



**DELIVERED VIA EMAIL**

November 1, 2017

Robert M. Endris  
FirstEnergy Corp.  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, OH 44308

Re: Notification of CBP Auction Results

Dear Bob:

Pursuant to the requirements of paragraph 10 of the October 11, 2017 Finding and Order of the Public Utility Commission of Ohio ("PUCO" or "Commission"), please find attached a redacted version of the post-auction letter addressed to you (and cc'd to others) that the Auction Manager, CRA International, submitted on October 10, 2017 following the conclusion of the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities' Competitive Bidding Process Auction to procure supply for Standard Service Offer customers for the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities.

Compared to the redacted letter submitted on October 10, the attached letter has fewer redactions pursuant to paragraph 10 of the Finding and Order cited above.

Sincerely yours,

CRA INTERNATIONAL, INC.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Bradley A. Miller". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Bradley A. Miller  
Vice President

cc:

Howard Petricoff, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Ray Strom, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

Attachment



**DELIVERED BY EMAIL**

CRA No. D20048 / D20049

October 10, 2017

Robert M. Endris  
FirstEnergy Corp.  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, OH 44308

Re: Notification of CBP Auction Results

Dear Bob:

This is to inform you that we have confirmed the results of the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities' Competitive Bidding Process Auction ("Auction") to procure supply for Standard Service Offer (SSO) customers for the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities. The Auction began on Tuesday, October 10, 2017 and concluded the same day.

There are three tables attached to this letter.

- Table 1 summarizes the results of the Auction.
- Table 2 shows, for each winning bidder, the number of tranches won for each contract in the auction.
- Table 3 provides the Auction Manager's assessment of the conduct of the auction.

In accordance with the Bidding Rules, winning bidders will be contacted directly by the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities to execute the Master SSO Supply Agreement no later than three (3) business days following the close of the auction.



Robert M. Endris  
October 10, 2017  
Page 2

Sincerely yours,

CRA INTERNATIONAL, INC.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Bradley A. Miller". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Bradley A. Miller  
Vice President

cc:

Asim Z. Haque, Chairman, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Lawrence K. Friedman, Commissioner, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
M. Beth Trombold, Commissioner, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Thomas W. Johnson, Commissioner, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Dan Conway, Commissioner, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Ray Strom, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Tamara Turkenton, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Steven E. Strah, Senior Vice President and President, FirstEnergy Utilities  
Mark A. Julian, Vice President, Utility Operations  
John Skory, Regional President, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company  
Randall A. Frame, Regional President, Ohio Edison Company  
Richard S. Sweeney, Regional President, The Toledo Edison Company  
Sonny Fanelli, Director of Ohio Rates  
Frank Mossburg, Bates White

Robert M. Endris  
 October 10, 2017  
 Page 3

**Table 1. Summary of SSO Auction Results**

		Delivery Period	
		June 1, 2018 to May 31, 2020	June 1, 2018 to May 31, 2021
Number of Registered Bidders	9		
Total initial eligibility of Registered Bidders (# tranches)			
Total initial eligibility divided by tranche target			
Number of bidders that submitted bids in round 1			
Number of tranches bid in round 1	119	77	42
Number of tranches bid in round 1 divided by tranche target	3.61	4.81	2.47
Number of tranches to procure in auction (tranche target)	33	16	17
Number of tranches procured in auction	33	16	17
Number of rounds in the auction	22		
Number of winning bidders	6	6	3
Starting price range (\$/MWh)		\$60.00-\$80.00	\$60.00-\$80.00
Starting price (\$/MWh)			
Clearing price (\$/MWh)		\$48.18	\$46.09

Robert M. Endris  
 October 10, 2017  
 Page 4

**Table 2. Winning Bidders and Tranches Won**

Winning Bidder	Number of Winning Tranches		
	Total	Delivery Period	
		June 1, 2018 to May 31, 2020	June 1, 2018 to May 31, 2021
American Electric Power Service Corporation	5	5	0
ConocoPhillips Company	1	1	0
DTE Energy Trading , Inc.	2	1	1
Exelon Generation Company, LLC	3	3	0
FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.	5	1	4
NextEra Energy Marketing, LLC	17	5	12
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>17</b>

Robert M. Endris  
 October 10, 2017  
 Page 5

**Table 3. Auction Manager's Assessment of the Conduct of the Auction**

	Question	
1	Were the competitive bidding rules violated?	No
2	Does the Auction Manager believe the auction was open, fair, transparent, and competitive?	Yes
3	Did bidders have sufficient information to prepare for the auction?	Yes. Bidders received information from the competitive bidding process documents, the Information Website, questions-and-answers posted to the Information Website, and bidder information sessions.
4	Was the information generally provided to bidders in accordance with the published timetable? Was the timetable updated appropriately as needed?	Yes
5	Were there any issues and questions left unresolved prior to the auction that created material uncertainty for bidders?	We do not believe that there were any unresolved issues or questions that created material uncertainty for bidders.
6	Were there any procedural problems or errors with the auction, including the electronic bidding process, the back-up bidding process, and communications between bidders and the Auction Manager?	No
7	Were protocols for communication between bidders and the Auction Manager adhered to?	Yes
8	Were there any hardware or software problems or errors, either with the auction system or with its associated communications systems?	No
9	Were there any unanticipated delays during the auction?	No
10	Did unanticipated delays appear to adversely affect bidding in the auction?	No
11	Were appropriate data back-up procedures planned and carried out?	Yes

Robert M. Endris  
 October 10, 2017  
 Page 6

	Question	
12	Were any security breaches observed with the auction process?	No
13	Were protocols followed for communications among FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities, the Auction Manager, the PUCO, and the PUCO's consultant during the auction?	Yes
14	Were the protocols followed for decisions regarding changes in auction parameters (e.g., volume adjustments and price decrements)?	Yes
15	Were the calculations (e.g., for price decrements or bidder eligibility) produced by the auction software double-checked or reproduced off-line by the Auction Manager?	Yes
16	Was there evidence of confusion or misunderstanding on the part of bidders that delayed or impaired the auction?	No
17	Were the communications between the Auction Manager and bidders timely and effective?	Yes
18	Was there evidence that bidders felt unduly rushed during the process?	No
19	Was there any evidence of collusion or improper coordination among bidders?	No
20	Was there any evidence of anti-competitive behavior in the auction?	No
21	Was information made public appropriately? Was confidential and sensitive information treated appropriately?	Yes
22	Were there factors exogenous to the auction (e.g., changes in market environment) that materially affected the auction in unanticipated ways?	No, not that we are aware of.

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**11/1/2017 12:37:36 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 16-0776-EL-UNC**

Summary: Report Notification of CBP Auction Results - Updated Redacted Version  
electronically filed by Mr. Timothy W Benedict on behalf of PUCO Staff