

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

| | | |
|---|---|------------------------|
| In the Matter of the Application of the |) | |
| Dayton Power and Light Company for |) | Case No. 16-395-EL-SSO |
| Approval of its Electric Security Plan |) | |

| | | |
|---|---|------------------------|
| In the Matter of the Application of the |) | |
| Dayton Power and Light Company for |) | Case No. 16-396-EL-ATA |
| Approval of Revised Tariffs |) | |

| | | |
|--|---|------------------------|
| In the Matter of the Application of the |) | |
| Dayton Power and Light Company for |) | |
| Approval of Certain Accounting Authority |) | Case No. 16-397-EL-AAM |
| Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code § 4905.13 |) | |

REPLY BRIEF OF PEOPLE WORKING COOPERATIVELY, INC.

People Working Cooperatively, Inc. (“PWC”) submits this reply brief to demonstrate support for the Amended Stipulation and Recommendation (“Amended Stipulation”).¹ PWC explained in its initial brief how the Amended Stipulation satisfies the three-prong test. As such, PWC will limit the scope of this brief to the Office of Ohio Consumers’ Counsel’s (“OCC”) argument regarding whether the Amended Stipulation benefits low-income customers.²

Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition (“Edgemont”), Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy (“OPAE”), and PWC are three organizations that represent the interest of low-income customers in this case. Each one of these low-income advocates is a signatory party to the Amended Stipulation.³ This is largely because the Amended Stipulation provides critical funding for the low-income customers that Edgemont, OPAE, and PWC represent. For low-income advocates

¹ Amended Stipulation (“Joint Ex 1”).

² OCC Initial Brief at 23, 33, and 41.

³ Joint Ex 1 at 40.

like PWC, this funding is no small matter. Further, the importance of these provisions of the Amended Stipulation is evident from the record. Edgemont/OPAE's witness Cronmiller testified that nearly one in five people in Montgomery County were living below poverty in 2014.⁴ She also testified that utility costs are one of the primary concerns of low-income customers.⁵ The low-income funding commitments of Dayton Power and Light Company ("DP&L") will help to directly address these issues. DP&L has agreed to provide \$765,000 per year in shareholder funds during the term of the DMR to support low-income customers through bill payment assistance and economic development programs.⁶ In addition, DP&L has agreed to provide \$200,000 per year in funding for PWC's programs, which will support PWC's efforts to assist low-income, elderly, and disabled customers in DP&L's territory.⁷ Although OCC characterizes this funding as a mere "pittance"⁸, these financial commitments by DP&L are incredibly important for low-income advocates, and important for the populations low-income advocates represent.

Further, the Amended Stipulation is consistent with the policy goal of R.C. 4928.02(L) because it protects these at-risk populations. Because of the important benefits the Amended Stipulation provides low-income customers, PWC respectfully requests that the Commission approve and adopt the stipulation.

⁴ Direct Testimony of Cherish Cronmiller ("Edgemont/OPAE Ex. 1") at 3.

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ Direct Testimony of Sharon Schroder ("DP&L Ex. 3) at 16.

⁷ Joint Ex. 1 at 36; DP&L Ex. 3 at 16; Direct Testimony of R. Jeffery Malinak ("DP&L Ex. 2B") at 17.

⁸ OCC Initial Brief at 23.

Respectfully submitted on behalf of
PEOPLE WORKING COOPERATIVELY, INC.



Devin D. Parram
BRICKER & ECKLER, LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
Telephone: (614) 227-8813
Facsimile: (614) 227-2390
E-mail: dparram@bricker.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that the foregoing Reply Brief was served via electronic mail upon the following, this 15th day of May 2017.



Devin D. Parram

cfaruki@ficlaw.com
djireland@ficlaw.com
jsharkey@ficlaw.com
dboehm@bkllawfirm.com
mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com
jkylercohn@bkllawfirm.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com
mjsettineri@vorys.com
smhoward@vorys.com
glpetrucci@vorys.com
ibatikov@vorys.com
tdougherty@theOEC.org
cmooney@ohiopartners.org
joliker@igsenergy.com
Slessor@calfee.com
jlang@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com
amy.spiller@duke-energy.com
elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com
jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com
gthomas@gtpowergroup.com
stheodore@epsa.org
laurac@chappelleconsulting.net
todonnell@dickinsonwright.com
dborchers@bricker.com
rick.sites@ohiohospitals.org
rseiler@dickinsonwright.com
jdoll@djflawfirm.com
mcrawford@djflawfirm.com
michael.schuler@aes.com
mfleisher@elpc.org
jeffrey.mayes@monitoringanalytics.com
evelyn.robinson@pjm.com
schmidt@sppgrp.com

rsahli@columbus.rr.comony.mendoza@sierr
aclub.org
kristin.henry@sierraclub.org
mdortch@kravitzllc.com
rparsons@kravitzllc.com
Bojko@carpenterlipps.com
Ghiloni@carpenterlipps.com
sechler@carpenterlipps.com
paul@carpenterlipps.com
lhawrot@spilmanlaw.com
dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com
charris@spilmanlaw.com
ejacobs@ablelaw.org
william.michael@occ.ohio.gov
kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov
thomas.mcnamee@ohioattorneygeneral.gov;
natalia.messenger@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

5/15/2017 5:21:48 PM

in

Case No(s). 16-0395-EL-SSO, 16-0396-EL-ATA, 16-0397-EL-AAM

Summary: Reply Reply Brief of People Working Cooperatively electronically filed by Mr. Devin D. Parram on behalf of People Working Cooperatively