

In the Matter of the 2014 Review of the Demand Side Management and Energy Efficiency Rider of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company.	)	Case No. 13-2173-EL-RDR
In the Matter of the 2015 Review of the Demand Side Management and Energy Efficiency Rider of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company.	)	Case No. 14-1947-EL-RDR
In the Matter of the 2016 Review of the Demand Side Management and Energy Efficiency Rider of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company.	)	Case No. 15-1843-EL-RDR
In the Matter of the 2017 Review of the Demand Side Management and Energy Efficiency Rider of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company.	)	Case No. 16-2167-EL-RDR
In the Matter of the 2018 Review of the Demand Side Management and Energy Efficiency Rider of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company.	)	Case No. 17-2277-EL-RDR
In the Matter of the Determination of the Existence of Significantly Excessive Earnings for 2017 Under the Electric Security Plan of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company.	)	Case No. 18-857-EL-UNC
In the Matter of the Determination of the Existence of Significantly Excessive Earnings for 2018 Under the Electric Security Plan of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company.	)	Case No. 19-1338-EL-UNC

In the Matter of the Determination of the	)	
Existence of Significantly Excessive Earnings	)	Case No. 20-1034-EL-UNC
for 2019 Under the Electric Security Plan of	)	
Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric	)	
Illuminating Company, and The Toledo	)	
Edison Company.	)	
In the Matter of the Quadrennial Review	)	
Required by R.C. 4928.143(E) for the Electric	)	Case No. 20-1476-EL-UNC
Security Plan of Ohio Edison Company, The	)	
Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and	)	
The Toledo Edison Company.	)	
In the Matter of the Determination of the	)	
Existence of Significantly Excessive Earnings	)	
for 2020 under the Electric Security Plan of	)	Case No. 21-0586-EL-UNC
Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric	)	
Illuminating Company, and The Toledo	)	
Edison Company	)	
In the Matter of the Application of Ohio	)	
Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric	)	Case No. 21-1127-EL-ATA
Illuminating Company, and The Toledo	)	
Edison Company for Approval of a Tariff	)	
Change	)	

---

### MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE

---

Pursuant to Rule 4901-1-02(A)(6) and Rule 4901-1-12, Ohio Administrative Code (“O.A.C.”), Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company (collectively, the “Companies”) move the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Commission”) for an order consolidating the above-captioned matters into a single proceeding for purposes of considering the adoption and approval of the Stipulation and Recommendation – signed by Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Staff”), the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel, Ohio Energy Group, Industrial Energy Users-Ohio, The Kroger Co., Nucor Steel Marion, Inc., Ohio Manufacturers’ Association Energy Group, Ohio Partners for

Affordable Energy, Ohio Hospital Association, Northeast Ohio Public Energy Council, Interstate Gas Supply, Inc., and the Companies (collectively, the “Signatory Parties”) – that resolves all contested issues in the above-captioned proceedings.

As set forth more fully in the Memorandum in Support, consolidating these proceedings will avoid duplication, conserve the resources of the parties and the Commission, achieve additional process and administrative efficiencies, and recognize the common and interrelated nature of the cases at issue. Additionally, the Companies request that the intervening parties in the above-captioned cases be joined as parties in all dockets. As set forth in the Stipulation, the Signatory Parties agree the above-captioned proceedings should be consolidated.

For the foregoing reasons and those set forth in the Memorandum in Support, the Companies respectfully request that the Commission grant this Motion and consolidate the above-captioned cases into a single proceeding and grant party status to all intervening parties in the above-captioned cases.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ N. Trevor Alexander

Brian J. Knipe (0090299)  
FirstEnergy Service Company  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, OH 44308  
(330) 384-5795  
bknipe@firstenergycorp.com

N. TREVOR ALEXANDER (0080713)  
MARK T. KEANEY (0095318)  
BENESCH, FRIEDLANDER, COPLAN &  
ARONOFF LLP  
41 S. High St.  
2600 Huntington Center  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Telephone: (614) 223-9363  
Fax: (614) 223-9330  
talexander@beneschlaw.com  
mkeaney@beneschlaw.com

*Attorneys for Ohio Edison Company, The  
Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company,  
and The Toledo Edison Company*

In the Matter of the 2014 Review of the Demand Side Management and Energy Efficiency Rider of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company.	)	)	Case No. 13-2173-EL-RDR
In the Matter of the 2015 Review of the Demand Side Management and Energy Efficiency Rider of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company.	)	)	Case No. 14-1947-EL-RDR
In the Matter of the 2016 Review of the Demand Side Management and Energy Efficiency Rider of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company.	)	)	Case No. 15-1843-EL-RDR
In the Matter of the 2017 Review of the Demand Side Management and Energy Efficiency Rider of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company.	)	)	Case No. 16-2167-EL-RDR
In the Matter of the 2018 Review of the Demand Side Management and Energy Efficiency Rider of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company.	)	)	Case No. 17-2277-EL-RDR
In the Matter of the Determination of the Existence of Significantly Excessive Earnings for 2017 Under the Electric Security Plan of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company.	)	)	Case No. 18-857-EL-UNC
In the Matter of the Determination of the Existence of Significantly Excessive Earnings for 2018 Under the Electric Security Plan of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company.	)	)	Case No. 19-1338-EL-UNC

In the Matter of the Determination of the	)	
Existence of Significantly Excessive Earnings	)	Case No. 20-1034-EL-UNC
for 2019 Under the Electric Security Plan of	)	
Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric	)	
Illuminating Company, and The Toledo	)	
Edison Company.	)	
In the Matter of the Quadrennial Review	)	
Required by R.C. 4928.143(E) for the Electric	)	Case No. 20-1476-EL-UNC
Security Plan of Ohio Edison Company, The	)	
Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and	)	
The Toledo Edison Company.	)	
In the Matter of the Determination of the	)	
Existence of Significantly Excessive Earnings	)	
for 2020 under the Electric Security Plan of	)	Case No. 21-0586-EL-UNC
Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric	)	
Illuminating Company, and The Toledo	)	
Edison Company	)	
In the Matter of the Application of Ohio	)	
Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric	)	Case No. 21-1127-EL-ATA
Illuminating Company, and The Toledo	)	
Edison Company for Approval of a Tariff	)	
Change	)	

---

### MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

---

The Companies move the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Commission”) for an order consolidating the above-captioned cases into a single proceeding to review and approve the Stipulation that resolves all outstanding issues in each of the above-captioned dockets. The common and interrelated issue in the above-captioned proceedings concerns the Stipulation, which resolves numerous contested issues and cases, including the Companies’ pending significantly excessive earnings test (“SEET”) proceedings under Section 4928.143(F) for calendar years 2017 through 2020, the Companies’ quadrennial review of ESP IV required by Section 4928.143(E), and issues related to annual audits of the Companies’ Demand Side Management and Energy

Efficiency Rider (“Rider DSE”) for calendar years 2014 through 2018. By considering these cases together, the Commission will avoid duplication, conserve the resources of the parties and the Commission, and achieve additional process and administrative efficiencies so that consumers realize savings associated with the Stipulation. As a related matter, the Companies request that the intervening parties in the above-captioned cases be joined as parties in all dockets.

On November 1, 2021, Staff, the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel, Ohio Energy Group, Industrial Energy Users-Ohio, The Kroger Co., Nucor Steel Marion, Inc., Ohio Manufacturers’ Association Energy Group, Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy, Ohio Hospital Association, Northeast Ohio Public Energy Council, Interstate Gas Supply, Inc., and the Companies (collectively, the “Signatory Parties”) signed the Stipulation, which resolves all issues raised in the above-captioned proceedings. Specifically, the Stipulation provides for the Companies to provide significant benefits to all consumers, through refunds and future rate reductions. Given that the Stipulation will resolve all contested issues raised in the above-captioned proceedings, the Commission should consolidate the dockets. Consolidation will streamline and ensure an expeditious process to consider the terms of the Stipulation, by preventing the duplication of efforts across eleven (11) individual dockets. Consequently, consolidation will conserve the resources of the Commission and the parties.

As set forth in the Stipulation, the Signatory Parties agree the above-captioned proceedings should be consolidated. The Companies also respectfully request that all parties that have been granted intervention in any of the above-captioned cases be deemed to have intervened as parties of record in the single consolidated proceeding. In so doing, the Commission will ensure consolidation does not prejudice any party, while also avoiding potentially duplicative motions to

intervene. In short, the consolidation of the cases will benefit all parties (including the Commission) and prejudice none.

In conclusion, the Companies respectfully request that the Commission enter an order consolidating the above-captioned proceedings into a single proceeding for purposes of considering the Stipulation, which resolves all contested issues raised in each of the eleven individual dockets. Additionally, the Companies request that the intervening parties in the above-captioned cases be joined as parties in all dockets to ensure no party is prejudiced by consolidation.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ N. Trevor Alexander

Brian J. Knipe (0090299)  
FirstEnergy Service Company  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, OH 44308  
(330) 384-5795  
bknipe@firstenergycorp.com

N. TREVOR ALEXANDER (0080713)  
MARK T. KEANEY (0095318)  
BENESCH, FRIEDLANDER, COPLAN &  
ARONOFF LLP  
41 S. High St.  
2600 Huntington Center  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Telephone: (614) 223-9363  
Fax: (614) 223-9330  
talexander@beneschlaw.com  
mkeaney@beneschlaw.com

*Attorneys for Ohio Edison Company, The  
Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company,  
and The Toledo Edison Company*



**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that the foregoing Motion to Consolidate and Memorandum in Support was filed electronically through the Docketing Information System of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio on this 1st day of November, 2021. The Commission's e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document on counsel for all parties.

/s/ Mark T. Keaney  
One of the Attorneys for Ohio Edison  
Company, The Cleveland Electric  
Illuminating Company, and The Toledo  
Edison Company

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities  
Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**11/2/2021 9:47:22 AM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 13-2173-EL-RDR, 14-1947-EL-RDR, 15-1843-EL-RDR, 16-2167-EL-RDR, 17-2277-EL-RDR, 18-0857-EL-UNC, 19-1338-EL-UNC, 20-1034-EL-UNC, 20-1476-EL-UNC, 21-0586-EL-UNC, 21-1127-EL-ATA**

Summary: Motion Motion to Consolidate electronically filed by Mark T. Keaney on behalf of Ohio Edison Company and The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company