



76 South Main Street  
Akron, Ohio 44308

Joshua R. Eckert  
Attorney

973-401-8838  
Fax: 330-384-3875

September 6, 2018

**VIA ELECTRONIC FILING**

Barcy F. McNeal  
Docketing Division  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
180 Broad Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793

**Re:** *In the Matter of the Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Program Portfolio Status Report for Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company, Case Nos. 18-0841-EL-EEC, et seq.*

To the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio:

Please accept for filing the attached Third Revised Appendix C to the Companies' Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Program Portfolio Status Report for the period ending December 31, 2017. The Third Revised Appendix C corrects a formatting error which previously caused the Residential Customer Action Program to not appear on this particular appendix. It also updates customer participation numbers for the CEI Residential Customer Action Program and modifies a footnote to eliminate unnecessary information carried over from the prior year's report. These minor revisions do not impact the Companies' reported energy savings or their compliance with their respective statutory savings requirements.

Thank you for your attention to this matter. Please do not hesitate to contact me should you have any questions.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Joshua R. Eckert  
An Attorney for Ohio Edison Company,  
The Cleveland Electric Illuminating  
Company, and The Toledo Edison  
Company

Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company Energy Efficiency Savings Summary

1 Incremental Savings and Expenditures from Programs in Year 2017

	Ex Ante Gross Savings			Realization Rate		Actual Expenditures			Participation		Weighted Program Measure Life	TRC Test Ratio <sup>1</sup>	PAC Test Ratio
	A	B	C	D	E	F	G=F/(A*1,000)	H=F/(C*1000)	I	J	K=C/A	L	M
	First Year Annual Energy Savings (MWh)	First Year Peak Demand Savings (MW)	Lifetime Savings (MWh)	Energy Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Demand Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Program Costs (\$)	Ex Ante First Year Cost Per First Year Annual Savings (\$/kWh)	Ex Ante Cost per Lifetime Savings (\$/kWh)	Participation Number	Unit Description (See Evaluation Report for Details)	Years	C/E Score By Program	C/E Score By Program
Residential Programs													
Appliance Turn-In	15,510	3.03	121,458	98%	84%	\$ 2,056,033	\$ 0.13	\$ 0.02	9,569	Appliances	7.8	5.22	3.57
Customer Action Program	45,851	12.01	653,608	N/A	N/A	\$ 74,979	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	1,053,419	See Appendix	14.3	3.16	509.05
Direct Load Control	0	0.00	0	N/A	N/A	\$ 93,445	N/A	N/A	7,055	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Energy Efficient Homes	37,005	4.71	388,307	103%	100%	\$ 4,796,213	\$ 0.13	\$ 0.01	150,465	See Appendix	10.5	3.97	3.97
Energy Efficient Products	32,138	3.96	417,726	88%	88%	\$ 1,435,365	\$ 0.04	<\$0.01	222,581	See Appendix	13.0	7.98	14.32
Low Income Energy Efficiency	3,659	0.53	55,209	100%	99%	\$ 2,900,826	\$ 0.79	\$ 0.05	1,908	Application	15.1	0.93	0.93
Total Residential	134,163	24.24	1,636,308	96%	92%	\$ 11,356,861	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	1,444,997		12.2	3.68	7.73
Business Programs													
C&I Demand Response Program	0	368.03	0	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	386	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Customer Action Program - Small	13,128	2.98	169,850	N/A	N/A	\$ 102,309	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	57,735	See Appendix	12.9	3.52	95.12
Customer Action Program - Large	370	0.16	5,223	N/A	N/A	\$ 3,055	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	416	See Appendix	14.1	4.45	120.46
Energy Solutions for Business - Small	68,331	11.99	745,640	88%	86%	\$ 7,462,460	\$ 0.11	\$ 0.01	914	See Appendix	10.9	2.51	5.54
Energy Solutions for Business - Large	16,275	3.03	172,834	103%	104%	\$ 2,192,584	\$ 0.13	\$ 0.01	58	See Appendix	10.6	2.54	4.46
Government Tariff Lighting	27	0.01	274	N/A	N/A	\$ 8,503	\$ 0.32	\$ 0.03	4	Project	10.2	1.96	1.96
Mercantile (Approved) <sup>2</sup>	10,850	1.41	139,309	95%	113%	\$ 544,628	\$ 0.05	<\$0.01	43	Application	12.8	N/A	12.81
Mercantile (Pending)	0	0.00	0	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	0	Application	N/A	N/A	N/A
Total Business	108,980	387.61	1,233,130	91%	92%	\$ 10,313,539	\$ 0.09	<\$0.01	59,556		11.3	2.92	6.62
Other Programs													
Energy Special Improvement District	0	0.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	0	Project	N/A	N/A	N/A
Smart Grid Modernization Initiative	0.3	0.01	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	N/A	22	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
T&D Improvements	1,789	0.65	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	N/A	3	Project	N/A	N/A	N/A
Total Other	1,789	0.66	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	N/A	25		N/A	N/A	N/A
Portfolio Total	244,932	412.50	2,869,438	94%	92%	\$ 21,670,400	\$ 0.09	<\$0.01	1,504,578		11.7	3.30	7.20
<sup>1</sup> N/A reflects a TRC score is not applicable for that program.													
<sup>2</sup> In line with the Commission's Orders in 10-834-EL-POR and 12-665-EL-UNC, the Companies' evaluator has calculated Mercantile program cost effectiveness using the Utility Cost Test (UCT), not the Total Resource Cost (TRC) Test													

2 Information Relative to Statutory Targets for Year 2017	
3 year baseline retail normalized (mercantile, weather, opt-out, etc.) sales. (MWh)	17,452,850
2017 Annual Benchmark Target (%)	1%
2017 Savings (MWh)	244,932
2017 Achievement (%)	140%

3 Banked Savings in Year 2017	
2017 Excess Savings Banked Toward Future Compliance	70,404
Total Banked Savings Remaining After 2017	1,081,506

4 Opt Out - Three year baseline in 2017	
Total Opt Out load (MWh)	1,559,313

Ohio Edison Illuminating Company Energy Efficiency Savings Summary

1 Incremental Savings and Expenditures from Programs in Year 2017

	Ex Ante Gross Savings			Realization Rate		Actual Expenditures			Participation		Weighted Program Measure Life	TRC Test Ratio <sup>1</sup>	PAC Test Ratio
	A	B	C	D	E	F	G=F/(A*1,000)	H=F/(C*1000)	I	J	K=C/A	L	M
	First Year Annual Energy Savings (MWh)	First Year Peak Demand Savings (MW)	Lifetime Savings (MWh)	Energy Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Demand Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Program Costs (\$)	Ex Ante First Year Cost Per First Year Annual Savings (\$/kWh)	Ex Ante Cost per Lifetime Savings (\$/kWh)	Participation Number	Unit Description (See Evaluation Report for Details)	Years	C/E Score By Program	C/E Score By Program
Residential Programs													
Appliance Turn-In	23,734	4.58	185,859	98%	84%	\$ 3,028,877	\$ 0.13	\$ 0.02	14,550	Appliances	7.8	5.49	3.70
Customer Action Program	63,823	16.75	909,794	N/A	N/A	\$ 156,406	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	1,484,621	See Appendix	14.3	3.15	339.85
Direct Load Control	0	0.00	0	N/A	N/A	\$ 153,430	N/A	N/A	12,374	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Energy Efficient Homes	53,034	6.24	556,502	104%	118%	\$ 6,667,753	\$ 0.13	\$ 0.01	223,308	See Appendix	10.5	3.92	3.92
Energy Efficient Products	41,290	5.14	536,685	88%	88%	\$ 2,297,934	\$ 0.06	<\$0.01	312,095	See Appendix	13.0	6.78	11.55
Low Income Energy Efficiency	2,951	0.41	44,525	100%	98%	\$ 2,440,630	\$ 0.83	\$ 0.05	1,425	Application	15.1	0.89	0.89
Total Residential	184,831	33.11	2,233,365	97%	99%	\$ 14,745,030	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	2,048,373		12.1	3.72	8.08
Business Programs													
C&I Demand Response Program	0	305.61	0	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	497	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Customer Action Program - Small	31,348	6.80	405,582	N/A	N/A	\$ 77,115	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	78,910	See Appendix	12.9	3.56	297.21
Customer Action Program - Large	8,332	1.25	117,464	N/A	N/A	\$ 21,333	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	1,027	See Appendix	14.1	3.32	277.07
Energy Solutions for Business - Small	66,909	10.78	730,125	101%	97%	\$ 6,357,608	\$ 0.10	<\$0.01	1,146	See Appendix	10.9	2.47	6.24
Energy Solutions for Business - Large	29,781	4.21	316,270	97%	91%	\$ 3,512,540	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.01	157	See Appendix	10.6	2.50	4.78
Government Tariff Lighting	1	0.00	13	N/A	N/A	\$ 7,130	\$ 5.60	\$ 0.55	1	Project	10.2	0.11	0.11
Mercantile (Approved) <sup>2</sup>	26,261	2.48	337,195	104%	116%	\$ 1,370,620	\$ 0.05	<\$0.01	59	Application	12.8	N/A	11.65
Mercantile (Pending)	0	0.00	0	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	0	Application	N/A	N/A	N/A
Total Business	162,632	331.13	1,906,648	101%	99%	\$ 11,346,347	\$ 0.07	<\$0.01	81,797		11.7	3.25	8.92
Other Programs													
Energy Special Improvement District	0	0.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	0	Project	N/A	N/A	N/A
Smart Grid Modernization Initiative	0.0	0.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	0	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
T&D Improvements	1,532	0.50	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	N/A	3	Project	N/A	N/A	N/A
Total Other	1,532	0.50	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	N/A	3		N/A	N/A	N/A
Portfolio Total	348,995	364.74	4,140,013	99%	99%	\$ 26,091,377	\$ 0.07	<\$0.01	2,130,173		11.9	3.49	8.45
<sup>1</sup> N/A reflects a TRC score is not applicable for that program.													
<sup>2</sup> In line with the Commission's Orders in 10-834-EL-POR and 12-665-EL-UNC, the Companies' evaluator has calculated Mercantile program cost effectiveness using the Utility Cost Test (UCT), not the Total Resource Cost (TRC) Test													

2 Information Relative to Statutory Targets for Year 2017	
3 year baseline retail normalized (mercantile, weather, opt-out, etc.) sales. (MWh)	22,389,259
2017 Annual Benchmark Target (%)	1%
2017 Savings (MWh)	348,995
2017 Achievement (%)	156%

3 Banked Savings in Year 2017	
2017 Excess Savings Banked Toward Future Compliance	125,103
Total Banked Savings Remaining After 2017	884,608

4 Opt Out - Three year baseline in 2017	
Total Opt Out load (MWh)	1,948,991

Toledo Edison Company Energy Efficiency Savings Summary

1 Incremental Savings and Expenditures from Programs in Year 2017

	Ex Ante Gross Savings			Realization Rate		Actual Expenditures			Participation		Weighted Program Measure Life	TRC Test Ratio <sup>1</sup>	PAC Test Ratio
	A	B	C	D	E	F	G=F/(A*1,000)	H=F/(C*1000)	I	J	K=C/A	L	M
	First Year Annual Energy Savings (MWh)	First Year Peak Demand Savings (MW)	Lifetime Savings (MWh)	Energy Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Demand Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Program Costs (\$)	Ex Ante First Year Cost Per First Year Annual Savings (\$/kWh)	Ex Ante Cost per Lifetime Savings (\$/kWh)	Participation Number	Unit Description (See Evaluation Report for Details)	Years	C/E Score By Program	C/E Score By Program
Residential Programs													
Appliance Turn-In	5,389	1.06	42,204	98%	84%	\$ 760,043	\$ 0.14	\$ 0.02	3,335	Appliances	7.8	4.77	3.36
Customer Action Program	18,302	4.88	260,893	N/A	N/A	\$ 55,544	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	408,034	See Appendix	14.3	3.13	275.89
Direct Load Control	0	0.00	0	N/A	N/A	\$ 26,695	N/A	N/A	1,735	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Energy Efficient Homes	13,482	1.53	141,470	102%	110%	\$ 1,952,409	\$ 0.14	\$ 0.01	60,052	See Appendix	10.5	3.86	3.86
Energy Efficient Products	11,558	1.41	150,225	87%	87%	\$ 564,453	\$ 0.05	<\$0.01	75,739	See Appendix	13.0	7.80	13.13
Low Income Energy Efficiency	1,349	0.19	20,350	101%	100%	\$ 1,338,340	\$ 0.99	\$ 0.07	805	Application	15.1	0.74	0.74
Total Residential	50,079	9.06	615,142	96%	95%	\$ 4,697,483	\$ 0.09	<\$0.01	549,700		12.3	3.49	7.20
Business Programs													
C&I Demand Response Program	0	138.69	0	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	112	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Customer Action Program - Small	3,254	0.93	42,105	N/A	N/A	\$ 31,659	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	23,971	See Appendix	12.9	3.75	81.93
Customer Action Program - Large	7	0.00	98	N/A	N/A	\$ 70	\$ 0.01	<\$0.01	424	See Appendix	14.1	3.87	84.68
Energy Solutions for Business - Small	24,181	3.61	263,868	100%	71%	\$ 2,036,030	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	418	See Appendix	10.9	2.44	6.92
Energy Solutions for Business - Large	16,038	2.69	170,320	102%	99%	\$ 1,849,880	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.01	86	See Appendix	10.6	2.63	5.08
Government Tariff Lighting	7	0.00	68	N/A	N/A	\$ 1,789	\$ 0.27	\$ 0.03	2	Project	10.2	2.30	2.30
Mercantile (Approved) <sup>2</sup>	9,419	0.78	120,937	100%	143%	\$ 594,194	\$ 0.06	<\$0.01	21	Application	12.8	N/A	9.46
Mercantile (Pending)	0	0.00	0	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	0	Application	N/A	N/A	N/A
Total Business	52,906	146.70	597,396	100%	90%	\$ 4,513,623	\$ 0.09	<\$0.01	25,034		11.3	3.12	7.03
Other Programs													
Energy Special Improvement District	0	0.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	0	Project	N/A	N/A	N/A
Smart Grid Modernization Initiative	0.0	0.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	0	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
T&D Improvements	304	0.10	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	N/A	6	Project	N/A	N/A	N/A
Total Other	304	0.10	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	N/A	6		N/A	N/A	N/A
Portfolio Total	103,289	155.87	1,212,538	99%	92%	\$ 9,211,106	\$ 0.09	<\$0.01	574,740		11.7	3.30	7.12
<sup>1</sup> N/A reflects a TRC score is not applicable for that program.													
<sup>2</sup> In line with the Commission's Orders in 10-834-EL-POR and 12-665-EL-UNC, the Companies' evaluator has calculated Mercantile program cost effectiveness using the Utility Cost Test (UCT), not the Total Resource Cost (TRC) Test													

2 Information Relative to Statutory Targets for Year 2017	
3 year baseline retail normalized (mercantile, weather, opt-out, etc.) sales. (MWh)	7,388,218
2017 Annual Benchmark Target (%)	1%
2017 Savings (MWh)	103,289
2017 Achievement (%)	140%

3 Banked Savings in Year 2017	
2017 Excess Savings Banked Toward Future Compliance	29,407
Total Banked Savings Remaining After 2017	439,070

4 Opt Out - Three year baseline in 2017	
Total Opt Out load (MWh)	3,172,453

FirstEnergy Energy Efficiency Savings Summary

1 Incremental Savings and Expenditures from Programs in Year 2017

	Ex Ante Gross Savings			Realization Rate		Actual Expenditures			Participation		Weighted Program Measure Life	TRC Test Ratio <sup>1</sup>	PAC Test Ratio
	A	B	C	D	E	F	G=F/(A*1,000)	H=F/(C*1000)	I	J	K=C/A	L	M
	First Year Annual Energy Savings (MWh)	First Year Peak Demand Savings (MW)	Lifetime Savings (MWh)	Energy Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Demand Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Program Costs (\$)	Ex Ante First Year Cost Per First Year Annual Savings (\$/kWh)	Ex Ante Cost per Lifetime Savings (\$/kWh)	Participation Number	Unit Description (See Evaluation Report for Details)	Years	C/E Score By Program	C/E Score By Program
Residential Programs													
Appliance Turn-In	44,633	8.67	349,521	98%	84%	\$ 5,844,953	\$ 0.13	\$ 0.02	27,454	Appliances	7.8	5.30	3.61
Customer Action Program	127,976	33.64	1,824,295	N/A	N/A	\$ 286,929	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	2,946,074	See Appendix	14.3	3.15	371.68
Direct Load Control	0	0.00	0	N/A	N/A	\$ 273,570	N/A	N/A	21,164	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Energy Efficient Homes	103,521	12.47	1,086,279	103%	110%	\$ 13,416,374	\$ 0.13	\$ 0.01	433,825	See Appendix	10.5	3.93	3.93
Energy Efficient Products	84,985	10.50	1,104,636	88%	88%	\$ 4,297,752	\$ 0.05	<\$0.01	610,415	See Appendix	13.0	7.33	12.68
Low Income Energy Efficiency	7,958	1.13	120,085	100%	99%	\$ 6,679,796	\$ 0.84	\$ 0.06	4,138	Applications	15.1	0.88	0.88
Total Residential	369,073	66.41	4,484,815	97%	96%	\$ 30,799,374	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	4,043,070		12.2	3.67	7.82
Business Programs													
C&I Demand Response Program	0	812.34	0	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	995	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Customer Action Program - Small	47,730	10.70	617,538	N/A	N/A	\$ 211,083	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	160,616	See Appendix	12.9	3.56	166.97
Customer Action Program - Large	8,710	1.41	122,784	N/A	N/A	\$ 24,459	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	1,867	See Appendix	14.1	3.37	256.96
Energy Solutions for Business - Small	159,421	26.38	1,739,633	95%	88%	\$ 15,856,099	\$ 0.10	<\$0.01	2,478	See Appendix	10.9	2.48	6.00
Energy Solutions for Business - Large	62,094	9.92	659,423	100%	97%	\$ 7,555,004	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.01	301	See Appendix	10.6	2.54	4.76
Government Tariff Lighting	35	0.01	355	N/A	N/A	\$ 17,422	\$ 0.50	\$ 0.05	7	Project	10.2	1.24	1.24
Mercantile (Approved) <sup>2</sup>	46,530	4.67	597,441	101%	120%	\$ 2,509,442	\$ 0.05	<\$0.01	123	Applications	12.8	N/A	11.38
Mercantile (Pending)	0	0.00	0	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	0	Applications	N/A	N/A	N/A
Total Business	324,518	865.43	3,737,174	97%	94%	\$ 26,173,509	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	166,387		11.5	3.11	7.69
Other Programs													
Energy Special Improvement District	0	0.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	0	Project	N/A	N/A	N/A
Smart Grid Modernization Initiative	0.3	0.01	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	N/A	22	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
T&D Improvements	3,625	1.25	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	N/A	12	Project	N/A	N/A	N/A
Total Other	3,626	1.26	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	N/A	34		N/A	N/A	N/A
Portfolio Total	697,217	933.11	8,221,989	97%	95%	\$ 56,972,883	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	4,209,491		11.8	3.39	7.76
<sup>1</sup> N/A reflects a TRC score is not applicable for that program.													
<sup>2</sup> In line with the Commission's Orders in 10-834-EL-POR and 12-665-EL-UNC, the Companies' evaluator has calculated Mercantile program cost effectiveness using the Utility Cost Test (UCT), not the Total Resource Cost (TRC) Test													

2 Information Relative to Statutory Targets for Year 2017	
3 year baseline retail normalized (mercantile, weather, opt-out, etc.) sales. (MWh)	47,230,328
2017 Annual Benchmark Target (%)	1%
2017 Savings (MWh)	697,217
2017 Achievement (%)	148%

3 Banked Savings in Year 2017	
2017 Excess Savings Banked Toward Future Compliance	224,914
Total Banked Savings Remaining After 2017	2,405,184

4 Opt Out - Three year baseline in 2017	
Total Opt Out load (MWh)	6,680,757

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**9/6/2018 3:55:20 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 18-0841-EL-EEC, 18-0842-EL-EEC, 18-0843-EL-EEC**

Summary: Text Third Revised Appendix C to Annual Report electronically filed by Mr. Joshua R. Eckert on behalf of Ohio Edison Company and The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company