

In the Matter of the Review of the)
Reconciliation Rider of Duke Energy Ohio,) Case No. 20-167-EL-RDR
Inc.)

Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., (Duke Energy Ohio or Company) hereby moves this honorable Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Commission) for leave to file under seal certain information contained in the document titled “Audit of the Price Stabilization Rider of Duke Energy Ohio” (Report). This Report was filed by the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Staff) on October 21, 2020 under seal. Duke Energy Ohio has now reviewed the Report and sets forth in the attached Memorandum in Support its reasons why confidential treatment of certain information contained in this Report is necessary. For the reasons set forth in the Memorandum in Support, Duke Energy Ohio respectfully requests that the Commission grant this motion and provide confidential treatment as requested.

Respectfully submitted,

DUKE ENERGY OHIO, INC.

/s/ Rocco O. D'Ascenzo

Rocco D'Ascenzo (0077651)

Deputy General Counsel

Jeanne W. Kingery (0012172) (Counsel of Record)

Associate General Counsel

Larisa M. Vaysman (0090290)

Senior Counsel

Duke Energy Business Services LLC

139 East Fourth Street, 1303-Main

Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

(614) 222-1331 (telephone)

(614) 222-1337 (facsimile)

Rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com (e-mail)

Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com (e-mail)

Larisa.vaysman@duke-energy.com (e-mail)

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

Duke Energy Ohio respectfully requests that the Commission grant its motion for protective order to protect the confidentiality of information contained in the Report.

Duke Energy Ohio is an Ohio corporation with its principal office in Cincinnati, Ohio. Duke Energy Ohio has the corporate power and authority, among others, to engage, and it is engaged, in the business of supplying electric distribution service to customers in the State of Ohio. Accordingly, Duke Energy Ohio is a public utility within the meaning of that term as used in R. C. 4905.02 and 4905.03. As such, Duke Energy Ohio is subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission in the manner and to the extent provided by the laws of the State of Ohio.

Duke Energy Ohio owns, operates, manages and controls plants, properties and equipment used and useful in supplying electric distribution service to over 624,000 customers in southwestern Ohio.

On April 8, 2020, an Entry was issued which directed the Staff to select London Economics International LLC (LEI) as the auditor in order to audit Duke Energy Ohio's Price Stabilization Rider (Rider PSR) application for the period of January 1, 2019 through December 31, 2019. It is the Rider PSR for the period of January 1, 2019 through December 31, 2019 that is the subject matter of the Report. This report contains confidential trade secret information. Specifically, the Report portrays Duke Energy Ohio's critical infrastructure photographically and through description, its competitive bidding information, including but not limited to forecasts, offer curves, analysis, coal procurement targets and strategy, and discusses internal procedures and procedural documents.

This confidential trade secret information, if publicly disclosed, would give competitive bidders access to competitively sensitive, confidential bidding information, which in turn could work to the detriment of Duke Energy Ohio and its customers. Furthermore, disclosure of information related to the Company's critical infrastructure could pose a security hazard.

Ohio Administrative Code Section 4901-1-24(D) allows Duke Energy Ohio to seek leave of the Commission to file information contained in or attached to the Report that Duke Energy Ohio considers to be proprietary trade secret information, or otherwise confidential, in a redacted and non-redacted form under seal¹ This rule also establishes a procedure for presenting to the Commission that information which is confidential, and therefore should be protected.²

The Staff filed a redacted version of the Report on October 21, 2020. The Staff has also filed the requisite number of unredacted versions of the confidential material of the Report under seal. The redacted information contained in the Report constitutes trade secret information in

¹ O.A.C. 4901-1-24.

² *Id.*

accordance with Ohio's Uniform Trade Secret Act and relevant jurisprudence. Subsection (D) of R.C. 1333.61 defines "trade secret" as follows:

"Trade secret" means information, including the whole or any portion or phase of any scientific or technical information, design, **process, procedure**, formula, pattern, compilation, program, device, method, technique, or improvement, or any business information or plans, financial information, or listing of names, addresses, or telephone numbers, that satisfies both of the following:

- (1) It derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by, other persons who can obtain economic value from its disclosure or use.
- (2) It is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.³

In analyzing a trade secret claim, the Ohio Supreme Court has adopted the following factors as relevant to determining whether a document constitutes a trade secret:

- (1) The extent to which the information is known outside the business;
- (2) the extent to which it is known to those inside the business, i.e., by the employees;
- (3) the precautions taken by the holder of the trade secret to guard the secrecy of the information;
- (4) the savings effected and the value to the holder in having the information as against competitors;
- (5) the amount of effort or money expended in obtaining and developing the information; and
- (6) the amount of time and expense it would take for others to acquire and duplicate the information.⁴

The confidential material described above, if disclosed, would enable competitors to ascertain the manner in which Duke Energy Ohio plans and manages its Rider PSR compliance efforts and the cost associated therewith. Disclosure of such competitively sensitive information would be detrimental to Duke Energy Ohio.

³ R.C. 1333.61 (emphasis added).

⁴ *State ex rel. Besser v. Ohio State Univ.*, 89 Ohio St. 3d 396, 732 N.E.2d 373 (2000).

The information for which Duke Energy Ohio is seeking confidential treatment is not known outside of Duke Energy Ohio, and it is not disseminated within Duke Energy Ohio except to those employees with a legitimate business need to know and act upon the information.

The public interest will be served by granting this motion. By protecting the confidentiality of the Report, the Commission will prevent undue harm to Duke Energy Ohio and its customers, as well as ensuring a sound competitive marketplace.

Duke Energy Ohio considers the Report's confidential material to be proprietary, confidential, and trade secrets, as that term is used in R.C. 1333.61. In addition, this information should be treated as confidential pursuant to R.C. 4901.16. The redacted version of the Report includes the confidential material blacked out for the public.

WHEREFORE, Duke Energy Ohio respectfully requests that the Commission, pursuant to O.A.C. 4901-1-24(D), grant its Motion for Protective Order to protect the confidentiality of information contained in the document titled "Audit of the Price Stabilization Rider of Duke Energy Ohio" by making a determination that the redacted information is confidential, proprietary, and a trade secret under R.C. 1333.61.

Respectfully submitted,

DUKE ENERGY OHIO, INC.

/s/ Rocco O. D'Ascenzo
Rocco D'Ascenzo (0077651)
Deputy General Counsel
Jeanne W. Kingery (0012172) (Counsel of Record)
Associate General Counsel
Larisa M. Vaysman (0090290)
Senior Counsel
Duke Energy Business Services, LLC
139 East Fourth Street, 1303-Main
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
(614) 222-1331 (telephone)
(614) 222-1337 (facsimile)

Rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com (e-mail)
Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com (e-mail)
Larisa.vaysman@duke-energy.com (e-mail)
Willing to accept service via email

Attorneys for Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of the foregoing was served on the following party this 21st day of October 2020, by regular U.S. Mail, overnight delivery, or electronic delivery.

/s/ Rocco O. D'Ascenzo
Rocco O. D'Ascenzo

John H. Jones
Thomas Lindgren
Assistant Attorneys General
Public Utilities Section
30 East Broad Street, 16th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
John.jones@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
thomas.lindgren@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

10/21/2020 10:55:12 AM

in

Case No(s). 20-0167-EL-RDR

Summary: Motion Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.'s Motion for Protective Order electronically filed by
Carys Cochern on behalf of Duke Energy