From: John Lipaj [mailto:johnlipaj@gmail.com]
Sent: Thursday, September 20, 2018 3:59 PM

To: Butler, Matthew <matthew.butler@puco.ohio.gov>; Puco ContactOPSB

<contactopsb@puco.ohio.gov>

Subject: Case Number 16-1871-E-BGN Icebreaker Wind Facility: Letter and 34 pages of petition

signatures

Dear Matt,

We would greatly appreciate your assistance with filing the attached letter and 34 pages of signatures in opposition to the Icebreaker Wind Facility, with the OPSB.

Sincerely, -John Lipaj

Cell: 440-476-0267



www.lakeeriefoundation.org

September 19, 2018

Asim Z Haque, Chairman Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 180 East Broad Street Columbus, OH 43215

Case Number: 16-1871-EL-BGN

We are submitting for your consideration the attached petitions from concerned residents of Ohio and Michigan urging you in your September 24 hearing to order appropriate delays of any approvals for the proposed "Icebreaker" demonstration project in Lake Erie.

As Ohio's greatest natural resource, Lake Erie is a fragile body of water already facing a massive algae problem, a myriad of invasive species, and other threats to the ecosystem. The Lake Erie Energy Development Company (LEEDCo) has a stated goal of stimulating construction of hundreds more turbines in "wind farms" throughout Lake Erie and other Great Lakes after this first demonstration project. However, blighting our beautiful lakes with hundreds of industrial-size windmills is completely incompatible with the value, enjoyment and protection of these treasured waters that are held in the public trust by the states of Ohio and Michigan.

Much has already been written and published about this proposal. The damage to the environment, ranging from spreading carcinogens trapped in the lake bottom into the drinking water of millions to killing birds protected under the Migratory Bird Treaty, will be the unacceptable result.

Moreover, recognizing the increased costs of building and maintaining turbines in the waters of the Great Lakes make it abundantly clear the claimed economic benefits of such wind power simply cannot be substantiated. A study of such offshore installations in countries like Great Britain and Germany document their electric rates to be among the highest in the world.

Further, we foresee such turbine installations will become navigational hazards and will trigger large "security zones" around any wind farm, something LEEDCo has never addressed. Prohibiting thousands of recreational boating and fishing families access to large areas of water that is held in the public trust should be unacceptable to every member of the OPSB.

Therefore, we ask you to recognize the overwhelming negative consequences of "Icebreaker." Further, that you uphold a duty to protect the health and aesthetics of Lake Erie and, thus, the quality of life for those who live, work and recreate on or near Ohio and Michigan's most important natural resource. We urgently request this Board put the value of Lake Erie above any need to jeopardize our waters, and disapprove the "Icebreaker" project.

Sincerely. Advocate

Bryan Ralston

President

Lake Eric Marine Trades Association

Westlake, OH

David Strapg President

saveourbeautifullake.org

ROME TOOK OH Cleveland

Thomas . Sullivan, dr

Officer

nolakeer windlaun.org

Bay Village, OH

Jim Herold Trustee

Edgewater Yacht Club

Cleveland, OH

Nicki Polan

Executive Director

Michigan Boating Industries Association

Livonia, MI

Attachments: Signed Petitions asking the Board to Reject the OPSB Staff Recommendation

PRINT NAME	A DORESS EMAIL	PHONE
Finds Krone 2. BoB, Sight Lings	jp709vj@bex.net	
But Sullo KENNA	SNINGLING PAPK. N	E7
4. Georard Buch	trukenna 55/1/6 5 buckrita @ gmail.	mail.com
EONARD BUCK 5. JOHN LIPAS	ovekrita (2) gmail.	Com
6. Ster Mill	JOHN LIPASE GMALL.	
Steven Miller	Smcoachstevel g.	/
Helen FUNARI Sulus Funari	hefunari @ /o.	hoo.com.
9.		YAHOO, COM
THOMAS HANWAY	TOM@ RISHEPIPHAN Vankick TRACEY @ S.N	ly. Com
- Cy - WINTER	MANKIEK TKHERT BO S.W.	rael Com

NAME	A-DORESS EMAIL	PHONE
1. Jane Day	janeday @ correct, net	352-538-3605
Ocra Whesvour	comeast net	
3. Wack Daning of	dennimment 476 grant un	216-536-1412
4. AlanMiller	alan 1310 outlook.co	
Bob Scheeter	scheet proor yehro.	com 216 952 1884
6. Adan Chells 7.	Chelfast & gmail.com	330 4643343
Maria Chellis 8.	mnchellis egmail.com	330-347-5615
9. Bethany Carpenter	Sthony corpenter Eyahoo Saminadaco Eparthalano	10m 937-209-1898
JAM INSALACO	Saminadaco eparthalano	r 216-272-3964
Joshua Button	jbotton 26@gnail.	3304141592

PRINT	Address and/or	
NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
Keleed McDevitt		phany · COM
MARYKAY PAQUEL	et marykay. Paquel	let@FTI consulting. com
WALT HESS	CHASKA 802 8 y	9 Na
MIKE SCRUGGS	scruggsmike @	3-01-11
6. Chris FELDMAN	cifboatajuno,	com 33. 714-2666
Il Parell	MATHER X @ YOU	
Ken Papay	Kenjapaye GM	e, 1.com
Done, Coldren	COLDRON OFFONT	IER. com Jana
10. Navid Janny	Sianne. Young 48	16R. com Jangten in Daughten in Jeneral
Dan Kay	Mi RADio	4269@gMA:L.00

"We the undersigned, urge the members of the <u>Ohio Power</u> <u>Siting Board</u>, to reject the staff recommendations regarding the Icebreaker Wind Facility"

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE	
Marjanne Kasmu	sse Roszy	ru Rool. com	
2.			
Stephen RASMUSSE 3.	n RAZZY194	4@ Aol. wm	
DONALDS HAAS			-830A
Brandon Haas	capt. brandon. ha	aspgmailcon 440-787-830	oZ
5. Jules Bené 6. Romnie Baker	juliafishte	Jahoo.com	
Romie Baker	NA		
7. Debu & Buken	NA	2167977728	
8. Carol Woundary	6		
9. Jon Blodge		Hoearlluk, ned	
10. Heidi Blorget			

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
Mechan and	College Claus Wedens & Co	may pet 586 463-4972- nov.com 586-3521.8021
Chester Van	Parker currenti 1@ var	100.com 586-354.8021
E. R. L. J.	ELU41 each con	734-525-3656
Benedite L. Ret Lug Pan Poince Beter Boine	18A CLARDODE	nail.com (313) 570-3546
Pavid Masla Dove Visley		810-335-5876 cm 56-263-8200 216-870-9244

"We the undersigned urge the members of the Ohio Power Siting Board to REJECT the current staff recommendation for approval of the proposed Icebreaker Wind Facility unless and until additional environmental and economic research is concluded and publicly presented.

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
1. Karla Cardevell 2.	Kenla. norwood@icloud con ACLEN 291 @ME, con	
A. Dittone	ACCEN 291 @ ME, COM	
4. W Forsythe	Captabill 139000 A GPATENA 8:	yahoo
5. GENO PATENA	A GPATENA 8:	39 @ AOL, COM
5 Shelley Patera	SPaterra OHIO HIOT.	A. 0+9
7. 1 STREACKE	tom@streacker+rac	bor.com
John Vergis	I vergise wherey.com	
Laura Vergis	(five lady bus@ya	how.com
o. Maria Malatja John Mac Alpin	macmarush@a	
* *		

5

"We the undersigned, urge the members of the <u>Ohio Power</u> Siting Board, to reject the staff recommendations regarding the Icebreaker Wind Facility"

1	EMAIL	PHONE
Nancy Brances	TBRANDES 2 WOWLY.	on 216-257-5841
Jim Honord 3. Vim Semancik 4. Lee Beach	BILLAHUNASIGO GA VIM ZAZE AWOWNAY,	MIL 440.915-3665 30M 216 662 6511 440-338-8197
Two Derkelsches	Speitelebetine telbaher, net	
Corney Culict	ualleysture X have	901.csm 413-624-35 on 440999992 US 219 7887

Bonita August bonaugust@mail.com 216-904-605/ Dana Baker dbaker 001@defigure.edu 978-1473 Sonne Matracker heyjudyreally@gmail.com 419-422- Reigh Ceth Cethy Reigh@gmail.com 330 842 167 5.				
Jane Maker abaker 001@ defigure. edu 978-1473 419-422- 419-422- 419-422- 419-422- 419-422- 419-422- 419-422- 419-422- 5. 6. Brian wild Texinerian Commission 5305715703 6. Jeff Davis Javis 411 6@mass.com 5305715703 7. Jeff Davis Javis 411 6@mass.net 248-219-6004 1. Haren Davis Javis 411 6@mass.net 248-219-6004 1. Haren Davis Javis 4116@ Comerst. Net 248-353633 1. Jeff Davis Javis 11160 Comerst. Net 248-353633 1. Jeff Davis 116-9203. 1. Jeff Davis 116-9203.	NAME	EMAIL	PHONE	
Jame Maker abaker 001@ defigure. edu 978-1473 Afanne Maker abaker 001@ defigure. edu 978-1473 Algoria Maker abaker begrudyreally Domail. com Algoria Com Reigh Coth Cothy Reigh @ gmail. com Source of Texine Filone a Bomarc. com Source of Davis Javis 411 6@ maest. net 248-219-6004 Maker Davis Javis 411 6@ maest. Net 248-219-6004 Maker Davis Javis 411 6@ maest. Net 248-353633 Brach 201 @ AOL 418-33-223	Bonita Augus	t bonaugusta	gnail.com 216-8	204-6051
James Stracker heyrodyreally Dynail.com 0076 Reigh Ceth Cethy Reigh Ogneric.com 330 842 167 5. Brian wich Texinerisma Domaric.com 5305715703 Jeff Davis Jdavis 411 6 Comcast. net 248-219-6004 KAREN DAVIS Wildthing 11100 Comerst. Net 248-353633 Beach 201 O Acr. 419-433 223	Dana Bak	er dhakeron	@do Go 121	6-
Brian Wild TCFINEFIGHTEN BOMANC. Com S305715703 Jeff Davis Jdavis 411 6 Comeast. net 248-219-6004 KAREN DAVIS Wildthing 11120 Comeast. Net 248-3553633 Brach 201 @ AOL 419-33 223	Jane MAh	æder heyjudys	eally Dgmail.com	419-422-
Jeff Davis Jdavis 4116 Comcast, net 248-219-6004 KAREN DAVIS W. Idthing 1110 Comeast, Net 248-315-3633 Bracen 201 @ AUL 419-433-223 HIST TBOANNESO (NOWNAY COM 216-9203)	Keigh Cat	h Cathy Reig	4 @ gmzic. com	330 842 1674
BUACH 201 @ AUL 419-133-223	Brian Wic	4 TCFIREFIGHT		5305715703
Brack 201 @ AUL 419-133-223	How Davis	s jdavis4116		
The Boards 1455 TBOANDESOLVOWNAY COM 216-8203.	JA C	9		
They hosley prestan 4 @ SMALLOON 1	In Sante			
	Taky Josley	,		
	V (2		

"We the undersigned urge the members of the Ohio Power Siting Board to REJECT the current staff recommendation for approval of the proposed Icebreaker Wind Facility unless and until additional environmental and economic research is concluded and publicly presented.

Address and ler PRINT NAME PHONE "ED FLASCHETT! EJ-haschern gme ocom 2/6543 Grug Faschion Grigtoschion Damilium 216-3370216 MARK CORSON MARKL CORSON @ACL. COM 7/39074881 4. William Zimlich sailing 25 Dyahou. 614-761-7626 Sharon Hasek Sharon hasek & Gmail cem 440-724.4485 Jusan Legisk Slesjak@ad.com 440-567-0475 Chris Stevens Chris@grandpointemurinuccon 517 7194523. Rathleen Rymner runner@ bex. wet 419-626-6655 216-269-1866 216.347 - 4880

9

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
John Sacker	-	536-308-1882
Lor Beaureezer	J	586-596-4483
middle Bishyp)	586-419-1097
TAMMY BRANDT		810-794-0864
5. Myhely Coyer S		5-855-2704
7. Malmaln 8.		586 5319349 734 425 9318
8. Corol Beautyus		86 794-7293
Alysia White Tammy Freen	3	586.855.2957
laming treen	nin	248-770-7147

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
Hemsethy alvey	KENALVEY @ Sbeglobe !	net 1
The Toopse	Mike Toups 480	2 6 mail. Com
Lorendosenbuy	locimes enburg@gmail, con	
4. YHICHARL O' GNNO, TH	mdo Cowwil. wm	419. 303-3504
5. Larouen a. Wood	Kareleen wood@ 9 mail	567-224-2311
6. Amb. Wood	KMB23CC@gminl.Co	My
7. My Show	greg 44281@ /ahol	7330-352-1417
Melissa Schieni	v	3307393626
Michael D. Mettle	TLP Me HIE @ D.Mai I CCA	
Catherine Linden	clinden Z@ Stu. Sandusky	4119-357-8278

NAME		EMAIL		PHONE		
chailes	RUSSO	Kath Russ	o G Ho Tmail	216-	701-3095	
3. OU AL	Perkins	Bighirdi	sabira	Dgmail	440-554 1.com	
4. Kash	ST LUS	So III	- loster	nifdiplo15	216-67	71-538
5. Folgon	sk. ef	Rogowski	Ogmilea	2/6 S	216-67 10 yanco . Com 143-8183 419 450	6
6. Commy	LKesom	1. Jennik	EN D. Kogo	ushi	330.860	1009
8. Thom	en K	USSO 1	- avussol	5@.Sja	students o	9
9. Toul	, voice	JE SV II	216.27	2.166S	216-645	, 06/
9. TomCon 10. Tem F.	eva Terr	y Pena	12210 1	HO-5 N, cake	10.0853 e Rd	
			Ve/MITIS	~, 04 6	44089	

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
1. Mr. Naporto 2.		ML con 586-242.564/
	es RK. James	garga lahoo.com
3. Pan Jaw	8 (1	((,)
Dy Ane & Rosse	L DYANHORD @	5866LOBAL 584 NET 731-3112
CHARLES PROS	u 1	'c 'c ' (
CHARLES PROS 6. RUSSELL BARR CAROL DOND 7.	FISHERMANTO YA	586-759-5656 2400, COM 586-759-5656
Melodie Kapolta		a C (mail. com 5868546931
NicHelas Bullardelle	NICH-Billardello	comment onet 586 925-2201
Shirley Doleck	Shirdol @ ao	51.com 596-295-7963
10. Megur Duruci	megan.dolecta	@ gmail. 5860 4197931

"We the undersigned urge the members of the Ohio Power Siting Board to REJECT the current staff recommendation for approval of the proposed Icebreaker Wind Facility unless and until additional environmental and economic research is concluded and publicly presented.

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
goy # V-G	VSO JOE DOG	MAL.com 810-824-0539
Stee Gordon	Gordo 123 @ C.	mil. 810-941-3372
Jeann a Egla	N n	No.
Jan Wei	kel	24866639
Marly We	Isel	1
Inda PHe	ughe huggh	dinda @ aol, com
hennel of	Drugghe Z.	48 853 3251
Grag OKoneus	istc.	248-496-7858
). Brian pelir		386-255-3924
Leah Sacker	/	405-923-3651

14

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE	
PAUL NO	A COMPANY OF THE PARTY OF THE P	The contract of the contract o	
2.	iceli RoseMiceli	pt comcast Net 586-8	77 7
she a	18	WCL 206-8	64-1
3 Can Loch	ran banilosia	B Smail. com 734	
I si	Jan 190001	& Small.com 134	-6248
Lisa Plum	- Plummar 1/46	M	
*		Romast Net 248505	5-1231
Bant Prim)]		
- 0 1	1	Ŋ	1
Dong Carles	Dmc 1 ma	noil.10 586-242 1127	
1 000 1	or less cogi	novilla 586-242 1127	
Lori Carle	SS LLCarless 91000	29 mail rom 11 11	Ports
na		D. reicom	
MARTYWELL	MARTYWEIKE	COATLINET 248666.	
1 11 11		Chaples (48666.	3993
thren Walte	ns jk waltersale	Chanter. 8106474079	
AIBUT DOLL			
	18 A DOUGIAS 202. Gar	il.cn 734 -624-496	
relades Tuz	innel!	M.cn 734 -624-496 Cyaloacan 81076530	L
	Melade 67	016 long . 8/17/653	101
	Manage 1	Myaran 010 18 336	//

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
Gary betweene	4 s ge Kiere	e ont. net 586-634-5918
Jeannaffe My	inne jminne 19400	gmail.com 586-588-5868
4. Petorant	Uffe Denvichbuff	Ta C youldon to 586-522-2794
PEGGY BO Robert Bo Michi Polan	BEL peggy bob.	el@ OUTLOOK. Com
Kobert Bo	Bec 11	(1)
Michi Polan	nicki polan ea	moust, net (248) 338-5285
ROGER DY		GNAL GN 586-491-6178
LISTAN LOFFINE	R DocHoffre	gmail.com Z69-251-1818.
Mika Holdora	h-Knamichale	gmail.com 269-251-1818. smail.com 219-25-1-8227
Dan Hall	dhalle colonum	nurine.um 586-291-5432
	7"	100 111 Com - 00 291-5432

WTOKARZBEON	Mail 22-756-4513 CAST. 734-981-6384
WTOKARZBEON	CAST. 734-981-6384
	, , , ,
f- 1-)	
iandsrieck@a	ol 810-794-3184
rizck 3313 @gma	11 810-278-1456
and strack (SO	4 Com 810-734-1173
ymodbatt 2@gw	Rila- 313-510-7873
SAGER AH, NE	ine.com
Billyseusa	586-4450300
	rieck3313@gma

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
Dennis Pe	rliski dperliskie	concast net 586-786-6472
Jour R.	rtiskin 11	•
Bell	LOVE W14818100	Dome AT 1/2
monia C	Love WL4818000	586 322-113 y
Ty Work	7	707@ AOL. Com 248-627
Deboraltwork	ey 11	"
Debra Emerso	V GEPPRESONELSON	John com
ose Miceli	Rose mission	onerst, net 596 489-495
LAN EMERSON	ALAN EMERSON & Y	Thou con

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
naren DeBoer	Lighthwase 13160	nel 586-961-6305
2. Kevin Scharf	Kevin D Ksinspections	
Solvat	()	11
Scott Spackers. Lancy Falarl	SUSPAULDING 62 DENIA	lin.com 910 824 0505
LAWRENCE YOST	gnlaparle att. net Lm Y OST @ HOTMAIL	810-194-1288
Carol Yost	// // j	582 752 3853
Dimis Koster	DENNISITOSTER 1 @ 9MAIL. COM	248 9911446

"We the undersigned urge the members of the Ohio Power Siting Board to REJECT the current staff recommendation for approval of the proposed Icebreaker Wind Facility unless and until additional environmental and economic research is concluded and publicly presented.

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
BN MX		566.293.3160
Jh Den	-1116	49hou Can 586-295 10-
Drawl Ja	Sky FK Kosky @	901.com 248464-0491
Shelly Mafa	den shellmir@y	901.com 248464.049/ alion.com 819-319-1268
Exam n		519 3196767
Listera	Keith mangle	9496 Can 586722 york
Cha Ban	-1- CUSSAMER & Solver?	100m 5869277651
Jame Crat	TRESSED 7	ARANTINE. NEE -
Bawn Surm		CHAUG 242-693-7385
euvi Jum	a aawnothesu	rmas. 586 801.0540

20

NAME 1.	EMAIL	PHONE
Kair Bedn	anski Imbelners	PHONE K. DYMAN, 586-464-7759
STEVE RIST	JUNO SEISTAGNIVAL	Vaho com 584 - 468.775
S. CARI Kalke	CA KELKER	GmAI, com 586322 436
6. Hingeline W	Villiams -	(941) 637-9900
Chris McCr	ocken —	1000,00m 286 201-9593
Pamin Supporte Billie Screpani	le Doute 421 Chotman	1 con 586-431-4333
o. E7Mine Lyen	elanetereno ostor	The state of the s

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
Michelle Wasterfo	rd Michelle. waterfolden	Mail com 586-339-0
Lewis Hora	ha Lewis Herderson 2012	Damale 1
Marijes	NATEDM 865 @ MSN. com	(586) 2K-4016
James Ethan	GLANTSTUNER YAHO. OM	586 7700007
m Lewis	mlewie.72 @gmail	E86-792-4007
KM eyers	Kanleen Nleys	(e17817 245)
Stevenson usa	julsteven@comcast.no	et 248 380 8806
Tahas	KTAK622@hormail.	248/ COM 200-9979
FAULS	TAFAULS Q gMAIL. COM	
DIENTEK	DAY BEE @ AOL. COM	and the state of t

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
1. Andreas as is	^	
Andrea Scacken		313-613-0179
ELMER RABINE	KZGOBC@YAHOO CO	586 \$49 2454
Andy Davis		517-455 -5839
Joann Triande	prontogolf@gmail.com	
Liz Szlaga	eszlaga@hotmail.com	*
tmounda wendecter	awendeckere on bia. org	property and the second
belly by	bsly a mbia. ong	810-449-1883
Janille 6	dbaldridgeambia.og	810-728-8360
Ed Willer		40. 372-1365
Venny Miller	4	40.829-2284

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
Muchael ag	Moter Cleans Wedens @	Concept 10th 566 463-4912- ahou.com 566-3521-8021
Chustere Van	Parker currenti 1000	ahou.com 586-354.8021
E. R. Let	ELII41 each com	734-525-3656
Beneditte Z		
Por Los	MALLARDBOR	
Peter Boin		
Pavid Mas C	andra	8/0-335-5876
	RAC 6 BUSECPA	

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
Mike Go		aom. us 586-630-2367
Lewise St.	coster gkoster	586 756 5853 Pegmail (248) 770-442
Alalkow.	USHZ 11 CH	comailar 586.879-760)
from & Pour PAULA PERS	6406 MARINA (RIVER DRIVE 810-858-384
		(586) 907-3916
Bols Higge		26-214-6632
tagh Swears		440-759-2906

"We the undersigned urge the members of the Ohio Power Siting Board to REJECT the current staff recommendation for approval of the proposed Icebreaker Wind Facility unless and until additional environmental and economic research is concluded and publicly presented.

Print	osteraded and publicly	
NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
1. Maria Sentiferra	v D	330 289 7026
2. Julie DiFilippe		ljule@yehos.com 440-258-6A2P
3. Cindy White	Cindyuh	ytegmail.con 4196027428
4. Ally Bailey	alexesra	PMURE YULLO COM (216)385-0228
6. Amber Bair	y ambur	bailey 20/00 yahoo.com 440 665 9, 41968ab@gmail.com 8159
7. Hmy barley	amybed	4/968ab@gmail.com 8/59
8. Il Di Vingel	BRIAN. KIN	2 ET CORRELE. COM
Melissa Mayer	-0	440.725.5113
9. Bonnett Kinze		
10. CHARLIE NINZE		440.899-9553

26

NAME 1.	EMAIL	PHONE
Engtree		248-770-7146
Dennis Wi		586-615-3269
Louise Li	ught	810-531-0778
Margart Yun		586-725-6117
most thouse	A	586 725 6117
L. Marka	Marine and American	586-716-5722
Rack Ly	n	810 223-1260
Dana J. De		734. 676.7447
Emy Kappler	AVKEPPLER OG M	
redopper		440.570-5836

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
DAVID DIMAURO 2. PATRICK MED	DUDO325B (GIOBALNE)	7 2165330621 216 2514686
3. Sharon Chmura	i slchmura13@gmail	.com · 216 3232379
	jhaseley@durr.	440-781-5079
5. DAN Haseloy	dahaseley@oh.rr.	440-781-5078
Charle L. Z	dzenglin Qgmail.com	440-773-7248 PAOL CA 440967-4497
		216.570.6539
Mary Linky	~ +	734-735.9547 440-539-6547
. JAKERABET	-/-	440-539-0040

Dignatures to be presented to the OHIO POWER Siting BOARD prior to 9-24-18 Meeting.

RESOLUTION

"We the undersigned urge the members of the Ohio Power Siting Board to REJECT the current staff recommendation for approval of the proposed Icebreaker Wind Facility unless and until additional environmental and economic research is concluded and publicly presented.

NAME	EMAIL	*
1. WALTER MCD		PHONE +409883799
2. AUBREY 1	McDowELL	440-988-3799
3. (MARK 1		941-544-3426
4. Patrice	Heec Ren	941-587-7680
5. 6. 7. JUSTIN S 8. Alex Smith 9. Pen Smith 10. Buon		440-781-8857 440-666-4575 440-356-5500 440-808-1933 440-319-2252 216-406-1475

29

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
Dang Hari	14GO @	810-650-6366
Words Taple	Jupitalach	2 Yorok
Marcell Child		nailican 810-858-8026
Matthew	Qmattweine 6	gmail 810-893-239
		73 23
		2 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 -
COLUMN CO	The second secon	***************************************
NOT 14 A 4 A 4 A 4 A 4 A 4 A 4 A 4 A 4 A 4	also y a second	

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
2. Buenda N 3. Such W. 9	Paul Vanderdo@ 62	THE RESIDENCE OF THE PRODUCT OF THE PROPERTY O
4. WI/Cn	WTRIPPOOLGH	DIL. COM 313-580-8059
5.		
,	The same of the sa	
-		
TEC 1000 1 - 1 - 2	* AN ()	n in the second
	A service of the serv	

NAME	EMAIL	PHONE
1. Joe ge Blog	by Soe bloomings	Jung CAH. Not 586-344-6627
3. Defl		PYActor.com 248361.6648
They M. 12		/MOO. COM 248.575. 7198
5.		
	The second second	
	The second secon	
1		
4		

NAME 1.	EMAIL	PHONE
Sarah Meyer 2.	Smeyerasanduskycco	Po-
3.		
4.		
5.		
6.		
7.		
8.		
9.		
10.		

"We the undersigned, urge the members of the Ohio Power Siting Board, to reject the staff recommendations regarding the Icebreaker Wind Facility"

NAME **EMAIL** PHONE 1. Jissica Springer & hayzijess@hotmail.com 440-610-9761 2. 3. 4. 5. 6. 7. 8. 9. 10.

From: Alan Isselhard [mailto:speedway2742@gmail.com]

Sent: Wednesday, September 19, 2018 8:39 PM

To: Butler, Matthew < matthew.butler@puco.ohio.gov>

Subject: Icebreaker comments

Hello Mr. Butler,

Please add my comments in the attachment below to the Public Comments section,

Case Record For: 16-1871-EL-BGN

Thank you.

Best regards,

Al Isselhard Wolcott, New York Great Lakes Wind Truth September 19, 2018

The Ohio Power Siting Board 180 East Broad Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

Re: Docket Number 16-1871-EL-BGN, Icebreaker Windpower, Inc.

ATTN: Mr. Matt Butler

Dear Ohio Power Siting Board,

I am deeply concerned about the future of the Great Lakes and Lake Erie in particular being transformed into an industrial site by the Ohio Power Siting Board permitting the development of an offshore wind factory called the Icebreaker. I believe there are numerous compelling reasons for denying Icebreaker Windpower Inc. a certificate of environmental compatibility and public need. There is <u>no need</u> for the 6 offshore turbines planned for this demonstration project as the OPSB has permitted numerous terrestrial wind projects to supply Ohio's renewable energy needs. Cleveland's population has dropped substantially as people are fleeing the city lessening the need for electric power.

This project needs an *Environmental Impact Statement*. Within the LEEDCo Project Icebreaker Environmental Assessment (DOE/EA-2045), Summary of Comment, from the US Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS) is this comment: 8) NEPA Comments - USFWS provides citations from CEQ NEPA regulations and argues that the project warrants an EIS-level analysis and recommends DOE conduct an EIS (Environmental Impact Statement), not an EA, for the project. If there ever was a project that needed an EIS approval - this is the one - yet I see nothing that indicates an EIS will be conducted relative to the Icebreaker project despite the above recommendation by the USFWS. For a project of this overwhelming magnitude the OPSB should compel that an EIS be conducted before voting on the Icebreaker project as recommended by the USFWS.

Also - CEQ NEPA Implementing Procedures 40 CFR Parts 1500 - 1508

Title 40: Protection of Environment
PART 1502—ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT

§1502.4 Major Federal actions requiring the preparation of environmental impact statements.

(c)(3) By stage of technological development including federal or federally assisted research, development or demonstration programs for new technologies which, if applied, could significantly affect the quality of the human environment. Statements shall be prepared on such programs and shall be available before the program has reached a stage of investment or commitment to implementation likely to determine subsequent development or restrict later alternatives.

The information within CEQ NEPA (c)(3) clearly mandates that this project should be required to conduct an EIS as it is federally assisted and a demonstration project for new technologies and may impact the human environment. The USFWS also refers to information within CEQ NEPA regulations demanding that the project should be required to develop and conduct an EIS.

Lake Erie is not owned by the OPSB - it is partially owned by the people of the state of Ohio. The lake is also partially owned by the people of Pennsylvania, New York, Michigan and Canada's Ontario. In the Lake Michigan 1892 legal case Illinois Central R.R. Co. v. Illinois, 146 U.S. at 453 it says "The State can no more abdicate its trust over property in which the whole people are interested, like navigable waters and soils under them, so as to leave them entirely under the use and control of private parties ... than it can abdicate its police powers in the administration of government and the preservation of the peace." The application to the OPSB is from Icebreaker Windpower Inc. - a private foreign company - a for-profit company that looks forward to making a profit for their shareholders. For the OPSB to allow this project is the abdication of Ohio's trust to act as responsible stewards of Lake Erie and for the OPSB to grant a certificate to Icebreaker Windpower Inc. is contrary to the principles of the Public Trust Doctrine and in conflict with this landmark decision from 1892.

In the seminal case of Illinois Central R.R. Co. v. Illinois, 146 U.S. 387; 13 S. Ct. 110; 36 L. Ed. 1018 (1892), the United States Supreme Court plainly held that the Public Trust Doctrine applied to the Great Lakes. The Court recognized that the doctrine "is founded upon the necessity of preserving to the public the use of navigable waters from private interruption and encroachment, a reason as applicable to navigable fresh waters as to waters moved by the tide." Illinois Central R.R. Co. v. Illinois, 146 U.S. at 436. I believe the Public Trust Doctrine also applies to the public's use of the lake for swimming and boating recreation and

would cause a private interruption and encroachment of the public's swimming and boating rights as well as fishing and navigation issues. I also believe that the erection of 479 ft. tall offshore wind turbines is a gross private interruption of the public view shed and contrary to the Public Trust Doctrine principles. I also believe that the turbine's flashing red strobe lights are a private interruption and encroachment of the public's right to darkness over Lake Erie and may also interfere with avian life. I also believe that fog horns mounted on the turbines are a private interruption and encroachment of the public's right to quiet over the lake and may also interfere with avian and marine life. The decibel level of the fog horns has never been released despite my requesting this information via the FOIA process. Who could have possibly anticipated in 1892 the gross private interruption and encroachment issues this offshore wind project will bring if the OPSB approves it?

The OPSB is a 7-member committee that is a non-elected bureaucracy seemingly with the power to permit the Icebreaker offshore wind project. It's possible that when the OPSB votes on this project that the vote might result 4 to 3 in favor of the Icebreaker. I find it appalling that with just one majority vote the OPSB could industrialize Lake Erie with offshore turbines and set a horrible president for all the Great Lakes in the future. And that 1 majority vote could be for personal reasons and not for the benefit of the people of the state of Ohio. This wonderful natural resource could become drastically changed forever as a result of just one OPSB vote - is this for the greater good for the people of not only Ohio but the other neighbor states and province as well? In my opinion the task to be undertaken by the OPSB in this matter that may allow this project is illegal and will eventually be challenged in the court system and see the OPSB approval decision reversed if their vote favors the Icebreaker.

Ohio, within its boundaries, holds the lake and bottom lands "in trust for the people of the State that they may enjoy the navigation of the waters, carry on commerce over them, and have liberty of fishing therein freed from the obstruction or interference of private parties." per Illinois Central R.R. Co. v. Illinois, 146 U.S. at 452. Icebreaker Windpower Inc. is a private foreign business. This illegal project could eventually be sold to another foreign party and soon other foreign parties will appear to stake out the lake for installing hundreds or thousands of offshore turbines for their profit while Americans (and Canadians) regret and suffer the consequences and loss of their Great Lakes forever and witness a hooligan's circus upon drinking water for millions of people thanks to a poor OPSB decision. Why should the OPSB be allowed to give away this precious resource to a foreign company? And will \$40m+ taxpayers dollars assist in this debacle?

There are companies at work right now attempting to design floating offshore wind turbines that can be placed anywhere and ignore unfavorable bathometry and the associated problems.

At the very least it should be the people of Ohio that vote for or against the Icebreaker - not an unelected committee of bureaucrats that may not use or live near Lake Erie. If the residents of Ohio voted to industrialize Lake Erie in Ohio's waters - then so be it and the generations that follow can suffer from their ancestors poor decision.

I have attempted to determine if LEEDCo has sold the Icebreaker project to Fred Olsen Renewables of Norway, as has been rumored, but I have not been able positively answer this question at this late date - how incredible! LEEDCo., OPSB and DOE will not answer this question as I've asked for an answer from each authority and received none. This demonstrates how obscure transparency is within this project! Regarding ownership of the project, the Icebreaker Windpower Inc. project application to the OPSB says this (page 41):

The relationship progressed to an agreement between LEEDCo and Fred. Olsen Renewables, whereby a) LEEDCo transferred the ownership of the proposed Facility, including all of the related assets, to the Applicant and b) Fred. Olsen Renewables created two new Ohio companies, based in Cleveland, to finish the engineering and permitting; procure the turbines, foundations, electrical substation, and cable; install and commission the Facility; and own and operate the Facility.

There is no need for the Icebreaker and the harm it will create as right now there is a more promising private electrical energy project being planned involving Lake Erie. The ITC Lake Erie Connector is a proposed 1,000 MW, bi-directional, high-voltage direct current (HVDC) underwater transmission line (cable) that would provide the first direct link between Ontario and the largest electrical market in the world – 13 U.S. Midwestern and Mid-Atlantic states. This 73-mile cable will be buried under Lake Erie water between Nanticoke, Ontario and Erie, Pennsylvania and avoid all the numerous problems now being considered with offshore Lake Erie Icebreaker turbines.

The names of the OPSB members voting to approve the Icebreaker project will not be forgotten. As of Sept. 15, 2018 the voting members are:

OPSB Members

- Public Utilities Commission of Ohio. Chairman Asim Z. Haque
- Ohio Department of Agriculture. David Daniels, Director
- Ohio Development Services Agency. David Goodman, Director
- Ohio Environmental Protection Agency. Craig Butler, Director
- Ohio Department of Health. Lance Himes, Director
- Ohio Department of Natural Resources, James Zehringer, Director
- Public member, Gregory Murphy, P.E.

Lake Erie cannot speak for itself but the deplorable Icebreaker facts do shout loudly that there's no need for this project. The OPSB should reject this project based solely on lack of need.

Sincerely,

Alan Isselhard

8135 North Huron Rd.

Wolcott, NY 14590

----Original Message-----

From: Pat Brown [mailto:ecojobsinfo@yahoo.com] Sent: Sunday, September 23, 2018 10:00 PM

To: Puco ContactOPSB < contactopsb@puco.ohio.gov>

Cc: DNR Wildinfo < <u>Wildinfo@dnr.state.oh.us</u>>

Subject: Case # 16-1871-EL-BGN: Patent Pending Wind Turbine Bird Protector CORRECTION

To whom it may concern,

I Pat Brown had the pleasure of learning about Wind Turbine Pilot Project Hearing Scheduled on 09/24/2018. As an Organizer who worked on the LEEDCO project to get signatures for the project, major supporter and a Female, Inventor who currently have a Patent WIND TURBINE BIRD PROTECTOR PATENT PENDING PRODUCT, on the desk at the UNITED STATES PATENT OFFICE, I WOULD like to discuss how I can help. I would have responded sooner but I had a family matter. However, I have attached a Presentation discussing the WIND TURBINE BIRD PROTECTOR PATENT PENDING PRODUCT, with the NOTES***. Our goal is to establish an Operating, and Licensing Agreement with LeedCo for the WIND TURBINE BIRD PROTECTOR PATENT PENDING PRODUCT. If you should have any questions please feel free to email or call me at your earliest convenience.

Regards,
Pat Brown, Inventor
Allaroundearth
P.O. Box 202595
Shaker Heights, Ohio 44120-9998
(330) 596-5134

THIS MESSAGE IS INTENDED ONLY FOR THE USE OF THE INDIVIDUAL OR ENTITY TO WHICH IT IS ADDRESSED AND MAY CONTAIN INFORMATION THAT IS PRIVILEGED, CONFIDENTIAL, AND EXEMPT FROM DISCLOSURE UNDER APPLICABLE LAW. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible for delivering the message to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify the sender immediately by e-mail or telephone and delete the original message. Copyright @ 2018 by Pat Brown. All Rights Reserved.



Allaroundearth

Wind Turbine Bird Protector
Patent Pending Product
Fig. 2

Disclaimer

 Information disclosed during this Presentation of Allaroundearth are Copyrighted and Patenting, information shall not be duplicated nor altered.

Survey Question

- 1. According to the Smithsonian.com 140,000 and 328,000 Birds die from Wind Turbines, annually.
- 2. However, clean Energy is a Billion Dollar Business, and its growing rapidly.
- 3. Are you interested in creating jobs?
- Birds have a higher probability of flying in a Wind Turbine and dying than any other
- 5. What if I told you we had a way to protect birds, while creating jobs and producing clean energy?
- 6. How much do you think this product should be priced at?
- 7. Would you refer this product to your environmental colleagues?

P.O.S

• Problem:

— Place Birds at risk?

Opportunity:

- Protect Birds
- Increase Employment
- Size Differentiation

• Solution:

Wind Turbine Bird Protector

Product Development Chart

- Skills:
 - Hire Engineer
 - Technology
- CWRU/Maker's Space:
 - -Location to Develop Product
- Prototype Tester:
 - LeedCo/Licensee

Accomplishments and Affiliations

- Author, Healthy Cookbook
- 4th Generation Entrepreneur/Inventor
- Bachelors Business Administration
- LeedCo Wind Turbine Project
- LEED Project Experience
- Market Gardener, Climate and Lead Certification
- Stanford Who's Who
- Cambridge Who's Who

SWOT - Analysis

- Strengths
 - Patent Pending Product
- Weakness
 - Finances for skills and labor
- Opportunity
 - Project Licensing
- Threats
 - Lack of Funding

Reference Guide

- Retrieved 09/23/2018 from:
 - https://www.smithsonianmag.com/smartnews/how-many-birds-do-wind-turbines-reallykill-180948154/

From: George, Garry [mailto:ggeorge@audubon.org]

Sent: Sunday, September 23, 2018 6:24 PM

To: Puco ContactOPSB < contactopsb@puco.ohio.gov>

Subject: Case #16-1871-EL-BGN Icebreaker - Comments on proposed Joint Stipulations

Please accept our comments attached.

Please acknowledge receipt.

Garry George Renewable Energy Initiative 323-933-6660 p

National Audubon Society 4700 Griffin Ave Los Angeles, CA 90031 http://climate.audubon.org



September 21, 2018

Ohio Power Siting Board
Docketing Division
180 East Broad Street, 11th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793
Email: contact OBSP (Prus ship so

Email: contactOPSB@puc.ohio.gov

Re: Icebreaker Windpower, Inc. Application for a Certificate, Case #16-1871-EL-BGN (the Application)

Dear Ohio Power Siting Board:

For more than a century, Audubon has built a legacy of conservation success by mobilizing the strength of its network of one million members and supporters, 450 local chapters, 41 Audubon centers, 23 state offices, and dedicated professional staff to connect people with nature and the power to protect it. A powerful combination of science, education and policy expertise combine in efforts ranging from protection and restoration of local habitats to the implementation of policies that safeguard birds, other wildlife, and the resources that sustain us all—in the U.S. and across the Americas.

Audubon's 2014 Climate science hosted online at www.climate.audubon.org reveals that 314 species of our North American birds are seriously threatened on their breeding and wintering grounds by changes in climate suitability depending on how fast we can reduce our emissions. Transforming our energy sector to emission-free generation by wind, solar and geothermal energy is a key strategy to combat the effects of climate change on our birds while providing jobs and economic benefits to our people, and is a priority for Audubon.

At the national, state and local level in Ohio and elsewhere we have supported policies that drive a rapid deployment of renewable energy as well as the adoption of siting guidelines and other policies to avoid, minimize and mitigate effectively for impacts on birds and other wildlife of that energy.

We have reviewed the Joint Stipulation and Recommendation (the Stipulation) filed by Icebreaker Windpower, Inc. et al on September 4, 2018 and provide the following comments on behalf of our 1 million members and supporters.

Background: Audubon previously filed comments on March 24, 2017 on the Application along with Blackbrook Audubon Society, Columbus Audubon Society, Mahoning Valley Audubon Society, Canton Audubon Society and Ohio Ornithological Society.

We incorporate those comments here, and retiterate from those comments that

- The standards in addressing environmental impacts in the permitting process at the Ohio Power Siting Board are standards that will likely be adopted throughout the Great Lakes Region in the U.S. and Canada for siting of offshore freshwater wind energy.
- The project is sited in an area designated by the National Audubon Society, as the U.S. partner for BirdLife International, as a globally significant Important Bird Area (IBA) identified as the Lake Erie Central Basin IBA.

We have reviewed and fully support with no reservations the Staff Report of Investigation of July 3, 2018 (Staff Report) Recommended Conditions of Certificate numbers 15 through 26 (the Conditions) contained in section IV, Ecological Conditions that address impacts to avian species. We supported these recommended conditions in public testimony on July 19, 2018 and fully support them now.

We have reviewed and fully support with no reservations the Memorandum of Understanding agreed to between Ohio Department of Natural Resources and Icebreaker Wind Power, Inc. dated June 8, 2017 (the MOU). We supported this MOU in public testimony on July 19, 2018 and fully support the MOU now.

Comments:

However, we do not support the Joint Stipulation and Recommendations numbers (18), (19) (21), (22), (23) and (24) or any others concerning avian issues filed by Icebreaker Windpower, Inc. et al on September 4, 2018.

We ask the Board to not adopt them.

It is our opinion that adoption of these recommendations regarding avian issues in the Stipulation will weaken the protections and the scientific standards of data collection for birds that migrate at night in great numbers over Lake Erie, our highest concern about this project.

It is also our opinion that Adoption of the Stipulation will present unnecessary legal and processional obstacles to the oversight of the project which rightfully should be the sole responsibility of the Ohio Department of Natural Resources and the Ohio Power Siting Board.

We do support and collaborate in the environmental efforts of the parties to the Stipulation to combat climate change through transforming the energy sector, creating jobs and growing a green economy in Ohio and appreciate and support their efforts.

We submit, however, that none of the parties to the stipulation (Business Network for Offshore Wind, Inc., the Sierra Club, Indiana/Kentucky/Ohio Regional Council of Carpenters and the Ohio Environmental Council) are experts on avian issues at wind projects.

Accordingly, we do not support any legal standing for those parties to "advise" or be granted increased powers to negotiate or change language in the Staff Conditions that have been carefully crafted by OPSB staff with ODNR regarding avian issues.

We also submit that ODNR, along with USFWS, has been in consultation with Icebreaker Wind Power, Inc. on this project since 2008 and continue to do so, and that the Conditions

recommended in the Staff Report are a result of that eight years of consultations and in response to the public's comments and concerns, including organizations like ours, and are not arbitrary.

Respectfully submitted,

Garry George

Renewable Energy Director National Audubon Society

Public comment 16-1871

Dear committee, I am totally against building a wind farm on besutiful Lake Erie. There are many inland acres available for this project. As an avid sailor on Lake Erie for 38 years. I find this project to be not in the best interest of all that avail themselves to the open waters of Lake Erie!

Joseph Miheli

Public comment 16-1871

-----Original Message-----

From: fk5@aol.com [mailto:webmaster@puc.state.oh.us]

Sent: Thursday, September 20, 2018 1:05 PM

To: Puco ContactOPSB < contactopsb@puco.ohio.gov >

Subject: OPSB-ContactUs

Submitted: Sep 20, 2018 1:05 PM

RENDER: server RESPONSECHART: 0

CONTACT_REASON: Comment,

TITLE: Mr.

FIRST_NAME: Frank LAST_NAME: Kern EMAIL: fk5@aol.com

PHONE_NUMBER: 4405675533 ALTERNATIVE_PHONE_NUMBER: STREET_ADDRESS1: 720 Radford Dr.

STREET_ADDRESS2: CITY: Richmond Hts.

STATE: OH

ZIP:

COUNTY: Cuyahoga COUNTRY: USA

COMPANY NAME: Mid-America Boating

CASE_NUMBER:

COMMENTS: I strongly object to the proposed wind turbine farm in the waters of Lake Erie off of

Cleveland!!!!

Public comment 16-1871

-----Original Message-----

From: clvlndr@aol.com [mailto:webmaster@puc.state.oh.us]

Sent: Thursday, September 20, 2018 10:01 AM

To: Puco ContactOPSB <contactopsb@puco.ohio.gov>

Subject: OPSB-ContactUs

Submitted: Sep 20, 2018 10:00 AM

RENDER: server RESPONSECHART: 0

CONTACT_REASON: Comment,

TITLE: Not Selected
FIRST_NAME: Joseph
LAST_NAME: Kavulis
EMAIL: clvlndr@aol.com

PHONE_NUMBER: 614-555-5555

ALTERNATIVE_PHONE_NUMBER: 614-555-5555

STREET_ADDRESS1: STREET_ADDRESS2:

CITY: STATE: OH ZIP:

COUNTY: Not Selected

COUNTRY: USA COMPANY_NAME: CASE_NUMBER:

COMMENTS: To whom it may concern:

I don't think it's a great idea to put wind turbines out in Lake Erie for the proposed Ice Breaker Project. Lake Erie has been without and should remain as a beautiful natural resource. Lake Erie should not be used as a location for the purpose of generating profit for any reason whatsoever.

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

9/24/2018 2:30:14 PM

in

Case No(s). 16-1871-EL-BGN

Summary: Public Comment electronically filed by Docketing Staff on behalf of Docketing.