# BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY

ATTORNEYS AT LAW 36 EAST SEVENTH STREET SUITE 1510 CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202 TELEPHONE (513) 421-2255

**TELECOPIER (513) 421-2764** 

Via E-File

December 4, 2019

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio PUCO Docketing 180 E. Broad Street, 10th Floor Columbus, OH 43215

#### In re: <u>Case Nos. 08-1094-EL-SSO, 08-1095-EL-ATA, 08-1096-EL-AAM, 08-1097-EL-UNC,</u> <u>16-0395-EL-SSO, 16-0396-EL-ATA and 16-0397-EL-AAM</u>

Dear Sir/Madam:

Please find attached the COMMENTS OF THE OHIO ENERGY GROUP (OEG) e-filed today in the above-referenced matter.

Copies have been served on all parties on the attached certificate of service. Please place this document of file.

Respectfully yours

Michael L. Kurtz, Esq. Kurt J. Boehm, Esq. Jody Kyler COH n, Esq. **BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY** 

MLKkew Encl. Cc: Ce

Certificate of Service Bryce McKenney, Attorney Examiner Gregory Price, Attorney Examiner

#### BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Its Electric Security Plan.	•	Case No. 08-1094-EL-SSO
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Revised Tariffs.	•	Case No. 08-1095-EL-ATA
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code § 4905.13.	•	Case No. 08-1096-EL-AAM
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Its Amended Corporate Separation Plan.	:	Case No. 08-1097-EL-UNC
In The Matter Of The Application Of Dayton Power And Light Company For Approval of its Electric Security Plan.	:	Case No. 16-0395-EL-SSO
In The Matter Of The Application Of The Dayton Power And Light Company For Approval of Revised Tariffs.	•	Case No. 16-0396-EL-ATA
In The Matter Of The Application Of Dayton Power And Light Company For Approval Of Certain Accounting Authority Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code §4905.13.	•	Case No. 16-0397-EL-AAM

## **COMMENTS OF THE OHIO ENERGY GROUP**

The Ohio Energy Group ("OEG") hereby submits its Comments in response to the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio's ("Commission") November 27, 2019 in the above-captioned proceeding. As discussed in greater detail herein, the Commission should reject The Dayton Power and Light Company's ("DP&L" or "Company") proposed tariffs filed on November 26, 2019 in this proceeding because DP&L has no statutory right under R.C. 4928.143(C)(2)(a) to withdraw its current Electric Security Plan ("ESP") under the particular circumstances of this case.

#### I. DP&L Cannot Withdraw Its Current ESP Pursuant To R.C. 4928.143(C)(2)(a).

While R.C. 4928.143(C)(2)(a) grants electric distribution utilities a statutory right to withdraw an ESP application (and thereby terminate the ESP) if the Commission modifies and approves that application, that statutory right does not apply when: 1) the impacted ESP is the product of a final, appealable Commission order; and 2) a subsequent Commission modification is required solely in order to enforce a finding by the Supreme Court of Ohio.

R.C. 4928.143(C)(2)(a) provides:

If the **commission** modifies and approves **an application** under division (C)(1) of this section, the electric distribution utility may withdraw the application, thereby terminating it, and may file a new standard service offer under this section or a standard service offer under section 4928.142 of the Revised Code.<sup>1</sup>

DP&L would have the Commission interpret this provision in a way that would extend a utility's right of withdrawal indefinitely, allowing utilities that are years into an ESP to simply withdraw that ESP in response to any slight modification and to revert to an entirely different rate structure, without a hearing and regardless of the potential rate shock to customers. The Commission should reject such an unreasonable interpretation. The most reasonable construction of R.C. 4928.143(C)(2)(a) is that a utility's statutory right of withdrawal applies only in cases where a *proposed* ESP application is modified by the Commission (whether through an initial order or a rehearing entry) as a result of the Commission's own volition – not when an ESP that is already subject to a final, appealable Commission order is subsequently modified solely due to a Court mandate.

DP&L's current ESP (approved in Case No. 16-395-EL-SSO *et al*) is not merely a *proposed* standard service offer. That ESP results from a final, appealable Commission order and has been in effect since November 1, 2017. Customers have come to rely on the current ESP rate structure and to use that structure to inform planning and budgeting decisions. Moreover, the Commission did not *voluntarily* modify DP&L's current ESP to remove the Distribution Modernization Rider ("DMR"). The only modification required – immediate cessation of the DMR – was entirely the result of the Court's decision and therefore involuntary on the part of the Commission. Accordingly, given that DP&L's request to withdraw its current ESP strays far from the situation contemplated by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Emphasis added.

the plain language R.C. 4928.143(C)(2)(a), that statute is not a basis upon which to approve withdrawal of its current ESP.

A utility's statutory right to withdraw an ESP does not extend indefinitely. That right does not apply when the utility accepts a Commission-modified ESP by allowing that ESP to go into effect and then the Commission's final order is later modified by the Court. The law gives the utility a limited "*veto*" right over Commission modifications of a proposed application; it does not give the utility a "*veto*" right over decisions of the Court.

Allowing the Company to withdraw its current ESP in light of the Court's finding with respect to DMR charges undermines the statutory appellate process provided for under R.C. 4903.13. The utility's statutory right to withdraw a proposed ESP must be read in concert with the other parties' statutory right to appeal a final Commission order and to receive the full relief ultimately provided by the Court. *"All statutes relating to the same general subject matter must be read in pari material, and in construing these statutes in pari material, this court must give them a reasonable construction so as to give proper force and effect to each and all of the statutes."<sup>2</sup> The best way to harmonize those two statutes is to bar a utility from invoking R.C. 4928.143(C)(2)(a) after the date upon which the Commission issues a final, appealable order on the utility's proposed ESP and the utility has accepted the Commission's modifications by allowing the ESP to go into effect.* 

Approving DP&L's requests would render the appellate process ineffective and again put this Commission on a collision course with the Court. In 2015, the Court stated that "*[i]f the commission makes a modification to a proposed ESP that the utility is unwilling to accept, R.C.* 4928.143(C)(2)(a) allows the utility to withdraw the ESP application. "<sup>3</sup> But the Court has never stated that a utility is entitled to thwart the Court's appellate mandate by withdrawing its ESP after receiving an unfavorable decision from the Court. While this issue was recently raised at the Court in an appeal of DP&L's previous ESP, the Court ultimately found the issue moot in light of the Commission's approval of DP&L's current ESP.<sup>4</sup> Thus, with respect to the proper interpretation of R.C.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> State ex rel. Herman v. Klopfleisch, 72 Ohio St. 3d 581, 585, 651 N.E.2d 995, 998 (1995) (citing United Tel. Co. v. Limbach (1994), 71 Ohio St.3d 369, 372, 643 N.E.2d 1129, 1131).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> In re Application of Ohio Power Co., 144 Ohio St. 3d 1, 2015-Ohio-2056 at ¶26 (emphasis added).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> In re Application of Dayton Power & Light Co., 154 Ohio St.3d 237, 2018-Ohio-4009.

4928.143(C)(2)(a), the Commission is not bound by any definitive Court precedent and can adopt an interpretation that preserves the appellate process as an effective mechanism by which to combat unlawful charges.

#### **II. DP&L Should Follow The FirstEnergy Precedent.**

In response to the Court's June 19, 2019 finding that FirstEnergy's DMR was unlawful and a directive that the Commission remove the DMR from FirstEnergy's current ESP,<sup>5</sup> the Commission issued orders modifying that ESP as directed.<sup>6</sup> FirstEnergy did not then withdraw its entire ESP, but instead retained rate stability for customers by continuing its current plan with the added benefit of the DMR removal. Nor did the Commission give any indication that its Court-mandated modification triggered R.C. 4928.143(C)(2)(a).

DP&L should adopt the same approach here. The Company's current ESP was the result of a carefullynegotiated and complex Stipulation among a diverse array of parties, and the majority of the provisions in that settlement need not and should not be disturbed.<sup>7</sup> Indeed, the Stipulation itself provides that if the Commission materially modifies the approved settlement pursuant to a Supreme Court reversal, then all signatory parties, *including DP&L*, must attempt to negotiate a resolution that maintains the intent of the settlement. Specifically, the Stipulation states:

If the Commission does not adopt the Stipulation without material modification upon rehearing, or if the Commission makes a material modification to any Order adopting the Stipulation pursuant to any reversal, vacation and/or remand by the Supreme Court of Ohio, then within thirty (30) days of the Commission's Entry on Rehearing or Order on Remand: (a) any Signatory Party may withdraw from the Stipulation by filing a notice with the Commission ("Notice of Withdrawal"); or (b) DP&L may terminate and withdraw from the Stipulation by filing a notice ("Utility Notice"). Upon the filing of such Utility Notice by DP&L, the Stipulation shall immediately become null and void. No Signatory Party shall file a Notice of Withdrawal or Utility Notice without first negotiating in good faith with the other Signatory Parties to achieve an outcome that substantially satisfies the intent of the Stipulation.<sup>8</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> In re Application of Ohio Edison Co., 157 Ohio St.3d 73, 2019-Ohio-2401.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Order on Remand, Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO (August 22, 2019); Finding and Order, Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO (September 26, 2019).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Amended Stipulation and Recommendation, Case No. 16-395-EL-SSO (March 14, 2017)("Stipulation").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Stipulation at 38.

It would therefore be unreasonable to allow DP&L to subvert its Stipulation obligation and to unduly harm retail customers by simply replacing one substantial charge (the DMR) with another (the Rate Stabilization Charge) through the invocation of an inapplicable ESP withdrawal statute.

Respectfully submitted,

U

Michael L. Kurtz, Esq. Kurt J. Boehm, Esq. Jody Kyler Cohn, Esq. **BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY** 36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202 Ph: (513) 421-2255 Fax: (513) 421-2764 E-Mail: <u>Mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com</u> <u>Kboehm@BKLlawfirm.com</u> Jkylercohn@BKLlawfirm.com

December 4, 2019

### **COUNSEL FOR OHIO ENERGY GROUP**

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that true copy of the foregoing was served by electronic mail (when available) or ordinary mail, unless otherwise noted, this 4<sup>th</sup> day of December, 2019 to the following:

Miebael L. Kurtz, Esq.

Kurt J. Boehm, Esq. Jody Kyler Cohn, Esq.

\*SHARKEY, JEFFREY S MR. FARUKI IRELAND COX RHINEHART & DUSING 110 NORTH MAIN STREET, SUITE 1600 DAYTON OH 45402

MAYES, JEFFREY W MONITORING ANALYTICS LLC 2621 VAN BUREN AVENUE, SUITE 160 VALLEY FORGE CORPORATE CENTER EAGLEVILLE PA19403

\*DRESSEL, BRIAN W MR. CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP 280 NORTH HIGH ST. SUITE 1300 COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*GAUNDER, DEBRA A CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP 280 N HIGH STREET, SUITE 1300 COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*MOONEY, COLLEEN L OPAE PO BOX 12451 COLUMBUS OH 43212-2451

\*MENDOZA, TONY G. MR. SIERRA CLUB 2101 WEBSTER ST., 13TH FLOOR OAKLAND CA94612

\*ORAHOOD, TERESA BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 SOUTH THIRD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215-4291

\*DOLL, JOH N R. MR. DOLL, JANSEN & FORD 111 W. FIRST ST., SUITE 1100 DAYTON OH 45402-1156

\*WILLIAMS, JAMIE MS. OH IO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL 65 EAST STATE STREET, 7TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215-4213

\*MILLER, VESTA R PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OH IO 180 EAST BROAD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*BOJKO, KIMBERLY W. MRS. CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP 280 NORTH HIGH STREET 280 PLAZA SUITE 1300 COLUMBUS OH 43215

MICHAEL, WILLIAM 10 W. BROAD ST.65 E STATE ST 7TH FL COLUMBUS OH 43215-4203

\*TAMM, CARL MR. CLASSIC CONNECTORS 382 PARK AVE EAST MANSFIELD OH 44905

\*SECHLER, JOEL E MR. CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP 280 PLAZA 280 N. HIGH ST STE 1300 COLUMBUS OH 43215

PAUL WHITFIELD, ANGELA CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP 280 NORTH HIGH STREET, SUITE 1300 COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*SMITH, CHERYL A MS. CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND 280 N. HIGH STREET SUITE 1300 COLUMBUS OH 43081

\*JACOBS, ELLIS MR. ADVOCATES FOR BASIC LEGAL EQUALITY 130 WEST SECOND ST. SUITE 700 EAST DAYTON OH 45402

\*PETRUCCI, GRETCHEN L. MRS. VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE 52 EAST GAY STREET, P.O. BOX 1008 COLUMBUS OH 43216-1008

\*DORTCH, MICHAEL D. MR. KRAVITZ, BROWN & DORTCH, LLC 65 E. STATE STREET SUITE 200 COLUMBUS OH 43215

HAWROT, LISA SPILMAN THOMAS & BATTLE PLLC 1233 MAIN STREET SUITE 4000 WHEELING WV 26003

\*HIGHT, DEBRA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OH IO 180 E. BROAD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43231

\*PARRAM, DEVIN D. MR. BRICKER AND ECKLER 100 SOUTH THIRD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215 \*SPENCER, KEN MR. ARMSTRONG & OKEY, INC. 222 EAST TOWN STREET, 2ND FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*OLIKER, JOSEPH E. MR. IGS ENERGY 6100 EMERALD PARKWAY DUBLIN OH 43016

\*SCHMIDT, KEVIN R MR. THE LAW OFFICES OF KEVIN R. SCHMIDT, ESQ. 88 EAST BROAD STREET, SUITE 1770 MAIL STOP 01 COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*KUHNELL, DIANNE DUKE ENERGY BUSINESS SERVICES 139 E. FOURTH STREET CINCINNATI OH 45202

\*PRITCHARD, MATTHEW R. MR. MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK 21 EAST STATE STREET #1700 COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*COFFEY, SANDRA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OH IO 180 E. BROAD ST. COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*BURDETT, FELECIA D PUCO 180 E BROAD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*FLEISHER, MADELINE ENVIRONMENTAL LAW AND POLICY CENTER 21 W. BROAD ST., 8TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*STOCK, JOH N F BENESCH FRIEDLANDER COPLAN & ARONOFF LLP 41 S. HIGH ST., SUITE 2600 COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*HOLLON, CHRISTOPHER C. MR. FARUKI IRELAND COX RHINEHART & DUSING P.L.L. 110 N. MAIN STREET SUITE 1600 DAYTON OH 45402

\*KRAUSEN, SUZETTE N MS. MONITORING ANALYTICS, LLC 2621 VAN BUREN AVENUE SUITE 160 EAGLEVILLE PA19403

\*BINGHAM, DEB J. MS. OFFICE OF THE OH IO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL 65 EAST STATE STREET, 7TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215-4203

\*DONOUGHE, REGAN IGS ENERGY 6100 EMERALD PARKWAY DUBLIN OH 43016 \*WHITFIELD, ANGELA MRS. CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP 280 NORTH HIGH STREET, SUITE 1300 COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*SWEENEY, HELEN INTERSTATE GAS SUPPLY, INC. 6100 EMERALD PARKWAY DUBLIN OH 43016

\*SMITH, CHERYL A MS. CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND 280 N. HIGH STREET SUITE 1300 COLUMBUS OH 43081

\*JACOBS, ELLIS MR. ADVOCATES FOR BASIC LEGAL EQUALITY 130 WEST SECOND ST. SUITE 700 EAST DAYTON OH 45402

\*PETRUCCI, GRETCHEN L. MRS. VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE 52 EAST GAY STREET, P.O. BOX 1008 COLUMBUS OH 43216-1008

\*DORTCH, MICHAEL D. MR. KRAVITZ, BROWN & DORTCH, LLC 65 E. STATE STREET SUITE 200 COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*KEANEY, MARK T MR. CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD LLP 1200 HUNTINGTON CENTER 41 SOUTH HIGH STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*LANDES, MARK MR. ISAAC WILES BURKHOLDER & TEETOR TWO MIRANOVA PLACE SUITE 700 COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*PARRAM, DEVIN D. MR. BRICKER AND ECKLER 100 SOUTH THIRD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*LEACH-PAYNE, VICKI L. MS. MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC 21 E. STATE ST., 17TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*O'DONNELL, TERRENCE DICKINSON WRIGHT PLLC 150 EAST GAY STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*SHARKEY, JEFFREY S MR. FARUKI IRELAND COX RHINEHART & DUSING 110 NORTH MAIN STREET, SUITE 1600 DAYTON OH 45402

\*DORTCH, JUSTIN M MR. KRAVITZ, BROWN & DORTCH, LCC 65 EAST STATE STREET SUITE 200 COLUMBUS OH 43215 JOH NSON, NATHAN G 1145 CHESAPEAKE AVE, STE I COLUMBUS OH 43212-3449

\*DRESSEL, BRIAN W MR. CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP 280 NORTH HIGH ST. SUITE 1300 COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*DOUGHERTY, TRENT A MR. OH IO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL 1145 CHESAPEAKE AVE SUITE I COLUMBUS OH 43212

\*GAUNDER, DEBRA A CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP 280 N HIGH STREET, SUITE 1300 COLUMBUS OH 43215 PHONE: 614-300-4005

\*MOONEY , COLLEEN L OPAE PO BOX 12451 COLUMBUS OH 43212-2451

\*MENDOZA, TONY G. MR. SIERRA CLUB 2101 WEBSTER ST., 13TH FLOOR OAKLAND CA94612

\*ORAHOOD, TERESA BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 SOUTH THIRD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215-4291 PHONE: (614) 227-4821

\*PIRIK, CHRISTINE M.T. DICKINSON WRIGHT, PLLC 150 E. GAY STREET SUITE 2400 COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*DOLL, JOH N R. MR. DOLL, JANSEN & FORD 111 W. FIRST ST., SUITE 1100 DAYTON OH 45402-1156

\*LEPPLA, MIRANDA R MS. THE OH IO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL 1145 CHESAPEAKE AVENUE SUITE I COLUMBUS OH 43212

\*BRIGNER, GINA L MS. OH IO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL 65 E. STATE STREET, 7TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*WILLIAMS, JAMIE MS. OH IO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL 65 EAST STATE STREET, 7TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215-4213

\*MILLER, VESTA R PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OH IO 180 EAST BROAD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215 \*SCHUHART, DENISE M MRS. PJM INTERCONNECTION, L.L.C. 1200 G STREET, N.W. SUITE 600 WASHINGTON DC20005

\*SCOTT, TONNETTA MS. OH IO ATTORNEY GENERAL 30 EAST BROAD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*BOJKO, KIMBERLY W. MRS. CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP 280 NORTH HIGH STREET 280 PLAZA SUITE 1300 COLUMBUSOH 43215

\*SPENCER, KEN MR. ARMSTRONG & OKEY, INC. 222 EAST TOWN STREET, 2ND FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*BETTERTON, EVAN F MR. IGS ENERGY 6100 EMERALD PARKWAY DUBLIN OH 43016

\*CHILCOTE, HEATHER A PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OH IO 180 EAST BROAD STREET COLUMBUS OH IO OH 43215

WANNIER, GREGORY E SIERRA CLUB 2101 WEBSTER ST 13TH FLOOR OAKLAND CA94612

\*KELLIE, JESSICA E MRS. DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT 1065 WOODMAN DRIVE DAYTON OH 45432

\*DARR, FRANK P MR. MCNEES, WALLACE & NURICK 21 E. STATE STREET 17TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*SAHLI, RICHARD C. MR. RICHARD SAHLI LAW OFFICE LLC 981 PINEWOOD LANE COLUMBUS OH 43230-3662

\*OLIKER, JOSEPH E. MR. IGS ENERGY 6100 EMERALD PARKWAY DUBLIN OH 43016

\*KEETON, KIMBERLY L OH IO ATTORNEY GENERAL'S OFFICE PUBLIC UTILITIES SECTION 30 EAST BROAD STREET, 16TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*WILLIAMSON, DERRICK P SPILMAN THOMAS & BATTLE, PLLC 1100 BENT CREEK BLVD., SUITE 101 MECHANICSBURG PA17050 \*STAFF, DOCKETING DOCKETING 180 EAST BROAD STREET 11TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*PRITCHARD, MATTHEW R. MR. MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK 21 EAST STATE STREET #1700 COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*COFFEY, SANDRA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OH IO 180 E. BROAD ST. COLUMBUS OH 43215

IRELAND, D. JEFFREY FARUKI IRELAND COX RHINEHAT & DUSING PPL 110 N MAIN ST, STE 1600 FIDELITY PLAZA DAYTON OH 45402

\*SETTINERI, MICHAEL J. MR. VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE LLP 52 EAST GAY STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*SEGER-LAWSON, DONA R MRS. AEP OH IO 700 MORRISON ROAD GAHANNA OH 43230

\*DOUGHERTY, TRENT A MR. OH IO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL 1145 CHESAPEAKE AVE SUITE I COLUMBUS OH 43212

\*NUGENT, MICHAEL A MR. IGS ENERGY 6100 EMERALD PARK WAY DUBLIN OH 43016

\*DARR, FRANK P MR. MCNEES, WALLACE & NURICK LLC 21 E. STATE STREET 17TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*ALEXANDER, TREVOR MR. CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD, LLP 21 E. STATE ST., SUITE 1100 COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*YIP, YVETTE L MS. OH IO ATTORNEY GENERAL'S OFFICE - PUBLIC UTILITIES 30 EAST BROAD STREET, 16TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215

\*GATES, DEBBIE L MRS. DUKE ENERGY 139 EAST FOURTH STREET 1303-MAIN CINCINANTI OH 45201

CITIZENS TO PROTECT BENESCH FRIEDLANDER 41 SOUTH HIGH ST SUITE 2600 COLUMBUS OH 43215 CITY OF DAYTON BARBARA DOSECK 101 W. THIRD STREET DAYTON OH 45401

ELECTRIC POWER SUPPLY ASSOCIATION DAN DOLAN VICE PRESIDENT, 1401 NEW YORK AVE, N.W. 11TH FLOOR WASHINGTON DC 20005

HONDA OF AMERICA MANUFACTURING INC 24000 U.S. ROUTE 33 MARYSVILLE OH 43040-9251

INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS OF OH IO MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC FIFTH THIRD CENTER 21 EAST STATE ST 17TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215

OH IO HOSPITAL ASSOCIATION BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 SOUTH THIRD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215-4291

OH IO MANUFACTURERS' ASSOCIATION 33 N HIGH STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215

PJM INTERCONNECTION LLC EVELYN R. ROBINSON 2750 MONROE BLVD. AUDUBON PA 19403

RETAIL ENERGY SUPPLY ASSOCIATION GRETCHEN L. PETRUCCI 52 EAST GAY ST COLUMBUS OH 43215

UTILITY WORKERS UNION OF AMERICA LOCAL 175 JOH N R. DOLL 111 W. FIRST ST., SUITE 1100 DAYTON OH 45402-1156

HARRIS, CARRIE M SPILMAN THOMAS & BATTLE PLLC 310 FIRST STREET SUITE 100 ROANOKE VA 24002-0090

ENEL X NORTH AMERICA INC MEGHAN HESTER ONE MARINA PARK DR., STE 400 BOSTON MA 02210

INTERSTATE GAS SUPPLY INC JOSEPH E. OLIKER 6100 EMERALD PARKWAY DUBLIN OH 43016 This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

12/4/2019 4:06:56 PM

in

Case No(s). 08-1094-EL-SSO, 08-1095-EL-ATA, 08-1096-EL-AAM, 08-1097-EL-UNC, 16-0395-EL-SSO,

Summary: Comments Ohio Energy Group (OEG) Comments electronically filed by Mr. Michael L. Kurtz on behalf of Ohio Energy Group