

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the OVEC Generation)	
Purchase Rider Audits Required by R.C.)	Case No. 21-477-EL-RDR
4928.148 for Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., The)	
Dayton Power and Light Company, and AEP)	
Ohio)	

**DUKE ENERGY OHIO, INC.'S
MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., (Duke Energy Ohio or Company) hereby moves this honorable Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Commission) for leave to file under seal certain information contained in the document titled “Audit of the Legacy Generation Resource Rider of Duke Energy Ohio Final Report” (Report). This Report was filed by the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Staff) on December 17, 2021 under seal. Duke Energy Ohio has now reviewed the Report and sets forth in the attached Memorandum in Support its reasons why confidential treatment of certain information contained in this Report is necessary. For the reasons set forth in the Memorandum in Support, Duke Energy Ohio respectfully requests that the Commission grant this motion and provide confidential treatment as requested.

Respectfully submitted,

DUKE ENERGY OHIO, INC.

/s/ Rocco O. D'Ascenzo

Rocco D'Ascenzo (0077651)

Deputy General Counsel

Jeanne W. Kingery (0012172) (Counsel of Record)

Associate General Counsel

Larisa M. Vaysman (0090290)

Senior Counsel

Duke Energy Business Services LLC

139 East Fourth Street, 1303-Main

Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

(614) 222-1331 (telephone)

(614) 222-1337 (facsimile)

Rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com (e-mail)

Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com (e-mail)

Larisa.vaysman@duke-energy.com (e-mail)

Attorneys for Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

Duke Energy Ohio respectfully requests that the Commission grant its motion for protective order to protect the confidentiality of information contained in the Report.

Duke Energy Ohio is an Ohio corporation with its principal office in Cincinnati, Ohio. Duke Energy Ohio has the corporate power and authority, among others, to engage, and it is engaged, in the business of supplying electric distribution service to customers in the State of Ohio. Accordingly, Duke Energy Ohio is a public utility within the meaning of that term as used in R. C. 4905.02 and 4905.03. As such, Duke Energy Ohio is subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission in the manner and to the extent provided by the laws of the State of Ohio.

Duke Energy Ohio owns, operates, manages and controls plants, properties and equipment used and useful in supplying electric distribution service to over 735,000 customers in southwestern Ohio.

On July 14, 2021, an Entry was issued which directed the Staff to select London Economics International LLC (LEI) as the auditor in order to audit Duke Energy Ohio's Legacy Generation Resource Rider (Rider LGR) application for the period of January 1, 2020 through December 31, 2020. It is the Rider LGR for the period of January 1, 2020 through December 31, 2020 that is the subject matter of the Report. The Report contains confidential trade secret information. Specifically, the Report portrays Duke Energy Ohio's management, including its sensitive business strategy, regarding its interest in the Ohio Valley Electric Corporation (OVEC). Among other things, the report describes the Company's its competitive bidding information, including but not limited to forecasts, offer curves, analysis, OVEC's coal procurement targets and strategy, and discusses internal procedures and procedural documents.

This confidential trade secret information, if publicly disclosed, would give competitive bidders access to competitively sensitive, confidential bidding information, which in turn could work to the detriment of Duke Energy Ohio, its customers and OVEC itself.

Ohio Administrative Code Section 4901-1-24(D) allows Duke Energy Ohio to seek leave of the Commission to file information contained in or attached to the Report that Duke Energy Ohio considers to be proprietary trade secret information, or otherwise confidential, in a redacted and non-redacted form under seal¹ This rule also establishes a procedure for presenting to the Commission that information which is confidential, and therefore should be protected.²

The Staff filed a redacted version of the Report on December 17, 2021. The Staff has also electronically filed the confidential material of the Report under seal. The redacted information contained in the Report constitutes trade secret information in accordance with Ohio's Uniform Trade Secret Act and relevant jurisprudence. Subsection (D) of R.C. 1333.61 defines "trade secret" as follows:

"Trade secret" means information, including the whole or any portion or phase of any scientific or technical information, design, **process, procedure**, formula, pattern, compilation, program, device, method, technique, or improvement, or any business information or plans, financial information, or listing of names, addresses, or telephone numbers, that satisfies both of the following:

- (1) It derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by, other persons who can obtain economic value from its disclosure or use.
- (2) It is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.³

¹ O.A.C. 4901-1-24.

² Id.

³ R.C. 1333.61 (emphasis added).

In analyzing a trade secret claim, the Ohio Supreme Court has adopted the following factors as relevant to determining whether a document constitutes a trade secret:

- (1) The extent to which the information is known outside the business;
- (2) the extent to which it is known to those inside the business, i.e., by the employees;
- (3) the precautions taken by the holder of the trade secret to guard the secrecy of the information;
- (4) the savings effected and the value to the holder in having the information as against competitors;
- (5) the amount of effort or money expended in obtaining and developing the information; and
- (6) the amount of time and expense it would take for others to acquire and duplicate the information.⁴

The confidential material described above, if disclosed, would enable competitors to ascertain the manner in which Duke Energy Ohio plans and manages its Rider LGR compliance efforts and the cost associated therewith. Disclosure of such competitively sensitive information would be detrimental to Duke Energy Ohio.

The information for which Duke Energy Ohio is seeking confidential treatment is not known outside of Duke Energy Ohio, and it is not disseminated within Duke Energy Ohio except to those employees with a legitimate business need to know and act upon the information.

The public interest will be served by granting this motion. By protecting the confidentiality of the Report, the Commission will prevent undue harm to Duke Energy Ohio and its customers, as well as ensuring a sound competitive marketplace.

Duke Energy Ohio considers the Report's confidential material to be proprietary, confidential, and trade secrets, as that term is used in R.C. 1333.61. In addition, this information should be treated as confidential pursuant to R.C. 4901.16. The redacted version of the Report includes the confidential material blacked out for the public.

WHEREFORE, Duke Energy Ohio respectfully requests that the Commission, pursuant to O.A.C. 4901-1-24(D), grant its Motion for Protective Order to protect the confidentiality of

⁴ *State ex rel. Besser v. Ohio State Univ.*, 89 Ohio St. 3d 396, 732 N.E.2d 373 (2000).

information contained in the document titled “Audit of the Legacy Generation Resource Rider of Duke Energy Ohio Final Report” by making a determination that the redacted information is confidential, proprietary, and a trade secret under R.C. 1333.61.

Respectfully submitted,

DUKE ENERGY OHIO, INC.

/s/ Rocco O. D’Ascenzo

Rocco D’Ascenzo (0077651)

Deputy General Counsel

Jeanne W. Kingery (0012172) (Counsel of Record)

Associate General Counsel

Larisa M. Vaysman (0090290)

Senior Counsel

Duke Energy Business Services, LLC

139 East Fourth Street, 1303-Main

Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

(614) 222-1331 (telephone)

(614) 222-1337 (facsimile)

Rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com (e-mail)

Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com (e-mail)

Larisa.vaysman@duke-energy.com (e-mail)

Willing to accept service via email

Attorneys for Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio's e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document on the parties referenced on the service list of the docket card who have electronically subscribed to the case. In addition, the undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing document is also being served via electronic mail on the 17th day of December, 2021, upon the persons listed below.

/s/ Rocco O. D'Ascenzo
Rocco O. D'Ascenzo

Thomas Lindgren
Kyle Kern
Sarah Feldkamp
30 East Broad Street, 16th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Telephone: 614-466-4397
Facsimile: 614-644-8764
Thomas.Lindgren@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
Kyle.Kern@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
Sarah.feldkamp@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

Counsel for Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

William Michael
John Finnigan
Assistant Consumers' Counsel
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
65 East State Street, 7th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4213
Telephone [Michael]: (614) 466-1291
Telephone [Finnigan]: (614) 466-9585
william.michael@occ.ohio.gov
John.finnigan@occ.ohio.gov

Counsel for the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

Robert Dove
Kegler Brown Hill + Ritter Co., L.P.A.
65 E State St.,
Ste. 1800
Columbus, OH 43215-4295
Office: (614) 462-5443
Fax: (614) 464-2634
rdove@keglerbrown.com

Counsel for Sierra Club

Matthew McDonnell (0090164)
(Counsel of Record)
Dickinson Wright PLLC
150 East Gay Street, Suite 2400
Columbus, Ohio 43215
(614) 591-5486
mmcdonnell@dickinsonwright.com

**Counsel for Citizens' Utility Board of Ohio and
the Union of Concerned Scientists**

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities
Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

12/17/2021 4:06:40 PM

in

Case No(s). 21-0477-EL-RDR

Summary: Motion Motion for Protective Order electronically filed by Mrs. Debbie L. Gates on behalf of Duke Energy Ohio Inc. and D'Ascenzo, Rocco O. Mr. and Vaysman, Larisa and Kingery, Jeanne W