

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of                    )  
Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc. for                    )        Case No. 08-0606-GA-AAM  
Authority to Defer Environmental                )  
Investigation and Remediation Costs.        )

---

---

**ANNUAL DEFERRAL REPORT OF  
COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.**

---

---

On May 19, 2008, Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc. (“Columbia”) filed its Application in this docket, requesting authority to defer on its books environmental investigation and remediation costs. By Entry dated September 24, 2008, the Commission approved the Application. Paragraph 11 of said Entry provides:

Prior to their deferral on its books, we require Columbia to make an annual filing in this docket detailing the costs incurred in the prior 12-month period covered by the deferrals and the total amount deferred to date.

Pursuant to Paragraph 11 of the September 24, 2008 Entry, Columbia provides the following information. The costs Columbia incurred for the eight-month period of April 2021 through November 2021,<sup>1</sup> and which Columbia proposes to defer, are \$127,319.26.<sup>2</sup> These costs are comprised of expenses incurred in the continued remediation of sites in Toledo, Fremont, Fostoria, Athens, Portsmouth, Lorain, Elyria, and Columbus, Ohio.<sup>3</sup> Columbia’s projects and costs are described in the following attachments:

---

<sup>1</sup> Columbia currently has a rate case pending in Case No. 21-0637-GA-AIR, et al. In that proceeding, Columbia is requesting recovery of the deferred environmental expenses for the period of January 2008 through March 2021.

<sup>2</sup> All sites have incurred at least \$25,000 of cost which Columbia has recognized as expense and is not including in this deferral.

<sup>3</sup> In previous Annual Reports in this docket, Columbia included Marion, Bellevue, and Grandview Heights/Goodale in the list of projects. Because these three sites have been fully remediated and will no longer incur costs, Columbia has removed these sites from this and future Annual Reports.

- Attachment 1 – Toledo (Swan Creek) project description
- Attachment 2 – Toledo cost detail
- Attachment 3 – Fremont project description
- Attachment 4 – Fremont cost detail
- Attachment 5 – Fostoria (Crocker Street) project description
- Attachment 6 – Fostoria (Crocker Street) cost detail
- Attachment 7 – Athens project description
- Attachment 8 – Athens cost detail
- Attachment 9 – Portsmouth project description
- Attachment 10 – Portsmouth cost detail
- Attachment 11 – Lorain project description
- Attachment 12 – Lorain cost detail
- Attachment 13 – Elyria project description
- Attachment 14 – Elyria cost detail
- Attachment 15 – Columbus I project description
- Attachment 16 – Columbus I cost detail
- Attachment 17 – Columbus II project description
- Attachment 18 – Columbus II cost detail
- Attachment 19 – Fostoria II (Wood Street) project description
- Attachment 20 – Fostoria II (Wood Street) cost detail
- Attachment 21 – Toledo II project description
- Attachment 22 – Toledo II cost detail

Additionally, Columbia has included in this report, as Attachment 23, a schedule showing the amounts deferred by year for all projects, and the total amount deferred to date.

Respectfully submitted by,

**COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.**

/s/ John R. Ryan

John R. Ryan (Counsel of Record)

Joseph M. Clark, Asst. Gen. Counsel  
(0080711)

John R. Ryan, Senior Counsel (0090607)

P.O. Box 117

290 W. Nationwide Blvd.

Columbus, Ohio 43216-0117

Telephone: (614) 285-2220

E-mail: johnryan@nisource.com

josephclark@nisource.com

(Willing to accept service by e-mail)

Attorneys for

**COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.**

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio's e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document on the parties referenced on the service list of the docket card who have electronically subscribed to the case. In addition, the undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing document is also being served via electronic mail on the 10th day of December, 2021 upon the parties listed below.

/s/ John R. Ryan

By: John R. Ryan

**Attorney for  
COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.**

Larry S. Sauer  
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel  
65 East State Street, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-4203  
larry.sauer@occ.ohio.gov

# **ATTACHMENT 1**

## Toledo (Swan Creek)

Description: The former Toledo Gas Light and Coke Company site located at 333 South Erie Street, Toledo, was owned and operated by Columbia as a Service Center until it sold the property and building in March 2011. The site is in the process of being remediated in accordance with Ohio's VAP regulations by the new property owner, River Road Redevelopment H, LLC ("R3II"). While the site was originally entered into the VAP with Columbia as the remedial applicant, after purchasing the property, R3II is now the remedial applicant. The Ohio EPA issued a Covenant Not to Sue for the site on November 10, 2014.

The former MGP property, located at 333 South Erie Street, Toledo, is adjacent to Swan Creek. The indemnification with R3I1 does not cover remediation of Swan Creek. Columbia will manage any sediment investigation and remediation under a future regulatory scenario. Sediments have been subject to a preliminary ecological assessment and limited sampling which indicated some areas of MGP related impacts. The state and federal regulatory agencies have expressed interest in the status of Swan Creek as a tributary to the Maumee River which is an identified Area of Concern under the Federal Great Lakes Legacy Act. There is a documented history of multiple parties discharging to the creek. Additional sediment investigation will be necessary since the extent of impacts and responsibility for those impacts have yet to be determined.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, there were no additional activities performed except the annual cost modeling evaluation.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia during April 2021 through November 2021 were \$2,181.66. Attachment 2 sets forth a detailed description of these expenses incurred during April 2021 through November 2021.

## **ATTACHMENT 2**

## **ATTACHMENT 3**



## Fremont

Description: An MGP operated at the Site from about 1873 to 1904 on two parcels at Justice and Knapp Streets, Fremont, Sandusky County, Ohio. The MGP Property was owned by a predecessor of Columbia from 1863 to 1929. The Holder Property was owned by a predecessor of Columbia from 1901 to 1935. A Phase I Assessment for the site was completed in 2011.

A Phase II assessment was started in 2012 and is ongoing. Columbia has conducted multiple sampling events at the Site between August 2012 and October 2018 including three soil sampling events, two phases of Tar Green Optical Screening Tool ("TarGOST®") investigation to identify and delineate dense non-aqueous phase ("DNAPL") impacts at the Site, multiple groundwater sampling events and multiple vapor/air sampling events.

During the eight-month period ending in November 2021, Columbia met with the property owner to discuss proposed remedial work for 2022 and the Remedial Action Plan and Risk management Plan documents were drafted. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia during April 2021 through November 2021 were \$14,128.19. Attachment 4 sets forth a detailed description of these expenses incurred during April 2021 through November 2021.

## **ATTACHMENT 4**

## **ATTACHMENT 5**

## **Fostoria I (Crocker St.)**

Description: Columbia authorized a history consulting firm to research corporate successors to the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century entities known to have been associated with two former MGPs located in Fostoria, Ohio. Columbia has reviewed its corporate history and has determined it is a successor to entities that owned or operated the former MGP on Crocker Street. Columbia conducted a Phase I Property Assessment at that MGP property in conformance with Ohio's VAP regulations. In addition, Columbia performed a historic evaluation to confirm site ownership, past operating practices and availability of historic information to aid in site evaluation.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, an environmental restrictive covenant (ERC) was presented to the current property owner and was recorded in 2021 with No Further Action documentation by the VAP Certified Professional. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia during April 2021 through November 2021 were \$17,653.42. Attachment 6 sets forth a detailed description of these expenses incurred during April 2021 through November 2021.

## **ATTACHMENT 6**

## **ATTACHMENT 7**

## Athens

Description: The former Athens MGP (The Athens Gas Light Company and The Athens Gas Light and Electric Company) operated from about 1872 until about 1898. Historic Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps indicated the MGP structures included two gas holders, retort and purification buildings, and materials storage. Columbia has reviewed its corporate history and has determined that it is a successor to entities that owned and/or operated the Athens MGP.

During the eight-month period ending in November 2021, Columbia conducted additional groundwater sampling event in early 2021. The Remedial Alternatives Evaluation was completed in 2021. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia during April 2021 through November 2021 were \$51,742.24. Attachment 8 sets forth a detailed description of these expenses incurred during April 2021 through November 2021.

## **ATTACHMENT 8**



## **ATTACHMENT 9**

## **Portsmouth**

Description: The former Portsmouth MGP operated in the vicinity of West Second, Madison and Jefferson Streets in Portsmouth between 1884 and 1905. Historical Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps indicated that MGP structures included three gas holders, retort and purifications buildings and materials storage. Columbia has reviewed its corporate history and has determined it is a successor to entities that owned and operated the MGP.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, the No Further Action (NFA) documentation by the VAP Certified Professional was completed. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia during April 2021 through November 2021 were \$4,382.59. Attachment 10 sets forth a detailed description of these expenses incurred during April 2021 through November 2021.

## **ATTACHMENT 10**

## **ATTACHMENT 11**

## Lorain

Description: Columbia authorized a history consultant firm to research corporate successors to the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century entities known to have been associated with the former MGP Site located in Lorain, Ohio. In addition, Columbia asked that this review include a confirmation of site ownership, past operating practices, and available historic information to aid in future site evaluation. Columbia has reviewed its corporate history and has determined that it is a successor to entities that owned and/or operated the Lorain MGP.

During the eight-month period ending in November 2021, Columbia continued to pursue access to conduct investigations consistent with Ohio VAP. Access has not been granted. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia during April 2021 through November 2021 were \$2,351.74. Attachment 12 sets forth a detailed description of these expenses incurred during April 2021 through November 2021.

## **ATTACHMENT 12**

## **ATTACHMENT 13**

## Elyria

Description: The former Elyria MGP operated from 1878 to 1902 on Maple Street (renamed Locust Street) in Elyria, Ohio, on property that was subsequently used by others for solvent recovery operations and which is now designated as a Superfund site. Companies that contributed used solvents in those operations and are now working to remediate the site under the direction of U.S. EPA (“USEPA”) and Ohio EPA. Columbia has reviewed its corporate history and has determined it is a successor to an entity that owned and operated the MGP.

The Elyria MGP occupied a property with a long history of commercial and industrial uses which started with the MGP (for over 20 years) and ended with solvent recovery operations (also for over 20 years), but also included the other industrial uses summarized below for relatively brief periods:

- I.T.S Rubber Company for shoe manufacturing (rubber heels of shoes);
- Standard Oil facility;
- Sinclair refining facility;
- Coal Yard;
- Concrete Facility;
- Heat and Stove Facility;
- Machine shop;
- Foundry; and
- Ice company.

The waste solvent reclamation activities at the site were operated by Obitts Chemical Company (1960 to 1974) and then Chemical Recovery Systems (“CRS”) (1974 to 1982). These facilities processed petroleum solvents, chlorinated solvents, and related petroleum wastes and marketed them for reuse. USEPA filed a lawsuit against CRS in 1981, requiring the owners to abate environmental issues that had been identified at the site. CRS completed a limited soils removal effort under USEPA Order and then filed for bankruptcy in 1982.

USEPA subsequently ordered CRS to conduct additional environmental remediation in 1983 that included additional soil excavation and erection of a site security fence. In the 1980’s little happened at the fence site. Ohio EPA, USEPA and other agencies conducted assessments of site conditions during the 1990s and ultimately added the site to the Superfund list and negotiated an Administrative Order with a number of potentially responsible parties (“PRPs” or “Settling Parties”) that had contracted historically with the former CRS to dispose of or recycle spent solvents in 2002. Since 2002, these Settling Parties have conducted remedial



investigation and reviewed remedial options for the site in a Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act (“CERCLA”)-type program with USEPA and Ohio EPA oversight.<sup>4</sup>

Studies completed by the Settling Parties identified impacts that resembled those from former MGP operations mixed with their solvent reclamation releases. A historic evaluation was conducted in which they identified Columbia as a successor to the MGP operator. They contacted Columbia and asked that Columbia become a participating member of the Settling Parties cleaning up the site.

The contamination identified at the site has impacted ground water in fractured bedrock beneath the site, and thus remediation to traditional USEPA clean-up standards was not considered to be possible within a 30 year time frame. The Settling Parties proposed a technical impracticability (“TI”) waiver for site cleanup, which would allow contaminants under the site to remain without removal (at a substantially lower cost). USEPA has requested further investigation before it will decide whether to grant the requested TI waiver. That investigation work is expected to continue through 2020 and perhaps beyond.

In October of 2018, the USEPA issued Columbia a General Notice Letter for the CRS Site indicating that it may be responsible under CERCLA, USEPA encouraged Columbia to communicate/work with the PRPs conducting work at the site.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, Columbia continued negotiation of a USEPA Removal Order to allow work to complete an investigation of the former manufactured gas plant facilities. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized. It is anticipated the Order and Field Sampling Plan finalized in early 2022 to allow the investigation of the MGP to be implemented in 2022.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia during April 2021 through November 2021 were \$19,682.30. Attachment 14 sets forth a detailed description of these expenses incurred during April 2021 through November 2021.

---

<sup>4</sup> CERCLA is commonly known as the federal Superfund Law for clean up at the site.

## **ATTACHMENT 14**

## **ATTACHMENT 15**

## **Columbus I**

Description: The former Columbus I manufactured gas plant operated from 1846 to 1904 on property bounded by West Spring, North Front, West Long and Marconi Streets in downtown Columbus. The western 50% of the parcel was formerly used for parking, however this property was recently purchased and the parking garage closed and demolished. Redevelopment of this parcel is planned, but the schedule is unknown. The northeast quarter of the property is occupied by the Bureau of Workers Compensation and the southeast quarter is the Michael B. Coleman Governmental Center.

Columbia authorized a history consultant firm to research corporate successors to the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century entities known to have been associated with the former MGP Site located in Columbus, Ohio. Columbia confirmed site ownership, past operating practices, and available historic information to aid in future site evaluation. Columbia reviewed its corporate history and has determined that it is a successor to entities that owned and/or operated the Columbus I MGP.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, there were no additional activities performed except for finalizing the site cost model.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia during April 2021 through November 2021 were \$1,339.25. Attachment 16 sets forth a detailed description of these expenses incurred during April 2021 through November 2021.

## **ATTACHMENT 16**

## **ATTACHMENT 17**

## **Columbus II**

Description: The former Columbus II manufactured gas plant operated from 1846 to 1901 on property located near I-670 and Goodale Street in downtown Columbus, Ohio.

Columbia engaged a history consultant firm to research corporate successors to the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century entities known to have been associated with the former MGP Site. Columbia confirmed site ownership, reviewed past operating practices, and reviewed available historic information to aid in future site evaluation. Columbia reviewed its corporate history and determined that it is a successor to entities that owned and/or operated the Columbus II MGP.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, there were no additional activities performed except for finalizing the site cost model.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia during April 2021 through November 2021 were \$1,339.25. Attachment 18 sets forth a detailed description of these expenses incurred during April 2021 through November 2021.

## **ATTACHMENT 18**



## **ATTACHMENT 19**

## **Fostoria II (Wood Street)**

Description: The former Fostoria II manufactured gas plant operated from approximately 1887 to 1901 on property located at 209 N. Wood Street in downtown Fostoria, Ohio. Columbia authorized a history consultant firm to research corporate successors to the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century entities known to have been associated with the former MGP Site. In addition, Columbia asked that this review include a confirmation of site ownership, past operating practices, and available historic information to aid in future site evaluation. Columbia determined it is a successor to entities that owned and/or operated the Fostoria II MGP.

Columbia began the process of conducting a Phase I and II project assessment in conformance with Ohio's VAP.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, Columbia began negotiating access with the current owner(s) of the former MGP parcel prior to the completion of a Phase I. Also, the annual cost modeling report was finalized.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia during April 2021 through November 2021 were \$11,179.38. Attachment 20 sets forth a detailed description of these expenses incurred during April 2021 through November 2021.

**ATTACHMENT 20**

## **ATTACHMENT 21**

## Toledo II

Description: The former Toledo II MGP operated in the vicinity of West Central Avenue and Interstate 75 in Toledo, Lucas County, Ohio. The site is currently owned by the City of Toledo, and occupied by the Division of Streets, Bridges and Harbor.

The former MGP operated on the site from 1918 to 1945 under the Atlas Chemical Company (1918-1928) and the Ohio Fuel Gas Company (1928-1945). Both Atlas Chemical and the Ohio Fuel Gas companies were, ultimately, subsidiaries of Columbia, confirming that Columbia Gas is a successor to entities that owned and/or operated the Toledo II MGP.

The Ohio Fuel Gas Company abandoned operations at the Central Avenue plant in 1945 and eventually sold the property in 1951. Ownership of the property changed several times between 1951 and 1973 when purchased by the City of Toledo. According to Sanborn Insurance Fire Maps, the various former MGP structures were razed by the different owners during the period of 1952-1976.

During the eight-month period ending November 2021, there were no additional activities performed except for finalizing of the annual site cost model.

Total Project Costs to Date: Total costs incurred by Columbia during April 2021 through November 2021 were \$1,339.24. Attachment 22 sets forth a detailed description of these expenses incurred during April 2021 through November 2021.

**ATTACHMENT 22**

**ATTACHMENT 23**

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities  
Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**12/10/2021 12:52:40 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 08-0606-GA-AAM**

Summary: Annual Report of Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc. electronically filed by Ms.  
Melissa L. Thompson on behalf of Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc.