

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company for Administration of the Significantly Excessive Earnings Test Under Section 4928.143(F), Revised Code, and Rule 4901:1-35-10, Ohio Administrative Code.

Case No. 18-857-EL-UNC

STIPULATION AND RECOMMENDATION

INTRODUCTION

Rule 4901-1-30, Ohio Administrative Code (“O.A.C.”) provides that any two or more parties to a proceeding may enter into a written stipulation covering the issues presented in such a proceeding. The purpose of this document is to set forth the understanding and agreement of the parties who have signed below (the “Signatory Parties”) and to recommend that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (the “Commission” or “PUCO”) approve and adopt this Stipulation and Recommendation (“Stipulation”), as part of its Opinion and Order in this proceeding, resolving all of the issues in the proceeding.

This Stipulation is supported by adequate data and information; represents a just and reasonable resolution of issues in this proceeding; violates no regulatory principle or precedent; and is the product of serious bargaining among knowledgeable and capable Signatory Parties in a cooperative process and undertaken by the Signatory Parties representing a wide range of interests to resolve the aforementioned issues. For purposes

of resolving the issues raised by this proceeding, the Signatory Parties stipulate, agree and recommend as set forth below.

PARTIES

This Stipulation is entered into by and among Ohio Edison Company (“Ohio Edison”), The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company (“CEI”), and The Toledo Edison Company (“Toledo Edison”) (collectively, “Companies”) and the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Staff”) and the Ohio Energy Group (“OEG”).¹

STIPULATION

The returns on equity earned in 2017 by the Companies, as adjusted by specific items contemplated in the stipulations in Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO, were: CEI 4.0%, Ohio Edison 11.8%, and Toledo Edison 6.4%. The Signatory Parties stipulate, agree and recommend that such returns do not reflect significantly excessive earnings for the Companies under their ESP for 2017.

The Signatory Parties stipulate, agree and recommend that the Commission admit the Companies’ Application and accompanying materials filed May 15, 2018 into the record of this proceeding and issue its Opinion and Order in this proceeding determining that significantly excessive earnings under Revised Code Section 4928.143(F) did not occur with respect to the Companies’ ESP in 2017.

¹ The Commission Staff is a party for the purpose of entering into this Stipulation pursuant to O.A.C. 4901-1-10(C).

PROCEDURAL ISSUES

This Stipulation is submitted for purposes of this proceeding only, and is not deemed binding in any other proceeding, nor is it to be offered or relied upon in any other proceedings, except as necessary to enforce the terms of this Stipulation. The agreement of the Signatory Parties reflected in this document is expressly conditioned upon its acceptance in its entirety and without alteration by the Commission. The Signatory Parties agree that if the Commission or any court of competent jurisdiction rejects all or any material part of this Stipulation, or otherwise materially modifies its terms, any adversely affected Signatory Party shall have the right to file an application for rehearing or a motion for reconsideration. If such application or motion is filed, and if the Commission or court does not, on rehearing or reconsideration, accept the Stipulation without material modification within 45 days of the filing of such motion, then anytime thereafter the adversely affected Signatory Party may terminate its Signatory Party status without penalty or cost and regain its rights as a non-Signatory Party as if it had never executed the Stipulation by filing a notice with the Commission and the other Signatory Parties.

Unless the Signatory Party exercises its right to terminate its Signatory Party status as described above, each Signatory Party agrees to and will support the reasonableness of this Stipulation before the Commission, and to cause its counsel to do the same, and in any appeal from the Commission's adoption and/or enforcement of this Stipulation. The Signatory Parties also agree to urge the Commission to accept and approve the terms hereof as promptly as possible.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, this Stipulation has been signed by the authorized agents of the undersigned Parties as of this 26th day of October, 2018. The undersigned Parties respectfully request the Commission to issue its Opinion and Order determining that significantly excessive earnings did not occur with respect to each of the individual Companies' ESPs in 2017. The Stipulation will be held open for additional interveners and parties to sign on as Signatory Parties until the issuance of an Order by the Commission.

/s/ Robert M. Endris

Robert M. Endris

FirstEnergy Service Company
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
330.384.5728 (telephone)
330.384.3875 (fax)
rendris@firstenergycorp.com

**On behalf of Ohio Edison Company,
The Toledo Edison Company, and The
Cleveland Electric Illuminating
Company**

/s/ Thomas W. McNamee

(per email authority)

Thomas W. McNamee
Assistant Attorney General
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor
Columbus, OH 43216-0573
614.466.4397 (telephone)
614.644.8764 (fax)
thomas.mcnamee@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

**On behalf of the Staff of the Public
Utilities Commission of Ohio**

/s/ Michael Kurtz

(per email authority)

Michael Kurtz
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
513.421.2255 (telephone)
513.421.2764 (fax)
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com

On behalf of the Ohio Energy Group

PROOF OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing Stipulation and Recommendation was served via electronic mail upon the following parties of record, this 26th day of October, 2018.

/s/ Robert M. Endris

Robert M. Endris
FirstEnergy Service Company

Parties of Record:

Thomas W. McNamee
Assistant Attorney General
Public Utilities Section
East Broad Street, 6th Floor
Columbus, OH 43216-0573
614.466.4397 (telephone)
614.644.8764 (fax)
thomas.mcnamee@ohioattorneygeneral.com

Michael Kurtz
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
513.421.2255 (telephone)
513.421.2764 (fax)
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com

Bryce McKenney
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
65 East State Street, 7th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
614.466.9585 (telephone)
Bryce.mckenney@occ.ohio.gov

Frank P. Darr
Wallace & Nurick LLC
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
614.469.8000 (telephone)
614.469.4653 (telecopier)
fdarr@mwncmh.com

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

10/26/2018 1:33:22 PM

in

Case No(s). 18-0857-EL-UNC

Summary: Stipulation Stipulation and Recommendation electronically filed by Mr Robert M Endris on behalf of Ohio Edison Company and The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company