a certified retail natural gas
2 supplier. This prohibits wholesale natural gas suppliers, that don't wish to file for
3 certification at the PUCO, from participating in the auctions. In a SSO auction
4 almost any entity that has the credit and expertise to supply natural gas can
5 participate. An expanded diverse set of bidders in the SSO will create more
6 competition and lower prices.

7

8 ***Q11. WHAT WAS THE PERSPECTIVE OF THE ENERGY MARKETERS YOU***
9 ***WORKED FOR REGARDING THE SSO VERSUS SCO?***

10

11 ***A11.*** Energy marketers generally prefer the SCO process. This is because it allows
12 them to have consumers to be directly assigned to them. With that assignment
13 they receive information about the consumer and are allowed to contact them to
14 switch them off the SCO and onto one of their products. Marketers can go to their
15 door, send mail, or even contact them via telephone. One energy marketer that I
16 worked for decided that it could ignore the national do-not-call registry because
17 technically they were doing business with the consumers assigned to them even
18 though most of those consumers had no idea who was supplying their natural gas
19 and had no prior direct interactions with the marketers.

20

21 ***Q12. DO YOU HAVE CONSUMER PROTECTION CONCERNS BECAUSE OF***
22 ***ENERGY MARKETERS' MARKETING ACTIVITY?***

23

24 ***A12.*** Yes. There have recently been a number of cases at the PUCO regarding
25 violations of O.A.C. 4901:1-29-05(D) which states "No retail natural gas supplier
26 or governmental aggregator may engage in marketing, solicitation, sales acts, or

*Direct Testimony of Michael P. Haugh
On Behalf of the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
PUCO Case No. 21-903-GA-EXM, et al.*

1 practices which are unfair, misleading, deceptive, or unconscionable in the
2 marketing, solicitation, or sale of a competitive retail natural gas service..⁸
3 ⁹There are complaints where a marketer charged consumers over three times the
4 standard choice offer rate.¹⁰ This is very concerning with wholesale natural gas
5 prices rising. If an unscrupulous marketer decides to triple already high rates
6 consumers can be pushed to the brink of being able to pay their utility bills. Triple
7 Duke's current GRC rate would be \$3.466 per ccf.¹¹ As a point of reference,
8 looking at New York Mercantile Exchange ('NYMEX'), the clearing house for
9 wholesale natural gas trades, settlement data since 1997 there has never been a
10 monthly natural gas settlement above \$1.30 per ccf.¹² These types of rule
11 violations should be noted before turning consumers over to marketers.

⁸ *In the Matter of Ambit Northeast, LLC*, PUCO Case No. 22-128-EL-UNC; *In the Matter of Josco Energy USA, LLC*, PUCO Case No. 22-170-EL-UNC, *In the Matter of the Commission's Investigation into PALMco Power OH, LLC, dba Indra Energy and PALMco Energy OH, LLC dba Indra Energy's Compliance with the Ohio Administrative Code and Potential Remedial Action*, PUCO Case No. 19-2153-GE-COI; *In the Matter of the Commission's Investigation into Verde Energy USA Ohio, LLC's Compliance with the Ohio Administrative Code and Potential Remedial Actions for Non-Compliance*, PUCO Case No. 19-598-GE-COI; *In the Matter of Xoom Energy Ohio, LLC*, PUCO Case No. 22-267-GE-COI.

⁹ Note: some of the above cases include both O.A.C. 4901:1-29-05(D) and O.A.C. 4901:1-21-03(A) which govern certified retail electric suppliers.

¹⁰ *In the Matter of the Commission's Investigation into PALMco Power OH, LLC, dba Indra Energy and PALMco Energy OH, LLC dba Indra Energy's Compliance with the Ohio Administrative Code and Potential Remedial Action*, PUCO Case No. 19-2153-GE-COI. Letter from Robert Fadley at page 2 (filed December 16, 2019).

¹¹ Duke Energy Ohio PUCO Natural Gas Tariff Sheet No. 71.309, effective September 1, 2022.

¹² US Energy Information Administration "Henry Hub Natural Gas Prices" link:
<https://www.eia.gov/dnav/ng/hist/rngwhhdm.htm>.

1 **IV. BILLING SYSTEM CHANGES**

2
3 ***Q13. WHAT BILLING SYSTEM CHANGES HAS DUKE PROPOSED IN THIS***
4 ***PROCEEDING?***

5
6 ***A13.*** Duke has proposed to include a Price to Compare calculation to their bill and a
7 related message. The bill message reads ““In order for you to save money, a
8 natural gas supplier must offer you a price lower than \$X.XX per Ccf for the same
9 usage that appears on this bill.”¹³

10
11 ***Q14. WHY DO YOU SUPPORT THIS BILL MESSAGE?***

12 ***A14.*** This message provides consumers with a good comparison when researching
13 shopping. When a customer switches from the standard offer service to an energy
14 marketer they need the information that is on their bill such as their Duke account
15 number. It is very helpful to be able to see what rate they are currently paying in
16 order to compare it to the rate that is being offered to the consumer. This is an
17 additional consumer protection that gives a consumer immediate information
18 when they are being solicited by a marketer. Information like this is also
19 beneficial to consumers who are being overcharged by a marketer as I described
20 above.

21
22 This is not a novel idea either, O.A.C. 4901:1-10-22 (B)(24) requires electric
23 utilities to include “The price-to-compare notice on residential customer bills and

¹³ Application, at page 8.

*Direct Testimony of Michael P. Haugh
On Behalf of the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
PUCO Case No. 21-903-GA-EXM, et al.*

1 a notice that such customers can obtain a written explanation of the price-to-
2 compare from their electric utility” on consumers’ bills. This is a good resource
3 for electric consumers and should also be afforded to natural gas consumers.
4

5 **Q15. HOW HAVE MARKETERS’ RATES IN OHIO COMPARED WITH THE**
6 **ELECTRIC AND GAS UTILITIES’ STANDARD OFFER RATES?**

7
8 **A15.** Marketers’ rates, in the aggregate, have been higher than utility standard offer
9 rates across Ohio. OCC receives shadow billing data from AEP Ohio since
10 January 2019, Duke Gas since January 2019, and Columbia Gas of Ohio since
11 April of 1997. Shadow billing data shows the aggregate dollar amount shopping
12 customers paid versus being on the utility default rate.
13 AEP Ohio shows cumulative losses of \$179 million for its shopping customers.
14 (Attachment MPH-2), Duke shows cumulative losses of \$53 million for its
15 shopping customers. (Attachment MPH-3). The most shocking is Columbia Gas
16 of Ohio that shows cumulative loses of over **\$2 billion**. (Attachment MPH-4).
17 This should not be a total shock because Columbia’s data cover almost 25 years,
18 but it should be noted that only 70 months have shown savings for those shopping
19 and 54 of them were in the first 4½ years.
20

21 In the aggregate switching to marketers has not proven to save consumers money.
22 I understand that not all consumers shop for savings. But that does not take away
23 from the fact that shopping consumers have overpaid by billions of dollars.

*Direct Testimony of Michael P. Haugh
On Behalf of the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
PUCO Case No. 21-903-GA-EXM, et al.*

1 Given the disparity between what shopping consumers have paid versus non-
2 shopping it is very important for price to compare information to be readily
3 available on consumers' bills.

4
5 ***Q16. HAVE THERE BEEN ANY STUDIES ON THE SSO AUCTIONS?***

6 ***A16.*** Yes, researchers at Ohio State and Cleveland State Universities prepared a report
7 for the Northeast Ohio Public Energy Council on customer choice in Ohio.¹⁴ This
8 study found that Ohio consumers saved \$19.5 million from SSO auctions from
9 2012 through 2018.¹⁵ Although this study concentrates on the electric auctions it
10 can be assumed the natural gas auctions have also brought savings to consumers.

11

12 **V. CONCLUSION**

13

14 ***Q17. DOES THIS CONCLUDE YOUR TESTIMONY?***

15 ***A17.*** Yes, however I reserve the right to incorporate new information that may
16 subsequently become available.

¹⁴ Thomas, A., Henning, M., Bowen, W., Hill, E., Kanter, A., (2019) *Update on Electricity Customer Choice in Ohio: Competition Continues to Outperform Traditional Monopoly Regulation* Northeast Ohio Public Energy Council, https://www.nopec.org/media/1573/19nop32-whitepaper_web.pdf.

¹⁵ *Id.* at page 7.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing Direct Testimony of Michael P. Haugh, on Behalf of the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel was served via electronic transmission upon the parties below this 7th day of September 2022.

/s/ Angela D. O'Brien
Angela D. O'Brien
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

The PUCO's e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document on the following parties:

SERVICE LIST

robert.eubanks@ohioAGO.gov
rhiannon.plant@ohioAGO.gov
mjsettineri@vorys.com
glpetrucci@vorys.com
Michael.nugent@igs.com
Evan.betterton@igs.com
Stacie.cathcart@igs.com

Attorney Examiner:
matthew.sandor@puco.ohio.gov
nicholas.walstra@puco.ohio.gov

Rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com
Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com
Larisa.vaysman@duke-energy.com
Elyse.akhbari@duke-energy.com
talexander@beneschlaw.com
mkeaney@beneschlaw.com
ssiewe@beneschlaw.com
dparram@bricker.com

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

Monongahela Power Company, Case No. 04-1047-EL-ATA

American Electric Power Company, Case No. 05-376-EL-UNC

Dayton Power and Light Company, Case No. 05-276-EL-AIR

Dominion East Ohio Company, Case No. 05-474-EL-ATA

Dominion East Ohio Company, Case No. 05-219-GA-GCR

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Case No. 05-221-GA-GCR

Duke Energy Ohio, Case No. 03-93-EL-ATA

American Electric Power, Case No. 07-63-EL-UNC

Eramet Marietta, Inc., Case No. 09-516-EL-AEC

TimkenSteel Corporation, Case No. 15-1857-EL-AEC

American Electric Power Company, Case No. 14-1693-EL-RDR

Columbia Gas of Ohio, Case No. 16-1309-GA-UNC

American Electric Power, Case No. 10-2929-EL-UNC

Dayton Power and Light, Case No. 16-395-EL-SSO

American Electric Power, Case No. 16-1852-EL-SSO

Duke Energy Ohio, Case No. 18-218-GA-GCR

Duke Energy Ohio, Case No. 20-167-EL-RDR

American Electric Power, Case No. 18-1004-EL-RDR

Campbell Soup Company, LLC, Case No. 21-1047-EL-AEC

Michigan Public Service Commission

Michigan Consolidated Gas Company, Case No. U-17131

Attachment MPH-2**AEP Ohio****Shadow Billing Data**

Month	Residential Shopping Savings	Residential Shopping Non-Savings	Total Monthly Choice Savings	Cumulative Savings
January 2019	\$ 439,818.07	\$ (6,014,490.87)	\$ (5,574,672.80)	\$ (5,574,672.80)
February 2019	\$ 407,506.67	\$ (5,437,438.01)	\$ (5,029,931.34)	\$ (10,604,604.14)
March 2019	\$ 434,778.83	\$ (4,760,607.60)	\$ (4,325,828.77)	\$ (14,930,432.91)
April 2019	\$ 356,692.98	\$ (3,825,919.33)	\$ (3,469,226.35)	\$ (18,399,659.26)
May 2019	\$ 313,279.27	\$ (3,406,209.10)	\$ (3,092,929.83)	\$ (21,492,589.09)
June 2019	\$ 193,028.01	\$ (4,192,365.47)	\$ (3,999,337.46)	\$ (25,491,926.55)
July 2019	\$ 295,526.84	\$ (5,370,430.11)	\$ (5,074,903.27)	\$ (30,566,829.82)
August 2019	\$ 268,030.82	\$ (5,648,420.03)	\$ (5,380,389.21)	\$ (35,947,219.03)
September 2019	\$ 270,886.76	\$ (4,817,912.77)	\$ (4,547,026.01)	\$ (40,494,245.04)
October 2019	\$ 837,978.81	\$ (3,164,270.62)	\$ (2,326,291.81)	\$ (42,820,536.85)
November 2019	\$ 753,602.34	\$ (2,688,336.84)	\$ (1,934,734.50)	\$ (44,755,271.35)
December 2019	\$ 814,275.88	\$ (3,788,276.27)	\$ (2,974,000.39)	\$ (47,729,271.74)
January 2020	\$ 682,751.53	\$ (4,518,318.33)	\$ (3,835,566.80)	\$ (51,564,838.54)
February 2020	\$ 684,186.68	\$ (3,982,965.37)	\$ (3,298,778.69)	\$ (54,863,617.23)
March 2020	\$ 698,536.40	\$ (3,689,155.48)	\$ (2,990,619.08)	\$ (57,854,236.31)
April 2020	\$ 466,808.73	\$ (3,071,838.38)	\$ (2,605,029.65)	\$ (60,459,265.96)
May 2020	\$ 516,750.99	\$ (2,911,475.35)	\$ (2,394,724.36)	\$ (62,853,990.32)
June 2020	\$ 170,204.05	\$ (5,139,753.80)	\$ (4,969,549.75)	\$ (67,823,540.07)
July 2020	\$ 149,979.57	\$ (6,888,352.30)	\$ (6,738,372.73)	\$ (74,561,912.80)
August 2020	\$ 154,110.59	\$ (6,691,087.28)	\$ (6,536,976.69)	\$ (81,098,889.49)
September 2020	\$ 231,797.20	\$ (5,791,050.39)	\$ (5,559,253.19)	\$ (86,658,142.68)
October 2020	\$ 455,082.54	\$ (2,899,306.47)	\$ (2,444,223.93)	\$ (89,102,366.61)
November 2020	\$ 448,982.36	\$ (2,836,005.67)	\$ (2,387,023.31)	\$ (91,489,389.92)
December 2020	\$ 505,829.46	\$ (4,020,119.40)	\$ (3,514,289.94)	\$ (95,003,679.86)
January 2021	\$ 392,309.29	\$ (5,162,903.68)	\$ (4,770,594.39)	\$ (99,774,274.25)
February 2021	\$ 391,905.67	\$ (4,810,185.55)	\$ (4,418,279.88)	\$ (104,192,554.13)
March 2021	\$ 346,061.40	\$ (4,573,512.11)	\$ (4,227,450.71)	\$ (108,420,004.84)
April 2021	\$ 495,499.46	\$ (3,393,097.84)	\$ (2,897,598.38)	\$ (111,317,603.22)
May 2021	\$ 446,172.96	\$ (3,185,200.53)	\$ (2,739,027.57)	\$ (114,056,630.79)
June 2021	\$ 1,297,174.51	\$ (3,740,322.66)	\$ (2,443,148.15)	\$ (116,499,778.94)
July 2021	\$ 997,886.00	\$ (4,845,429.03)	\$ (3,847,543.03)	\$ (120,347,321.97)
August 2021	\$ 1,070,138.25	\$ (5,702,205.86)	\$ (4,632,067.61)	\$ (124,979,389.58)
September 2021	\$ 1,333,190.19	\$ (6,362,978.54)	\$ (5,029,788.35)	\$ (130,009,177.93)
October 2021	\$ 661,625.10	\$ (5,383,677.53)	\$ (4,722,052.43)	\$ (134,731,230.36)
November 2021	\$ 576,644.43	\$ (5,108,447.24)	\$ (4,531,802.81)	\$ (139,263,033.17)
December 2021	\$ 722,355.76	\$ (6,196,732.44)	\$ (5,474,376.68)	\$ (144,737,409.85)
January 2022	\$ 1,244,510.69	\$ (8,149,441.72)	\$ (6,904,931.03)	\$ (151,642,340.88)
February 2022	\$ 1,251,762.35	\$ (8,152,269.82)	\$ (6,900,507.47)	\$ (158,542,848.35)
March 2022	\$ 1,027,298.33	\$ (6,455,333.47)	\$ (5,428,035.14)	\$ (163,970,883.49)
April 2022	\$ 729,876.32	\$ (5,898,062.10)	\$ (5,168,185.78)	\$ (169,139,069.27)
May 2022	\$ 608,293.76	\$ (5,918,267.08)	\$ (5,309,973.32)	\$ (174,449,042.59)
June 2022	\$ 4,688,460.87	\$ (5,460,030.05)	\$ (771,569.18)	\$ (175,220,611.77)
July 2022	\$ 4,919,903.32	\$ (9,107,717.25)	\$ (4,187,813.93)	\$ (179,408,425.70)

Attachment MPH-3

DUKE ENERGY OHIO

GAS SHOPPING SAVINGS (TRANSPORTATION RATES) VS DEO GCR

NOTE: PIPP ACCOUNTS ARE NOT ALLOWED TO SHOP

NOTE: SUPPLIER CHARGES INCLUDE OH SALES TAX @6.5%, RIDER CCCR, AND RIDER GSR CREDIT

NOTE: GCR, GSR, AND CCCR INCLUDE 4.89% EXCISE TAX

Month	Res. Savings / Losses (-)	Com. Savings / Losses (-)	Ind. Savings / Losses (-)	OPA Savings / Losses (-)	Total Monthly Choice Savings / Losses (-)	Cumulative Savings / Losses (-)
Jan-19	-\$2,562,959	-\$937,166	-\$90,779	-\$41,183	-\$3,632,087	-\$3,632,087
Feb-19	-\$4,867,614	-\$1,712,828	-\$180,006	-\$86,159	-\$6,846,607	-\$10,478,694
Mar-19	-\$3,561,223	-\$1,218,817	-\$127,991	-\$62,708	-\$4,970,739	-\$15,449,433
Apr-19	-\$2,227,261	-\$852,191	-\$86,908	-\$35,171	-\$3,201,531	-\$18,650,965
May-19	-\$953,337	-\$406,296	-\$42,252	-\$15,082	-\$1,416,967	-\$20,067,931
Jun-19	-\$447,239	-\$184,489	-\$20,795	-\$3,802	-\$656,325	-\$20,724,256
Jul-19	-\$405,354	-\$191,263	-\$22,242	-\$4,775	-\$623,634	-\$21,347,890
Aug-19	-\$342,987	-\$156,394	-\$19,792	-\$3,235	-\$522,408	-\$21,870,298
Sep-19	-\$455,105	-\$246,022	-\$32,621	-\$6,581	-\$740,329	-\$22,610,627
Oct-19	-\$484,039	-\$225,535	-\$19,126	-\$8,382	-\$737,082	-\$23,347,709
Nov-19	-\$1,744,751	-\$628,085	-\$47,810	-\$37,844	-\$2,458,490	-\$25,806,199
Dec-19	-\$2,325,124	-\$660,626	-\$38,150	-\$23,526	-\$3,047,426	-\$28,853,625
Jan-20	-\$2,575,508	-\$698,792	-\$40,745	-\$26,528	-\$3,341,573	-\$32,195,198
Feb-20	-\$3,257,193	-\$937,393	-\$69,682	-\$46,962	-\$4,311,230	-\$36,506,428
Mar-20	-\$3,721,454	-\$1,200,967	-\$97,394	-\$62,941	-\$5,082,756	-\$41,589,184
Apr-20	-\$2,701,875	-\$978,349	-\$101,932	-\$62,175	-\$3,844,331	-\$45,433,515
May-20	-\$2,122,775	-\$739,334	-\$75,248	-\$42,833	-\$2,980,190	-\$48,413,705
Jun-20	-\$799,752	-\$297,740	-\$36,408	-\$13,983	-\$1,147,883	-\$49,561,588
Jul-20	-\$526,358	-\$237,527	-\$31,575	-\$9,838	-\$805,298	-\$50,366,886
Aug-20	-\$447,188	-\$202,360	-\$28,347	-\$8,903	-\$686,798	-\$51,053,684
Sep-20	-\$385,521	-\$140,813	-\$12,652	-\$5,698	-\$544,684	-\$51,598,368
Oct-20	-\$510,103	-\$159,041	-\$10,070	-\$8,553	-\$687,767	-\$52,286,135
Nov-20	-\$1,168,797	-\$356,106	-\$26,736	-\$21,015	-\$1,572,654	-\$53,858,789
Dec-20	-\$2,502,154	-\$756,777	-\$60,692	-\$44,151	-\$3,363,774	-\$57,222,563
Jan-21	-\$3,943,376	-\$1,232,228	-\$116,451	-\$76,257	-\$5,368,312	-\$62,590,875
Feb-21	-\$4,170,774	-\$1,296,475	-\$129,376	-\$83,631	-\$5,680,256	-\$68,271,131
Mar-21	-\$1,635,838	-\$348,527	-\$7,162	-\$8,214	-\$1,999,741	-\$70,270,872
Apr-21	-\$775,427	-\$140,506	\$10,578	-\$336	-\$905,691	-\$71,176,563
May-21	-\$667,456	-\$179,172	-\$16,645	-\$8,148	-\$871,421	-\$72,047,984
Jun-21	\$262,371	\$313,662	\$84,275	\$22,716	\$683,024	-\$71,364,960 Note 1
Jul-21	\$206,031	\$314,884	\$77,523	\$19,840	\$618,278	-\$70,746,681 Note 1
Aug-21	\$303,670	\$393,181	\$92,043	\$24,375	\$813,269	-\$69,933,413 Note 1
Sep-21	\$351,880	\$456,303	\$103,012	\$27,608	\$938,803	-\$68,994,610 Note 1
Oct-21	\$490,335	\$541,907	\$137,370	\$43,808	\$1,213,420	-\$67,781,190 Note 1
Nov-21	\$2,086,513	\$1,472,095	\$406,147	\$94,205	\$4,058,960	-\$63,722,229 Note 1
Dec-21	\$2,345,897	\$1,635,408	\$309,435	\$121,170	\$4,411,910	-\$59,310,320 Note 1
Jan-22	\$1,260,564	\$1,344,466	\$276,935	\$56,683	\$2,938,648	-\$56,371,672 Note 1
Feb-22	\$1,324,130	\$1,339,034	\$250,539	\$102,091	\$3,015,794	-\$53,355,878 Note 1

Note 1: GCR temporary increase related to February 2021 Texas weather event.

MPH Attachment-4
Columbia Gas of Ohio
Shadow Billing Data

Month	Res. Savings CAB	Com. Savings CAB	Ind. Savings CAB	Com. Savings GAS	Ind. Savings GAS	Total Monthly Choice Savings	Monthly PIPP Savings	Monthly Savings Including PIPP	Cumulative PIPP Savings	Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP)	Cumulative Savings (Excl PIPP)
Apr-97	\$425,351	\$43,275	\$0			\$468,626	\$335,000	\$803,626	\$335,000	\$803,626	\$468,626
May-97	\$342,846	\$39,215	\$0			\$382,061	\$305,627	\$687,688	\$640,627	\$1,491,314	\$850,687
Jun-97	\$195,327	\$28,158	\$0			\$223,485	\$59,826	\$283,311	\$700,453	\$1,774,625	\$1,074,172
Jul-97	\$87,295	\$19,242	\$0			\$106,537	\$57,698	\$164,235	\$758,151	\$1,938,860	\$1,180,709
Aug-97	\$76,251	\$11,529	\$0			\$87,780	\$49,657	\$137,437	\$807,808	\$2,076,297	\$1,268,489
Sep-97	\$83,182	\$12,863	\$0			\$96,045	\$47,863	\$143,908	\$855,671	\$2,220,205	\$1,364,534
Oct-97	\$128,462	\$13,284	\$0			\$141,746	\$68,492	\$210,238	\$924,163	\$2,430,443	\$1,506,280
Nov-97	\$395,185	\$39,517	\$0			\$434,702	\$238,592	\$673,294	\$1,162,755	\$3,103,737	\$1,940,982
Dec-97	\$579,381	\$123,876	\$0			\$703,257	\$351,824	\$1,055,081	\$1,514,579	\$4,158,818	\$2,644,239
Jan-98	\$824,159	\$263,876	\$0			\$1,088,035	\$488,246	\$1,576,281	\$2,002,825	\$5,735,099	\$3,732,274
Feb-98	\$682,159	\$154,769	\$0			\$836,928	\$539,537	\$1,376,465	\$2,542,362	\$7,111,564	\$4,569,202
Mar-98	\$595,217	\$114,732	\$0			\$709,949	\$516,279	\$1,226,228	\$3,058,641	\$8,337,792	\$5,279,151
Apr-98	\$462,581	\$80,935	\$0			\$543,516	\$405,279	\$948,795	\$3,463,920	\$9,286,587	\$5,822,667
May-98	\$374,279	\$43,982	\$0			\$418,261	\$269,582	\$687,843	\$3,733,502	\$9,974,430	\$6,240,928
Jun-98	\$197,956	\$20,984	\$0			\$218,940	\$125,985	\$344,925	\$3,859,487	\$10,319,355	\$6,459,868
Jul-98	\$93,579	\$14,839	\$0			\$108,418	\$89,153	\$197,571	\$3,948,640	\$10,516,926	\$6,568,286
Aug-98	\$86,279	\$9,524	\$0			\$95,803	\$58,426	\$154,229	\$4,007,066	\$10,671,155	\$6,664,089
Sep-98	\$83,279	\$16,842	\$0			\$100,121	\$67,518	\$167,639	\$4,074,584	\$10,838,794	\$6,764,210
Oct-98	\$154,283	\$123,849	\$0			\$278,132	\$84,159	\$362,291	\$4,158,743	\$11,201,085	\$7,042,342
Nov-98	\$786,924	\$459,627	\$0			\$1,246,551	\$241,897	\$1,488,448	\$4,400,640	\$12,689,533	\$8,288,893
Dec-98	\$1,248,953	\$815,476	\$0			\$2,064,429	\$386,295	\$2,450,724	\$4,786,935	\$15,140,257	\$10,353,322
Jan-99	\$2,841,953	\$1,524,869	\$0			\$4,366,822	\$595,015	\$4,961,837	\$5,381,950	\$20,102,094	\$14,720,144
Feb-99	\$2,692,746	\$1,362,745	\$0			\$4,055,491	\$428,931	\$4,484,422	\$5,810,881	\$24,586,516	\$18,775,635
Mar-99	\$1,792,549	\$1,198,257	\$0			\$2,990,806	\$491,930	\$3,482,736	\$6,302,810	\$28,069,251	\$21,766,441
Apr-99	\$1,295,736	\$992,843	\$0			\$2,288,579	\$420,001	\$2,708,580	\$6,722,811	\$30,777,831	\$24,055,020
May-99	\$35,928	\$305,672	\$0			\$341,600	\$171,237	\$512,837	\$6,894,048	\$31,290,668	\$24,396,620
Jun-99	-\$6,482	\$274,958	\$0			\$268,476	\$94,756	\$363,232	\$6,988,804	\$31,653,900	\$24,665,096
Jul-99	-\$5,169	\$128,965	\$0			\$123,796	\$67,171	\$190,967	\$7,055,974	\$31,844,866	\$24,788,892
Aug-99	\$323,859	\$216,852	\$0			\$540,711	\$62,777	\$603,488	\$7,118,752	\$32,448,355	\$25,329,603
Sep-99	\$301,528	\$287,495	\$0			\$589,023	\$55,638	\$644,661	\$7,174,390	\$33,093,016	\$25,918,626
Oct-99	\$547,523	\$437,053	\$0			\$984,576	\$113,827	\$1,098,403	\$7,288,217	\$34,191,419	\$26,903,202
Nov-99	\$2,924,475	\$1,350,835	\$0			\$4,275,310	\$269,173	\$4,544,483	\$7,557,390	\$38,735,902	\$31,178,512
Dec-99	\$4,287,950	\$2,184,202	\$0			\$6,472,152	\$438,838	\$6,910,990	\$7,996,228	\$45,646,892	\$37,650,664
Jan-00	\$5,411,314	\$2,833,574	\$24,986			\$8,269,874	\$696,339	\$8,966,213	\$8,692,566	\$54,613,105	\$45,920,538
Feb-00	\$2,147,364	\$1,606,382	\$0			\$3,753,746	\$699,457	\$4,453,203	\$9,392,023	\$59,066,307	\$49,674,284
Mar-00	\$2,227,071	\$1,501,788	\$0			\$3,728,859	\$457,115	\$4,185,974	\$9,849,138	\$63,252,281	\$53,403,143
Apr-00	\$1,650,460	\$866,914	\$11,678			\$2,529,053	\$120,373	\$2,649,425	\$9,969,510	\$65,901,706	\$55,932,196
May-00	\$2,044,089	\$1,000,117	\$13,276			\$3,057,481	\$150,316	\$3,207,797	\$10,119,826	\$69,109,503	\$58,989,677

Month	Res. Savings CAB	Com. Savings CAB	Ind. Savings CAB	Com. Savings GAS	Ind. Savings GAS	Total Monthly Choice Savings	Monthly PIPP Savings	Monthly Savings Including PIPP	Cumulative PIPP Savings	Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP)	Cumulative Savings (Excl PIPP)
Jun-00	\$1,004,800	\$554,738	\$14,060			\$1,573,599	\$68,996	\$1,642,595	\$10,188,822	\$70,752,098	\$60,563,276
Jul-00	\$710,130	\$432,868	\$11,315			\$1,154,313	\$46,821	\$1,201,134	\$10,235,643	\$71,953,232	\$61,717,589
Aug-00	\$1,567,967	\$623,002	\$20,452			\$2,211,421	\$58,508	\$2,269,929	\$10,294,151	\$74,223,161	\$63,929,009
Sep-00	\$1,549,256	\$748,851	\$17,637			\$2,315,744	\$51,350	\$2,367,095	\$10,345,502	\$76,590,255	\$66,244,753
Oct-00	\$2,706,833	\$1,056,352	\$13,042			\$3,776,227	\$121,841	\$3,898,068	\$10,467,343	\$80,488,323	\$70,020,980
Nov-00	\$6,178,117	\$2,092,866	\$38,268			\$8,309,251	\$208,106	\$8,517,357	\$10,675,449	\$89,005,680	\$78,330,231
Dec-00	\$13,810,672	\$4,534,145	\$45,946			\$18,390,763	\$538,633	\$18,929,396	\$11,214,082	\$107,935,076	\$96,720,994
Jan-01	\$14,432,877	\$3,812,320	\$0			\$18,245,197	\$752,288	\$18,997,484	\$11,966,369	\$126,932,560	\$114,966,191
Feb-01	\$17,203,007	\$4,588,353	\$0			\$21,791,360	\$723,181	\$22,514,541	\$12,689,551	\$149,447,101	\$136,757,550
Mar-01	\$14,710,273	\$4,050,611	\$0			\$18,760,884	\$693,255	\$19,454,138	\$13,382,805	\$168,901,239	\$155,518,434
Apr-01	\$9,859,471	\$2,860,423	\$0			\$12,719,894	\$571,992	\$13,291,885	\$13,954,797	\$182,193,125	\$168,238,328
May-01	\$3,855,778	\$1,247,301	\$18,417			\$5,121,496	\$155,768	\$5,277,264	\$14,110,565	\$187,470,389	\$173,359,824
Jun-01	\$2,754,276	\$997,069	\$9,968			\$3,761,313	\$114,641	\$3,875,954	\$14,225,206	\$191,346,342	\$177,121,136
Jul-01	\$1,598,501	\$603,386	\$8,469			\$2,210,356	\$69,621	\$2,279,976	\$14,294,827	\$193,626,319	\$179,331,492
Aug-01	-\$387,396	-\$36,966	\$3,322			-\$421,041	\$48,501	-\$372,539	\$14,343,328	\$193,253,779	\$178,910,452
Sep-01	-\$541,007	-\$101,867	\$214			-\$642,660	\$44,301	-\$598,359	\$14,387,629	\$192,655,420	\$178,267,791
Oct-01	-\$903,224	-\$246,449	\$1,115			-\$1,148,558	\$95,536	-\$1,053,022	\$14,483,165	\$191,602,398	\$177,119,233
Nov-01	-\$4,785,389	-\$1,519,422	\$0			-\$6,304,811	\$166,584	-\$6,138,228	\$14,649,748	\$185,464,170	\$170,814,422
Dec-01	-\$6,417,765	-\$2,190,879	\$0			-\$8,608,644	\$241,333	-\$8,367,311	\$14,891,081	\$177,096,859	\$162,205,778
Jan-02	-\$11,213,067	-\$4,009,360	-\$24,850			-\$15,247,278	\$456,852	-\$14,790,425	\$15,347,933	\$162,306,434	\$146,958,501
Feb-02	-\$8,931,637	-\$3,242,954	-\$16,811			-\$12,191,402	\$342,231	-\$11,849,171	\$15,690,165	\$150,457,263	\$134,767,098
Mar-02	-\$6,934,816	-\$2,364,856	-\$15,592			-\$9,315,264	\$355,597	-\$8,959,667	\$16,045,761	\$141,497,596	\$125,451,834
Apr-02	-\$5,332,798	-\$1,839,321	\$0			-\$7,172,119	\$295,298	-\$6,876,821	\$16,341,060	\$134,620,775	\$118,279,715
May-02	-\$3,351,622	-\$1,404,541	-\$8,027			-\$4,764,190	\$158,107	-\$4,606,083	\$16,499,167	\$130,014,691	\$113,515,525
Jun-02	-\$2,013,498	-\$738,132	-\$5,322			-\$2,756,952	\$94,387	-\$2,662,565	\$16,593,553	\$127,352,126	\$110,758,573
Jul-02	-\$1,101,529	-\$456,628	-\$3,312			-\$1,561,469	\$50,750	-\$1,510,718	\$16,644,304	\$125,841,408	\$109,197,104
Aug-02	\$236,023	\$130,777	\$675			\$367,475	\$44,089	\$411,564	\$16,688,393	\$126,252,972	\$109,564,579
Sep-02	\$135,406	\$121,064	-\$9			\$256,461	\$41,585	\$298,046	\$16,729,978	\$126,551,017	\$109,821,040
Oct-02	\$156,437	\$113,894	-\$197			\$270,134	\$62,349	\$332,483	\$16,792,327	\$126,883,501	\$110,091,174
Nov-02	\$771,332	\$309,783	\$1,902			\$1,083,017	\$217,814	\$1,300,831	\$17,010,141	\$128,184,332	\$111,174,191
Dec-02	\$726,676	-\$6,217	\$1,461			\$721,920	\$392,134	\$1,114,055	\$17,402,276	\$129,298,386	\$111,896,111
Jan-03	\$1,102,780	-\$1,000,067	\$0			\$102,713	\$519,274	\$621,987	\$17,921,549	\$129,920,374	\$111,998,824
Feb-03	\$5,523,850	\$1,167,509	\$8,870			\$6,700,229	\$655,759	\$7,355,988	\$18,577,309	\$137,276,361	\$118,699,053
Mar-03	\$4,199,337	\$509,070	\$2,948			\$4,711,356	\$601,685	\$5,313,041	\$19,178,994	\$142,589,403	\$123,410,409
Apr-03	\$5,673,189	\$1,770,099	\$7,841			\$7,451,129	\$236,472	\$7,687,601	\$19,415,466	\$150,277,004	\$130,861,538
May-03	\$4,007,475	\$1,296,707	\$8,797			\$5,312,980	\$124,194	\$5,437,173	\$19,539,660	\$155,714,177	\$136,174,517
Jun-03	\$2,563,180	\$1,013,374	\$5,887			\$3,582,441	\$84,048	\$3,666,490	\$19,623,708	\$159,380,667	\$139,756,959
Jul-03	\$1,385,724	\$674,473	\$3,314			\$2,063,510	\$44,755	\$2,108,266	\$19,668,464	\$161,488,933	\$141,820,469
Aug-03	-\$199,255	-\$82,351	-\$218			-\$281,823	\$38,953	-\$242,870	\$19,707,417	\$161,246,063	\$141,538,646
Sep-03	-\$122,424	\$3,139	-\$212			-\$119,498	\$38,189	-\$81,310	\$19,745,605	\$161,164,753	\$141,419,148
Oct-03	-\$192,077	\$100,989	-\$697			-\$91,785	\$87,000	-\$4,785	\$19,832,605	\$161,159,968	\$141,327,363

Month	Res. Savings CAB	Com. Savings CAB	Ind. Savings CAB	Com. Savings GAS	Ind. Savings GAS	Total Monthly Choice Savings	Monthly PIPP Savings	Monthly Savings Including PIPP	Cumulative PIPP Savings	Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP)	Cumulative Savings (Excl PIPP)
Nov-03	-\$2,676,204	-\$786,416	-\$9,233			-\$3,471,853	\$130,215	-\$3,341,638	\$19,962,820	\$157,818,330	\$137,855,510
Dec-03	-\$5,412,084	-\$2,327,899	-\$14,949			-\$7,754,932	\$251,134	-\$7,503,798	\$20,213,955	\$150,314,533	\$130,100,578
Jan-04	-\$11,732,403	-\$4,826,612	-\$27,265			-\$16,586,279	\$369,962	-\$16,216,317	\$20,583,916	\$134,098,215	\$113,514,299
Feb-04	-\$10,668,507	-\$4,004,885	-\$17,696			-\$14,691,088	\$447,855	-\$14,243,234	\$21,031,771	\$119,854,982	\$98,823,211
Mar-04	-\$7,356,309	-\$2,355,718	-\$10,959			-\$9,722,986	\$334,371	-\$9,388,615	\$21,366,142	\$110,466,366	\$89,100,225
Apr-04	-\$5,408,848	-\$1,596,368	-\$7,561			-\$7,012,777	\$0	-\$7,012,777	\$21,366,142	\$103,453,590	\$82,087,448
May-04	-\$1,849,168	-\$361,959	-\$2,501			-\$2,213,629	\$0	-\$2,213,629	\$21,366,142	\$101,239,961	\$79,873,819
Jun-04	-\$973,902	-\$145,292	-\$1,036			-\$1,120,230	\$0	-\$1,120,230	\$21,366,142	\$100,119,732	\$78,753,590
Jul-04	-\$913,368	-\$223,736	-\$114,560			-\$1,251,664	\$0	-\$1,251,664	\$21,366,142	\$98,868,068	\$77,501,926
Aug-04	-\$116,386	\$54,895	\$0			-\$61,491	\$0	-\$61,491	\$21,366,142	\$98,806,577	\$77,440,435
Sep-04	\$10,843	\$67,262	\$1,170			\$79,275	\$0	\$79,275	\$21,366,142	\$98,885,852	\$77,519,710
Oct-04	-\$42,681	\$137,841	\$1,460			\$96,620	\$0	\$96,620	\$21,366,142	\$98,982,472	\$77,616,330
Nov-04	-\$1,538,128	-\$436,246	-\$3,391			-\$1,977,765	\$0	-\$1,977,765	\$21,366,142	\$97,004,707	\$75,638,565
Dec-04	-\$1,502,379	-\$806,935	-\$4,559			-\$2,313,873	\$0	-\$2,313,873	\$21,366,142	\$94,690,834	\$73,324,692
Jan-05	-\$1,578,126	-\$1,005,151	-\$2,823			-\$2,586,099	\$0	-\$2,586,099	\$21,366,142	\$92,104,734	\$70,738,593
Feb-05	-\$7,501,073	-\$2,234,889	-\$14,464			-\$9,750,426	\$0	-\$9,750,426	\$21,366,142	\$82,354,308	\$60,988,166
Mar-05	-\$7,712,573	-\$2,518,040	-\$18,620			-\$10,249,233	\$0	-\$10,249,233	\$21,366,142	\$72,105,075	\$50,738,933
Apr-05	-\$1,844,632	-\$704,283	-\$5,848			-\$2,554,763	\$0	-\$2,554,763	\$21,366,142	\$69,550,312	\$48,184,170
May-05	-\$1,616,796	-\$210,553	-\$2,467			-\$1,829,816	\$0	-\$1,829,816	\$21,366,142	\$67,720,496	\$46,354,354
Jun-05	-\$845,291	-\$44,472	-\$4,230			-\$893,993	\$0	-\$893,993	\$21,366,142	\$66,826,503	\$45,460,361
Jul-05	-\$739,294	-\$31,196	-\$621			-\$771,110	\$0	-\$771,110	\$21,366,142	\$66,055,392	\$44,689,251
Aug-05	-\$78,266	\$70,916	\$0			-\$7,350	\$0	-\$7,350	\$21,366,142	\$66,048,042	\$44,681,901
Sep-05	\$210,761	\$100,586	\$1,038			\$312,384	\$0	\$312,384	\$21,366,142	\$66,360,427	\$44,994,285
Oct-05	\$847,001	-\$135,534	\$4,638			\$716,106	\$0	\$716,106	\$21,366,142	\$67,076,533	\$45,710,391
Nov-05	\$184,914	-\$1,283,433	\$10,074			-\$1,088,445	\$0	-\$1,088,445	\$21,366,142	\$65,988,088	\$44,621,946
Dec-05	\$185,165	-\$1,358,303	\$1,942			-\$1,171,195	\$0	-\$1,171,195	\$21,366,142	\$64,816,892	\$43,450,750
Jan-06	-\$961,598	-\$2,941,083	-\$150,058			-\$4,052,738	\$0	-\$4,052,738	\$21,366,142	\$60,764,154	\$39,398,012
Feb-06	-\$5,604,909	-\$3,093,449	-\$32,232			-\$8,730,590	\$0	-\$8,730,590	\$21,366,142	\$52,033,564	\$30,667,422
Mar-06	-\$11,177,508	-\$4,065,279	-\$42,318			-\$15,285,104	\$0	-\$15,285,104	\$21,366,142	\$36,748,459	\$15,382,317
Apr-06	-\$7,293,950	-\$2,287,715	-\$24,904			-\$9,606,569	\$53,181	-\$9,553,388	\$21,419,323	\$27,195,071	\$5,775,748
May-06	-\$3,926,951	-\$1,116,790	-\$12,355			-\$5,056,096	\$26,802	-\$5,029,294	\$21,446,125	\$22,165,777	\$719,652
Jun-06	-\$2,704,723	-\$598,065	-\$9,368			-\$3,312,155	\$14,795	-\$3,297,361	\$21,460,920	\$18,868,417	-\$2,592,503
Jul-06	-\$1,975,016	-\$494,379	-\$8,324			-\$2,477,718	\$8,309	-\$2,469,409	\$21,469,229	\$16,399,008	-\$5,070,221
Aug-06	-\$2,101,535	-\$420,782	-\$11,119			-\$2,533,436	\$8,075	-\$2,525,361	\$21,477,304	\$13,873,646	-\$7,603,658
Sep-06	-\$1,571,928	-\$516,412	-\$12,047			-\$2,100,387	\$8,066	-\$2,092,321	\$21,485,370	\$11,781,325	-\$9,704,045
Oct-06	-\$5,152,570	-\$1,734,363	-\$33,089			-\$6,920,021	\$17,003	-\$6,903,018	\$21,502,373	\$4,878,307	-\$16,624,066
Nov-06	-\$9,020,018	-\$2,654,434	-\$49,911			-\$11,724,363	\$40,939	-\$11,683,424	\$21,543,312	-\$6,805,117	-\$28,348,429
Dec-06	-\$12,714,226	-\$3,707,906	-\$75,247			-\$16,497,380	\$59,733	-\$16,437,647	\$21,603,046	-\$23,242,764	-\$44,845,809
Jan-07	-\$14,772,242	-\$5,844,496	-\$82,866			-\$20,699,603	\$71,970	-\$20,627,633	\$21,675,016	-\$43,870,396	-\$65,545,412
Feb-07	-\$21,638,440	-\$6,425,648	-\$62,487			-\$28,126,575	\$105,900	-\$28,020,675	\$21,780,916	-\$71,891,071	-\$93,671,988
Mar-07	-\$15,335,851	-\$5,020,217	-\$41,454			-\$20,397,523	\$91,869	-\$20,305,654	\$21,872,785	-\$92,196,725	-\$114,069,510

Month	Res. Savings CAB	Com. Savings CAB	Ind. Savings CAB	Com. Savings GAS	Ind. Savings GAS	Total Monthly Choice Savings	Monthly PIPP Savings	Monthly Savings Including PIPP	Cumulative PIPP Savings	Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP)	Cumulative Savings (Excl PIPP)
Apr-07	-\$13,730,839	-\$4,746,463	-\$38,360			-\$18,515,663	\$77,960	-\$18,437,702	\$21,950,745	-\$110,634,428	-\$132,585,173
May-07	-\$4,045,124	-\$1,461,868	-\$24,204			-\$5,531,196	\$41,549	-\$5,489,647	\$21,992,294	-\$116,124,075	-\$138,116,369
Jun-07	-\$1,824,264	-\$756,525	-\$6,479			-\$2,587,269	\$18,743	-\$2,568,525	\$22,011,037	-\$118,692,601	-\$140,703,638
Jul-07	-\$1,575,114	-\$666,103	-\$11,375			-\$2,252,592	\$13,759	-\$2,238,833	\$22,024,796	-\$120,931,434	-\$142,956,230
Aug-07	-\$1,548,150	-\$648,202	-\$9,630			-\$2,205,982	\$11,085	-\$2,194,897	\$22,035,882	-\$123,126,330	-\$145,162,212
Sep-07	-\$1,483,832	-\$600,649	-\$7,762			-\$2,092,243	\$11,445	-\$2,080,798	\$22,047,327	-\$125,207,128	-\$147,254,455
Oct-07	-\$2,044,185	-\$731,511	-\$6,280			-\$2,781,976	\$14,771	-\$2,767,205	\$22,062,098	-\$127,974,333	-\$150,036,431
Nov-07	-\$4,561,749	-\$1,277,436	-\$4,391			-\$5,843,575	\$49,773	-\$5,793,803	\$22,111,871	-\$133,768,135	-\$155,880,006
Dec-07	-\$8,568,268	-\$2,599,283	-\$27,095			-\$11,194,646	\$104,032	-\$11,090,614	\$22,215,903	-\$144,858,749	-\$167,074,653
Jan-08	-\$10,096,120	-\$2,931,314	-\$24,470			-\$13,051,903	\$131,676	-\$12,920,228	\$22,347,579	-\$157,778,977	-\$180,126,556
Feb-08	-\$7,024,941	-\$1,824,434	-\$10,632			-\$8,860,007	\$141,785	-\$8,718,221	\$22,489,365	-\$166,497,198	-\$188,986,563
Mar-08	-\$7,533,256	-\$2,519,223	-\$13,759			-\$10,066,238	\$142,920	-\$9,923,318	\$22,632,284	-\$176,420,516	-\$199,052,801
Apr-08	-\$2,506,939	-\$950,180	\$2,713			-\$3,454,406	\$73,436	-\$3,380,970	\$22,705,720	-\$179,801,486	-\$202,507,206
May-08	-\$1,179,307	-\$749,652	\$856			-\$1,928,103	\$31,482	-\$1,896,621	\$22,737,202	-\$181,698,107	-\$204,435,310
Jun-08	-\$603,512	-\$565,362	-\$1,217			-\$1,170,091	\$20,328	-\$1,149,763	\$22,757,530	-\$182,847,870	-\$205,605,401
Jul-08	-\$121,880	-\$668,469	\$304			-\$790,044	\$11,537	-\$778,508	\$22,769,066	-\$183,626,378	-\$206,395,445
Aug-08	-\$920,216	-\$692,303	-\$1,841			-\$1,614,359	\$9,710	-\$1,604,649	\$22,778,777	-\$185,231,027	-\$208,009,805
Sep-08	-\$1,587,392	-\$1,011,676	-\$3,722			-\$2,602,790	\$8,792	-\$2,593,998	\$22,787,569	-\$187,825,025	-\$210,612,595
Oct-08	-\$2,969,271	-\$977,128	-\$6,760			-\$3,953,159	\$14,224	-\$3,938,935	\$22,801,793	-\$191,763,960	-\$214,565,754
Nov-08	-\$4,157,953	-\$925,308	\$4,846			-\$5,078,415	\$43,070	-\$5,035,346	\$22,844,862	-\$196,799,305	-\$219,644,169
Dec-08	-\$3,814,931	\$332,636	\$22,238			-\$3,460,056	\$92,916	-\$3,367,141	\$22,937,778	-\$200,166,446	-\$223,104,225
Jan-09	-\$28,681,170	-\$9,070,920	-\$72,169			-\$37,824,259	\$124,409	-\$37,699,849	\$23,062,188	-\$237,866,295	-\$260,928,484
Feb-09	-\$22,216,722	-\$6,779,101	-\$58,538			-\$29,054,361	\$125,729	-\$28,928,632	\$23,187,917	-\$266,794,927	-\$289,982,845
Mar-09	-\$14,231,242	-\$3,873,959	-\$28,150			-\$18,133,351	\$95,546	-\$18,037,806	\$23,283,463	-\$284,832,732	-\$308,116,196
Apr-09	-\$14,866,518	-\$4,294,526	-\$35,204			-\$19,196,248	\$14,350	-\$19,181,898	\$23,297,813	-\$304,014,630	-\$327,312,444
May-09	-\$8,101,872	-\$2,856,819	-\$18,422			-\$10,977,112	\$6,975	-\$10,970,138	\$23,304,788	-\$314,984,768	-\$338,289,557
Jun-09	-\$3,431,341	-\$1,247,366	-\$6,467			-\$4,685,174	\$3,592	-\$4,681,582	\$23,308,381	-\$319,666,350	-\$342,974,731
Jul-09	-\$2,737,380	-\$1,060,690	-\$5,052			-\$3,803,121	\$2,223	-\$3,800,898	\$23,310,604	-\$323,467,248	-\$346,777,852
Aug-09	-\$3,552,993	-\$1,512,985	-\$20,633			-\$5,086,611	\$2,092	-\$5,084,519	\$23,312,696	-\$328,551,766	-\$351,864,463
Sep-09	-\$3,368,242	-\$1,428,350	-\$19,836			-\$4,816,429	\$1,949	-\$4,814,479	\$23,314,646	-\$333,366,245	-\$356,680,892
Oct-09	-\$7,246,610	-\$2,384,038	-\$36,028			-\$9,666,676	\$4,560	-\$9,662,116	\$23,319,206	-\$343,028,362	-\$366,347,568
Nov-09	-\$11,737,467	-\$4,226,695	-\$54,205			-\$16,018,366	\$8,603	-\$16,009,764	\$23,327,808	-\$359,038,125	-\$382,365,935
Dec-09	-\$21,782,094	-\$7,865,117	-\$109,853			-\$29,757,064	\$14,783	-\$29,742,282	\$23,342,591	-\$388,780,407	-\$412,122,999
Jan-10	-\$40,572,070	-\$17,771,809	-\$190,682			-\$58,534,561	\$25,333	-\$58,509,229	\$23,367,923	-\$447,289,636	-\$470,657,560
Feb-10	-\$37,456,299	-\$17,263,379	-\$166,964			-\$54,886,642	\$23,999	-\$54,862,644	\$23,391,922	-\$502,152,279	-\$525,544,202
Mar-10	-\$29,544,799	-\$12,895,726	-\$125,155			-\$42,565,680	\$20,305	-\$42,545,375	\$23,412,227	-\$544,697,654	-\$568,109,882
Apr-10	-\$10,205,850	-\$5,302,857	-\$44,161			-\$15,552,868	\$0	-\$15,552,868	\$23,412,227	-\$560,250,522	-\$583,662,750
May-10	-\$5,030,596	-\$1,850,366	-\$11,344			-\$6,892,306	\$0	-\$6,892,306	\$23,412,227	-\$567,142,828	-\$590,555,056
Jun-10	-\$3,111,808	-\$1,367,655	-\$10,126			-\$4,489,589	\$0	-\$4,489,589	\$23,412,227	-\$571,632,417	-\$595,044,645
Jul-10	-\$2,355,905	-\$929,182	-\$4,453			-\$3,289,540	\$0	-\$3,289,540	\$23,412,227	-\$574,921,957	-\$598,334,185
Aug-10	-\$1,906,242	-\$750,001	-\$3,512			-\$2,659,755	\$0	-\$2,659,755	\$23,412,227	-\$577,581,712	-\$600,993,940

Month	Res. Savings CAB	Com. Savings CAB	Ind. Savings CAB	Com. Savings GAS	Ind. Savings GAS	Total Monthly Choice Savings	Monthly PIPP Savings	Monthly Savings Including PIPP	Cumulative PIPP Savings	Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP)	Cumulative Savings (Excl PIPP)
Sep-10	-\$2,515,082	-\$1,055,284	-\$11,219			-\$3,581,584	\$0	-\$3,581,584	\$23,412,227	-\$581,163,296	-\$604,575,524
Oct-10	-\$3,682,710	-\$1,296,045	-\$13,255			-\$4,992,010	\$0	-\$4,992,010	\$23,412,227	-\$586,155,306	-\$609,567,534
Nov-10	-\$8,929,195	-\$2,980,686	-\$36,259			-\$11,946,139	\$0	-\$11,946,139	\$23,412,227	-\$598,101,446	-\$621,513,674
Dec-10	-\$14,247,734	-\$4,376,832	-\$31,214			-\$18,655,779	\$0	-\$18,655,779	\$23,412,227	-\$616,757,225	-\$640,169,453
Jan-11	-\$20,178,145	-\$7,226,845	-\$66,450			-\$27,471,440	\$0	-\$27,471,440	\$23,412,227	-\$644,228,665	-\$667,640,894
Feb-11	-\$17,503,090	-\$6,663,572	-\$57,222			-\$24,223,884	\$0	-\$24,223,884	\$23,412,227	-\$668,452,549	-\$691,864,778
Mar-11	-\$15,140,570	-\$5,431,256	-\$49,063			-\$20,620,889	\$0	-\$20,620,889	\$23,412,227	-\$689,073,439	-\$712,485,667
Apr-11	-\$9,382,832	-\$2,899,984	-\$22,843			-\$12,305,658	\$0	-\$12,305,658	\$23,412,227	-\$701,379,096	-\$724,791,324
May-11	-\$5,043,450	-\$1,581,832	-\$15,485			-\$6,640,768	\$0	-\$6,640,768	\$23,412,227	-\$708,019,864	-\$731,432,092
Jun-11	-\$2,526,502	-\$908,185	-\$7,605			-\$3,442,292	\$0	-\$3,442,292	\$23,412,227	-\$711,462,156	-\$734,874,384
Jul-11	-\$1,869,945	-\$802,740	-\$6,252			-\$2,678,937	\$0	-\$2,678,937	\$23,412,227	-\$714,141,094	-\$737,553,322
Aug-11	-\$1,695,636	-\$671,399	-\$4,174			-\$2,371,209	\$0	-\$2,371,209	\$23,412,227	-\$716,512,303	-\$739,924,531
Sep-11	-\$2,030,481	-\$881,393	-\$7,308			-\$2,919,182	\$0	-\$2,919,182	\$23,412,227	-\$719,431,485	-\$742,843,713
Oct-11	-\$3,140,807	-\$1,164,355	-\$10,329			-\$4,315,491	\$0	-\$4,315,491	\$23,412,227	-\$723,746,976	-\$747,159,204
Nov-11	-\$6,997,438	-\$2,263,598	-\$34,310			-\$9,295,346	\$0	-\$9,295,346	\$23,412,227	-\$733,042,322	-\$756,454,550
Dec-11	-\$12,557,750	-\$3,945,419	-\$64,240			-\$16,567,409	\$0	-\$16,567,409	\$23,412,227	-\$749,609,731	-\$773,021,959
Jan-12	-\$18,651,178	-\$5,916,444	-\$76,824			-\$24,644,446	\$0	-\$24,644,446	\$23,412,227	-\$774,254,177	-\$797,666,405
Feb-12	-\$20,382,726	-\$6,813,519	-\$80,778			-\$27,277,024	\$0	-\$27,277,024	\$23,412,227	-\$801,531,201	-\$824,943,429
Mar-12	-\$16,793,300	-\$5,589,328	-\$60,396			-\$22,443,024	\$0	-\$22,443,024	\$23,412,227	-\$823,974,225	-\$847,386,453
Apr-12	-\$9,349,064	-\$3,600,962	-\$45,096			-\$12,995,122	\$0	-\$12,995,122	\$23,412,227	-\$836,969,347	-\$860,381,575
May-12	-\$7,406,658	-\$2,572,108	-\$29,530			-\$10,008,296	\$0	-\$10,008,296	\$23,412,227	-\$846,977,643	-\$870,389,871
Jun-12	-\$3,202,658	-\$1,327,809	-\$13,942			-\$4,544,409	\$0	-\$4,544,409	\$23,412,227	-\$851,522,052	-\$874,934,280
Jul-12	-\$2,380,923	-\$1,043,505	-\$7,700			-\$3,432,128	\$0	-\$3,432,128	\$23,412,227	-\$854,954,180	-\$878,366,408
Aug-12	-\$1,986,608	-\$848,902	-\$8,092			-\$2,843,602	\$0	-\$2,843,602	\$23,412,227	-\$857,797,782	-\$881,210,010
Sep-12	-\$2,321,318	-\$1,044,077	-\$11,926			-\$3,377,321	\$0	-\$3,377,321	\$23,412,227	-\$861,175,104	-\$884,587,332
Oct-12	-\$3,653,559	-\$1,102,057	-\$11,358			-\$4,766,974	\$0	-\$4,766,974	\$23,412,227	-\$865,942,077	-\$889,354,306
Nov-12	-\$7,303,123	-\$2,016,031	-\$30,021			-\$9,349,175	\$0	-\$9,349,175	\$23,412,227	-\$875,291,253	-\$898,703,481
Dec-12	-\$10,718,224	-\$3,009,674	-\$34,951			-\$13,762,849	\$0	-\$13,762,849	\$23,412,227	-\$889,054,102	-\$912,466,330
Jan-13	-\$17,561,829	-\$5,237,632	-\$51,727			-\$22,851,187	\$0	-\$22,851,187	\$23,412,227	-\$911,905,289	-\$935,317,517
Feb-13	-\$18,925,582	-\$5,598,939	-\$45,406			-\$24,569,927	\$0	-\$24,569,927	\$23,412,227	-\$936,475,216	-\$959,887,444
Mar-13	-\$16,218,739	-\$4,350,721	-\$28,889			-\$20,598,350	\$0	-\$20,598,350	\$23,412,227	-\$957,073,565	-\$980,485,793
Apr-13	-\$9,824,400	-\$2,408,704	-\$10,098			-\$12,243,202	\$0	-\$12,243,202	\$23,412,227	-\$969,316,767	-\$992,728,995
May-13	-\$3,969,390	-\$1,005,427	-\$8,133			-\$4,982,951	\$0	-\$4,982,951	\$23,412,227	-\$974,299,717	-\$997,711,946
Jun-13	-\$2,415,361	-\$657,077	-\$4,765			-\$3,077,203	\$0	-\$3,077,203	\$23,412,227	-\$977,376,921	-\$1,000,789,149
Jul-13	-\$2,215,582	-\$723,016	-\$6,497			-\$2,945,095	\$0	-\$2,945,095	\$23,412,227	-\$980,322,016	-\$1,003,734,244
Aug-13	-\$2,138,758	-\$765,977	-\$8,254			-\$2,912,988	\$0	-\$2,912,988	\$23,412,227	-\$983,235,004	-\$1,006,647,232
Sep-13	-\$2,047,364	-\$639,512	-\$6,073			-\$2,692,950	\$0	-\$2,692,950	\$23,412,227	-\$985,927,954	-\$1,009,340,182
Oct-13	-\$2,815,864	-\$818,831	-\$16,192			-\$3,650,886	\$0	-\$3,650,886	\$23,412,227	-\$989,578,840	-\$1,012,991,068
Nov-13	-\$7,562,682	-\$2,155,379	-\$62,083			-\$9,780,144	\$0	-\$9,780,144	\$23,412,227	-\$999,358,984	-\$1,022,771,212
Dec-13	-\$13,763,019	-\$3,797,676	-\$51,496			-\$17,612,191	\$0	-\$17,612,191	\$23,412,227	-\$1,016,971,175	-\$1,040,383,403
Jan-14	-\$15,981,935	-\$4,344,835	-\$46,431			-\$20,373,200	\$0	-\$20,373,200	\$23,412,227	-\$1,037,344,376	-\$1,060,756,604

Month	Res. Savings CAB	Com. Savings CAB	Ind. Savings CAB	Com. Savings GAS	Ind. Savings GAS	Total Monthly Choice Savings	Monthly PIPP Savings	Monthly Savings Including PIPP	Cumulative PIPP Savings	Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP)	Cumulative Savings (Excl PIPP)
Feb-14	-\$8,748,912	-\$792,898	\$6,411			-\$9,535,399	\$0	-\$9,535,399	\$23,412,227	-\$1,046,879,775	-\$1,070,292,003
Mar-14	-\$15,113,887	-\$4,423,825	-\$45,744			-\$19,583,455	\$0	-\$19,583,455	\$23,412,227	-\$1,066,463,230	-\$1,089,875,458
Apr-14	-\$9,661,541	-\$2,203,349	-\$20,533			-\$11,885,423	\$0	-\$11,885,423	\$23,412,227	-\$1,078,348,653	-\$1,101,760,881
May-14	-\$4,308,980	-\$879,750	-\$7,338	\$38,047	\$34,335	-\$5,123,687	\$0	-\$5,123,687	\$23,412,227	-\$1,083,472,340	-\$1,106,884,568
Jun-14	-\$2,499,474	-\$638,593	-\$5,820	-\$5,630	\$61,031	-\$3,088,486	\$0	-\$3,088,486	\$23,412,227	-\$1,086,560,826	-\$1,109,973,054
Jul-14	-\$2,327,035	-\$625,615	-\$6,631	-\$42,096	\$59,117	-\$2,942,259	\$0	-\$2,942,259	\$23,412,227	-\$1,089,503,084	-\$1,112,915,312
Aug-14	-\$2,581,985	-\$750,265	-\$8,389	-\$63,833	\$77,033	-\$3,327,439	\$0	-\$3,327,439	\$23,412,227	-\$1,092,830,524	-\$1,116,242,752
Sep-14	-\$2,569,170	-\$632,911	-\$6,336	-\$17,212	\$67,644	-\$3,157,984	\$0	-\$3,157,984	\$23,412,227	-\$1,095,988,508	-\$1,119,400,736
Oct-14	-\$3,731,082	-\$814,930	-\$12,555	\$37,077	\$73,254	-\$4,448,236	\$0	-\$4,448,236	\$23,412,227	-\$1,100,436,744	-\$1,123,848,972
Nov-14	-\$8,519,324	-\$1,952,682	-\$35,137	\$30,825	\$67,232	-\$10,409,087	\$0	-\$10,409,087	\$23,412,227	-\$1,110,845,831	-\$1,134,258,059
Dec-14	-\$12,884,435	-\$3,090,609	-\$61,504	\$47,032	\$48,796	-\$15,940,721	\$0	-\$15,940,721	\$23,412,227	-\$1,126,786,552	-\$1,150,198,780
Jan-15	-\$24,103,802	-\$6,731,228	-\$96,765	\$101,261	\$40,306	-\$30,790,227	\$0	-\$30,790,227	\$23,412,227	-\$1,157,576,779	-\$1,180,989,007
Feb-15	-\$27,342,772	-\$7,357,262	-\$106,216	\$169,688	\$18,540	-\$34,618,022	\$0	-\$34,618,022	\$23,412,227	-\$1,192,194,801	-\$1,215,607,029
Mar-15	-\$23,346,881	-\$6,432,525	-\$96,751	\$245,073	\$25,336	-\$29,605,747	\$0	-\$29,605,747	\$23,412,227	-\$1,221,800,548	-\$1,245,212,776
Apr-15	-\$13,206,425	-\$3,819,985	-\$60,265	\$73,304	\$18,404	-\$16,994,968	\$0	-\$16,994,968	\$23,412,227	-\$1,238,795,516	-\$1,262,207,744
May-15	-\$5,874,990	-\$1,659,536	-\$24,504	\$63,709	\$19,577	-\$7,475,743	\$0	-\$7,475,743	\$23,412,227	-\$1,246,271,259	-\$1,269,683,488
Jun-15	-\$3,022,034	-\$953,870	-\$14,081	\$6,185	\$31,353	-\$3,952,446	\$0	-\$3,952,446	\$23,412,227	-\$1,250,223,705	-\$1,273,635,933
Jul-15	-\$2,517,799	-\$838,616	-\$11,460	\$13,055	\$35,924	-\$3,318,895	\$0	-\$3,318,895	\$23,412,227	-\$1,253,542,601	-\$1,276,954,829
Aug-15	-\$2,236,562	-\$706,709	-\$12,089	-\$34,315	\$82,867	-\$2,906,808	\$0	-\$2,906,808	\$23,412,227	-\$1,256,449,408	-\$1,279,861,636
Sep-15	-\$2,421,039	-\$776,506	-\$12,446	\$3,354	\$49,646	-\$3,156,991	\$0	-\$3,156,991	\$23,412,227	-\$1,259,606,399	-\$1,283,018,627
Oct-15	-\$3,143,346	-\$990,394	-\$20,122	\$11,751	\$64,692	-\$4,077,419	\$0	-\$4,077,419	\$23,412,227	-\$1,263,683,818	-\$1,287,096,046
Nov-15	-\$6,647,549	-\$2,120,236	-\$42,765	\$32,806	\$78,831	-\$8,698,913	\$0	-\$8,698,913	\$23,412,227	-\$1,272,382,731	-\$1,295,794,959
Dec-15	-\$11,434,927	-\$3,771,764	-\$60,957	\$8,563	\$72,641	-\$15,186,444	\$0	-\$15,186,444	\$23,412,227	-\$1,287,569,175	-\$1,310,981,403
Jan-16	-\$16,112,731	-\$5,678,615	-\$94,065	-\$34,989	\$9,775	-\$21,910,625	\$0	-\$21,910,625	\$23,412,227	-\$1,309,479,800	-\$1,332,892,028
Feb-16	-\$18,597,905	-\$6,753,189	-\$119,339	-\$1,951	\$18,368	-\$25,454,015	\$0	-\$25,454,015	\$23,412,227	-\$1,334,933,815	-\$1,358,346,043
Mar-16	-\$15,872,469	-\$5,580,592	-\$102,175	\$7,502	\$13,209	-\$21,534,525	\$0	-\$21,534,525	\$23,412,227	-\$1,356,468,340	-\$1,379,880,568
Apr-16	-\$10,415,718	-\$3,156,401	-\$49,603	\$10,821	\$6,722	-\$13,604,179	\$0	-\$13,604,179	\$23,412,227	-\$1,370,072,519	-\$1,393,484,747
May-16	-\$5,964,571	-\$1,727,504	-\$24,245	-\$11,723	\$44,730	-\$7,683,313	\$0	-\$7,683,313	\$23,412,227	-\$1,377,755,832	-\$1,401,168,060
Jun-16	-\$3,487,938	-\$1,055,352	-\$14,102	-\$24,004	\$55,326	-\$4,526,070	\$0	-\$4,526,070	\$23,412,227	-\$1,382,281,902	-\$1,405,694,130
Jul-16	-\$1,991,284	-\$607,071	-\$6,338	-\$29,412	\$71,233	-\$2,562,872	\$0	-\$2,562,872	\$23,412,227	-\$1,384,844,774	-\$1,408,257,002
Aug-16	-\$2,033,848	-\$612,147	-\$6,595	-\$31,069	\$86,108	-\$2,597,551	\$0	-\$2,597,551	\$23,412,227	-\$1,387,442,325	-\$1,410,854,553
Sep-16	-\$2,009,458	-\$597,987	-\$7,340	-\$6,580	\$55,578	-\$2,565,788	\$0	-\$2,565,788	\$23,412,227	-\$1,390,008,113	-\$1,413,420,341
Oct-16	-\$2,257,699	-\$619,928	-\$10,332	\$67,158	\$80,285	-\$2,740,516	\$0	-\$2,740,516	\$23,412,227	-\$1,392,748,629	-\$1,416,160,857
Nov-16	-\$5,015,771	-\$1,363,107	-\$32,609	-\$46,694	\$1,689	-\$6,456,492	\$0	-\$6,456,492	\$23,412,227	-\$1,399,205,120	-\$1,422,617,349
Dec-16	-\$8,848,222	-\$2,602,060	-\$39,483	-\$52,895	\$77,846	-\$11,464,815	\$0	-\$11,464,815	\$23,412,227	-\$1,410,669,935	-\$1,434,082,163
Jan-17	-\$8,602,412	-\$1,932,895	-\$23,094	-\$197,580	\$16,657	-\$10,739,324	\$0	-\$10,739,324	\$23,412,227	-\$1,421,409,259	-\$1,444,821,488
Feb-17	-\$10,479,905	-\$3,212,465	-\$45,344	-\$189,553	\$20,621	-\$13,906,646	\$0	-\$13,906,646	\$23,412,227	-\$1,435,315,906	-\$1,458,728,134
Mar-17	-\$12,403,111	-\$3,981,768	-\$66,462	-\$14,808	\$13,044	-\$16,453,105	\$0	-\$16,453,105	\$23,412,227	-\$1,451,769,011	-\$1,475,181,239
Apr-17	-\$7,152,840	-\$2,079,943	-\$33,637	-\$44,992	\$20,985	-\$9,290,427	\$0	-\$9,290,427	\$23,412,227	-\$1,461,059,438	-\$1,484,471,666
May-17	-\$4,249,551	-\$1,084,496	-\$16,756	-\$19,605	\$51,743	-\$5,318,664	\$0	-\$5,318,664	\$23,412,227	-\$1,466,378,103	-\$1,489,790,331
Jun-17	-\$2,846,544	-\$749,126	-\$12,220	-\$29,457	\$67,299	-\$3,570,047	\$0	-\$3,570,047	\$23,412,227	-\$1,469,948,150	-\$1,493,360,378

Month	Res. Savings CAB	Com. Savings CAB	Ind. Savings CAB	Com. Savings GAS	Ind. Savings GAS	Total Monthly Choice Savings	Monthly PIPP Savings	Monthly Savings Including PIPP	Cumulative PIPP Savings	Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP)	Cumulative Savings (Excl PIPP)
Jul-17	-\$2,432,674	-\$673,504	-\$11,964	\$17,247	\$53,984	-\$3,046,912	\$0	-\$3,046,912	\$23,412,227	-\$1,472,995,062	-\$1,496,407,290
Aug-17	-\$2,371,761	-\$675,104	-\$12,487	\$2,572	\$16	-\$3,056,763	\$0	-\$3,056,763	\$23,412,227	-\$1,476,051,825	-\$1,499,464,053
Sep-17	-\$2,539,390	-\$714,249	-\$12,382	\$5,325	\$60,276	-\$3,200,419	\$0	-\$3,200,419	\$23,412,227	-\$1,479,252,244	-\$1,502,664,472
Oct-17	-\$2,648,172	-\$744,642	-\$15,885	\$22,212	\$43,730	-\$3,342,756	\$0	-\$3,342,756	\$23,412,227	-\$1,482,595,000	-\$1,506,007,228
Nov-17	-\$7,587,488	-\$1,966,136	-\$50,909	\$30,457	\$50,781	-\$9,523,295	\$0	-\$9,523,295	\$23,412,227	-\$1,492,118,295	-\$1,515,530,523
Dec-17	-\$12,595,841	-\$3,405,446	-\$73,570	-\$42,110	\$70,159	-\$16,046,808	\$0	-\$16,046,808	\$23,412,227	-\$1,508,165,103	-\$1,531,577,331
Jan-18	-\$22,918,445	-\$6,713,323	-\$115,325	\$16,576	\$56,107	-\$29,674,409	\$0	-\$29,674,409	\$23,412,227	-\$1,537,839,513	-\$1,561,251,741
Feb-18	-\$11,398,416	-\$2,573,054	-\$37,638	\$32,141	\$35,553	-\$13,941,414	\$0	-\$13,941,414	\$23,412,227	-\$1,551,780,927	-\$1,575,193,155
Mar-18	-\$13,701,257	-\$4,102,488	-\$71,874	\$97,706	\$23,532	-\$17,754,381	\$0	-\$17,754,381	\$23,412,227	-\$1,569,535,308	-\$1,592,947,536
Apr-18	-\$14,252,376	-\$4,362,801	-\$80,331	\$48,637	\$20,711	-\$18,626,161	\$0	-\$18,626,161	\$23,412,227	-\$1,588,161,468	-\$1,611,573,696
May-18	-\$6,279,749	-\$1,859,047	-\$35,776	\$20,324	\$15,933	-\$8,138,314	\$0	-\$8,138,314	\$23,412,227	-\$1,596,299,783	-\$1,619,712,011
Jun-18	-\$2,785,837	-\$866,876	-\$13,609	\$15,332	\$43,914	-\$3,607,076	\$0	-\$3,607,076	\$23,412,227	-\$1,599,906,859	-\$1,623,319,087
Jul-18	-\$2,391,788	-\$728,416	-\$12,355	\$17,243	\$71,279	-\$3,044,037	\$0	-\$3,044,037	\$23,412,227	-\$1,602,950,896	-\$1,626,363,124
Aug-18	-\$2,370,543	-\$763,545	-\$11,058	-\$8,968	\$73,229	-\$3,080,885	\$0	-\$3,080,885	\$23,412,227	-\$1,606,031,780	-\$1,629,444,009
Sep-18	-\$2,377,345	-\$747,286	-\$11,546	\$8,187	\$48,877	-\$3,079,113	\$0	-\$3,079,113	\$23,412,227	-\$1,609,110,894	-\$1,632,523,122
Oct-18	-\$3,048,855	-\$877,058	-\$21,557	-\$8,173	\$41,244	-\$3,914,399	\$0	-\$3,914,399	\$23,412,227	-\$1,613,025,293	-\$1,636,437,521
Nov-18	-\$8,245,795	-\$2,195,153	-\$46,857	\$49,759	\$57,367	-\$10,380,680	\$0	-\$10,380,680	\$23,412,227	-\$1,623,405,972	-\$1,646,818,201
Dec-18	-\$7,107,855	-\$486,892	-\$11,127	-\$131,642	\$36,444	-\$7,701,071	\$0	-\$7,701,071	\$23,412,227	-\$1,631,107,044	-\$1,654,519,272
Jan-19	-\$14,432,062	-\$4,330,882	-\$90,482	-\$9,463	-\$117,386	-\$18,980,275	\$0	-\$18,980,275	\$23,412,227	-\$1,650,087,319	-\$1,673,499,547
Feb-19	-\$20,526,817	-\$6,533,568	-\$128,396	\$24,773	\$23,583	-\$27,140,424	\$0	-\$27,140,424	\$23,412,227	-\$1,636,251,318	-\$1,659,663,546
Mar-19	-\$17,106,315	-\$5,386,552	-\$109,858	-\$51,686	-\$1,770	-\$22,656,180	\$0	-\$22,656,180	\$23,412,227	-\$1,658,907,497	-\$1,682,319,726
Apr-19	-\$11,367,867	-\$3,623,774	-\$74,339	\$49,716	\$10,455	-\$15,005,809	\$0	-\$15,005,809	\$23,412,227	-\$1,673,913,306	-\$1,697,325,534
May-19	-\$6,410,621	-\$1,840,759	-\$28,594	\$17,288	\$30,188	-\$8,232,499	\$0	-\$8,232,499	\$23,412,227	-\$1,682,145,805	-\$1,705,558,033
Jun-19	-\$3,592,368	-\$1,200,432	-\$15,590	-\$6,574	\$26,184	-\$4,788,780	\$0	-\$4,788,780	\$23,412,227	-\$1,686,934,584	-\$1,710,346,813
Jul-19	-\$2,998,675	-\$1,087,420	-\$14,994	\$18,709	\$39,386	-\$4,042,994	\$0	-\$4,042,994	\$23,412,227	-\$1,690,977,578	-\$1,714,389,806
Aug-19	-\$2,813,061	-\$1,067,297	-\$15,342	\$18,693	\$40,760	-\$3,836,246	\$0	-\$3,836,246	\$23,412,227	-\$1,694,813,825	-\$1,718,226,053
Sep-19	-\$2,859,421	-\$1,071,283	-\$14,214	\$25,450	\$46,097	-\$3,873,371	\$0	-\$3,873,371	\$23,412,227	-\$1,698,687,196	-\$1,722,099,424
Oct-19	-\$3,348,874	-\$1,102,361	-\$19,762	\$2,084	\$44,122	-\$4,424,791	\$0	-\$4,424,791	\$23,412,227	-\$1,703,111,987	-\$1,726,524,215
Nov-19	-\$8,645,982	-\$2,655,864	-\$57,042	\$107,477	\$56,498	-\$11,194,913	\$0	-\$11,194,913	\$23,412,227	-\$1,714,306,900	-\$1,737,719,128
Dec-19	-\$16,457,094	-\$5,480,208	-\$131,140	\$96,260	\$42,802	-\$21,929,380	\$0	-\$21,929,380	\$23,412,227	-\$1,736,236,280	-\$1,759,648,508
Jan-20	-\$18,659,395	-\$6,818,494	-\$157,018	\$112,697	\$23,420	-\$25,498,789	\$0	-\$25,498,789	\$23,412,227	-\$1,761,735,069	-\$1,785,147,297
Feb-20	-\$20,153,919	-\$7,318,893	-\$164,857	\$119,648	\$8,427	-\$25,498,789	\$0	-\$27,509,594	\$23,412,227	-\$1,789,244,663	-\$1,812,656,891
Mar-20	-\$18,103,090	-\$6,385,425	-\$141,270	\$82,100	\$4,253	-\$25,498,789	\$0	-\$24,543,434	\$23,412,227	-\$1,813,788,097	-\$1,837,200,325
Apr-20	-\$13,271,864	-\$4,320,014	-\$95,686	\$60,573	\$7,402	-\$25,498,789	\$0	-\$17,619,589	\$23,412,227	-\$1,831,407,686	-\$1,854,819,914
May-20	-\$10,105,148	-\$3,022,800	-\$59,180	\$39,324	\$19,243	-\$25,498,789	\$0	-\$13,128,560	\$23,412,227	-\$1,844,536,246	-\$1,867,948,474
Jun-20	-\$4,981,287	-\$1,563,980	-\$27,330	\$26,538	\$29,521	-\$25,498,789	\$0	-\$6,516,538	\$23,412,227	-\$1,851,052,783	-\$1,874,465,012
Jul-20	-\$3,427,680	-\$1,231,796	-\$19,076	\$12,545	\$34,018	-\$25,498,789	\$0	-\$4,631,990	\$23,412,227	-\$1,855,684,773	-\$1,879,097,001
Aug-20	-\$2,885,618	-\$1,016,131	-\$16,235	\$14,923	\$37,981	-\$25,498,789	\$0	-\$3,865,080	\$23,412,227	-\$1,859,549,853	-\$1,882,962,081
Sep-20	-\$2,619,833	-\$818,632	-\$10,300	\$28,296	\$18,070	-\$25,498,789	\$0	-\$3,402,399	\$23,412,227	-\$1,862,952,253	-\$1,886,364,481
Oct-20	-\$4,316,431	-\$1,409,642	-\$24,376	\$30,873	\$40,906	-\$25,498,789	\$0	-\$5,678,670	\$23,412,227	-\$1,868,630,922	-\$1,892,043,150
Nov-20	-\$5,812,412	-\$1,607,908	-\$37,387	\$62,014	\$40,068	-\$25,498,789	\$0	-\$7,355,625	\$23,412,227	-\$1,875,986,547	-\$1,899,398,775

Month	Res. Savings CAB	Com. Savings CAB	Ind. Savings CAB	Com. Savings GAS	Ind. Savings GAS	Total Monthly Choice Savings	Monthly PIPP Savings	Monthly Savings Including PIPP	Cumulative PIPP Savings	Cumulative Savings (Incl PIPP)	Cumulative Savings (Excl PIPP)
Dec-20	-\$11,200,126	-\$3,625,383	-\$80,765	\$106,855	\$47,245	-\$25,498,789	\$0	-\$14,752,175	\$23,412,227	-\$1,890,738,722	-\$1,914,150,950
Jan-21	-\$19,491,141	-\$6,666,876	-\$143,223	\$154,450	\$31,771	-\$26,115,017	\$0	-\$26,115,017	\$23,412,228	-\$1,916,853,739	-\$1,940,265,967
Feb-21	-\$21,196,479	-\$7,336,740	-\$152,312	\$156,417	\$4,674	-\$26,115,017	\$0	-\$28,524,440	\$23,412,227	-\$1,945,378,180	-\$1,968,790,408
Mar-21	-\$20,318,419	-\$7,231,681	-\$154,242	\$99,776	\$10,154	-\$26,115,017	\$0	-\$27,594,413	\$23,412,227	-\$1,972,972,592	-\$1,996,384,820
Apr-21	-\$8,209,071	-\$2,226,020	-\$40,889	\$92,010	\$9,969	-\$26,115,017	\$0	-\$10,374,000	\$23,412,227	-\$1,983,346,592	-\$2,006,758,820
May-21	-\$5,479,371	-\$1,314,604	-\$16,485	\$85,657	\$34,582	-\$26,115,017	\$0	-\$6,690,222	\$23,412,227	-\$1,990,036,814	-\$2,013,449,042
Jun-21	-\$3,289,413	-\$864,557	-\$8,249	\$44,137	\$38,264	-\$26,115,017	\$0	-\$4,079,817	\$23,412,227	-\$1,994,116,631	-\$2,017,528,860
Jul-21	-\$2,037,807	-\$387,060	\$1,995	\$33,575	\$39,901	-\$2,349,396	\$0	-\$2,349,396	\$23,412,227	-\$1,996,466,028	-\$2,019,878,256
Aug-21	-\$1,709,138	-\$246,676	\$18,741	\$35,241	\$55,692	-\$1,846,140	\$0	-\$1,846,140	\$23,412,227	-\$1,998,312,168	-\$2,021,724,396
Sep-21	-\$1,633,679	-\$144,748	\$5,963	\$44,710	\$41,065	-\$1,686,690	\$0	-\$1,686,690	\$23,412,227	-\$1,999,998,858	-\$2,023,411,086
Oct-21	-\$956,744	\$465,322	\$22,335	\$67,881	\$69,925	-\$331,282	\$0	-\$331,282	\$23,412,227	-\$2,000,330,140	-\$2,023,742,368
Nov-21	-\$513,114	\$1,426,661	\$50,748	\$156,154	\$44,599	\$1,165,047	\$0	\$1,165,047	\$23,412,227	-\$1,999,165,092	-\$2,022,577,320
Dec-21	-\$4,006,520	\$1,487,874	\$42,726	\$209,405	\$4,604	-\$2,261,910	\$0	-\$2,261,910	\$23,412,227	-\$2,001,427,003	-\$2,024,839,231
Jan-22	-\$13,714,816	-\$2,735,771	-\$51,028	\$187,499	-\$2,073	-\$16,316,189	\$0	-\$16,316,189	\$23,412,227	-\$2,017,743,192	-\$2,041,155,420
Feb-22	\$1,046,725	\$5,673,939	\$158,580	\$216,027	\$12,435	\$7,107,707	\$0	\$7,107,707	\$23,412,227	-\$2,010,635,485	-\$2,034,047,713

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities
Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

9/7/2022 4:27:16 PM

in

Case No(s). 21-0903-GA-EXM, 21-0904-GA-ATA, 21-0905-GA-AAM

Summary: Testimony Direct Testimony of Michael P. Haugh on Behalf of Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel electronically filed by Ms. Alana M. Noward on behalf of O'Brien, Angela D.