

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

)	Case No. 14-375-GA-RDR
)	Case No. 15-452-GA-RDR
In the Matters of the Applications of Duke)	Case No. 16-542-GA-RDR
Energy Ohio, Inc., for Adjustments to Rider)	Case No. 17-596-GA-RDR
MGP Rates.)	Case No. 18-283-GA-RDR
)	Case No. 19-174-GA-RDR
)	Case No. 14-376-GA-ATA
)	Case No. 15-453-GA-ATA
In the Matters of the Applications of Duke)	Case No. 16-543-GA-ATA
Energy Ohio, Inc. for Tariff Approval.)	Case No. 17-597-GA-ATA
)	Case No. 18-284-GA-ATA
)	Case No. 19-175-GA-ATA

**MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER
BY
THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL**

The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel ("OCC") hereby moves the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("PUCO") for a protective order regarding information asserted to be confidential by Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.¹ As part of discovery in this proceeding, Duke provided information to OCC, subject to a protective agreement, and Duke asserts that this information constitutes trade secret information under Ohio law.

OCC hereby requests that, in accordance with Ohio Adm. Code. 4901-1-02(E), the PUCO issue such order as is necessary to protect the undisclosed (redacted) portions of the Direct Testimony of James R. Campbell, Ph.D. and the Direct Testimony of Kerry J. Adkins that are asserted to be confidential by Duke. Subject to OCC's rights under the protective agreement, OCC is filing the Direct Testimony of James R. Campbell, Ph.D.

¹ This Motion is filed pursuant to Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-02(E), 4901-1-12, and 4901-1-24(D).

and the Direct Testimony of Kerry J. Adkins under seal and is also filing a public version that shows all information not claimed by Duke to be confidential.

By filing this Motion, OCC does not concede that the information constitutes trade secret information. However, OCC acknowledges that it has obtained this information pursuant to a protective agreement with Duke that provides for such information to be treated as confidential and protected (subject to OCC's right under the protective agreement to initiate a process for the PUCO to rule whether the information deserves confidential treatment under Ohio law).

The grounds for this motion are more fully described in the accompanying memorandum in support.

Respectfully submitted,

Bruce Weston (0016973)
Ohio Consumers' Counsel

/s/ Christopher Healey

Christopher Healey (0086027)
Counsel of Record

Amy Botschner-O'Brien (0074423)
Bryce McKenney (0088203)
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

65 East State Street, 7th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4213
Telephone [Healey]: (614) 466-9571
Telephone [Botschner]: (614) 466-9575
Telephone [McKenney]: (614) 466-9585
christopher.healey@occ.ohio.gov
amy.botschner.obrien@occ.ohio.gov
bryce.mckenney@occ.ohio.gov
(willing to accept service by e-mail)

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

)	Case No. 14-375-GA-RDR
)	Case No. 15-452-GA-RDR
In the Matters of the Applications of Duke)	Case No. 16-542-GA-RDR
Energy Ohio, Inc., for Adjustments to Rider)	Case No. 17-596-GA-RDR
MGP Rates.)	Case No. 18-283-GA-RDR
)	Case No. 19-174-GA-RDR

)	Case No. 14-376-GA-ATA
)	Case No. 15-453-GA-ATA
In the Matters of the Applications of Duke)	Case No. 16-543-GA-ATA
Energy Ohio, Inc. for Tariff Approval.)	Case No. 17-597-GA-ATA
)	Case No. 18-284-GA-ATA
)	Case No. 19-175-GA-ATA

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

OCC files this Motion contemporaneously with the filing of the Direct Testimony of James R. Campbell Ph.D. In filing this Motion, OCC does not concede that the information in the Direct Testimony of James R. Campbell, Ph.D. and the Direct Testimony of Kerry J. Adkins is trade secret information pursuant to R.C. 1333.61(D) and does not concede that the information is deserving of protection from public revelation under Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-24(D).

OCC understands that Duke considers the undisclosed (redacted) information to be confidential and deserving of the protection of trade secret information as defined in R.C. 1333.61(D). OCC's understanding is based on claims by Duke that the information (1) derives economic value, actual or potential, from not being known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by others, and (2) is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy. *See* R.C. 1333.61(D). Under

the assertions made by Duke, at this time, confidential treatment of the redacted information in Direct Testimony of James R. Campbell, Ph.D. and the Direct Testimony of Kerry J. Adkins would be appropriate, subject to OCC's rights under its protective agreement with Duke to initiate a process to determine whether the information should be protected.

In addition, OCC is filing a public version of the Direct Testimony of James R. Campbell, Ph.D. and the Direct Testimony of Kerry J. Adkins so that all information not claimed by Duke to be confidential is accessible for the public's review. The public version does not contain information that was asserted by Duke to be confidential.

For the foregoing reasons and subject to the foregoing reservations of rights, this motion should be granted at this time.

Respectfully submitted,

Bruce Weston (0016973)
Ohio Consumers' Counsel

/s/ Christopher Healey

Christopher Healey (0086027)
Counsel of Record

Amy Botschner-O'Brien (0074423)

Bryce McKenney (0088203)

Assistant Consumers' Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

65 East State Street, 7th Floor

Columbus, Ohio 43215-4213

Telephone [Healey]: (614) 466-9571

Telephone [Botschner]: (614) 466-9575

Telephone [McKenney]: (614) 466-9585

christopher.healey@occ.ohio.gov

amy.botschner.obrien@occ.ohio.gov

bryce.mckenney@occ.ohio.gov

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the Motion for Protective Order was served on the persons stated below via electronic transmission this 8th day of October 2019.

/s/ Christopher Healey
Christopher Healey
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

The PUCO's e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document on the following parties:

SERVICE LIST

Thomas.mcnamee@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
Robert.eubanks@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
John.jones@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
cmooney@ohiopartners.org
dboehm@BKLawfirm.com
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com
jkylercohn@BKLawfirm.com

Rocco.dasenzo@duke-energy.com
Elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com
Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com
Larisa.vaysman@duke-energy.com
Paul@carpenterlipps.com
bojko@carpenterlipps.com

Attorney Examiner:

Megan.addison@puc.ohio.gov

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

10/8/2019 4:43:50 PM

in

Case No(s). 14-0375-GA-RDR, 15-0452-GA-RDR, 16-0542-GA-RDR, 17-0596-GA-RDR, 18-0283-GA-RD

Summary: Motion Motion for Protective Order by The Office of The Ohio Consumers' Counsel
electronically filed by Mrs. Tracy J Greene on behalf of Healey, Christopher