

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Ohio Edison	)	
Company, the Cleveland Electric	)	
Illuminating Company, and the Toledo	)	Case No. 17-974-EL-UNC
Edison Company's Compliance with	)	
R.C. 4928.17 and the Ohio Adm. Code	)	
Chapter 4901:1-37.	)	

---

**MOTION FOR A SUBPOENA FOR FORMER FIRSTENERGY LOBBYIST AND  
DIRECTOR OF STATE AFFAIRS TY PINE TO APPEAR AT DEPOSITION  
BY  
OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL**

---

Bruce Weston (0016973)  
Ohio Consumers' Counsel

Maureen R. Willis (0020847)  
Counsel of Record  
John Finnigan (0018689)  
Connor D. Semple (0101102)  
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

**Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel**  
65 East State Street, Suite 700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Telephone [Willis]: (614) 466-9567  
Telephone [Finnigan]: (614) 466-9585  
Telephone [Semple]: (614) 466-9565  
[maureen.willis@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:maureen.willis@occ.ohio.gov)  
[john.finnigan@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:john.finnigan@occ.ohio.gov)  
[connor.semples@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:connor.semples@occ.ohio.gov)  
(willing to accept service by email)

Brian M. Zets (0066544)  
**Isaac Wiles & Burkholder, LLC**  
Two Miranova Place, Suite 700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Telephone: (614) 221-2121  
[bzets@isaacwiles.com](mailto:bzets@isaacwiles.com)  
(willing to accept service by e-mail)

August 4, 2022

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Ohio Edison	)	
Company, the Cleveland Electric	)	
Illuminating Company, and the Toledo	)	Case No. 17-974-EL-UNC
Edison Company's Compliance with	)	
R.C. 4928.17 and the Ohio Adm. Code	)	
Chapter 4901:1-37.	)	

---

**MOTION FOR A SUBPOENA FOR FORMER FIRSTENERGY LOBBYIST AND  
DIRECTOR OF STATE AFFAIRS TY PINE TO APPEAR AT DEPOSITION  
BY  
OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL**

---

This motion is to subpoena FirstEnergy's former lobbyist and Director of State Affairs, Ty Pine. The subpoena requires Mr. Pine to appear at deposition.<sup>1</sup>

FirstEnergy terminated Mr. Pine as a lobbyist effective February 23, 2021.<sup>2</sup> Mr. Pine lobbied for FirstEnergy on House Bill 6 and House Bill 166 (2020-2021 state operating budget).<sup>3</sup> During the period from February 2017 through July 2019, Mr. Pine had 188 phone contacts with Mr. Householder.<sup>4</sup>

The conduct that Mr. Pine failed to address was described by Plaintiffs' counsel in an affidavit filed in the federal securities lawsuit related to H.B. 6. The affidavit states:

\* \* \*

4. Plaintiffs' counsel believe that the discovery received would have shown at trial that two senior

---

<sup>1</sup> OCC would have included a request for Mr. Pine to bring documents to his deposition; however, the Attorney Examiner ruled (wrongly in our view) that OCC is not entitled to request documents when it filed a motion to subpoena Ebony Yeboah-Amankwah for deposition. *See* Entry (June 16, 2022).

<sup>2</sup> A. Tobias, *FirstEnergy cancels registration for in-house lobbyists*, Cleveland.com (March 9, 2021).

<sup>3</sup> AER Agent Legislative Registration for Ty R. Pine, Joint Legislative Ethics Committee (May – August 2019).

<sup>4</sup> *United States v. Larry Householder, et al.*, Case No. 1:20-cr-00077, Criminal Complaint at 61 (S.D. Ohio) (July 21, 2020).

executives of FirstEnergy devised and orchestrated FirstEnergy's payments to public officials in exchange for favorable legislation and regulatory action:

- Defendant Charles E. Jones, who was FirstEnergy's Chief Executive Officer and a director at the time of the scheme and has since been terminated by the Company; and
  - Defendant Michael J. Dowling, who was FirstEnergy's Senior Vice President for External Affairs at the time of the scheme and has since been terminated by the Company.
5. Based on the discovery, Plaintiffs' counsel understand that Defendant Jones is the individual identified in the DPA [Deferred Prosecution Agreement] as "Executive 1" and that Defendant Dowling is the individual identified in the DPA as "Executive 2." The DPA describes Executive 1's and Executive 2's central roles in the events giving rise to this litigation.
6. Defendants Jones and Dowling have vehemently denied acting improperly, and neither Jones nor Dowling have been charged by the Department of Justice.<sup>5</sup>

A text message exchange between Mr. Jones and Mr. Dowling on June 19, 2019 discusses whether the Senate version of House Bill 166 would include favorable language for FirstEnergy regarding the Significantly Excessive Earnings Test (“SEET”). As part of this text message exchange, Mr. Dowling texted to Mr. Jones that “Senate kept SEET in – thanks to ty and Sam Randazzo. Story later.”<sup>6</sup>

---

<sup>5</sup> *Jennifer L. Miller v. Michael J. Anderson, et al.*, Case No. 5:20-cv-1743 Affidavit of Jeroen Van Kwaegen and Thomas Curry (N.D. Ohio) (March 23, 2022).

<sup>6</sup> Text message exchange between Mr. Jones and Mr. Dowling on June 19, 2019, Bates No. 0000003 – 0000004, produced by FirstEnergy Utilities.

The present subpoena compels Mr. Pine to appear for deposition. The deposition will be at OCC's offices at 65 East State Street, Suite 700, Columbus, Ohio 43215, fourteen days from the date of the subpoena (or at such alternative date and/or location that is mutually agreed upon).

This case concerns FirstEnergy's noncompliance with Ohio corporate separation requirements, including FirstEnergy's misallocations of costs related to House Bill 6, which were part of "the largest bribery money laundering scheme in Ohio history." Mr. Pine was lobbyist and Director of State Affairs at FirstEnergy through February 23, 2021.<sup>7</sup>

Among other things, OCC needs to question Mr. Pine regarding his interactions with Generation Now representatives and Sam Randazzo in the course of his lobbying work on Hose Bill 6 and House Bill 166. Mr. Pine may have relevant information related to Generation Now, Sustainability Funding Alliance and Mr. Randazzo, which is relevant to the misallocated costs to the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities.<sup>8</sup>

It appears that, at Mr. Jones' and Mr. Dowling's direction, FirstEnergy made various political contributions which were then improperly allocated to the FirstEnergy Utilities and improperly charged to consumers. The misallocations were for FirstEnergy political contributions to Generation Now and Hardworking Ohioans, as well as

---

<sup>7</sup> A. Tobias, *FirstEnergy cancels registration for in-house lobbyists*, Cleveland.com (March 9, 2021).

<sup>8</sup> *Jennifer L. Miller v. Michael J. Anderson, et al.*, Case No. 5:20-cv-1743 Affidavit of Jeroen Van Kwaegen and Thomas Curry (N.D. Ohio) (March 23, 2022).

payments to Sustainability Funding Alliance, a firm associated with former PUCO Chair Sam Randazzo.<sup>9</sup>

Consumers were wrongly charged \$6,639,339 for FirstEnergy's improper cost allocations. FirstEnergy also improperly charged to capital accounts an additional \$7,445,573 which a PUCO auditor has recommended should be removed from rate base in future rate cases.<sup>10</sup> OCC seeks information from Mr. Pine relating to his involvement with Generation Now and Mr. Randazzo related to these misallocations.

The PUCO has repeatedly stated that it is "determined to act in a deliberate manner, based upon facts rather than speculation."<sup>11</sup> Signing this subpoena for OCC is part of obtaining the facts (and justice). The subpoena also would help to achieve Chair French's objective to provide "more transparency" "to lift the 'black cloud' of [the] HB 6 scandal" from over the PUCO."<sup>12</sup>

Accordingly, OCC files this motion for a subpoena to Mr. Pine, per O.A.C. 4901-1-25. This motion is more fully explained in the attached memorandum in support.

---

<sup>9</sup> *In the Matter of the 2020 Review of the Delivery Capital Recovery Rider of the Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company*, Case No. 20-1629-EL-UNC, Audit Report, Expanded Scope (August 3, 2021).

<sup>10</sup> Case No. 20-1629-EL-UNC, Audit Report, Expanded Scope at 28 (August 3, 2021).

<sup>11</sup> *In the Matter of the Review of Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company's Compliance with R.C. 4928.17 and Ohio Adm. Code Chapter 4901:1-37*, Case No. 17-974-EL-UNC, Entry at ¶ 17 (November 4, 2020).

<sup>12</sup> J. Pelzer, *New PUCO Chair Jenifer French: more transparency needed to lift the 'black cloud' of [the] HB 6 scandal*, Cleveland.com (May 18, 2021).

Respectfully submitted,

Bruce Weston (0016973)  
Ohio Consumers' Counsel

/s/ Maureen R. Willis

Maureen R. Willis (0020847)  
Counsel of Record  
John Finnigan (0018689)  
Connor D. Semple (0101102)  
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

**Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel**

65 East State Street, Suite 700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Telephone [Willis]: (614) 466-9567  
Telephone [Finnigan]: (614) 466-9585  
Telephone [Semple]: (614) 466-9565  
[maureen.willis@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:maureen.willis@occ.ohio.gov)  
[john.finnigan@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:john.finnigan@occ.ohio.gov)  
[connor.semples@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:connor.semples@occ.ohio.gov)  
(willing to accept service by email)

Brian M. Zets (0066544)  
**Isaac Wiles & Burkholder, LLC**  
Two Miranova Place, Suite 700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Telephone: (614) 221-2121  
[bzets@isaacwiles.com](mailto:bzets@isaacwiles.com)  
(willing to accept service by e-mail)

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	<b>PAGE</b>
I. INTRODUCTION .....	1
II. LAW AND ARGUMENT .....	2
A. The PUCO should grant OCC's motion and sign OCC's subpoena to FirstEnergy's former lobbyist and Director of State Affairs. ....	2
III. CONCLUSION.....	4

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Ohio Edison	)	
Company, the Cleveland Electric	)	
Illuminating Company, and the Toledo	)	Case No. 17-974-EL-UNC
Edison Company's Compliance with	)	
R.C. 4928.17 and the Ohio Adm. Code	)	
Chapter 4901:1-37.	)	

---

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

---

**I. INTRODUCTION**

OCC files this motion, per O.A. C. 4901-1-25, to subpoena Ty Pine. Mr. Pine should be compelled to appear for deposition at OCC's offices at 65 East State Street, Suite 700, Columbus, Ohio 43215, fourteen days from the date of the subpoena (or alternatively at such date and/or location that is mutually agreed upon).

According to Plaintiffs counsel's affidavit in the *Miller* litigation, Mr. Jones and Mr. Dowling "devised and orchestrated FirstEnergy's payments to public officials in exchange for favorable legislation and regulatory action."<sup>13</sup> An audit ordered by the PUCO revealed that a significant amount of the costs for these payments was improperly allocated to the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities.<sup>14</sup> FirstEnergy due to terminated Mr. Pine as a lobbyist effective February 23, 2021.<sup>15</sup> Ebony Yeboah-Amankwah was "separated" at the same time as Mr. Pine for her inactions related to the House Bill 6 matter.<sup>16</sup> The PUCO

---

<sup>13</sup> *Jennifer L. Miller v. Michael J. Anderson, et al.*, Case No. 5:20-cv-1743 Affidavit of Jeroen Van Kwaegen and Thomas Curry (N.D. Ohio) (March 23, 2022).

<sup>14</sup> *In the Matter of the 2020 Review of the Delivery Capital Recovery Rider of the Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company*, Case No. 20-1629-EL-UNC, Audit Report, Expanded Scope (August 3, 2021).

<sup>15</sup> A. Tobias, *FirstEnergy cancels registration for in-house lobbyists*, Cleveland.com (March 9, 2021).

<sup>16</sup> *Id.*



previously granted OCC's motion to subpoena Ms. Yeboah-Amankwah in this case and overruled Ms. Yeboah-Amankwah's motion to quash the subpoena.<sup>17</sup>

The PUCO has stated that it is "determined to act in a deliberate manner, based upon facts rather than speculation."<sup>18</sup> But to take appropriate action for public protection based on facts, the PUCO *must first obtain the facts*, including by signing this subpoena for OCC.

Accordingly, the PUCO should grant OCC's motion.

## II. LAW AND ARGUMENT

### A. **The PUCO should grant OCC's motion and sign OCC's subpoena to FirstEnergy's former lobbyist and Director of State Affairs.**

OCC satisfies O.A.C. 4901-1-25 for the granting of its motion for a subpoena.

Essentially, the signing of the subpoena is a ministerial act for the PUCO. The Attorney Examiner should sign the subpoena when presented by OCC in person, per O.A.C. 4901-1-25(A)(2). If that signing does not occur for whatever reason, the PUCO Examiner should promptly return the signed subpoena to OCC via "United States mail," per O.A.C. 4901-1-25(A)(1). The PUCO's consideration of whether a subpoena is "unreasonable or oppressive" is only prompted if another party moves to quash, per O.A.C. 4901-1-25(C).

Under R.C. 4903.082, parties must be given ample rights of discovery. The Ohio Supreme Court recently affirmed OCC and NOPEC's broad statutory rights to discovery (as intervenors), when it reversed the PUCO's decision in the FirstEnergy Advisors case. Discovery rights are also in O.A.C. 4901-1-16 et seq. The PUCO denied motions to

---

<sup>17</sup> Entry (June 16, 2022).

<sup>18</sup> *In the Matter of the Review of Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company's Compliance with R.C. 4928.17 and Ohio Adm. Code Chapter 4901:1-37*, Case No. 17-974-EL-UNC, Entry at ¶ 17 (November 4, 2020).

compel discovery among other things, in the case.<sup>19</sup> The Court directed the PUCO to rule on the discovery motions before issuing a decision on the matters before it.<sup>20</sup>

Requiring Mr. Pine to testify at deposition will help establish how and why FirstEnergy improperly misallocated House Bill 6 costs to the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities. The evidence obtained to date establishes that FirstEnergy improperly charged the FirstEnergy Utilities for several items. One item was a portion of the \$60 million in payments to Generation Now to benefit a legislator for help in passing House Bill 6.<sup>21</sup> Another item was “a FirstEnergy Corp. payment of \$4,333,333, made on January 2, 2019 under a consulting agreement with Sustainability Funding Alliance (“SFA”), which the U.S. Attorney/FirstEnergy deferred prosecution agreement indicates was political spending in support of House Bill 6.”<sup>22</sup>

The PUCO should grant OCC’s motion for a subpoena to require Mr. Pine to testify at deposition.

---

<sup>19</sup> *In re Suvon LLC*, 2021 WL 4783198, 2021-Ohio-3630 (October 14, 2021).

<sup>20</sup> *Id.* at ¶ 41.

<sup>21</sup> *In the Matter of the Review of the Political and Charitable Spending by Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company*, Deposition of Santino Fanelli at 129-130 (March 9, 2021) (testifying that political and charitable spending costs involving Generation Now payments were allocated to the Ohio companies); *see also In the Matter of the 2020 Review of the Delivery Capital Recovery Rider of Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company*, Case No. 20-1629-EL-RDR, Compliance Audit of the 2020 Delivery Capital Recovery (DCR) Riders of Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company, Expanded Audit Report at Table 24 at 27 (Auditor finding that a payment of \$355,800 to Generation Now was “unsupported” but nonetheless classified in part as capital investment and charged to FirstEnergy consumers through the 2017 Rider DCR and the Pole attachment charges) (August 3, 2021).

<sup>22</sup> *In the Matter of the Review of the Political and Charitable Spending by Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company*, Case No. 20-1502-EL-UNC, Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company’s Supplemental Response to the September 15, 2020 Show Cause Entry at 1 (August 6, 2021).

### III. CONCLUSION

The PUCO should sign OCC's subpoena toward giving Ohioans the benefit of a proper investigation of FirstEnergy's apparent corporate separation violations related to House Bill 6. OCC's requested subpoena to FirstEnergy's former lobbyist and Director of State Affairs is needed to obtain crucial information for case preparation toward reaching justice in this proceeding.

Respectfully submitted,

Bruce Weston (0016973)  
Ohio Consumers' Counsel

/s/ Maureen R. Willis  
Maureen R. Willis (0020847)  
Counsel of Record  
John Finnigan (0018689)  
Connor D. Semple (0101102)  
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

**Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel**

65 East State Street, Suite 700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Telephone [Willis]: (614) 466-9567  
Telephone [Finnigan]: (614) 466-9585  
Telephone [Semple]: (614) 466-9565  
[maureen.willis@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:maureen.willis@occ.ohio.gov)  
[john.finnigan@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:john.finnigan@occ.ohio.gov)  
[connor.semples@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:connor.semples@occ.ohio.gov)  
(willing to accept service by email)

Brian M. Zets (0066544)  
**Isaac Wiles & Burkholder, LLC**  
Two Miranova Place, Suite 700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Telephone: (614) 221-2121  
[bzets@isaacwiles.com](mailto:bzets@isaacwiles.com)  
(willing to accept service by e-mail)

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of this Motion was served on the persons stated below  
via electric transmission this 4<sup>th</sup> day of August 2022.

/s/ Maureen R. Willis  
Maureen R. Willis  
Senior Counsel

The PUCO's e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document  
on the following parties:

### **SERVICE LIST**

[thomas.lindgren@ohioAGO.gov](mailto:thomas.lindgren@ohioAGO.gov)  
[werner.margard@ohioAGO.gov](mailto:werner.margard@ohioAGO.gov)  
[joliker@igsenergy.com](mailto:joliker@igsenergy.com)  
[Mnugent@igsenergy.com](mailto:Mnugent@igsenergy.com)  
[bethany.allen@igs.com](mailto:bethany.allen@igs.com)  
[evan.betterton@igs.com](mailto:evan.betterton@igs.com)  
[gkrassen@bricker.com](mailto:gkrassen@bricker.com)  
[dstinson@bricker.com](mailto:dstinson@bricker.com)  
[whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com](mailto:whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com)  
[trent@hubaydougherty.com](mailto:trent@hubaydougherty.com)  
[mwise@mcdonaldhopkins.com](mailto:mwise@mcdonaldhopkins.com)  
[mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com](mailto:mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com)  
[kboehm@BKLlawfirm.com](mailto:kboehm@BKLlawfirm.com)  
[jkylercohn@BKLlawfirm.com](mailto:jkylercohn@BKLlawfirm.com)  
[talexander@beneschlaw.com](mailto:talexander@beneschlaw.com)  
[khehmeyer@beneschlaw.com](mailto:khehmeyer@beneschlaw.com)

Attorney Examiners:

[megan.addison@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:megan.addison@puco.ohio.gov)  
[jacqueline.st.john@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:jacqueline.st.john@puco.ohio.gov)

[edanford@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:edanford@firstenergycorp.com)  
[cwatchorn@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:cwatchorn@firstenergycorp.com)  
[bknipe@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:bknipe@firstenergycorp.com)  
[mrgladman@jonesday.com](mailto:mrgladman@jonesday.com)  
[mdengler@jonesday.com](mailto:mdengler@jonesday.com)  
[radoringo@jonesday.com](mailto:radoringo@jonesday.com)  
[marcie.lape@skadden.com](mailto:marcie.lape@skadden.com)  
[iavalon@taftlaw.com](mailto:iavalon@taftlaw.com)  
[kverhalen@taftlaw.com](mailto:kverhalen@taftlaw.com)  
[mpritchard@mcneeslaw.com](mailto:mpritchard@mcneeslaw.com)  
[rdove@keglerbrown.com](mailto:rdove@keglerbrown.com)  
[bojko@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:bojko@carpenterlipps.com)  
[tdougherty@theOEC.org](mailto:tdougherty@theOEC.org)  
[ctavenor@theOEC.org](mailto:ctavenor@theOEC.org)  
[knordstrom@theoec.org](mailto:knordstrom@theoec.org)  
[jweber@elpc.org](mailto:jweber@elpc.org)  
[trhayslaw@gmail.com](mailto:trhayslaw@gmail.com)  
[leslie.kovacik@toledo.oh.gov](mailto:leslie.kovacik@toledo.oh.gov)  
[sgoyal@jonesday.com](mailto:sgoyal@jonesday.com)  
[calee@jonesday.com](mailto:calee@jonesday.com)  
[dparram@bricker.com](mailto:dparram@bricker.com)  
[rmains@bricker.com](mailto:rmains@bricker.com)

STATE OF OHIO  
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION  
180 E. EAST BROAD STREET  
COLUMBUS OHIO 43266-0573

Michael DeWine  
GOVERNOR



PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO  
SUBPOENA

TO: Mr. Ty R. Pine  
2630 Henthorn Road  
Columbus, Ohio 43221

Upon application of the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel ("OCC"), Mr. Ty R. Pine, former lobbyist and Director of State Affairs of FirstEnergy, is hereby required to appear for deposition at OCC's office at 65 East State Street, Suite 700, Columbus, Ohio 43215 fourteen days of the date of this subpoena or at such alternative time and/or location as is mutually agreed.

This subpoena is issued in connection with the proceeding entitled: "*In the Matter of the Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company's Compliance with R.C. 4928.17 and the Ohio Adm. Code Chapter 4901:1-37, Case No. 17-974-EL-UNC.*"

Dated at Columbus, Ohio, this \_\_\_\_\_ day of August 2022.

---

PUCO Attorney Examiner

NOTICE: If you are not a party or an officer, agent, or employee of a party to this proceeding, then witness fees for attending under this subpoena are to be

paid by the party at whose request the witness is summoned. Every copy of this subpoena for the witness must contain this notice.

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities  
Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**8/4/2022 4:11:37 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 17-0974-EL-UNC**

Summary: Subpoena Motion for a Subpoena for Former FirstEnergy Lobbyist and Director of State Affairs Ty Pine to Appear at Deposition by Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel electronically filed by Ms. Alana M. Noward on behalf of Willis, Maureen R.