

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

- - -

In the Matter of the :
Application of Ohio Power :
Company for Authority to :
Establish a Standard :
Service Offer Pursuant to : Case No. 16-1852-EL-SSO
R.C. 4928.143 in the Form :
of an Electric Security :
Plan. :

In the Matter of the :
Application of Ohio Power :
Company for Approval of : Case No. 16-1853-EL-AAM
Certain Accounting :
Authority. :

- - -

PROCEEDINGS

before Ms. Sarah Parrot, Attorney Examiner, and Ms.
M. Beth Trombold, Commissioner, at the Public
Utilities Commission of Ohio, 180 East Broad Street,
Room 11-B, Columbus, Ohio, called at 12:30 p.m. on
Tuesday, April 25, 2017.

- - -

PUBLIC HEARING - COLUMBUS

- - -

ARMSTRONG & OKEY, INC.
222 East Town Street, Second Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-5201
(614) 224-9481 - (800) 223-9481

- - -

APPEARANCES:

American Electric Power
By Mr. Steven T. Nourse
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215

On behalf of the Applicant.

Bruce E. Weston, Ohio Consumers' Counsel
By Mr. Ajay Kumar,
Mr. William Michael,
and Mr. Kevin F. Moore,
Assistant Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485

Bricker & Eckler, LLP
By Mr. Dane Stinson
100 South Third Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291

On behalf of the Residential Consumers of
the Ohio Power Company.

Environmental Law & Policy Center
By Ms. Madeline Fleisher
21 West Broad Street, Suite 500
Columbus, Ohio 43215

On behalf of the Environmental Law &
Policy Center.

Ohio Environmental Council
By Ms. Miranda Leppla
1145 Chesapeake Avenue, Suite I
Columbus, Ohio 43212

On behalf of the Ohio Environmental
Council and Environmental Defense Fund.

- - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

INDEX

- - -

Witness	Page
Harold Minnich	10
Reverend Lane Campbell	11
Reverend Lynda Smith	14
Lee Blackburn	16
Mathew Roberts	
Direct Examination	18
Cross-Examination by Mr. Kumar	21
Reverend Charles Wilson	23
Tim Wagner	25
Alistair Bradley	28
Pamela Simmons	31
Sister Gemma Doll	32
Joan Settina	35
Jed DeBruin	37
Julie Kronenberger	39
Ruby Motley	43

- - -

Roberts Exhibit	Identified
1 PUCO PowerForward and Grid Modernization Testimony	22

- - -

1 Tuesday Afternoon Session,
2 April 25, 2017.

3 - - -

4 EXAMINER PARROT: The Public Utilities
5 Commission of Ohio has assigned for public hearing at
6 this time and place Case No. 16-1852-EL-SSO which is
7 captioned in the Matter of the Application of Ohio
8 Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard
9 Service Offer Pursuant to R.C. 4928.143 in the Form
10 of an Electric Security Plan and Case No.
11 16-1853-EL-AAM being captioned in the Matter of the
12 Application of Ohio Power Company for Approval of
13 Certain Accounting Authority.

14 Good afternoon. My name is Sarah Parrot.
15 I am one of the attorney examiners assigned by the
16 Commission to hear this case. And I will be
17 conducting the public hearing this afternoon.
18 Presiding with me today is Commissioner Beth Trombold
19 who would like to share a few words with you.

20 COMMISSIONER TROMBOLD: Good afternoon.
21 Thanks for coming today. We are really excited to
22 have so many people here. If you are new to the
23 Commission, this is the meeting room where we -- we
24 actually vote on cases each week. It's usually
25 Wednesdays at 1:30. So this -- we are glad to have

1 you come and see where we work too.

2 Today we are going to be hearing your
3 views on the case before us, and I'm one of the five
4 commissioners that will be voting on this case. And
5 we are always interested in hearing what the public
6 has to say about these types of cases that are filed
7 before us. So although Sarah will be running the
8 hearing, I want you to know I will be listening
9 intently, and I encourage you to come forward as she
10 calls your name and give us your views. So thank you
11 for coming today.

12 EXAMINER PARROT: Also with us today are
13 staff from the Commission Service Monitoring and
14 Enforcement Department and the Commission's Public
15 Affairs Office. They are available to assist you if
16 you have questions regarding a general utility matter
17 or questions about the Commission's process in this
18 case.

19 At this time I would like to take
20 appearances of the parties. We'll start with Ohio
21 Power Company.

22 MR. NOURSE: Thank you, your Honor. On
23 behalf of Ohio Power Company, Steven T. Nourse, 1
24 Riverside Plaza, Columbus, Ohio. I probably don't
25 have to say that part for this, do I?

I would also like to introduce Marc Reitter with AEP Ohio and Katie Graham with AEP Ohio as well as Adam Zullig and Todd Baughman. These guys are both linemen. If anyone wants to talk to a real lineman after the meeting, we would be happy to answer your questions. They are here to listen, but Katie is also available to answer any questions you have about bills or customer service, probably anything else. We are all available after the meeting to talk as well.

Thank you, your Honor.

EXAMINER PARROT: Thank you. On behalf of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel.

MR. KUMAR: Thank you, your Honor. On behalf of the residential consumers of the Ohio Power Company, the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel, Bruce Weston, by Bill Michael, Kevin Moore, and me, Ajay Kumar, also Dane Stinson with the law firm of Bricker & Eckler, and I think outside is Ray Fuller with our Public Affairs Department.

Thank you, your Honor.

EXAMINER PARROT: Thank you. And I believe we have counsel present on behalf of some of our environment intervenors.

Ms. Fleisher.

1 MS. FLEISHER: Good afternoon. Madeline
2 Fleisher on behalf of the Environmental Law & Policy
3 Center.

4 MS. LEPPLA: Good afternoon, your Honor.
5 Miranda Leppla for the Ohio Environmental Council and
6 Environmental Defense Fund.

7 EXAMINER PARROT: Thank you.

8 Any other counsel present in the room
9 today?

10 All right. Thank you. I do note that
11 there are a number of other parties that have
12 intervened in these proceedings. They are
13 intervenors that represent residential consumers,
14 commercial customers, industrial customers, and other
15 consumer advocates. Each of these parties represents
16 its various constituents in the case before the
17 Commission.

18 On November 23, 2016, Ohio Power Company
19 filed an application with the Commission to establish
20 a standard service offer in the form of an electric
21 security plan, or ESP, to be in effect from June 2018
22 through May 2024.

23 The four local public hearings scheduled
24 in this case are just one aspect of the case process.
25 An evidentiary hearing is also scheduled to begin on

1 June 6, 2017, here at the Commission offices. The
2 purpose of today's public hearing is to receive
3 comments from the public regarding Ohio Power
4 Company's application. It is not a question and
5 answer session but instead is your opportunity to let
6 the Commission know what you think about Ohio Power
7 Company's application.

8 As you have probably noticed, today's
9 hearing is being transcribed by a court reporter. If
10 you do plan to testify, please speak clearly so that
11 the court reporter can accurately reflect your
12 comments on the record. Also if you have prepared a
13 written statement, it would be extremely helpful if
14 you provide a copy to the court reporter when you
15 have finished testifying.

16 When you arrived, you were offered the
17 opportunity to sign up to testify. After I finish
18 with this introduction, I am going to begin calling
19 witnesses forward to the podium. I will ask each
20 witness to come up to the podium and face the court
21 reporter. Before you give your comments, I am going
22 to ask that you state your full name and address for
23 the record. I am also going to ask that you take an
24 oath or affirmation that what you are about to say
25 will be the truth. Your testimony will then be

1 considered part of the official record in this case,
2 and it will be reviewed by the Commission before a
3 final decision is made regarding AEP's application.

4 Additionally, the parties in this case
5 and I will be permitted to ask you questions about
6 your statement. Should you decide you do not wish to
7 testify when I call your name, you can pass to the
8 next witness. And once you have finished testifying
9 or if you are here merely to observe today, you may,
10 of course, leave at any time.

11 We appreciate your participation in
12 today's hearing, and we want everyone who wishes to
13 make a statement to have the opportunity to do so.
14 At this time I am going to call witnesses forward,
15 and I apologize in advance if I mispronounce names
16 which I am sure that I will do.

17 Our first witness today is Harold
18 Minnich.

19 MR. MINNICH: Minnich.

20 EXAMINER PARROT: Minnich.

21 MR. MINNICH: Yes. Thank you for the
22 opportunity to speak.

23 EXAMINER PARROT: Mr. Minnich, if you
24 would please raise your right hand.

25 - - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

HAROLD MINNICH

presented himself as a public witness, and being
first duly sworn, testified as follows:

DIRECT EXAMINATION

EXAMINER PARROT: Please state your name
and address for the record.

THE WITNESS: My name is Harold Minnich.
I live at 526 Wynridge Court in Powell, Ohio.

EXAMINER PARROT: Please proceed.

THE WITNESS: I would just like to make a
short statement. It occurred to me that there were
two reasons why I am against this proposal. One is
higher fixed fees put a higher burden, it seems to
me, on the lower income families.

They don't have the opportunity to do
anything about those fixed fees; whereas, they would
have the opportunity if -- to do something with the
amount of electricity used.

The other reason is higher fixed fees
reduce, in my opinion, the incentives to invest in
newer technology, electrical devices that would save
energy because more of the fees are fixed. So I've
started to actually replace lightbulbs and things
like that with newer technology. But those savings
now, part of them at least, are going to be offset by

1 higher fixed fees. That's basically all I have to
2 say.

3 EXAMINER PARROT: Thank you. Any
4 questions from counsel? Thank you very much.

5 Our next witness is Reverend Lane
6 Campbell. Please state your name address for the
7 record.

8 REVEREND CAMPBELL: Reverend Lane
9 Campbell, 106 North Huron Ave. in Columbus, Ohio.

10 EXAMINER PARROT: Raise your right hand
11 for me, please.

12 - - -

13 REVEREND LANE CAMPBELL
14 presented herself as a public witness, and being
15 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

16 DIRECT EXAMINATION

17 EXAMINER PARROT: Please proceed.

18 THE WITNESS: Thank you. It is a joy to
19 be with you this morning. As a unitarian
20 universalist minister who works with children and
21 youth, we do our best to educate our kids about how
22 to moderate our use of the earth's resources. We
23 teach our kids to use less energy in their homes and
24 classrooms through turning off the water, turning off
25 the heat or the AC when it's not needed, turning off

1 lights when you aren't in a room. For some kids this
 2 is an earth friendly measure and serves to save some
 3 money on their electricity bill, but for some kids --
 4 for some of our kids this is an earth friendly
 5 measure and a way to survive. Some of our families
 6 find themselves choosing between paying the electric
 7 bill each month and having enough food on the table.
 8 When families are asked to make that choice due to
 9 poverty, we know our society and our community is not
 10 taking care of them in the way that they should.

11 As a person of faith, I have been charged
 12 by many religious authorities, Jesus, Buda, Allah,
 13 Yahweh to care for the least of those among us. We
 14 have been called as a community to care for our poor
 15 and disenfranchised. And these fixed rate hikes are
 16 not in the service of the poorest among us being that
 17 those of us who have to choose between the electric
 18 bill and eating this month will have an even higher
 19 bill to pay and a more difficult choice to make.

20 As a community member and a person living
 21 in the Hilltop neighborhood in Columbus, I know some
 22 of my neighbors will not be able to afford to pay if
 23 such an increase were to go into effect. Doubling
 24 the fixed rates AEP asks us to pay will put some over
 25 the edge forcing them into further debt, starvation,

1 and difficult choices about where the money from a
2 small paycheck is going to go. Raising the fixed
3 rates already being charged does not honor the
4 humanity or the dignity of those working to survive
5 and just getting by. My faith calls me to do right
6 by each other and by the earth.

7 One additional concern here is by raising
8 the fixed rates, we are penalizing those children and
9 adults who are working hard to conserve energy and
10 care for our planet. Our congregation has made a
11 commitment to do this through investing in solar
12 energy and investing in becoming a more earth
13 friendly congregation and especially engage where the
14 devastating effects of climate change are growing.
15 We must be good stewards of the limited resources we
16 have.

17 I am grateful for this opportunity to
18 speak here and to represent my faith today. Thank
19 you for listening.

20 EXAMINER PARROT: Thank you. Any
21 questions from counsel? Thank you very much.

22 Our next witness is the Reverend Lynda
23 Smith.

24 - - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REVEREND LYNDA SMITH

presented herself as a public witness, and being
first duly sworn, testified as follows:

DIRECT EXAMINATION

EXAMINER PARROT: Please state your name
and address.

THE WITNESS: It's Lynda Smith, L-Y-N-D-A
S-M-I-T-H. I live at 186 East Stanton Avenue,
Columbus, 43214.

EXAMINER PARROT: Thank you. Please
proceed.

THE WITNESS: So I live in the
Clintonville area, and the Clintonville Resource
Center has a food pantry and support services for the
elderly and low-income folks, folks who are trying to
make ends meet on minimum wage, folks who are trying
to make ends meet living on Social Security. My own
mother, who is now deceased, lived on Social Security
and had to be very, very careful about how she spent
her money.

And this fixed rate increase that goes
across the board regardless of a person's ability to
pay is totally unjust. I'm now retired in my
ministry, but I spend a lot of time working with
social justice organizations, for example, the

1 People's Justice Project and Columbus People's
2 Partnership in -- in Columbus who work with families
3 who are trying to make ends meet on minimum wage.
4 And I'll tell you it's not easy, and as other
5 speakers have -- the two previous speakers have
6 already said, it's a cruel choice when people have to
7 choose between food and paying their electric bill or
8 their gas bill or their rent.

9 So there -- there has to be a better way
10 for the public utilities to fund infrastructure. And
11 whatever they need to do with all the transition
12 going on with sustainable energy and green energy and
13 solar, I cannot believe that the utility company
14 would need to do this fixed rate increase in order to
15 make their -- their -- do whatever they need to do
16 and there has to be a better way to do whatever they
17 need to do rather than unfairly hurting low-income
18 people.

19 As we all know, poverty is a huge issue
20 in the United States. In Ohio the impact of low
21 wages and poverty on people who are just trying to
22 survive is a real issue and I think it's totally
23 within the scope of the Utility Commission to take
24 that issue seriously and I pray that they will do so.

25 And I thank you very much for listening.

1 EXAMINER PARROT: Any questions from
2 counsel? Okay. Thank you.

3 Next witness is Lee Blackburn.
4 Mr. Blackburn, please raise your right hand.

5 - - -

6 LEE BLACKBURN
7 presented himself as a public witness, and being
8 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

9 DIRECT EXAMINATION

10 EXAMINER PARROT: Please state your name
11 and address.

12 THE WITNESS: Good afternoon. My name is
13 Lee Blackburn. I live at 148 Pincott Street in
14 Pataskala, Ohio.

15 Thanks to the Commission for listening to
16 what I have to say today. Unfortunately this rate
17 increase is regressive in that the more electric you
18 use, the smaller your percentage increase.
19 Conversely, the less you use, the more you pay, much
20 more.

21 With this rate increase AEP has all but
22 declared war on the poor and indigent, those
23 individuals too impoverished to even own air
24 conditioning, let alone afford the energy to run it.
25 It is the downtrodden who are most affected by this

1 irresponsible rate increase.

2 A handout from the PUCO directs you to
3 Exhibit DRG-7 of AEP Ohio's application. Frankly, I
4 was appalled when I reviewed that exhibit. It uses
5 November 2016 as the baseline to forecast changes in
6 the electric bill charges. By June of next year,
7 someone who's struggling to stretch every penny and
8 uses but 200 kilowatts per month would see a whopping
9 34 percent increase in their electric bill. Let me
10 say that again, a 34 percent increase.

11 On the other hand, someone who is
12 wasteful and uses 1,500 kilowatt-hours gets rewarded
13 with a 5 percent decrease in their electric bill with
14 that decrease remaining unchanged through year 2024.
15 However, for someone using only 200 kilowatt-hours,
16 there would be yet more pain with another increase of
17 12 percent.

18 So under this offensive plan the
19 disadvantaged would see their bill go up by half
20 while someone who is wasteful benefits by a 5 percent
21 reduction. And at 2,000 kilowatt-hours, the
22 reduction would be even greater at almost 9 percent.

23 This is not the way to treat the
24 unfortunate and any -- and AEP should be ashamed of
25 itself. I urge the PUCO to have a heart and reject

1 this plan. Ask AEP to come back with a plan that's
2 more fair and equitable. Thank you.

3 EXAMINER PARROT: Any questions from
4 counsel? Thank you, Mr. Blackburn.

5 Mathew Roberts. Please raise your right
6 hand.

7 - - -

8 MATHEW ROBERTS
9 presented himself as a public witness, and being
10 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

11 DIRECT EXAMINATION

12 EXAMINER PARROT: Please state your name
13 and address.

14 THE WITNESS: My name is Mathew Roberts.
15 I live 43 East First Street in The Plains, Ohio,
16 which is in Athens County. I want to thank the
17 Commission for opening up multiple hearings. I
18 wasn't able to make the Marietta hearing, so I am
19 glad I get the opportunity to speak now.

20 I'm representing an organization called
21 UpGrade Ohio which is a nonprofit pro consumer group
22 that advocates for and creates access for energy
23 efficiency and renewable energy solutions for
24 consumers.

25 I want to take the opportunity to speak

1 about the PowerForward Initiative and how this case
 2 and multiple utility cases might interplay with what
 3 the PowerForward is looking to achieve. I would like
 4 to say that the PUCO's emerging opportunity here is
 5 to create fair and open access to the grid as an
 6 energy highway for a diverse set of energy generators
 7 including distributed energy generation as people
 8 have said, energy storage, and the advent of electric
 9 transportation to really try to path forward that is
 10 fair for everyone. And I do want to echo the fact
 11 that a fixed charge increase would really
 12 disproportionately affect low-income populations.

13 To chart a path forward that's fair for
 14 these folks, the PUCO could adopt three basic
 15 principles that are equivalent to those adopted in
 16 the "Smart Rate Design for a Smart Future" prepared
 17 by the Regulatory Assistance Project out of
 18 Montpelier, Vermont.

19 These principles include, one, a customer
 20 should be able to connect to the grid for no more
 21 than the cost of the connecting to the grid which
 22 means that fixed costs, if any, should reflect full,
 23 open access and should not affect at-risk consumers.

24 Two, customers should pay for grid
 25 services and power supply in proportion to how

1 these -- how much they use these services and how
2 much power they consume. And essentially that means
3 incentivizing efficiency behaviors.

4 And, three, customers who supply power to
5 the grid should be fairly compensated for the full
6 value of the power they supply meaning that the
7 PUCO's opportunity here is to ensure that people are
8 capturing the full value of the energy resources they
9 provide.

10 I've prepared a document that we've
11 submitted online, but I can pass it forward if you
12 would like. We outline a community approach to this
13 proposal and the other proposals that address five
14 key priorities around supporting for microgrids,
15 community solar that directly helps low-income
16 consumers, electric vehicles, storage that requires
17 utilities to use a standard best fit, least-cost
18 benefit methodology that compares energy storage
19 providing a full suite of stacked services with
20 incumbent technologies, and advanced meter
21 infrastructure that supports a transactive grid that
22 can create, again, fair and open access for everyone
23 on the electricity grid.

24 Thank you.

25 EXAMINER PARROT: Any questions from

1 counsel?

2 MR. KUMAR: Your Honor.

3 EXAMINER PARROT: Yes, Mr. Kumar.

4 MR. KUMAR: I just have a few questions.

5 - - -

6 CROSS-EXAMINATION

7 By Mr. Kumar:

8 Q. Mr. Roberts.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. You said you had a document that you
11 submitted.

12 A. Uh-huh.

13 MR. KUMAR: Your Honor, may I have that
14 document marked as an exhibit and submit it to the
15 record for this hearing?

16 EXAMINER PARROT: Any objections to that
17 proposal, Mr. Nourse, or any other counsel wish to
18 weigh in on this request?

19 MR. NOURSE: I haven't seen the document.

20 EXAMINER PARROT: Do you have a copy,
21 Mr. Roberts --

22 THE WITNESS: I do.

23 EXAMINER PARROT: -- that you could share
24 with counsel?

25 THE WITNESS: I have another copy.

1 MR. NOURSE: Yeah, I have no objection as
2 long as this is indicated as Mr. Roberts -- part of
3 Mr. Roberts' testimony.

4 EXAMINER PARROT: Okay. Can I see a copy
5 of the exhibit, Mr. Kumar, or, Mr. Roberts? Sorry.
6 Watch -- not the most easy path up here. Thanks.

7 Any other counsel?

8 Okay. Yes, I'm fine with marking the
9 exhibit as call it Roberts Exhibit 1, I guess, if
10 that's all right with counsel. I'm going to give
11 this copy to the court reporter.

12 (EXHIBIT MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.)

13 EXAMINER PARROT: Any other questions,
14 Mr. Kumar?

15 MR. KUMAR: No other questions, your
16 Honor.

17 EXAMINER PARROT: Okay. Thank you very
18 much, Mr. Roberts.

19 THE WITNESS: Yeah. Thanks for the
20 opportunity.

21 EXAMINER PARROT: All right. I'm sorry,
22 may get this next one wrong, Charles Wilson.

23 MR. WILSON: Wilson.

24 EXAMINER PARROT: Please raise your right
25 hand.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REVEREND CHARLES WILSON

presented himself as a public witness, and being
first duly sworn, testified as follows:

DIRECT EXAMINATION

EXAMINER PARROT: Please state your name
and address.

THE WITNESS: Reverend Charles Wilson,
166 Woodland Avenue, Columbus, Ohio 43203.

I too have a short statement I would like
to share with you today. As we live and as we are in
this situation, in a society which checks our
balances are in place for our society to run
smoothly. I thank you for the work and
responsibility given to the PUCO. And I understand
the work before you in deciding this issue of a rate
and fee increase for AEP, but I call on you to
remember your responsibility to the people of Ohio.

I am against this increase for I know
that it is too much to bear for the people I serve
and work with on the near east side of Columbus and
also throughout many communities through Ohio. The
increase of what some would say is a small amount,
\$10 or so, adds up quickly. If this increase were to
be put in place, that \$18.40 would mean over \$200
taken away from the pockets of struggling families.

1 That means almost 32 gallons of milk that a family
2 will not be able to purchase. That means boxes of
3 diapers and formula that people will have to scrounge
4 for because the money went to AEP.

5 The loss of 200 plus dollars means simple
6 car maintenance, gas fill-ups will be delayed
7 endangering people's employment which means that AEP
8 and other utilities will not be paid anything forcing
9 a shutoff in service. Giving this increase to AEP
10 would mean less money for doctor visit copays,
11 prescriptions, and other means of self-care that in
12 turn would mean a less healthy population for already
13 stretched and struggling health care systems.

14 It is my understanding the increase in
15 the fixed fee that AEP and others have sought across
16 the country and in Ohio are motivated by a potential
17 loss possibly projected in the future. I can tell
18 you that the losses facing families with this
19 increase are not possible but are presently happening
20 as people are already struggling to pay their
21 utilities across the board. Is securing a revenue
22 stream for AEP now against possible losses then more
23 important than the real losses that their customers
24 and to whom you are responsible are experiencing now?

25 As a priest who sees and knows and tries

1 to help those who struggle with this, I can tell you
2 I have seen the future, and it is now.

3 In the Christian tradition, we are in the
4 season of Easter, the time when the church celebrates
5 and remembers and proclaims resurrection, the raising
6 of one who was crushed by the system. This message
7 is one that resonates with people because it means
8 moving from a place where they are stuck in with a
9 death-like grip.

10 No one wants to be struck where they are,
11 especially those who struggle in our society, in our
12 society, not a system. Your vote to deny this
13 increase will be one less nail holding them in place
14 and will demonstrate that you take responsibility for
15 the people of our society seriously. Thank you.

16 EXAMINER PARROT: Any questions from
17 counsel?

18 Our next witness is Tim Wagner. Please
19 raise your right hand.

20 - - -

21 TIM WAGNER
22 presented himself as a public witness, and being
23 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

24 DIRECT EXAMINATION

25 EXAMINER PARROT: Please state your name

1 and address.

2 THE WITNESS: My name is Tim Wagner,
3 W-A-G-N-E-R, address 1376 Melrose Avenue, Columbus.

4 I hope the other commissioners will have
5 a chance to hear our testimony even if they are not
6 here. I've been retired for a few years, so I am
7 fairly sensitive to escalating costs such as this. I
8 am just a spec of dust in the AEP scope because I
9 have used about 2,000 kilowatt-hours of electricity
10 per year. Last several months my bill has been about
11 \$25 a month so this rate increase would be somewhere
12 between a 20 and 40 percent increase for me
13 personally.

14 For those who are not familiar with
15 Social Security, every year they give cost of living
16 increases. Last year the increase was .3 percent.
17 And it was immediately offset by an increase in the
18 Medicare premium, so it ended up being a 0 percent
19 cost of living increase last year, and the previous
20 year was likewise a 0 percent increase, so I'm not
21 quite sure how they calculate that. They don't
22 appear to be using the utility costs as part of the
23 formula.

24 While I realize there is a lot of people
25 that go out and spend \$5 a day for a cup of coffee

1 and you see the restaurants and the bars packed with
2 people who apparently won't notice these kinds of
3 increases, there are those of us who really don't
4 live this lifestyle and will be impacted a lot more.

5 Possibly there's a way to have a tiered
6 fixed cost increase so that the lower usage people
7 might pay a lower fixed rate, and it would just sort
8 of increase a little bit, kind of a combination of
9 fixed and consumption based.

10 I would like to finish with a little
11 story. There was a T.V. show some probably 10 or 15
12 years ago, one of those cop shows where this woman
13 calls into the police station complaining about just
14 being completely overheated in her apartment.

15 Doesn't know what to do. And the detective that
16 answers the phone says, well, fill the bathtub with
17 cold water and climb in. And I thought, wow, that's
18 pretty clever. But I don't think that we should be
19 basing our health and safety concerns on a different
20 utility. Why don't we allow people to have a cool
21 apartment so they don't have to face this kind of a
22 trauma?

23 Thank you very much.

24 EXAMINER PARROT: Any questions for
25 Mr. Wagner? Thank you.

1 Next witness is Alistair Bradley.

2 EXAMINER PARROT: Please raise your right
3 hand.

4 - - -

5 ALISTAIR BRADLEY

6 presented himself as a public witness, and being
7 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

8 DIRECT EXAMINATION

9 EXAMINER PARROT: Please state your name
10 and address.

11 THE WITNESS: Alistair Bradley,
12 A-L-I-S-T-A-I-R. Actually I have a written --
13 printed out what I will read. So I am at 3243
14 Prairie Gardens Drive, Hilliard, it's 43026.

15 I'm speaking as an AEP customer and a
16 homeowner with a net metering contract for the nine
17 grid-tied solar panels on our roof. Even the last
18 increase in customer charge in 2015 already grossly
19 affected the payback on our solar and energy
20 efficiency measures.

21 It was made clear decades ago that we
22 must reduce greenhouse gas emissions, and your
23 Commission is supposedly "encouraging a diverse mix
24 of generation sources," to quote your website.
25 However, even now in Ohio, Ohio is still generating

1 97 percent of its electricity from nonrenewable
2 resources. So when you see people marching for
3 climate action this Saturday, they are asking you,
4 the Commissioners, to do more.

5 Rooftop solar, usually installed by small
6 local companies, is the most efficient and least
7 environmental impact way we have to produce power.
8 As power generated at the point of use, it reduces
9 power loss in transmission lines and uses space
10 already taken rather than destroying valuable
11 cropland and priceless natural areas. We also use
12 the grid far less than other customers, especially in
13 the summer months when there is the highest
14 electricity demand in Ohio.

15 I am specifically requesting that your
16 Commission factor in low consumption customers when
17 assessing the impact of this increase in the fixed
18 customer charge.

19 Table 2 of the amended ESP III rate
20 changes in the testimony of AEP's Andrea Moore, I
21 have a printout of that, conveniently hides this by
22 only showing customers with average and above average
23 consumption, meaning a thousand kilowatt-hours per
24 month and higher, most of whom they show having a
25 decrease in their energy bill.

1 In contrast bill payers who consume less
2 than average because they can't afford to and due to
3 energy efficiency and renewable energy generation
4 will see large increases in their bills. Due to the
5 lack of transparency, I can't tell how much more AEP
6 will actually charge me, but even with a reduction in
7 the distribution service charge, it looks like my
8 bills could go up by as much as 40 percent.

9 I believe that using low-consumption
10 customers to pay for higher consumption and to
11 guarantee AEP's shareholder profits is an unfair
12 attack on home solar and counter to the direction
13 PUCO needs to encourage.

14 Sure AEP Ohio complains about customers
15 with net metering contracts every chance they get.
16 But right now they have 1.5 million customers and
17 only about a thousand of us with net metering
18 contracts. If you look at the numbers with all the
19 fixed and tapered charges which already favor higher
20 consumption, we are already paying more than our way.

21 Go solar!

22 EXAMINER PARROT: Any questions? Thank
23 you.

24 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

25 EXAMINER PARROT: Pam Simmons. Please

1 raise your right hand.

2 - - -

3 PAMELA SIMMONS

4 presented herself as a public witness, and being
5 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

6 DIRECT EXAMINATION

7 EXAMINER PARROT: Please state your name
8 and address.

9 THE WITNESS: Pamela Simmons, 2581 East
10 5th Avenue, Columbus, Ohio 43219.

11 Okay. I -- you asked if other counsel
12 were here. I am an attorney who is not practicing.
13 I don't represent anyone, but I used to work for the
14 Legal Aid Society of Ohio, and I talked to people all
15 the time on their hotline. And part of the things
16 that we would talk about is paying bills and how
17 people balance things and, you know, people who ask
18 me questions.

19 And then they would say to me why is it
20 fair, why is it fair that this gets increased for me
21 and at the same rate as everyone else's or why is
22 this fair? And my answer is, well, it isn't. People
23 don't understand that, you know, AEP has to pay all
24 the bills, and they want to reach into everyone's
25 pockets because they think that is fair. But when

1 you have so many things in your life that are
 2 grabbing at you and grabbing at your resources, to
 3 have AEP which has the ability to -- to get money
 4 from every single household in this state -- or,
 5 excuse me, not all of them but so many of them that
 6 they can -- they can choose who their preferred
 7 customers are, who should those preferred customers
 8 be? The people who use -- use huge amounts of
 9 electricity and have to have all these infrastructure
 10 to support it or the people whose infrastructure
 11 needs are much lower even if they are in a poor
 12 neighborhood? It just seems to me that the way you
 13 are going about raising rates, A, isn't fair and
 14 doesn't make sense.

15 Thank you very much.

16 EXAMINER PARROT: Any questions? Thank
 17 you, Ms. Simmons.

18 Our next witness is Sister Gemma Doll, I
 19 believe. Please raise your right hand.

20 - - -

21 SISTER GEMMA DOLL

22 presented herself as a public witness, and being
 23 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

24 DIRECT EXAMINATION

25 EXAMINER PARROT: Please state your name

1 and address.

2 THE WITNESS: Sister Gemma Doll, 2320
3 Airport Drive, Columbus, Ohio.

4 And thank you for taking this testimony
5 and opening this hearing. I'm Sister Gemma Doll
6 representing the Dominican Sisters of Peace, a group
7 of Catholic Sisters, and we have about 200 Sisters
8 living in this area.

9 And we request the Commission today to
10 deny the fixed rate increase that has been proposed.
11 This is an unfair burden as so many of the speakers
12 have already mentioned, particularly those living on
13 a fixed income or lower income families, those who
14 live in small apartments or have lower than average
15 energy use. The poorest get hit the hardest with the
16 higher percentage of their bill being in the fixed
17 rate.

18 As also has been mentioned, there is a
19 less incentive to conserve energy, to use more
20 efficient appliances, to improve insulation, or to
21 use renewable energy systems as our global community
22 so much needs at this time. Utility bills should go
23 up when we use more, not when we use less. If we
24 save electricity, our bills should go down.

25 The proposed fixed rate increase boosts

1 the profits of large corporations on the backs of the
2 poorest and the least able to absorb the increased
3 charges. It may mean that a senior goes without a
4 prescription. That does not seem equitable to me.

5 As a person of faith, I quote to AEP from
6 the First Letter of John 3, I ask you how can God's
7 love survive in a person who has enough of this
8 world's goods yet closes his heart to his brother and
9 sister when he sees them in need? In an effort to
10 protect consumers, as the Public Utilities Commission
11 of Ohio does, and those like you around the country,
12 you have -- these commissions have denied these types
13 of requests in other states.

14 And so I ask in the name of the faith
15 community and the Dominican Sisters that the Public
16 Utilities Commission of Ohio deny the fixed rate
17 charges that have been proposed.

18 EXAMINER PARROT: Any questions? Thank
19 you.

20 Our next witness is Joan Settina. Sorry,
21 probably said that wrong.

22 MS. SETTINA: No. You did just great.

23 EXAMINER PARROT: Please raise your right
24 hand.

25 - - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

JOAN SETTINA

presented herself as a public witness, and being
first duly sworn, testified as follows:

DIRECT EXAMINATION

EXAMINER PARROT: Please state your name
and address.

THE WITNESS: Joan Settina, 1475 Beaver
Run Road Southwest, Hebron, Ohio 43025.

Well, I'm here today in agreement with
all my brothers and sisters here and in particular
those that have expressed a concern for the welfare
of people on fixed incomes such as myself being a
retired person. And I -- you know, I have tried my
best over the -- since retiring to be frugal thanks
to the teaching of my mother years ago who went
through the Depression, and I am very dismayed to see
further burdens placed on people of low income and
fixed incomes.

It seems that the world moves forward
without the need to take into consideration its
senior citizens and their -- their conflicts as they
age towards their final days. I look at, you know,
what you're requesting. Every month when I look at
my bill, I try not to look at all those fixed
charges. I feel very helpless and burdened because

1 above and beyond the distribution and generation
2 costs, I add those up, and it just seems to be
3 insurmountable.

4 I noted on my last bill that there was a
5 reduction on fixed charges by the PUCO, something
6 amounting to \$5 and some cents, and I'm not sure why
7 that was, but I was grateful.

8 And then I look at -- I look at this, and
9 I just -- I don't know if these are new, how much it
10 is going to increase the list of these fixed charges,
11 DTR, CIR, RGR, all these riders, my God.

12 And then I'm also concerned with the
13 creeping technology that's going to further increase
14 costs such as the smart meters that AEP Ohio is
15 talking about. And I live in, you know, in a rural
16 area. I have a small farm. And in the wintertime I
17 set my thermostat as low as I possibly can and wear
18 extra clothing. And I don't know what more I can do
19 except, you know, try to weather the storm, but it
20 just seems like the storm is coming, and it's going
21 to overtake us all. I agree with everything everyone
22 has proposed here.

23 I would also note AEP Energy that I've
24 contracted with to pay for my generation costs has
25 none of these fixed charges. I'm not sure I

1 understand the reason for that. It's all AEP Ohio.

2 So I hope that you have seriously
3 listened to everything everyone has expressed here
4 today and will search your hearts to come to a better
5 resolution for us. Thank you very much.

6 EXAMINER PARROT: Any questions?

7 All right. I believe it's Tad DeBruin
8 maybe.

9 MR. DeBRUIN: Jed.

10 EXAMINER PARROT: Jed. Did I get the
11 last name close?

12 MR. DeBRUIN: Yeah.

13 - - -

14 JED DeBRUIN

15 presented himself as a public witness, and being
16 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

17 DIRECT EXAMINATION

18 EXAMINER PARROT: State your name and
19 address.

20 THE WITNESS: Jed with a D DeBruin, 95
21 East Norwich Avenue, Apartment D, Columbus, Ohio.

22 So I'm a student at Ohio State,
23 originally from Athens County, and I'm working with a
24 group here on campus called United Students Against
25 Sweatshops. And through this work the last two years

1 we have been seeking to protect the interests and
2 provide economic justice for workers and students in
3 the campus community including on campus and off
4 campus. And I do not think fixed costs are a way of
5 providing the economic justice.

6 Something that me as a student, I am
7 personally working 20 plus hours a week on top of a
8 full course load of classes as I've done for the past
9 four years, and it's something when I am trying to
10 manage my money each month living paycheck to
11 paycheck, that \$10 could really be the dividing line
12 between me, you know, to get food or if I have to
13 rely on parents or friends to pass me the extra \$10.

14 And I know that I'm one of the more
15 fortunate student workers on campus with being a
16 student manager, I get over \$11 an hour, but I have
17 friends I work with, and they are getting 9, 10
18 dollars an hour. And where are they going to make
19 that up at? I think that we need to be aware fair is
20 not always equal; and providing \$10 from everybody,
21 that's kind of like if you are giving a 1 foot stool
22 to someone who is 6 foot and someone who is 5 foot.
23 The 6-foot person is still going to be taller, so I
24 think we can't look at it from a fixed standpoint.

25 And if we are going to look at the

workers as well, you know, that's not -- that's not justice, and I really believe that there are other ways we can afford these costs without turning this onto those who do not have the money to do so. And in being -- Columbus being the second most economically segregated city in Columbus, I do not see how this proposed deal does not further drive a wedge between those that have and those that do not have in this city.

Thank you.

EXAMINER PARROT: Any questions? Thank you.

THE WITNESS: Thank you.

EXAMINER PARROT: Ruby Motley. One more time, Ruby Motley, I believe.

All right. Go to the next witness.
Julie Kronenberger. Please raise your right hand.

- - -

JULIE KRONENBERGER
presented herself as a public witness, and being first duly sworn, testified as follows:

DIRECT EXAMINATION

EXAMINER PARROT: Please state your name and address.

THE WITNESS: My name is Julie

1 Kronenberger. I live 134 East Royal Forest
2 Boulevard, Columbus, Ohio 43214.

3 First of all, I want to thank the
4 Commission for having the hearings, and I want to
5 also express my appreciation for the webcast of the
6 PowerForward presentation that was given last week
7 and thank everyone who is here today.

8 And, first of all, I just want to express
9 empathy for everyone involved in this juncture and
10 time. I agree with what others have said about that
11 we are at a point in time of where I believe we are
12 past the tipping point on the environment. I believe
13 strongly in science and I -- from what I've been able
14 to see and the information I have been able to
15 gather, the impacts of climate change affect the
16 poorest people first. And the overwhelming majority
17 of the poor are women and children, and so I do want
18 to express again my empathy for the Commission to be
19 in the situation that you are in and also my empathy
20 for all involved, AEP, all the citizens that are
21 involved at this juncture of time.

22 I am a homeowner, residential homeowner,
23 and I -- in the year 2010 when I witnessed -- when I
24 saw a video of the Horizon deep oil water spill, I
25 said to myself what can I do? I'm sorry. I

1 apologize.

2 EXAMINER PARROT: Take a moment.

3 THE WITNESS: 11 people were killed in
4 that explosion, first of all, and people on that
5 coastline were greatly affected. So what I am
6 observing we are in a system that's failing.

7 And we have really enjoyed the benefits
8 of fossil fuels. And in the time of my grandfather
9 and grandmother, we couldn't know that we would be
10 here today. So we used a lot. If we had used fossil
11 fuels wisely, we could have used fossil fuels
12 forever. But we can't do anything about that now.

13 So we are in the present moment. But the
14 difference about this at the same time now is because
15 of the explosion of digital technology and the cyber
16 age. More people are -- have access to more
17 information. And what I would love to see happen
18 that we all work together to make better choices now.
19 And that would be really wonderful.

20 So in 2010, our household made the plan
21 to reduce our use as much as we could. And so over
22 those years, this past seven years, we've prioritized
23 the replacement of some windows, storm doors. We had
24 the Columbia Gas energy audit. We replaced old
25 appliances. You know, we did everything we could to

1 reduce our consumption, first of all, and we got very
2 efficient. We replaced vehicles. And, you know, we
3 got more interested in biking and walking, driving
4 less, consolidating our trips.

5 And then this past summer we got a small
6 Solar-Ray on our house, and it was, you know, was
7 able to be very small because we had done efficiency
8 first. And so some of the proposals about, you know,
9 a fixed charge for people, I mean, just on a basic
10 economic level will affect how we can recoup
11 whatever -- how we've invested what we have invested
12 in this whole process.

13 And, you know, I agree with everything
14 everybody else has said about how these big sweeping
15 changes usually affect the people who are least able
16 to absorb them. And so I would -- again, I have
17 empathy for all involved in this situation. I am
18 hoping that we can all work together, that people on
19 an individual basis do what they can and that, you
20 know, the organizations and governments,
21 corporations, the people that have the access to the
22 most resources to make changes happen quickly will
23 all work together in a wise way because we can do it.
24 I believe we can do it wisely now. I want to believe
25 that.

1 And I appreciate your time today. Thank
2 you.

3 EXAMINER PARROT: Any questions from
4 counsel? Thank you, Ms. Kronenberger.

5 I think a few folks rejoined the room.
6 Is Ruby Motley one of those? All right.

7 MS. MOTLEY: Hello.

8 EXAMINER PARROT: Hi. Please raise your
9 right hand.

10 - - -

11 RUBY MOTLEY

12 presented herself as a public witness, and being
13 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

14 DIRECT EXAMINATION

15 EXAMINER PARROT: Please state your name
16 and address.

17 THE WITNESS: Ruby Motley, 774 East
18 Mithoff Street, Columbus, Ohio 43206.

19 I'm part of Columbus People's
20 Partnership, and I'm affiliated with five or six
21 different churches in the city working with the
22 children and people. And I wasn't prepared for this
23 at all because I thought it was more of a rally
24 outside, not a public forum, but I am glad I'm a part
25 of it. I'm representing them, Columbus People's

1 Partnership, on the south side in the city of
2 Columbus and elsewhere where people are being
3 affected -- will be affected by this increase in
4 Ohio, okay?

5 As a retired Army nurse and I have also
6 been politically inclined, I campaigned many years
7 for different people. I find that now we don't have
8 a choice -- the choices that we had back 20 years
9 ago, 30, 40 years ago as far as picking and choosing
10 what's going to happen in our community, but I always
11 had access to the Public Utilities Commission, always
12 felt I could call on them if I had trouble with my
13 electric, gas, anything, I could call them just like
14 I do the Attorney General's Office, okay, and people
15 would help me, okay?

16 I find now that we're left outfield with
17 a lot of people. I mean, like a lot of people don't
18 have the empathy, compassion, apathy for other
19 people, okay? And we can see that, and I can really
20 see it in our communities with all the death and
21 everything.

22 So as far as an increase for retired
23 people as myself, okay, after 42 years of working, I
24 retired. I know a lot of people that retired longer
25 than I have, okay, we are already suffering, but I

1 see families and the children, the children, okay,
 2 how can we -- how can we appreciate or accept this?
 3 It's ludicrous and it's evil. And people ought to
 4 think about and people ought to come together because
 5 this is only the ice -- we've seen the tip of the
 6 iceberg, but it's going to get worse, and if we don't
 7 stop now what's going on and care about other people,
 8 we're not going to survive this.

9 And I want to do it -- or I picked some
 10 day but this is not working. If God forbid this
 11 should pass, and I wish like what Reverend Philips --
 12 Reverend Wilson at Philips Church just stated
 13 earlier, when he said that we are being pulled down,
 14 it's like an albatross around our neck, and it's
 15 getting tighter and tighter and pulling us down
 16 quicker and quicker now. And we see it happening.

17 So I wish the Public Utilities Commission
 18 could have some compassion and some understanding
 19 what's already going on and not make it any worse.
 20 120 percent, what is that? That's crazy. Just
 21 terrible.

22 Thank you.

23 EXAMINER PARROT: Any questions from
 24 counsel? All right. Thank you.

25 That concludes the witnesses who have

signed up to testify on the sign-in sheet. Are there any other folks present today that would like to offer testimony at this time?

All right. Going once. Going twice.

All right. Well, seeing no one, I thank everyone for coming here today. This will conclude the public hearing which will be submitted on the record for the Commission's consideration in this case.

The Commission staff will stay for a while in case you have questions about the process or about how to file comments in the docket of the case.

Thank you, everyone.

(Thereupon, at 1:30 p.m., the hearing was concluded.)

- - -

CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is
a true and correct transcript of the proceedings
taken by me in this matter on Tuesday, April 25,
2017, and carefully compared with my original
stenographic notes.

Karen Sue Gibson, Registered
Merit Reporter.

(KSG-6352)

- - -

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

4/27/2017 9:52:58 AM

in

Case No(s). 16-1852-EL-SSO, 16-1853-EL-AAM

Summary: Transcript In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to R.C. 4928.143 in the Form of an Electric Security Plan and In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority, hearing held on April 25, 2017. electronically filed by Mr. Ken Spencer on behalf of Armstrong & Okey, Inc. and Gibson, Karen Sue Mrs.