From: PUCO Consumer Call Center

To: <u>Puco Docketing</u>

Subject: PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO - CASE #: 00772870 [ ref:\_00Dt0GzXt.\_5008y506sR:ref ]

**Date:** Monday, August 15, 2022 11:48:34 AM



### PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO Consumer Service Division Memorandum

**CASE ID**: 00772870

**COMPANY:** Southwest Ohio for Responsible Technology/SWORT

**CUSTOMER:** Monique Maisenhalter

ADDRESS: 154 Junefield Avenue, Cincinnati, Ohio 45218

SERVICE ADDRESS: 154 Junefield Avenue, Cincinnati, Ohio 45218

AIQ: Duke Energy Ohio

**NIQ:** 5137314843

\*\*\*To ensure your response attaches to the appropriate case, please reply to this email without changing the subject line. Thank you!\*\*\*

**DOCKETING CASE #:** 21-887-EL-AIR; 21-888-EL-ATA; and 21-889-EL-AAM.

**SUBJECT:** Duke Energy Ohio - Protest Rate Case

Please docket the associated customer comment and/or attached in the case number referenced above under "Public Comments". This information was received by the Consumer Services Division through alternate channels and is being forwarded to be filed formally. This information is not the opinion of Staff and should not be viewed as such.

I am submitting a comment in opposition on behalf of myself and organization, SWORT (SW Ohio for Responsible Technology) to the proposed Duke Energy Rate Increase, PUCO Case Records 21-887-EL-AIR, 21-888-EL-ATA, and 21-889-EL-AAM.

According to a July 26, 2022 WLWT news story, The Ohio Consumer Council (OCC) has analyzed Duke Energy's proposal and thinks the company can maintain a reliable power grid while lowering rates instead of raising them. https://puco.my.salesforce.com/apex/AFSC UrlCheck?

id=04a0q8y000000Z5LmAAK (https:??www?wlwt?com?article?duke-energy-request-rate-increase-final-hearing?40722876) I am asking that PUCO follow what the OCC has recommended instead of approving this proposed rate increase or a rate increase of any amount for Duke Energy Ohio customers.

If PUCO approves a rate increase of any amount, it will be one of several that PUCO has already approved for Duke Energy, some of them allocated directly for the installation, replacement, maintenance, and operation of Duke Energy's Smart Technology which includes Smart Meters. Here is a list of PUCO approved tariffs included on a residential customer bills study conducted by SWORT Board Member, Vince Welage: Duke Energy Ohio Gas Tariffs

- 1. PIPP, Percentage of Income Payment Plan Rider 63
- 2. ETR, Ohio Excise Tax Liability Rider 64 (4.890%)
- 3. AMRP, Accelerated Main Replacement Program Rider 65 (@2.82/month)
- 4. UE-G, Uncollectible Expense Rider 67
- 5. STR, State Tax Rider 68
- 6. MGP, Manufactured Gas Plant Rider 69
- 7. GCR, Gas Cost Recover Rider 70
- 8. GCRR, Gas Cost Recover Rate Rider 71
- 9. CCCR, Contract Commitment Cost Recovery Rider 76
- 10. CEP, Capital Expenditure Program Rider 84 (\$3.69/month)

#### **Duke Energy Ohio Electric Tariffs**

- 1. ETCJA, Electric Tax Cuts and Jobs Act Rider 77
- 2. ESRR, Electric Service Reliability Rider 80 (2.18% x Distribution Charges)
- 3. OET. Ohio Excise Tax Rider 83
- 4. PF, Power Future Rider
- 5. USR, Universal Service Fund Rider 86
- 6. UE-GEN, Uncollectable Expense, Electric Generation Rider 88
- 7. BTR, Base Transmission Rider 89
- 8. RTO, Regional Transmission Organization Rider 97
- 9. DSR, Distribution Storm Rider 101
- 10. DCI, Distribution Capital Investment Rider 103 (22.763% x Distribution Charges)
- 11. DR-IM, Infrastructure Modernization Rider 104
- 12. DR-ECF, Economic Competitive Fund Rider 105 (0.60% x Distribution Charges)
- 13. UE-ED, Uncollectible Expense, Electric Distribution Rider 108
- 14. AER-R, Alternative Energy Recovery Rider 110
- 15. RC, Retail Capacity Rider 111
- 16. RE, Retail Energy Rider 112
- 17. SCR, Supplier Cost Reconciliation Rider 115
- 18. EE-PDRR, Energy Efficiency/Peak Demand Response Recovery Rider 119

- 19. DDR, Distribution Decoupling Rider 122
- 20. PSR, Price Stabilization Rider 126
- 21. AMO, Advanced Meter Opt-out –Res 127 (\$100 one time + \$30/month)

Mr. Welage's study consisted of a group of residential customers who submitted monthly bills covering the period 2018-2022. The study itself concentrated on the hidden cost items on the bills which are the delivery riders for both gas and electric usage. The delivery riders are derived from customer usage distribution charges.

Not all of the customers in Mr. Welage's study have opted-out of Duke Energy Smart Meters as not all can afford the 2016 PUCO approved Duke Energy Smart Meter opt-out fees of \$100 for replacement and \$30/month (14-1160-EL-UNC). The study shows that many Duke Energy Ohio residential customers are receiving higher bills after Duke Energy installed Smart Meters on their homes even when their energy use decreases. All of these increases and delivery riders have created a financial hardship for many Duke Energy Ohio residential customers. This has likely contributed to the high shut off numbers among Duke Energy Ohio residential customers.

I am also opposed to the 2016 PUCO approved Duke Energy Smart Meter Opt-Out Fees of \$100 for replacement and \$30/month (14-1160-EL-UNC). These fees are excessive and unjust especially to Duke Energy Ohio customers with doctors' notes stating that these meters adversely impact their health. In North Carolina, Duke Energy charges no opt-out fees for customers with doctors' notes stating that Smart Meters adversely impact their health. Duke Energy North Carolina also charges lower monthly fees to opt-out customers who don't have doctors' notes. See Duke Energy North Carolina Smart Meter Opt Out webpage https://puco.my.salesforce.com/apex/AFSC\_\_UrlCheck? id=04a0q8y000000Z5LnAAK (https:??www?duke-energy?com?our-company?about-us?smart-grid?smart-meter)

In 2017, a letter dated February 3, 2017 and signed by 3 doctors was submitted to PUCO Duke Energy Smart Meter Opt Out case record, 14-1160-EL-UNC, asking that there be no Smart Meter opt-out fees approved for Duke Energy and all other Ohio utility customers because of adverse health impacts from Smart Meters. These fees are unlawful surcharges under the ADA/ADAA, FHA/FHAA, and state equivalent rules. Under the Fair Housing Amendments Act and/or Title III of the Americans with Disabilities Act, and Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, and Title 10, in addition to other state and federal laws against discrimination, it is unlawful discrimination to deny a person with a disability a reasonable accommodation of policies, procedures, and activities, where necessary to avoid discrimination if such accommodation may be necessary to afford such person full enjoyment of the premises or equal access and/or participation in programs and services.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

Monique Maisenhalter SWORT Board Member and Duke Energy Ohio customer

This message and any response to it may constitute a public record and thus may be publicly available to anyone who requests it.

----- Original Message -----

From: PUCO Consumer Call Center [contactthepuco@puc.state.oh.us]

Sent: 8/12/2022 2:57 PM To: docketing@puco.ohio.gov

Subject: PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO - CASE #: 00772870

ref:\_00Dt0GzXt.\_5008y506sR:ref]



## PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO Consumer Service Division Memorandum

**CASE ID**: 00772870

**COMPANY:** Duke Energy Ohio **CUSTOMER:** Monique Maisenhalter

ADDRESS: 154 Junefield Avenue, Cincinnati, Ohio 45218

AIQ: Duke Energy Ohio

**NIQ:** 5137314843

\*\*\*To ensure your response attaches to the appropriate case, please reply to this email without changing the subject line. Thank you!\*\*\*

**DOCKETING CASE #: 21-0887-EL-AIR** 

#### **SUBJECT:** Duke Energy Ohio - Protest Rate Case

Please docket the associated customer comment and/or attached in the case number referenced above under "Public Comments". This information was received by the Consumer Services Division through alternate channels and is being forwarded to be filed formally. This information is not the opinion of Staff and should not be viewed as such.

•

 I am submitting a comment in opposition on behalf of myself and organization, SWORT (SW Ohio for Responsible Technology) to the proposed Duke Energy Rate Increase, PUCO Case Records 21-887-EL-AIR, 21-888-EL-ATA, and 21-889-EL-AAM.

According to a July 26, 2022 WLWT news story, The Ohio Consumer Council (OCC) has analyzed Duke Energy's proposal and thinks the company can maintain a reliable power grid while lowering rates instead of raising them. https://puco.my.salesforce.com/apex/AFSC\_\_UrlCheck? id=04a0q8y000000Z5LmAAK (https:??www?wlwt?com? article?duke-energy-request-rate-increase-final-hearing? 40722876) I am asking that PUCO follow what the OCC has recommended instead of approving this proposed rate increase or a rate increase of any amount for Duke Energy Ohio customers.

If PUCO approves a rate increase of any amount, it will be one of several that PUCO has already approved for Duke Energy, some of them allocated directly for the installation, replacement, maintenance, and operation of Duke Energy's Smart Technology which includes Smart Meters. Here is a list of PUCO approved tariffs included on a residential customer bills study conducted by SWORT Board Member, Vince Welage:

Duke Energy Ohio Gas Tariffs

- 1. PIPP, Percentage of Income Payment Plan Rider 63
- 2. ETR, Ohio Excise Tax Liability Rider 64 (4.890%)
- 3. AMRP, Accelerated Main Replacement Program Rider 65 (@2.82/month)
- 4. UE-G, Uncollectible Expense Rider 67
- 5. STR, State Tax Rider 68
- 6. MGP, Manufactured Gas Plant Rider 69
- 7. GCR, Gas Cost Recover Rider 70
- GCRR, Gas Cost Recover Rate Rider 71

CCCR, Contract Commitment Cost Recovery Rider 76
 CEP, Capital Expenditure Program Rider 84 (\$3.69/month)

#### Duke Energy Ohio Electric Tariffs

- 1. ETCJA, Electric Tax Cuts and Jobs Act Rider 77
- 2. ESRR, Electric Service Reliability Rider 80 (2.18% x Distribution Charges)
- 3. OET, Ohio Excise Tax Rider 83
- 4. PF, Power Future Rider
- USR, Universal Service Fund Rider 86
- 6. UE-GEN, Uncollectable Expense, Electric Generation Rider 88
- 7. BTR, Base Transmission Rider 89
- 8. RTO, Regional Transmission Organization Rider 97
- 9. DSR, Distribution Storm Rider 101
- 10. DCI, Distribution Capital Investment Rider 103 (22.763% x Distribution Charges)
- 11. DR-IM, Infrastructure Modernization Rider 104
- 12. DR-ECF, Economic Competitive Fund Rider 105 (0.60% x Distribution Charges)
- 13. UE-ED, Uncollectible Expense, Electric Distribution Rider 108
- 14. AER-R, Alternative Energy Recovery Rider 110
- 15. RC, Retail Capacity Rider 111
- 16. RE, Retail Energy Rider 112
- 17. SCR, Supplier Cost Reconciliation Rider 115
- 18. EE-PDRR, Energy Efficiency/Peak Demand Response Recovery Rider 119
- 19. DDR, Distribution Decoupling Rider 122
- 20. PSR, Price Stabilization Rider 126
- 21. AMO, Advanced Meter Opt-out –Res 127 (\$100 one time + \$30/month)

Mr. Welage's study consisted of a group of residential customers who submitted monthly bills covering the period 2018-2022. The study itself concentrated on the hidden cost items on the bills which are the delivery riders for both gas and electric usage. The delivery riders are derived from customer usage distribution charges.

Not all of the customers in Mr. Welage's study have opted-out of Duke Energy Smart Meters as not all can afford the 2016 PUCO approved Duke Energy Smart Meter opt-out fees of \$100 for replacement and \$30/month (14-1160-EL-UNC). The study shows that many Duke Energy Ohio residential customers are receiving higher bills after Duke Energy installed Smart Meters on their homes even when their energy use decreases. All of these increases and delivery riders have

created a financial hardship for many Duke Energy Ohio residential customers. This has likely contributed to the high shut off numbers among Duke Energy Ohio residential customers.

I am also opposed to the 2016 PUCO approved Duke y Smart Meter Opt-Out Fees of \$100 for replacement and \$30/month (14-1160-EL-UNC). These fees are excessive and unjust especially to Duke Energy Ohio customers with doctors' notes stating that these meters adversely impact their health. In North Carolina, Duke Energy charges no opt-out fees for customers with doctors' notes stating that Smart Meters adversely impact their health. Duke Energy North Carolina also charges lower monthly fees to opt-out customers who don't have doctors' notes. See Duke Energy North Carolina Smart Meter Opt Out webpage

https://puco.my.salesforce.com/apex/AFSC\_\_UrlCheck? id=04a0q8y000000Z5LnAAK (https:??www?duke-energy? com?our-company?about-us?smart-grid?smart-meter)

In 2017, a letter dated February 3, 2017 and signed by 3 doctors was submitted to PUCO Duke Energy Smart Meter Opt Out case record, 14-1160-EL-UNC, asking that there be no Smart Meter opt-out fees approved for Duke Energy and all other Ohio utility customers because of adverse health impacts from Smart Meters. These fees are unlawful surcharges under the ADA/ADAA, FHA/FHAA, and state equivalent rules. Under the Fair Housing Amendments Act and/or Title III of the Americans with Disabilities Act, and Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973, and Title 10, in addition to other state and federal laws against discrimination, it is unlawful discrimination to deny a person with a disability a reasonable accommodation of policies, procedures, and activities, where necessary to avoid discrimination if such accommodation may be necessary to afford such person full enjoyment of the premises or equal access and/or participation in programs and services.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely, Monique Maisenhalter SWORT Board Member and Duke Energy Ohio customer This message and any response to it may constitute a public record and thus may be publicly available to anyone who requests it.

- Original Message -----

From: PUCO Consumer Call Center [noreply@puc.state.oh.us]

**Sent:** 8/12/2022 1:09 PM

**To:** swo4responsibletech@fuse.net

Subject: PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO - Your Case #00772870



Dear Monique Maisenhalter:

Thank you for contacting the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (PUCO). Your case number is 00772870.

A PUCO Call Center Representative will contact you as soon as possible to discuss your case.

Sincerely,

**PUCO Call Center** (800) 686-PUCO (7826) www.PUCO.ohio.gov



nttps://www.facebook.com/PUCOhio

This message and any response to it may constitute a public record and thus may be publicly available to anyone who requests it.

ref:\_00Dt0GzXt.\_5008y506sR:ref



**CAUTION:** This is an external email and may not be safe. If the email looks suspicious, please do not click links or open attachments and forward the email to <u>csc@ohio.gov</u> or click the Phish Alert Button if available.

# This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

8/15/2022 3:11:51 PM

in

Case No(s). 21-0887-EL-AIR, 21-0888-EL-ATA, 21-0889-EL-AAM

Summary: Public Comment of Monique Maisenhalter on behalf of Southwest Ohio For Responsible T Technology/SWORT, via website, electronically filed by Docketing Staff on behalf of Docketing