

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Procurement of	:	
Percentage of Income Payment Plan	:	Case No. 16-936-EL-UNC
Program Generation for Customers of	:	
Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland	:	
Electric Illuminating Company, and The	:	
Toledo Edison Company.	:	

---

**MOTION FOR A PROTECTIVE ORDER  
SUBMITTED ON BEHALF OF THE STAFF OF  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

---

Comes now the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Staff) and requests that both the Report of the Commission's Consultant Regarding FirstEnergy's February 2018 PIPP RFP and the Notification of PIPP RFP Results be kept confidential pursuant to O.A.C. Rule 4901-1-24 for the reasons set forth in the attached memorandum in support.

Respectfully submitted,

**Dave Yost**  
Ohio Attorney General

**John H. Jones**  
Section Chief

/s/ Thomas W. McNamee

**Thomas W. McNamee**  
Assistant Attorney General  
Public Utilities Section  
30 East Broad Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor  
614.466.4396 (telephone)

614.644.8764 (facsimile)  
thomas.mcnamee@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

**On behalf of the Staff of  
The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

---

## MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

---

Staff requests that the Commission keep both the Report of the Commission's Consultant Regarding FirstEnergy's February 2018 PIPP RFP and the Notification of PIPP RFP Results be kept confidential and that they not be publicly released. This information identifies the details of various bids and parties making the bids in the February 2018 PIPP RFP. This information is highly competitively sensitive. Public disclosure of this information would be highly prejudicial to the bidding parties and to the viability of any future auction in Ohio. Keeping this material confidential is consistent with the Commission's actions in prior auction matters. A redacted version of the Notification of PIPP RFP Results has been filed publicly in this docket.

Respectfully submitted,

**Dave Yost**  
Ohio Attorney General

**John H. Jones**  
Section Chief

/s/ Thomas W. McNamee

**Thomas W. McNamee**  
Assistant Attorney General  
Public Utilities Section  
30 East Broad Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor  
614.466.4396 (telephone)  
614.644.8764 (facsimile)  
thomas.mcnamee@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

**On behalf of the Staff of  
The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

## PROOF OF SERVICE

I certify that a true copy of the foregoing **Motion for a Protective Order** submitted on behalf of the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio was served via electronic mail upon the following parties of record, this 12<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2018.

/s/ Thomas W. McNamee

**Thomas W. McNamee**  
Assistant Attorney General

### Parties of Record:

**Scott J. Casto**  
FirstEnergy Corp.  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, Ohio 44308  
scasto@firstenergycorp.com

**Steven T. Nourse**  
American Electric Power Service Corp.  
1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
stnourse@aep.com

**Joseph Olikier**  
**Matthew White**  
IGS Energy  
6100 Emerald Parkway  
Dublin, Ohio 43016  
joliker@igsenergy.com  
mswhite@igsenergy.com

**Colleen L. Mooney**  
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy  
231 West Lima Street  
Findlay, Ohio 45840  
cmooney@ohiopartners.org

**Frank P. Darr**  
**Matthew R. Pritchard**  
McNees Wallace & Nurick  
21 East State Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
fdarr@mwncmh.com  
mpritichard@mwncmh.com

**Elizabeth H. Watts**  
Duke Energy Ohio  
139 East Fourth Street  
P.O. Box 960  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45201  
elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com

**Terry L. Etter**  
**Christopher Healey**  
Assistant Consumers' Counsel  
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel  
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485  
terry.etter@occ.ohio.gov  
christopher.healey@occ.ohio.gov

**Dane Stinson**

Bricker & Eckler  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
dstinson@bricker.com

**Michael J. Schuler**

The Dayton Power and Light Company  
1065 Woodman Drive  
Dayton, Ohio 45432  
michael.schuler@aes.com

**Scott M. Howard**

**Gretchen L. Petrucci**

Vorys Sater Seymour Pease  
52 East Gay Street  
P.O. Box 1008  
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008  
smhoward@vorys.com  
glpetrucci@vorys.com

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**2/12/2020 11:14:25 AM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 16-0936-EL-UNC**

Summary: Motion for a Protective Order electronically filed by Mrs. Kimberly M Naeder on behalf of PUCO