

Confidential Release

Case Number: 13-912-EL-ACP

Date of Confidential Document: 4/15/2013

Release Date:

Page Count: 6

Document Description: Ten Year Alternative Energy Compliance Plan.

“Consent to Release to the PUCO DIS Website”

Name



Reviewing Attorney Examiner's Signature

Date Reviewed

SEP 21 2017

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.
Technician LDH Date Processed 9/21/17

CONFIDENTIAL

Confidential treatment has been requested for the following document:

Case: 13-912-EL-ACP

Page Count: 6

Date Filed: 4/15/2013

Filed by: Mark A. Hayden

Behalf of: FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.

*Summary of document: Ten-Year Alternative Energy
Compliance Plan.*

RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV
2013 APR 15 PM 4:25
PUCO

Before The
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.

Ten-Year Alternative Energy Compliance Plan

RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV

2013 APR 15 PM 4:26

PUCO

April 15, 2013

Docket No. 13-0912-EL-ACP

CONFIDENTIAL VERSION

INTRODUCTION

Pursuant to Rule 4901:1-40-03(C) of the Ohio Administrative Code (O.A.C.), FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. ("FES") hereby files its ten-year alternative energy compliance plan. O.A.C. 4901:1-40-03(C) requires each electric utility and electric services company to file an annual "plan for compliance with future annual advanced- and renewable-energy benchmarks, including solar, utilizing at least a ten-year planning horizon." This plan must contain at least the following four items:

- (1) Baseline for the current and future calendar years.
- (2) Supply portfolio projection, including both generation fleet and power purchases.
- (3) A description of the methodology used by the company to evaluate its compliance options.
- (4) A discussion of any perceived impediments to achieving compliance with required benchmarks, as well as suggestions for addressing any such impediments.

O.A.C. 4901:1-40-03(C)(1)-(4). Each of these items is addressed below.

TEN-YEAR COMPLIANCE PLAN

I. Baseline for Current and Future Calendar Years

FES is a competitive electric services company with little certainty of a customer base beyond what is secured under current contract. As a result, a ten-year projection is challenging and somewhat speculative. Exhibit 1 reflects FES's projected baselines, which are estimates only and based on a number of assumptions and uncertainties that may or may not be accurate, or come to fruition. FES's baseline is expected to increase over the next several years along with projected growth in FES's retail business, as shown on Line 2 of Exhibit 1. Lines 7 and 15 on Exhibit 1 list FES's respective non-solar and solar renewable obligations using the baselines referenced above.

II. Supply Portfolio Projection

1. Non-Solar Generation Fleet and Purchase Agreements

The FES renewable portfolio consists of renewable assets that are under multi-year contracts, through which FES purchases output from the renewable generation facilities. The estimated output from these facilities is shown on Exhibit 1, lines 6 and 14.

In February 2011, FES entered into a power purchase agreement with Iberdrola Renewables to purchase output from the Blue Creek Wind Farm in Ohio starting in 2012. This was the first wind power agreement in Ohio for FES and has helped FES meet its in-state

compliance obligations. FES also has wind generation in Pennsylvania currently under contract, which is used to help meet its adjacent-state compliance obligations.

2. Solar Generation Fleet and Purchase Agreements

FES currently owns no solar generating assets. FES has, however, recently completed a series of solar REC purchase agreements that support the development of solar in both Ohio and Pennsylvania and that will allow FES to meet its solar compliance obligations once fully constructed. For example, FES has solar REC purchase agreements for solar facilities at the Cincinnati Zoo & Botanical Garden in Cincinnati, Ohio, at the Campbell Soup Company's manufacturing facility in Napoleon, Ohio, at First Solar's manufacturing facility in Perrysburg, Ohio, and at various other facilities throughout Ohio. The terms of these agreements are confidential. The combined annual estimate of the renewable generation from these assets and others for the next 10 years is shown on line 14 of the attached Exhibit 1.

III. Methodology to Evaluate Compliance Options

As described above, FES already has assembled a diverse and competitive portfolio of renewable assets to meet FES's advanced and renewable obligations. The portfolio includes a wide array of technologies (*e.g.*, wind, storage, solar, hydro) and it leverages existing assets where it makes sense economically and environmentally. FES will look to add incrementally to both its solar and non-solar portfolios well in advance of any projected compliance shortfalls, and in fact is engaged in discussions to add to both the solar and non-solar portfolios.

As FES looks to add renewable assets to its portfolio, it will use the same basic principles it has used to date. First and foremost, any investment in advanced or renewable energy sources must be the most cost-effective option. Second, FES will continue to manage its risk by utilizing a wide array of technologies and by using a mix of owned assets and RECs purchased through long-term purchase agreements. Third, FES likely will continue to prefer technologies that have broader system benefits like grid stability, technologies that actually enable other forms of intermittent renewable energy like wind, and technologies that are dispatchable and that utilize existing assets – and jobs – that are already in place. Lastly, FES is likely to continue to favor renewable assets that have the ability to qualify in multiple programs to assist FES with meeting its compliance obligations in multiple jurisdictions and that competitively position FES in multiple markets.

IV. Potential Impediments to Compliance with Benchmarks

Looking forward, FES will face several potential impediments to its compliance plan:

- **Regulatory Conditions** – Renewable energy resources must be certified by the Commission in order to be qualified for meeting the renewable energy resource benchmarks. FES's future compliance is projected based on existing law and Commission rules, including, without limitation, the ability to use a REC for compliance any time in the five calendar years following the date of its initial purchase or acquisition. Changes in Ohio law or Commission rules, or failures by the Commission to certify legitimate renewable energy resources that limit FES's ability to make use of renewable

energy generated in Ohio or deliverable into Ohio could impede FES's compliance with renewable energy resource benchmarks.

- **Solar Requirement** – Ohio ranks near the bottom of all U.S. states for solar renewable generation potential due to the state's relative lack of natural solar resources. All of the current solar projects that FES is considering adding to its portfolio are driven by the Ohio AEPS, but are financially buoyed by the federal and state incentives for solar generation.
- **Project cost** – Installed cost is one of the biggest drivers of the cost of renewable projects to the end-use consumer, which is particularly true for solar projects. Solar technology has shown annual reductions in the cost of panels, which has made solar projects significantly cheaper. In addition, the cost of capital today is at or near all time lows, which helps further reduce the total cost of solar projects. It is widely expected that interest rates will begin to rise in the near future. If the cost of capital or solar technology cost increases, there will be a corresponding increase in project costs, thus making it more challenging to develop solar projects.
- **Economic Conditions** – The economic recession continues to affect Ohio. The speed and length of the recovery will affect the amount of money consumers will be able – or perhaps, more importantly, willing – to pay for renewable generation. Significant unwillingness of customers to pay the green premium will challenge the completion of renewable projects and, as a result, it may be difficult for FES to meet its compliance obligations.

CONCLUSION

As demonstrated above, FES is committed to assembling a diverse and cost-effective alternative energy portfolio in order to meet its long-term alternative energy requirements.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Mark A. Hayden

Mark A. Hayden (0081077)
Scott J. Casto (0085756)
FIRSTENERGY SERVICE COMPANY
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
(330) 761-7835
(330) 384-3875 (fax)
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com
scasto@firstenergycorp.com

Laura C. McBride (0080059)
ULMER & BERNE LLP
1660 West Second Street
Cleveland, OH 44113
(216) 583-7034
(216) 583-7035 (fax)
lmcbride@ulmer.com

Attorneys for FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.

**FirstEnergy Solutions
Annual Plan for Future Compliance
Pursuant to Section 4901:1-40-03**

CONFIDENTIAL

Line 1										
Line 2										
Line 3										
Line 4										
Line 5										
Line 6										
Line 7										
Line 8										
Line 9										
Line 10										
Line 11										
Line 12										
Line 13										
Line 14										
Line 15										
Line 16										
Line 17										
Line 18										
Line 19										
Line 20										
Line 21										
Line 22										
Line 23										
Line 24										
Line 25										
Line 26										
Line 27										
Line 28										
Line 29										
Line 30										
Line 31										
Line 32										
Line 33										
Line 34										
Line 35										
Line 36										
Line 37										
Line 38										
Line 39										
Line 40										
Line 41										
Line 42										
Line 43										
Line 44										
Line 45										
Line 46										
Line 47										
Line 48										
Line 49										
Line 50										
Line 51										
Line 52										
Line 53										
Line 54										
Line 55										
Line 56										
Line 57										
Line 58										
Line 59										
Line 60										
Line 61										
Line 62										
Line 63										
Line 64										
Line 65										
Line 66										
Line 67										
Line 68										
Line 69										
Line 70										
Line 71										
Line 72										
Line 73										
Line 74										
Line 75										
Line 76										
Line 77										
Line 78										
Line 79										
Line 80										
Line 81										
Line 82										
Line 83										
Line 84										
Line 85										
Line 86										
Line 87										
Line 88										
Line 89										
Line 90										
Line 91										
Line 92										
Line 93										
Line 94										
Line 95										
Line 96										
Line 97										
Line 98										
Line 99										
Line 100										
Line 101										
Line 102										
Line 103										
Line 104										
Line 105										
Line 106										
Line 107										
Line 108										
Line 109										
Line 110										
Line 111										
Line 112										
Line 113										
Line 114										
Line 115										
Line 116										
Line 117										
Line 118										
Line 119										
Line 120										
Line 121										
Line 122										
Line 123										
Line 124										
Line 125										
Line 126										
Line 127										
Line 128										
Line 129										
Line 130										
Line 131										
Line 132										
Line 133										
Line 134										
Line 135										
Line 136										
Line 137										
Line 138										
Line 139										
Line 140										
Line 141										
Line 142										
Line 143										
Line 144										
Line 145										
Line 146										
Line 147										
Line 148										
Line 149										
Line 150										
Line 151										
Line 152										
Line 153										
Line 154										
Line 155										
Line 156										
Line 157										
Line 158										
Line 159										
Line 160										
Line 161										
Line 162										
Line 163										
Line 164										
Line 165										
Line 166										
Line 167										
Line 168										
Line 169										
Line 170										
Line 171										
Line 172										
Line 173										
Line 174										
Line 175										
Line 176										
Line 177										
Line 178										
Line 179										
Line 180										
Line 181										
Line 182										
Line 183										
Line 184										
Line 185										
Line 186										
Line 187										
Line 188										
Line 189										
Line 190										
Line 191										
Line 192										
Line 193										
Line 194										
Line 195										
Line 196										
Line 197										
Line 198										
Line 199										
Line 200										
Line 201										
Line 202										
Line 203										
Line 204										
Line 205										
Line 206										
Line 207										
Line 208										
Line 209										
Line 210										
Line 211										
Line 212										
Line 213										
Line 214										
Line 215										
Line 216										
Line 217										
Line 218										
Line 219										
Line 220										
Line 221										
Line 222										
Line 223										
Line 224										
Line 225										
Line 226										
Line 227										
Line 228										
Line 229										
Line 230										
Line 231										
Line 232										