

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of : Case No. 20-0680-EL-UNC  
The Dayton Power and Light Company for a  
Finding That Its Current Electric Security :  
Plan Passes the Significantly Excessive  
Earnings Test and More Favorable in the :  
Aggregate Test in R.C. 4928.143(E).

---

**THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY'S  
MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER RELATING TO ITS REPLY COMMENTS**

---

Pursuant to Ohio Adm.Code 4901-1-24(D), The Dayton Power and Light Company ("DP&L") moves for the entry of a Protective Order to exempt from public disclosure certain information that is confidential, proprietary, and competitively sensitive trade secret information. R.C. 1333.61(D). The information at issue is Confidential Information relating to financial projections and data contained in the Reply Comments of The Dayton Power and Light Company, which cite and quote confidential material from the Direct Testimony of Gustavo Garavaglia M. and the Direct Testimony of R. Jeffrey Malinak in this proceeding.

The information at issue is maintained as confidential by DP&L, and constitutes proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret material, the public disclosure of which would subject DP&L to an unfair competitive disadvantage. In accordance with Ohio Adm.Code 4901-1-24(D)(2), an original and two unredacted copies of the Confidential Information are to be filed under seal with the Commission via mail. *In the Matter of the Proper Procedures and Process for the Commission's Operations and Proceedings During the Declared State of Emergency and Related Matters*, Pub. Util. Comm. No. 20-591-AU-UNC (Mar. 16, 2020 Entry, ¶5(c)).

If this Motion is opposed, then DP&L will submit a declaration in support.  
DP&L will further produce an unredacted copy of the Reply Comments of The Dayton Power and Light Company to any party who enters into a protective agreement with DP&L in this proceeding.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Michael J. Schuler

Michael J. Schuler (0082390)  
THE DAYTON POWER AND  
LIGHT COMPANY  
1065 Woodman Drive  
Dayton, OH 45432  
Telephone: (937) 259-7358  
Telecopier: (937) 259-7178  
Email: michael.schuler@aes.com

/s/ Jeffrey S. Scharkey

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)  
(Counsel of Record)  
D. Jeffrey Ireland (0010443)  
Christopher C. Hollon (0086480)  
FARUKI PLL  
110 North Main Street, Suite 1600  
Dayton, OH 45402  
Telephone: (937) 227-3747  
Telecopier: (937) 227-3717  
Email: jsharkey@ficlaw.com  
djireland@ficlaw.com  
chollon@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power  
and Light Company

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF THE DAYTON POWER  
AND LIGHT COMPANY'S MOTION FOR  
PROTECTIVE ORDER RELATING TO ITS REPLY COMMENTS**

Pursuant to Ohio Adm.Code 4901-1-24(D), The Dayton Power and Light Company ("DP&L") moves for the entry of a Protective Order to exempt from public disclosure certain information as confidential, proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret information. Specifically, DP&L requests that certain confidential information contained in the Reply Comments of The Dayton Power and Light Company relating to financial projections and data contained in the Direct Testimony of Gustavo Garavaglia M. and the Direct Testimony of R. Jeffrey Malinak be exempt from public disclosure as confidential, proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret information ("Confidential Information").

Section 4901-1-24(D) of the Ohio Administrative Code provides that the Commission may issue an order which is necessary to protect the confidentiality of information contained in documents filed with the Commission's Docketing Division to the extent that state or federal law prohibits the release of the information, and where non-disclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code. *Accord:* R.C. 4905.07 (providing that "[e]xcept as provided in section 149.43 of the Revised Code and as consistent with the purposes of Title XLIX [49] of the Revised Code, all facts and information in the possession of the public utilities commission shall be public").

The release of trade secret information by the Commission is prohibited by state law. *In the Matter of the Joint Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Integration of an Energy Efficiency or Peak-Demand Reduction Program with Honda of Am. Mfg., Inc.*, Pub. Util. Comm. No. 10-2205-EL-EEC, 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1313, at \*6 (Dec. 7, 2011 Finding and Order) ("Section 149.43, Revised Code, specifies that the term 'public records'

excludes information which, under state or federal law, may not be released. The Ohio Supreme Court has clarified that the 'state or federal law' exemption is intended to cover trade secrets.") (citing *State ex rel. Besser v. Ohio State Univ.*, 89 Ohio St.3d 396, 399, 732 N.E.2d 373 (2000)). The definition of a "trade secret" includes "any business information or plans [and] financial information." R.C. 1333.61(D).

"A company's determination of its costs, overhead and volume of sales, and particularly its calculation of profit margins on customers' purchases may be the kind of information that the trade secret statute seeks to protect." *Kenker Box Co. v. Riemeier Lumber Co.*, 1st Dist. Hamilton Nos. C-990803 and C-990824, 2000 Ohio App. LEXIS 6198, at \*10 (Dec. 29, 2000). *Accord: Alpha Benefits Agency, Inc. v. King Ins. Agency, Inc.*, 134 Ohio App. 3d 673, 683, 731 N.E.2d 1209 (8th Dist.1999) (holding that trial court should have ordered plaintiff to produce its "profitability information" to defendant subject to a protective order); *Vanguard Transp. Sys. v. Edwards Transfer & Storage Co. Gen. Commodities Div.*, 109 Ohio App. 3d 786, 789-90, 673 N.E.2d 182 (10th Dist.1996) (affirming trial court order that held that various information including "corporate financial information" constituted a trade secret).

This definition reflects the state policy favoring the protection of trade secrets such as the information that is the subject of this Motion. The Commission has issued protective orders in numerous prior proceedings to prevent the public disclosure of trade secrets, *e.g.*, *In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. for an Increase in Electric Distribution Rates*, Pub. Util. Comm. No. 17-32-EL-AIR, *et al.*, 2018 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1268 (Dec. 19, 2018 Opinion and Order), ¶ 161-163 ("we note that the Commission has previously granted protective treatment for portions of briefs filed under seal and testimony containing sensitive data, including information that appears to matters relating to competitive business information"); *In*

*the Matter of the Application of Midwest Utility Consultants, Inc. for Certification as a Competitive Retail Natural Gas Aggregator/Broker*, Pub. Util. Comm. No. 09-893-GA-AGG, 2012 Ohio PUC LEXIS 103 (Jan. 30, 2012 Entry) (forecasted financial statements were trade secrets and granted protective treatment); *In the Matter of the Application of the Ohio Power Co. and Columbus S. Power Co. for Authority to Merge and Related Approvals, et al.*, Pub. Util. Comm. No. 10-2376-EL-UNC, *et al.*, 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1325, at \*22-23 (Dec. 14, 2011 Opinion and Order) (forecasted fuel expenditures were trade secrets and granted protective treatment); *In the Matter of the Joint Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Integration of an Energy Efficiency or Peak-Demand Reduction Program with Honda of Am. Mfg., Inc.*, Pub. Util. Comm. No. 10-2205-EL-EEC, 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1313, at \*2-5 (Dec. 7, 2011 Finding and Order) (release of trade secrets prohibited by state law). *Accord: Ohio Consumers' Counsel v. Pub. Util. Comm.*, 121 Ohio St.3d 362, 2009-Ohio-604, 904 N.E.2d 853, ¶ 8.

Here, the Confidential Information constitutes "business information or plans, [and] financial information" that is confidential, proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret information under R.C. 1333.61(D). The Confidential Information is not known outside of DP&L, and is not disseminated to internal employees unless those employees have a legitimate business need to know the information. Maintaining the confidentiality of this information will prevent an undue competitive disadvantage to DP&L, as well as assisting in fostering the interests of maintaining a fair and robust competitive marketplace within Ohio.

The Commission and its Staff will have full access to the Confidential Information in order to fulfill its statutory obligations. Further, DP&L was careful to redact from

the publicly-filed version of the Reply Comments of The Dayton Power and Light Company only those portions that are essential to prevent disclosure of Confidential Information.

For these foregoing reasons, DP&L requests that the Commission issue a Protective Order that permits the Confidential Information to be designated as confidential and to remain under seal.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Michael J. Schuler

Michael J. Schuler (0082390)  
THE DAYTON POWER AND  
LIGHT COMPANY  
1065 Woodman Drive  
Dayton, OH 45432  
Telephone: (937) 259-7358  
Telecopier: (937) 259-7178  
Email: michael.schuler@aes.com

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)  
(Counsel of Record)  
D. Jeffrey Ireland (0010443)  
Christopher C. Hollon (0086480)  
FARUKI PLL  
110 North Main Street, Suite 1600  
Dayton, OH 45402  
Telephone: (937) 227-3747  
Telecopier: (937) 227-3717  
Email: jsharkey@ficlaw.com  
djireland@ficlaw.com  
chollon@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power  
and Light Company

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that a copy of the foregoing The Dayton Power and Light Company's Motion for Protective Order Relating to Its Reply Comments has been served via electronic mail upon the following counsel of record, this 16th day of July, 2020.

Thomas Lindgren  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
30 East Broad Street, 16th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
thomas.lindgren@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

Attorneys for Staff of the Commission

Matthew R. Pritchard  
Rebekah J. Glover  
McNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC  
21 East State Street, 17th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
mpritchard@mwncmh.com  
rglover@mwncmh.com

Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

Steven D. Lesser  
N. Trevor Alexander  
Mark T. Keaney  
Kari D. Hehmeyer  
CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD LLP  
41 South High Street  
1200 Huntington Center  
Columbus, OH 43215  
slesser@calfee.com  
talexander@calfee.com  
mkeaney@calfee.com  
khehmeyer@calfee.com

Attorneys for the City of Dayton and Honda of America Mfg., Inc.

Michael L. Kurtz  
Kurt J. Boehm  
Jody Kyler Cohn  
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry  
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510  
Cincinnati, Oh 45202  
Mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com  
Kboehm@BKLawfirm.com  
Jkylercohn@BKLawfirm.com

Attorneys for Ohio Energy Group

Christopher Healey  
William J. Michael  
Amy Botschner O'Brien  
OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS'  
COUNSEL  
65 East State Street, 7th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-4213  
christopher.healey@occ.ohio.gov  
william.michael@occ.ohio.gov  
amy.botschner.obrien@occ.ohio.gov

Attorneys for The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

Kimberly W. Bojko  
CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP  
280 North High Street, Suite 1300  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Bojko@carpenterlipps.com

Attorney for The Ohio Manufacturers' Association Energy Group

Devin D. Parram  
Dane Stinson  
Jhay T. Spottswood  
BRICKER & ECKLER LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, OH 43215-4291  
dparram@bricker.com  
dstinson@bricker.com  
jspottswood@bricker.com

Attorneys for The Ohio Hospital Association

Stephanie M. Chmiel  
Kevin D. Oles  
THOMPSON HINE LLP  
41 South High Street, Suite 1700  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Stephanie.Chmiel@ThompsonHine.com  
Kevin.Oles@ThompsonHine.com

Attorneys for University of Dayton

Bethany Allen  
Joseph Olier  
Michael Nugent  
IGS Energy  
6100 Emerald Parkway  
Dublin, OH 43016  
Bethany.allen@igs.com  
Joe.olier@igs.com  
Michael.nugent@igs.com

Frank P. Darr  
6800 Linbrook Blvd.  
Columbus, OH 43235  
Fdarr2019@gmail.com

Attorneys for IGS Energy

Angela Paul Whitfield  
CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP  
280 North High Street, Suite 1300  
Columbus, OH 43215  
paul@carpenterlipps.com

Attorney for The Kroger Company

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey  
Jeffrey S. Sharkey



**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**7/16/2020 4:38:29 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 20-0680-EL-UNC**

Summary: Motion The Dayton Power and Light Company's Motion for Protective Order  
Relating to Its Reply Comments electronically filed by Mr. Jeffrey S Sharkey on behalf of The  
Dayton Power and Light Company