

BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Its Plan to Modernize Its Distribution Grid	:	CASE NO. 18-1875-EL-GRD
	:	
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of a Limited Waiver of Ohio Adm.Code 4901:1-18-06(A)(2)	:	CASE NO. 18-1876-EL-WVR
	:	
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Methods	:	CASE NO. 18-1877-EL-AAM
	:	
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Administration of the Significantly Excessive Earnings Test Under R.C. 4928.143(F) and Ohio Adm.Code 4901:1-35-10 for 2018	:	CASE NO. 19-1121-EL-UNC
	:	
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Administration of the Significantly Excessive Earnings Test Under R.C. 4928.143(F) and Ohio Adm.Code 4901:1-35-10 for 2019	:	CASE NO. 20-1041-EL-UNC
	:	
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for a Finding That Its Current Electric Security Plan Passes the Significantly Excessive Earnings Test and More Favorable in the Aggregate Test in R.C. 4928.143(E)	:	CASE NO. 20-0680-EL-UNC
	:	

---

**THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY'S  
MOTION FOR A PROTECTIVE ORDER RELATING TO  
CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION CITED IN ITS POST-HEARING REPLY BRIEF**

---

Pursuant to Ohio Adm.Code 4901-1-24(D), The Dayton Power and Light Company ("DP&L") moves for the entry of a Protective Order to exempt from public disclosure

certain information that is confidential, proprietary, and competitively sensitive trade secret information. R.C. 1333.61(D). The information at issue is Confidential Information relating to financial projections and data contained in the Post-Hearing Reply Brief of The Dayton Power and Light Company, which cites and quotes confidential material from the April 1, 2020 Direct Testimony of Gustavo Garavaglia M. and the April 1, 2020 Direct Testimony of R. Jeffrey Malinak in Case No. 20-0680-EL-UNC.

As shown in the February 12, 2021 The Dayton Power and Light Company's Motion for a Protective Order Relating to Confidential Information Cited in Its Initial Post-Hearing Brief and the November 19, 2020 Motion of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Entry of a Protective Order Relating to Confidential Information Cited in the Direct Testimony of Matthew I. Kahal in Case No. 20-680-EL-UNC concerning much of the same Confidential Information, the Confidential Information is maintained as confidential by DP&L and constitutes proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret material, the public disclosure of which would subject DP&L to an unfair competitive disadvantage. The November 19, 2020 Motion was supported by evidence and was granted at the evidentiary hearing in this proceeding. Tr. Vol. I, pp. 20-21.

Pursuant to the April 8, 2020 and September 9, 2020 Entries in In re the Proper Procedures and Process for the Commission's Operations and Proceedings During the Declared State of Emergency and Related Matters, Case No. 20-591-AU-UNC, an unredacted copy of the Post-Hearing Reply Brief will be filed with the Commission electronically under seal in Case No. 20-2000-XX-XXX.

If this Motion is opposed, then DP&L reserves the right to submit additional evidence in support. DP&L will further produce an unredacted copy of the Post-Hearing Reply Brief to any party who enters into a protective agreement with DP&L in this proceeding.

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Michael J. Schuler

---

Michael J. Schuler (082390)  
THE DAYTON POWER AND  
LIGHT COMPANY  
1065 Woodman Drive  
Dayton, OH 45432  
Telephone: (937) 259-7358  
Telecopier: (937) 259-7178  
Email: michael.schuler@aes.com

s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey

---

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)  
(Counsel of Record)  
D. Jeffrey Ireland (0010443)  
Christopher C. Hollon (0086480)  
FARUKI PLL  
110 North Main Street, Suite 1600  
Dayton, OH 45402  
Telephone: (937) 227-3747  
Fax: (937) 227-3717  
Email: jsharkey@ficlaw.com  
djireland@ficlaw.com  
chollon@ficlaw.com

*Counsel for The Dayton Power  
and Light Company*

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT  
COMPANY'S MOTION FOR A PROTECTIVE ORDER RELATING TO  
CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION CITED IN ITS POST-HEARING REPLY BRIEF**

Pursuant to Ohio Adm.Code 4901-1-24(D), DP&L moves for the entry of a Protective Order to exempt from public disclosure certain information as confidential, proprietary, and competitively sensitive trade secret information. Specifically, DP&L requests that certain confidential information relating to financial projections and data contained in the Post-Hearing Reply Brief of The Dayton Power and Light Company, which cites and quotes confidential material from the April 1, 2020 Direct Testimony of Gustavo Garavaglia M. and the April 1, 2020 Direct Testimony of R. Jeffrey Malinak in Case No. 20-680-EL-UNC, be exempt from public disclosure as confidential, proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret information ("Confidential Information"). The Confidential Information was originally filed with the Commission pursuant to The Dayton Power and Light Company's Motion for Protective Order Relating to the Direct Testimony of Gustavo Garavaglia M. and R. Jeffrey Malinak, filed April 1, 2020, and much of it was addressed in the November 19, 2020 Motion of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Entry of a Protective Order Relating to Confidential Information Cited in the Direct Testimony of Matthew I. Kahal in Case No. 20-680-EL-UNC, which the Commission granted. Tr. Vol. I, pp. 20-21.

Section 4901-1-24(D) of the Ohio Administrative Code provides that the Commission may issue an order that is necessary to protect the confidentiality of information contained in documents filed with the Commission's Docketing Division to the extent that state or federal law prohibits the release of the information, and where non-disclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code. Accord: R.C. 4905.07 (providing that "[e]xcept as provided in section 149.43 of the Revised Code and as

consistent with the purposes of Title XLIX [49] of the Revised Code, all facts and information in the possession of the public utilities commission shall be public").

The release of trade secret information by the Commission is prohibited by state law. In re The Dayton Power and Light Co., Case No. 10-2205-EL-EEC, Finding and Order (Dec. 7, 2011), 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1313, at \*6 ("Section 149.43, Revised Code, specifies that the term 'public records' excludes information which, under state or federal law, may not be released. The Ohio Supreme Court has clarified that the 'state or federal law' exemption is intended to cover trade secrets.") (citing State ex rel. Besser v. Ohio State Univ., 89 Ohio St.3d 396, 399, 732 N.E.2d 373 (2000)). The definition of a "trade secret" includes "any business information or plans [and] financial information." R.C. 1333.61(D).

"A company's determination of its costs, overhead and volume of sales, and particularly its calculation of profit margins on customers' purchases may be the kind of information that the trade secret statute seeks to protect." Kenker Box Co. v. Riemeier Lumber Co., 1st Dist. Hamilton Nos. C-990803 and C-990824, 2000 Ohio App. LEXIS 6198, at \*10 (Dec. 29, 2000). Accord: Alpha Benefits Agency, Inc. v. King Ins. Agency, Inc., 134 Ohio App. 3d 673, 683, 731 N.E.2d 1209 (8th Dist.1999) (holding that trial court should have ordered plaintiff to produce its "profitability information" to defendant subject to a protective order); Vanguard Transp. Sys. v. Edwards Transfer & Storage Co. Gen. Commodities Div., 109 Ohio App. 3d 786, 789-90, 673 N.E.2d 182 (10th Dist.1996) (affirming trial court order that held that various information including "corporate financial information" constituted a trade secret).

This definition reflects state policy favoring the protection of trade secrets such as the information that is the subject of this Motion. The Commission has issued protective orders

in numerous prior proceedings to prevent the public disclosure of trade secrets, e.g., In re Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., Case No. 17-32-EL-AIR, et al., Opinion and Order (Dec. 19, 2018) at ¶¶ 161-163, 2018 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1268 ("we note that the Commission has previously granted protective treatment for portions of briefs filed under seal and testimony containing sensitive data, including information that appears to matters relating to competitive business information"); In re Midwest Utility Consultants, Inc., Case No. 09-893-GA-AGG, Entry (Jan. 30, 2012), 2012 Ohio PUC LEXIS 103 (forecasted financial statements were trade secrets and granted protective treatment); In re Ohio Power Co., Case No. 10-2376-EL-UNC, et al., Opinion and Order (Dec. 14, 2011), 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1325, at \*22-23 (forecasted fuel expenditures were trade secrets and granted protective treatment); In re Dayton Power and Light Co., Case No. 10-2205-EL-EEC, Finding and Order (Dec. 7, 2011), 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1313, at \*2-5 (release of trade secrets prohibited by state law). Accord: Ohio Consumers' Counsel v. Pub. Util. Comm., 121 Ohio St.3d 362, 2009-Ohio-604, 904 N.E.2d 853, ¶ 8.

Here, the Confidential Information constitutes "business information or plans, [and] financial information" that is confidential, proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret information, and derives independent economic value from not being publicly available. R.C. 1333.61(D). Accord: Plain Dealer v. Ohio Dept. of Ins., 80 Ohio St.3d 513, 687 N.E.2d 661 (1997). DP&L maintains the Confidential Information subject to reasonable efforts to keep its secrecy, and the Confidential Information derives independent economic value from not being generally known to others persons who could obtain economic value from its disclosure or use. Nov. 19, 2020 Motion of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Entry of a Protective Order Relating to Confidential Information Cited in the Direct Testimony of Matthew I. Kahal (citing

Nov. 19, 2020 Affidavit of Karin Nyhuis). The Commission (and its Staff) will have full access to the Confidential Information in order to fulfill its statutory obligations.

For these foregoing reasons, DP&L requests that the Commission issue a Protective Order that permits the Confidential Information to be designated as confidential and to remain under seal.

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Michael J. Schuler

Michael J. Schuler (082390)  
THE DAYTON POWER AND  
LIGHT COMPANY  
1065 Woodman Drive  
Dayton, OH 45432  
Telephone: (937) 259-7358  
Telecopier: (937) 259-7178  
Email: michael.schuler@aes.com

s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)  
(Counsel of Record)  
D. Jeffrey Ireland (0010443)  
Christopher C. Hollon (0086480)  
FARUKI PLL  
110 North Main Street, Suite 1600  
Dayton, OH 45402  
Telephone: (937) 227-3747  
Fax: (937) 227-3717  
Email: jsharkey@ficlaw.com  
djireland@ficlaw.com  
chollon@ficlaw.com

*Counsel for The Dayton Power  
and Light Company*

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that a copy of the foregoing The Dayton Power and Light Company's Motion for a Protective Order Relating to Confidential Information Cited in Its Post-Hearing Reply Brief has been served via electronic mail upon the following counsel of record, this 5th day of March, 2021:

Steven L. Beeler  
Robert A. Eubanks  
Thomas G. Lindgren  
OFFICE OF THE  
OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL  
PUBLIC UTILITIES SECTION  
30 East Broad Street, 16th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
steven.beeler@ohioattorneygeneral.gov  
robert.eubanks@ohioattorneygeneral.gov  
thomas.lindgren@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Staff of the  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio*

Matthew R. Pritchard  
Todd J. Long  
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC  
21 E. State Street, 17th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
mritchard@mcneeslaw.com  
tlong@mcneeslaw.com

*Counsel for Industrial Energy Users - Ohio*

Christopher Healey  
William J. Michael  
Amy Botschner O'Brien  
Angela O'Brien  
OFFICE OF THE  
OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL  
65 East State Street, 7th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
christopher.healey@occ.ohio.gov  
william.michael@occ.ohio.gov  
amy.botschner.obrien@occ.ohio.gov  
angela.obrien@occ.ohio.gov

Michael D. Dortch  
Justin M. Dortch  
KRAVITZ, BROWN & DORTCH, LLC  
64 E. State Street, Suite 200  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
mdortch@kravitzllc.com  
jdortch@kravitzllc.com

*Counsel for Office of the  
Ohio Consumers' Counsel*

Kimberly W. Bojko  
Jonathan Wygonski  
CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP  
280 North High Street, Suite 1300  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Bojko@carpenterlipps.com  
Wygonski@carpenterlipps.com

*Counsel for Ohio Manufacturers'  
Association Energy Group*



Steven D. Lesser  
N. Trevor Alexander  
Mark T. Keaney  
Kari D. Hehmeyer  
BENESCH, FRIEDLANDER,  
COPLAN & ARONOFF LLP  
41 South High Street, Suite 2600  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-6164  
slesser@benschlaw.com  
talexander@benschlaw.com  
mkeaney@benschlaw.com  
khehmeyer@benschlaw.com

*Counsel for the City of Dayton and  
Honda of America Mfg., Inc.*

Angela Paul Whitfield  
CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP  
280 North High Street, Suite 1300  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

*Counsel for The Kroger Co.*

Christine M.T. Pirik  
Madeline Fleisher  
DICKINSON WRIGHT PLLC  
150 East Gay Street, Suite 2400  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
cpirik@dickinsonwright.com  
mfleisher@dickinsonwright.com

*Counsel for Mission: data Coalition*

Michael L. Kurtz  
Kurt J. Boehm  
Jody Kyler Cohn  
BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY  
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202  
mkurtz@BKLLawfirm.com  
kboehm@BKLLawfirm.com  
jkylercohn@BKLLawfirm.com

*Counsel for Ohio Energy Group*

Stephanie M. Chmiel  
Kevin D. Oles  
THOMPSON HINE LLP  
41 South High Street, Suite 1700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Stephanie.Chmiel@ThompsonHine.com  
Kevin.Oles@ThompsonHine.com

*Counsel for University of Dayton*

David C. Rinebolt  
OHIO PARTNERS FOR  
AFFORDABLE ENERGY  
P.O. Box 1793  
Findlay, Ohio 45839

*Counsel for Ohio Partners  
for Affordable Energy*

Devin D. Parram  
Dane Stinson  
Jhay T. Spottswood  
BRICKER& ECKLER LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291  
dparram@bricker.com  
dstinson@bricker.com  
Jspottswood@bricker.com

*Counsel for The Ohio Hospital  
Association*

Madeline Fleisher  
Christine M.T. Pirik  
William Vorys  
DICKINSON WRIGHT PLLC  
150 East Gay Street, Suite 2400  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
mfleisher@dicksoninwright.com  
cpirik@dicksonwright.com  
wvorys@dicksonwright.com

*Counsel for Smart Thermostat Coalition*

Caroline Cox  
ENVIRONMENTAL LAW & POLICY CENTER  
21 W. Broad Street, Suite 800  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
ccox@elpc.org

Nikhil Vijaykar  
ENVIRONMENTAL LAW & POLICY CENTER  
35 E. Wacker Dr., Suite 1600  
Chicago, Illinois 60601  
nvijaykar@elpc.org

*Counsel for Environmental  
Law & Policy Center*

Robert Dove  
KEGLER BROWN HILL + RITTER Co. L.P.A.  
65 East State Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
rdove@keglerbrown.com

*Counsel for Natural Resources  
Defense Council*

Joseph Halso  
SIERRA CLUB  
ENVIRONMENTAL LAW PROGRAM  
1536 Wynkoop Street  
Denver, Colorado 80202  
joe.halso@sierraclub.org  
Richard C. Sahli  
RICHARD SAHLI LAW OFFICE, LLC  
981 Pinewood Lane  
Columbus, Ohio 43230  
rsahli@columbus.rr.com

*Counsel for Sierra Club*

Miranda Leppla  
Trent Dougherty  
Chris Tavenor  
1145 Chesapeake Avenue, Suite I  
Columbus, Ohio 43212  
mleppla@theocc.org  
tdougherty@theocc.org  
ctavenor@theocc.org

*Counsel for Ohio Environmental Council*

Dylan F. Borchers  
Kara H. Hernstein  
Jhay T, Spottswood  
BRICKER& ECKLER LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
dborchers@bricker.com  
khernstein@bricker.com  
jspottswood@bricker.com

*Counsel for Chargepoint, Inc.*

Bethany Allen  
Joseph Olikier  
Michael Nugent  
IGS ENERGY  
6100 Emerald Parkway  
Dublin, Ohio 43016  
bethany.allen@igs.com  
joe.oliker@igs.com  
michael.nugent@igs.com

Frank P. Darr  
6800 Linbrook Boulevard  
Columbus, Ohio 43235  
fdarr2019@gmail.com

*Counsel for Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.*

Michael J. Settineri  
Gretchen L. Petrucci  
VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE LLP  
52 East Gay Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
mjsettineri@vorys.com  
glpetrucci@vorys.com

Drew Romig  
Armada Power LLC  
230 West Street, Suite 150  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
dromig@armadapower.com

*Counsel for Armada Power, LLC*

Mark A. Whitt  
Lucas A. Fykes  
WHITT STURTEVANT LLP  
88 E. Broad Street, Suite 1590  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com  
fykes@whitt0sturtevant.com

*Counsel for Direct Energy, LP*

s/ Christopher C. Hollon  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Christopher C. Hollon

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**3/5/2021 4:31:49 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 18-1875-EL-GRD, 18-1876-EL-WVR, 18-1877-EL-AAM, 19-1121-EL-UNC, 20-1041-EL-UNC**

Summary: Motion The Dayton Power and Light Company's Motion for a Protective Order Relating to Confidential Information Cited in Its Post-Hearing Reply Brief electronically filed by Mr. Jeffrey S Sharkey on behalf of The Dayton Power and Light Company