## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

- - -

In the Matter of the
Commission's Review of:

Chapters 4901:1-17 and : Case No. 19-52-AU-ORD

4901:1-18 of the Ohio : Administrative Code. :

- - -

## PROCEEDINGS

before Ms. Greta See, Attorney Examiner, at the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio, 180 East Broad Street, Room 11-B, Columbus, Ohio, called at 10:01 a.m. on Tuesday, February 5, 2019.

- - -

ARMSTRONG & OKEY, INC. 222 East Town Street, 2nd Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215-5201 (614) 224-9481 - (800) 223-9481

- - -

```
2
     PANEL MEMBERS:
 1
 2
     OHIO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES AGENCY:
 3
     Randall Hunt, Deputy Chief of the Office of Community
     Assistance, ODSA;
 4
     Brandy Kolattukudy, Energy Assistance Manager, ODSA.
 5
 6
     COMMISSION STAFF:
 7
     Megan DeLisi, Staff Attorney, PUCO;
     Robert Fadley, Interim Director of the Service
 8
     Monitoring and Enforcement Department, PUCO;
 9
     Tonja Stewart Shaw, Low-Income Program Specialist,
     PUCO;
10
11
     Barbara Bossart, Chief of the Reliability and Service
     Analysis Division, PUCO;
12
     Nicole Moore, Chief of the Consumer Services
     Division, PUCO.
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
2.0
21
22
23
24
25
```

Tuesday Morning Session,

February 5, 2019.

2.1

EXAMINER SEE: Good morning. Today we have scheduled a joint workshop on behalf of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio and the Ohio Development Services Agency, to review the Commission's rules in Chapters 4901:1-17 and 4901:1-18 of the Ohio Administrative Code, and ODSA's rules in Chapter 122:5-3 of the Ohio Administrative Code. The Commission's proceeding is Case No. 19-52-AU-ORD and is entitled "In the Matter of the Commission's Review of Chapters 4901:1-17 and 4901:1-18 of the Ohio Administrative Code."

establish the -- address the establishment of credit for residential utility service and the disconnection of gas, natural gas, and electric service for residential customers as well as the Percentage of Income Payment Plan Plus Program commonly referred to as the PIPP or PIPP Plus Program. And because the ODSA administers the PIPP Plus Program for electric utilities, the workshop will include Chapter 122:5-3.

My name is Greta See, and I am the Attorney Examiner -- an Attorney Examiner in the

Legal Department with the Commission, and I'll be moderating the workshop this morning.

2.1

2.2

First, I'd like to note that the web -that the workshop is being webcast so that
stakeholders throughout the state are aware of the
the workshop and learn what the Commission and ODSA
are considering. The workshop is also being
transcribed by a court reporter.

I hope everyone remembered to sign in.

And I want to remind those that may be watching the webcast that you need not be present, today, to submit comments or reply comments in these proceedings. We'll provide more details on that a little later.

We, the Commission and ODSA, are holding the workshop as part of our respective rule review process to receive feedback from interested persons and stakeholders on the rules in Chapters 17, 18, and 5-3 of the Ohio Administrative Code.

The workshop will be divided into three segments. The first segment relates to the Commission's and ODSA's rules for the PIPP Program. The Staff of ODSA and the Commission recognize that PIPP participants may be on the program for both their gas and electric utility services and, to the

extent feasible, consistency and clarity is important. We'll go through the PIPP rules by topic areas and take comments, questions, or concerns as to that topic area. We recognize that the rules in the chapters may intertwine and overlap, but we would ask that you focus on the topic area.

2.1

Next, ODSA Staff will take comments on the other rules in Chapter 122:5-3.

In the final segment of the workshop,

Commission Staff will take comments and questions on
the rules in Chapters 4901:1-17 and 18.

The Staffs of the -- the Staff of the two agencies have just begun their respective rule review process. The focus of the workshop is to receive feedback or comments on the rules and any recommendations that you have on how the current rules can be improved.

Both the Commission and ODS will be issuing their respective rule proposals in the upcoming months, at which time all stakeholders will have the opportunity to submit written comments and reply comments to each agency's proposal. We'll provide additional information on the filing of written comments when the proposals are issued.

As I previously informed you, the

workshop is being transcribed by a court reporter.

Nothing that is said today will be considered binding on the parties or any stakeholder in regards to the positions advocated on any issue. The transcript for today's workshop will be filed in the Commission's case docket in approximately two weeks and will also be posted to ODSA's website.

2.1

I would also like to point out that today's workshop is being webcast and an archive -- and a video recording of the workshop will be on the Commission's website.

As I said before, the purpose of the workshop is to open the dialogue among interested stakeholders and the staff of the two agencies and is not intended to substitute for the formal rule review and comment process. If you wish to raise a comment, a question, or a concern on a particular issue, please raise your hand and, once you're called upon, stand if you wish and you may make your comments from your chair or, if you prefer, you may come forward and use the podium and the microphone just here to my left. Please identify yourself and state your organization. And in the interest of affording everyone present an opportunity to make comments, we ask that you limit your comments to a reasonable

```
length of time.
```

2.1

2.2

As I noted previously, there will be an opportunity to file written comments and we certainly hope that you will participate in that manner.

With that explanation, are there any questions regarding the procedural process today?

Okay. Then let's move forward.

First, I'd like the members at the table here to introduce themselves. If you could start with Mr. Hunt.

MR. HUNT: Sure. I'm Randy Hunt with the Ohio Development Services Agency. I'm the Deputy Chief of the Office of Community Assistance.

MS. KOLATTUKUDY: I'm Brandy Kolattukudy with the Ohio Development Services Agency. I am the Energy Assistance Manager.

MS. DELISI: I am Megan DeLisi, Staff Attorney with the PUCO.

MR. FADLEY: I'm Rob Fadley, Interim

Director of the Service Monitoring and Enforcement

Department here on Staff.

MS. STEWART SHAW: I'm -- sorry. I'm

Tonja Stewart Shaw. I'm the Low-Income Program

Specialist here at the Public Utilities Commission.

MS. BOSSART: I'm Barbara Bossart and I'm

the Chief of the Reliability and Service Analysis Division.

2.

2.1

2.2

MS. MOORE: I'm Nicole Moore and I'm Chief of the Consumer Services Division.

EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Let's start with the Percentage of Income Payment Plan for both ODSA and the Commission. The first rule for each program is definitions. Are there any comments, questions, proposals for Rule 1?

MS. THOMPSON: Good morning. My name is Melissa Thompson and I'm with Columbia Gas of Ohio.

First of all, we want to thank you all for the opportunity this morning to present at a workshop and to take, I'll call it, introductory thoughts about the rules before the actual rule proposed changes are issued, so thank you.

Columbia only has one proposed change to the definitions in 4901:1-18-01 and that's at the definition at letter K and that's the definition for the "Former percentage of income payment plan plus customer." Columbia proposes to delete two words of that definition. So the definition reads: "(Former PIPP plus customer) means a customer that remains...." And we propose to delete "that remains" because former PIPP Plus customers may move out of

the service territory; they may not stay within that service territory. And that's the only change we are recommending this morning regarding the definitions. Thank you.

EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

2.1

Are there any other comments, proposals, or recommendations regarding the definitions in Chapter 18 or in ODSA's -- ODSA's rule in Rule 3-1?

Okay. Moving right along.

Let's move to PIPP Plus eligibility criteria and requirements reflected in Rule 18-12 and ODSA Rule 3-02. Any comments, concerns, questions, or issues?

MS. BLEND: Good morning. My name is Christen Blend. I'm counsel for AEP Ohio. Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments regarding the PIPP rules this morning.

AEP Ohio has two suggested changes to the criteria for customer eligibility rules contained in 122:5-3-02. The first is to subpart C of that rule. The final sentence of subpart C provides that -- currently provides that "Any overpayment of PIPP plus or graduate PIPP plus payments shall be applied to future PIPP plus or graduate PIPP plus payments once any default balance has been paid."

AEP Ohio suggests this morning that after the words "shall be applied to," the phrase "the customer's accrued arrearage and then to" should be inserted. So the sentence would read: "Any overpayment of PIPP plus or graduate PIPP plus payments shall be applied to the customer's accrued arrearage and then to future PIPP plus or graduate PIPP plus payments once any default balance has been paid."

2.1

AEP believes that this would bring the electric -- this portion of the electric rules into harmony with the gas rules and would enable customers who make overpayments to reduce their accrued arrearage and, therefore, reduce the overall revenue requirement for the utility before they begin to build credits for future PIPP payments.

The second -- the Company's second suggestion relates to Rule 122:5-3-02(H). In subpart (H)(1)(b)(i) or per (H)(1)(b)(i), customers are required to be current with their monthly PIPP payments only once a year. AEP Ohio believes that this rule does not encourage on-time and in-full payments each month, and to better encourage that customers continue to make on-time and in-full payments and, therefore, obtain the credits

applicable to those payments, that the Commission consider a rule change that would provide that after a second consecutive nonpayment of a monthly PIPP amount, the consumer would be dropped from PIPP Plus until they paid those default PIPP payments at which point they could be reactivated. And the Company will provide specific amendment language to that effect in comments. Thank you.

2.1

EXAMINER SEE: Any other comments?

MR. WILLIAMS: Good morning. My name is

Jim Williams, I'm with the Ohio Consumers' Counsel,

and I'm going to be talking about 4901:1-18-12(D) and

ODSA 122:5-3-02(H)(1) concerning the anniversary date

requirement.

The issue with this rule is that all payments have to be made, PIPP payments have to be made within one month of a customer's anniversary date; otherwise, they could be ineligible to participate in the program. We believe that this rule could be overly restrictive in terms of encouraging the participation for customers that definitely need the program, could benefit from the program.

This specifically pertains to areas where there are medical emergencies in the home at the

time, where services have been disconnected for nonpayment, where customers voluntarily stop service, where it's just cost-prohibitive for customers to restore services.

2.1

2.2

We believe that the rule -- or, we would ask that the PUCO and ODSA consider a little more flexibility in this rule so that customers have more than one month to try to make missed PIPP payments. Thank you very much.

EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

Any other comments regarding PIPP Plus eligibility or requirements, including income reverification and payment requirements?

Okay. The PIPP Plus installment payment amount, the application of assistance to PIPP customers' accounts, as reflected in Rules 18-13 and 3-04. Any comments, recommendations, questions?

Quiet group this morning. Did everybody get coffee?

(Laughter all around.)

EXAMINER SEE: Okay, just checking.

Moving to PIPP and Graduate PIPP incentives or arrearage credits contained in Rules 18-14 and 3-04. Any comments, questions, or recommendations?

Armstrong & Okey, Inc., Columbus, Ohio (614) 224-9481

MR. WILLIAMS: Thank you. Again, Jim Williams with the Ohio Consumers' Counsel.

2.1

This rule -- this comment pertains to ODSA Rule 122:5-3-04 and this concerns a rule where there are periodic reviews or where the ODSA Director may require periodic reviews of PIPP. One of the things that we would benefit from is to the extent that ODSA or the PUCO have conducted any types of analysis of PIPP since the rules were last reviewed, we would ask for the benefit of any of those types of reviews that might help kind of refine our thinking as we work on comments in the case. Thank you.

EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Any other comments, recommendations, or questions on that matter?

Moving right along. Let's look at the general provisions of the PIPP in the gas rules at 18-15 and 3-04. Any comments?

Mr. Williams, getting your steps in today, aren't you?

MR. WILLIAMS: Thank you, Your Honor.

Yes. We do have a couple comments concerning

1-18-15(G) as well as the ODSA Rule 122:5-3-05. This

concerns the Post PIPP Program. We think this has

been a very beneficial program for customers.

The only suggestion that we would make is

```
that when ODSA and PUCO are considering rules
1
2
     revisions is to, again, try to provide more latitude
     for more customers to be able to participate in the
 3
     Post PIPP. We think that 12 months or that the
 4
 5
     eligibility requirements where the Post PIPP only
 6
     applies for 12 months after a customer finals an
7
     account may be too restrictive, and that if payments
     are made after the 12 months, it would serve to
8
     benefit both the USF as well as the PIPP Riders.
9
10
     Thank you for your consideration.
11
                 EXAMINER SEE: Any other comments on that
12
    matter?
13
                 Let's move to the Graduate PIPP Program
14
     including the rules in 18-16 and 3-4. Any
15
     recommendations, comments, concerns?
16
                 Hearing none, let's talk about
17
     termination or removal from the PIPP Program as
18
     reflected in Rules 18-17 and 3-02.
19
                 Ms. Thompson.
20
                 MS. THOMPSON: Thank you, Your Honor.
2.1
                 Columbia Gas is proposing one minor
```

change to Rule 4901:1-18-17(C) regarding "Fraudulent act." In this rule, the rule reads, in the first sentence, that: "The gas or natural gas utility company shall terminate a customer's participation in

22

23

24

25

PIPP plus or graduate PIPP plus when it is determined by the gas or natural gas utility company that the PIPP plus or graduate PIPP plus customer was fraudulently enrolled in the program or when the customer is found to be non-compliant by ODSA."

There, we'd like to insert the following language:
"or by the gas or natural gas utility company."

2.1

There are times when the gas company and any other utility may understand when a customer has fraudulently enrolled and we also would like the ability to determine that as well, in partnership with ODSA. Thank you, Your Honor.

EXAMINER SEE: Any other comments or recommendations?

MR. WILLIAMS: Thank you, Your Honor.

There is one suggested change that we would like to see made in 4901:1-18-17 and also 122:5-3-05 concerning default payment plans. This issue concerns when customers are taken off of PIPP that there could be substantial balances that are due and the requirement for those arrearages to be due and payable under the standard what we'd assume to be the Commission-ordered payment plans.

We believe that since these balances could be substantial, that more flexibility would

benefit customers in being able to have longer payment terms; as well as for other social service agencies, that may be working on behalf of customers, to be able to come up with payment arrangements that can allow the customer or can enable the customer to continue to have utilities. Thank you.

EXAMINER SEE: Any other comments?

Are there any general comments or recommendations regarding the electric or gas PIPP Program that may not be currently contained in the rules?

Very quiet group.

2.1

2.2

Okay. With that, let's move to Phase 2 of the rules workshop. Let's move to the other rules in ODSA Chapter 122:5-03- -- -03, and let's start with the definitions unrelated to the PIPP Program. Are there any comments or recommendations to that rule?

Moving right along. The next rule, excluding the PIPP rules, would be procedures for disbursing public funds to electric utilities contained within Rule 122:5-3-05.

If there are no comments on that rule, we'll move to the next rule which is aggregation, 3-06.

1 If there are no comments regarding 2 aggregation, the next rule in the chapter is 3 procedures for administering funds under director's jurisdiction. That's Rule 3-07. Any comments or 4 5 recommendations? Next rule, 3-08, regarding energy 6 7 efficiency and weatherization services and consumer 8 education. 9 Rule 3-09, delegation of functions. Any 10 comments or recommendations? 11 And the final rule in the chapter, 12 severability, Rule 3-10. 13 Okay. Are there any other comments or 14 recommendations for any of the provisions in Chapter 15 122:5-3 that may not be reflected in ODSA's current 16 rules? 17 Let's move to the third segment of the 18 workshop and that's the Commission's rules in 19 Chapters 17 and 18 of the Ohio Administrative Code. 20 Let's start with the definitions in 2.1 Chapter 17; the establishment of credit for 2.2 residential service. 23 Any comments or recommendations as to 24 Rule 1? 25 Any comments or recommendations as to

```
18
     17-02, the general provisions?
 1
 2
                 Let's try Rule 3, the establishment of
 3
     credit.
                 Rule 4, the deposit to reestablish
 4
 5
     creditworthiness.
                 Any comments or recommendations regarding
 6
 7
     the deposit administration provisions in Rule 5?
                 Okav. Next, refund of deposit and
 8
     release of guarantor in Rule 17-06.
 9
10
                 Record of deposit in Rule 7. Any
11
     comments, recommendations?
12
                 Okay, hearing none.
13
                 Rule 17-08, applicant and/or customer
14
     rights.
15
                 Okay. We've covered Chapter 17 in record
16
     time.
17
                 Moving to Commission Chapter 18.
     Termination of residential service. Let's start with
18
19
     the definitions. Any comments or recommendations
20
     regarding the definitions outside of the PIPP Plus
2.1
     Program?
2.2
                 Hearing none, let's move to Rule 18-02.
23
     The general provisions.
24
                 Hearing none, let's move to Rule 3.
25
     Reasons for disconnecting residential electric gas or
```

natural gas service.

2.1

Ms. Thompson.

MS. THOMPSON: Thank you, Your Honor.

Columbia Gas and other utilities face a challenge that's not really addressed in the rules and that's 4901:1-18-03, specifically (E). (E) walks through when a customer, property owner, landowner, or agent does one of the following: (1) is prevent a utility from reading the meter once a year; (2) is after notice and a reasonable period of time, prevents utility company personnel from accessing, calibrating, maintaining, or replacing the utility company's meter, metering equipment, or other company property used to supply service at the premises.

The issue faced by many utilities, including Columbia, is the fact that we have certain manifold meters that are in homes that we do not have access to; homes where there may be multi-unit properties where there are good-paying customers as well as customers who are not paying and that we would need to disconnect for nonpayment.

Unfortunately, because there are good-paying customers and we don't have access to those meters, we can't shut off those accounts.

We'd like to propose some language to

address it, but we are definitely interested in the Commission's thoughts on how to address this issue in the future because the rules don't contemplate times when we cannot get into a premises but do need to shut off the gas. Thank you.

2.1

EXAMINER SEE: Ms. Thompson, before you leave the podium, could you just explain or give us a couple of examples of situations that you're thinking of when you're proposing revisions to this rule.

MS. THOMPSON: So, for example, in a home that is a duplex, so it's one premises but the meters are manifolded, they're together in the basement.

One customer on the left side of the premises is a good-paying customer. The customer on the right side of the premises is not a good-paying customer, and so we would have the right to disconnect under these rules. The problem is when we go to turn off that meter in the basement, we can't get access. The good-paying customer may not have access to the basement. It might be the landlord, and the landlord is prohibiting us from getting access into the premises.

The only way to shut off gas to the customer who is not paying their bill is to turn off at the street at the curb valve and, right now, the

rules don't contemplate an ability for us to do that because we do have a good-paying customer there who may not be able to provide us access.

So one of the rule considerations, language considerations we had was to put that burden on the property owner or the landowner, somebody who does have control of the premises, to give adequate notice to the customers that are in the premises, so then we can try to disconnect service to those customers who are not good-paying customers, who may be stealing service, fraudulent issues, safety issues. We just -- we don't really have a rule that defines what our rights are to at least take care of that customer.

EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

MS. THOMPSON: Any other questions from Commission Staff?

Thank you, Your Honor.

EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

Any other comments on 18-03?

Moving to 18-04, delinquent bills. Any comments, concerns, recommendations?

Moving to the next rule. Extended payment plans and responsibilities, 18-05. Comments or recommendations?

Hearing none.

2.1

The next rule is disconnection procedures for electric, gas, and natural gas utilities as contained within Rule 18-06.

Please step forward.

MR. CASTO: Thank you. I am Scott Casto, here on behalf of The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, The Toledo Edison Company, and The Ohio Edison Company; the FirstEnergy Ohio utilities.

Three comments; one overarching.

The rules do not currently contemplate what happens when there's full deployment of smart meters, and so we would ask the Commission Staff to take into account any changes in technology or abilities that the utilities might have once smart meters are fully deployed. That's not really contemplated right now in the current version of the rules.

The second comment is 4901:1-18-06(A)(1). It reads: "No disconnections for nonpayment shall be made after 12:30 p.m. on the day preceding a day" and then it goes on. We would recommend that when smart meters are fully deployed that there be a separate section to move that time to 3:30 p.m. instead of 12:30 p.m.

And the last comment dealing with the 1 2 medical certification in 4901:1-18-06(C)(3)(h). A consumer may renew their certification two additional 3 times for 30 days each. We would recommend that that 4 5 be only for one additional time, and remind Staff 6 that customers have the winter option for the winter 7 months from November 1st to April 15th, two occurrences to utilize the medical certification, the 8 9 initial time and then their one renewal, and they 10 also have the potential to enroll in our utility's 11 Critical Customer Program which is defined in 12 4901:1-10-08(L). That is all I have. 13 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you, Mr. Casto. 14 Are there any other comments, 15 recommendations, or comments regarding Rule 18-06? 16 Did I hear some excitement and rumbling 17 back there? 18 (Laughter all around) 19 MS. BOTSCHNER O'BRIEN: 06 were you on? 20 EXAMINER SEE: Yes. 2.1 MS. BOTSCHNER O'BRIEN: Good morning. 22 I'm Amy Botschner O'Brien from the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel. 23 24 The winter disconnection rules, 25 4901:1-18-06(B), should clarify that the winter rules apply to disconnections that occur during the winter season, November 1st through April 15th, regardless of when the usage occurred or the original disconnection notice was given to the customer.

2.1

This was an issue in a complaint case.

The PUCO ruled that the winter rules applied whenever the usage occurred or the notice was given. It should be codified in the rules. Thank you.

EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

Any other comments or recommendations?

Moving on to Rule 18-07. The

reconnection of service. Comments, concerns, issues?

Mr. Williams.

MR. WILLIAMS: Thank you, Your Honor.

The one suggestion that we would like
Staff to consider on the reconnection of service is
to consider the utility companies that have AMI
meters that have the remote-reconnection capabilities
and to provide for more accelerated reconnection of
service if customers have AMI meters and the service
can be restored from the utility back office as
opposed to sending a truck out to turn on service.

The current rules, as I understand them, require that payments have to be made by 12:30 in order for service to be reconnected the same day. We

believe that with the remote-reconnect capabilities, 1 2 that could perhaps be accelerated. Customers could pay later in the day and still get services. 3 That's all I have. Thank you. 4 5 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you. 6 Any other comments? 7 Moving on to Rule 18-08. Landlord-tenant 8 provisions. Are there any comments or recommendations on that rule? 9 10 Combination utility companies as 11 reflected in Rule 18-09. 12 Okay. Hearing no comments, let's move to 13 Rule 18-10. Insufficient reasons for refusing 14 service or for disconnecting service. Any comments, 15 recommendations, or issues? 16 Hearing none, Rule 18-11. Restrictive 17 language prohibition. Any comments? 18 Hearing none, that concludes the rules in 19 Chapter 18 since we addressed the PIPP Program first. 20 Are there any other comments or 2.1 recommendations for provisions that are not currently 2.2 reflected in Chapter 18 of the Commission's rules? 23 Any proposals? 24 Very quiet group today. 25 If there are no other comments or

recommendations for proposal or proposals, the Commission Staff and ODSA Staff would like to thank you all for coming out today. We appreciate your participation. That concludes the workshop, and we hope that you will file written comments in the formal proceeding. Thank you very much.

(Thereupon, the proceedings concluded at 10:42 a.m.)

## CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the proceedings taken by me in this matter on Tuesday, February 5, 2019, and carefully compared with my original stenographic notes.

Carolyn M. Burke, Registered Professional Reporter, and Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio.

My commission expires July 17, 2023.



This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on** 

2/13/2019 1:05:53 PM

in

Case No(s). 19-0052-AU-ORD

Summary: Transcript In the Matter of the Commission's Review of Chapters 4901:1-17 and 4901:1-18 of the Ohio Administrative Code, hearing held on February 5th, 2019. electronically filed by Mr. Ken Spencer on behalf of Armstrong & Okey, Inc. and Burke, Carolyn