

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

- - -

In the Matter of the :
Application of Ohio Power :
Company for Authority to :
Establish a Standard :
Service Offer Pursuant to : Case No. 16-1852-EL-SSO
R.C. 4928.143 in the Form :
of an Electric Security :
Plan. :

In the Matter of the :
Application of Ohio Power :
Company for Approval of : Case No. 16-1853-EL-AAM
Certain Accounting :
Authority. :

- - -

PROCEEDINGS

before Ms. Greta See, Attorney Examiner, and
Mr. Thomas W. Johnson, Commissioner, at the Ohio
History Connection, 800 East 17th Avenue, Cardinal
Classroom, Columbus, Ohio, called at 6:00 p.m. on
Monday, April 17, 2017.

- - -

PUBLIC HEARING - COLUMBUS, OHIO

- - -

ARMSTRONG & OKEY, INC.
222 East Town Street, Second Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-5201
(614) 224-9481 - (800) 223-9481

- - -

APPEARANCES:

American Electric Power
By Mr. Steven T. Nourse
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215

On behalf of the Applicant.

Bruce E. Weston, Ohio Consumers' Counsel
By Mr. Ajay Kumar,
Mr. William Michael,
and Mr. Kevin F. Moore,
Assistant Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485

On behalf of the Residential Consumers of
the Ohio Power Company.

Ohio Environmental Council
By Ms. Miranda Leppla
1145 Chesapeake Avenue, Suite I
Columbus, Ohio 43212

On behalf of the Ohio Environmental
Council.

Natural Resources Defense Council
By Ms. Samantha Williams
Staff Attorney
20 North Wacker Drive, Suite 1600
Chicago, Illinois 60606

On behalf of the Natural Resources
Defense Council.

- - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

INDEX

- - -

Witness	Page
Eddie Smith	10
Madeline Shaw	12
Lee Blackburn	14
Rachael Belz	17
Amanda Hoyt	22
Gerald Newsom	24
Grant Eckhart	29
Matthew Crouch	33
Craig Renkert	35
Danielle Poling	37
Lois Hornbostel	42
Kelsey Starr	44
Ted Klupinski	47
Amy R. Ivanoff	49
Spencer Dennis	52
Cindy Gildersleeve	53
Robin Craft	56

- - -

1 Monday Evening Session,
2 April 17, 2017.

3 - - -

4 EXAMINER SEE: Scheduled for hearing
5 today before the Public Utilities Commission is Case
6 No. 16-1852-EL-SSO which is entitled in the Matter of
7 the Application of Ohio Power Company for Authority
8 to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to
9 Revised Code 4928.143 in the Form of an Electric
10 Security Plan and Case No. 16-1853-EL-AAM in the
11 Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company for
12 Approval of Certain Accounting Authority.

13 My name is Greta See. I am one of the
14 attorney examiners assigned to this case by the
15 Commission. Also presiding this evening is
16 Commissioner Thomas Johnson.

17 In addition there are several staff
18 members of the Commission, Zach Hoffman and Sam
19 Bolster. If you would raise your hands, please.
20 These individuals would be happy to answer questions
21 for you about the Commission's process, or if you
22 have concerns about your other utility services here
23 tonight, once I take appearances of the counsel for
24 the parties, I will also indicate to you the
25 individuals here from Ohio Power or you may hear me

1 say AEP Ohio. I am talking about the same company.
2 And you can approach them for questions about the
3 application or if you have other utility questions or
4 concerns that you would like to ask them about.

5 Okay. At this time I would like to take
6 appearances of the parties who have inter -- the
7 company and the intervenors in this case starting
8 first with counsel for the company.

9 MR. NOURSE: Thank you, your Honor. On
10 behalf of Ohio Power Company, I'm Steven Nourse, and
11 with me tonight here for AEP Ohio Marc Reitter and
12 Katie Graham and also Scott Blake and Shelly Slone.
13 I believe we have a customer service representative
14 in the back, Ms. Day -- Mr. Day, I'm sorry. Be happy
15 to answer any questions you have about bills or
16 anything like that afterward. Sometimes it's a
17 little easier to do that afterward informally in the
18 back, so we will be available.

19 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

20 MR. NOURSE: Thank you, your Honor.

21 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you, Mr. Nourse.

22 On behalf of the Ohio Consumers Counsel.

23 MR. KUMAR: Thank you, your Honor. On
24 behalf of the residential consumers of the Ohio Power
25 Company, the Consumers' Counsel Bruce Weston, along

1 with Bill Michael and Kevin F. Moore and me, Ajay
2 Kumar. Also with me today I have a member of our
3 public affairs staff in the back corner Molly
4 McGuire.

5 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

6 MR. KUMAR: Thank you, your Honor.

7 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you. Is there
8 counsel for any of the other intervening parties
9 present?

10 MS. LEPPLA: Yes. Miranda Leppla with
11 the Ohio Environmental Council.

12 EXAMINER SEE: I'm sorry. Repeat.

13 MS. LEPPLA: Miranda Leppla with Ohio
14 Environmental Council.

15 MS. WILLIAMS: One back here too,
16 Samantha Williams, Natural Resources Defense Council.

17 EXAMINER SEE: I am going to ask counsel
18 for the parties if you could find a seat up front.

19 Anyone else?

20 Okay. I want to tell you a little bit
21 about the application and the process in this case.
22 As you noted, there are several parties. I think I
23 counted 28 intervening parties representing
24 residential customers including low-income customers,
25 commercial customers, industrial customers,

1 competitive retail electric suppliers, environmental
2 advocates, and other consumer advocates. Each of
3 these parties represents its various constituents in
4 the case before the Commission. In addition, the
5 staff of the Public Utilities Commission is a party
6 in this matter.

7 Ohio Power Company currently has an
8 electric security plan which includes a Standard
9 Service Offer to be effective through May 31, 2018.
10 On November 23, 2016, Ohio Power Company filed an
11 application with the Commission to extend its
12 electric security plan, or you may here me call it
13 ESP, same thing, to be effective through May 31,
14 2024.

15 As part of the Commission's consideration
16 of AEP Ohio application, the Commission scheduled
17 four public -- local public hearings including this
18 one. There is one more scheduled for April 25 at
19 12:30 at the Commission's offices.

20 This is just one aspect of the
21 Commission's review of the application. An
22 evidentiary hearing is also scheduled to commence on
23 June 6, 2017, at the Commission's offices.

24 The purpose of tonight's public hearing
25 is to receive comments from you, the public,

1 regarding Ohio Power's application. It -- it works
2 best if you get your questions answered and then come
3 forward, give your testimony, and say what your
4 opinion of the application is, and how it will affect
5 you.

6 Tonight's hearing is being transcribed by
7 a court reporter. If you plan to testify, please
8 speak loudly and clearly so that the court reporter
9 can accurately record your comments.

10 Also if you have a written statement that
11 you're testifying from, it would help if you gave the
12 court reporter a copy of that statement afterwards so
13 that we know what she has in the transcript is clear.

14 Okay. When you arrived, someone at the
15 back table, Sam, asked if you wanted to offer
16 testimony. When I call witnesses forward tonight, we
17 will use that as the list, and we will call in order
18 of that list. If you decide once I call your name
19 that you no longer want to offer testimony, you can
20 indicate that you pass. When I call you forward,
21 I'll ask you to raise your right hand, take an oath
22 or affirmation that the information you are about to
23 give is true. I'll ask you to state and spell your
24 name for the record and give us your address. Your
25 testimony will be considered part of the record in

1 this case.

2 Additionally, counsel for the -- counsel
3 for the intervenors that are present will have the
4 opportunity to ask you questions, to cross-examine
5 you on your testimony, as well as myself or
6 Commissioner Johnson.

7 If some of you are here and do not wish
8 to offer testimony, feel free to quietly leave at any
9 time. You are not required to stay for the entire
10 hearing.

11 Are there any questions about the
12 process? If not, I believe Commissioner Johnson
13 wants to say a few words.

14 COMMISSIONER JOHNSON: My name is Tom
15 Johnson. I am one of the Commissioners at the Public
16 Utilities Commission. There are five Commissioners
17 at the Commission and I just want to thank you for
18 participating in this. We as a Commission take the
19 testimony that you give and that will be on the
20 record very seriously and -- and, again, I just want
21 to thank you for participating in this very important
22 process.

23 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you. I'll call the
24 first witness. Eddie Smith. And let me just
25 apologize now for possibly butchering names.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

EDDIE SMITH

presented himself as a public witness, and being
first duly sworn, testified as follows:

DIRECT EXAMINATION

EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Please state and
spell your name for the record.

THE WITNESS: My name is Eddie Smith.
That's E-D-D-I-E S-M-I-T-H.

EXAMINER SEE: And your address, sir?

THE WITNESS: My address is 6346
Apartment B Avanelle Drive; that's in Athens, Ohio.

EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Go ahead with your
testimony.

THE WITNESS: Yes. My name is Eddie
Smith. I serve as the executive director of the
Southeast Ohio Public Energy Council, otherwise known
as SOPEC. SOPEC is a bundle of local governments in
the southeast Ohio region that have decided to work
cooperatively on energy utility issues affecting our
part of the state. These local governments have
decided to legally bundle together under Chapter 167
of the Ohio Revised Code to form what's known as a
regional council of governments.

I'm here today speaking on behalf of that
council of governments, and one of our largest

1 programming areas an electric aggregation program
2 that serves approximately 14,000 electric utility
3 accounts in southeast Ohio. I want to speak on
4 behalf of SOPEC and say that SOPEC is incredibly
5 empathetic to the challenge of attracting capital
6 investment. This is a chronic problem for southeast
7 Ohio, for Appalachian Ohio.

8 With that being said, SOPEC has some
9 concerns about the flat customer charge portion of
10 the ESP. Raising the flat customer charge on the ESP
11 is equivalent to any excise tax or sales tax in any
12 other market. It has an incredibly regressive effect
13 on low-income consumers, low-income households, and
14 southeast Ohio has some of the highest low-income
15 household percentages in the entire state.

16 A quick look at the Ohio Development
17 Services Agency profiles on Athens County shows that
18 Athens County, a member government of SOPEC, has the
19 highest de facto property rate in the entire state.
20 So I want to speak on behalf of SOPEC and our
21 customer accounts here today to say that SOPEC
22 believes that raising the customer charge by
23 120 percent is a thoroughly bad idea, and we do not
24 at all support that.

25 So that's all I have to say.

1 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Any
2 cross-examination by counsel for this witness?

3 I am going to take the lack of any answer
4 as a "no" from counsel present.

5 MR. KUMAR: No questions, your Honor.

6 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you, Mr. Smith.
7 Madeline Shaw.

8 - - -

9 MADELINE SHAW
10 presented herself as a public witness, and being
11 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

12 DIRECT EXAMINATION

13 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you. Please state
14 and spell your name for the record and give us your
15 address.

16 THE WITNESS: Madeline Shaw,
17 M-A-D-E-L-I-N-E S-H-A-W, 1213 Leicester Place, that's
18 spelled L-E-I-C-E-S-T-E-R, Place, Columbus.

19 EXAMINER SEE: Go ahead with your
20 testimony.

21 THE WITNESS: I am just an ordinary
22 citizen, and I just thought I would give my voice to
23 my disagreement about approving this much of a rate
24 increase.

25 As it states here, it went from 8.40 a

1 month to 13.40 and that's a roughly 50 percent
2 increase. And then the proposal is to raise it to
3 18.40. That's a dramatic increase that represents in
4 the pocket profit for AEP.

5 Now, I understand AEP is facing some
6 challenges going forward with regard to old plants
7 and so forth but this is a dramatic increase and in
8 light of the fact that last year they raised their
9 dividend, when you consider they raised their
10 dividend, so it's clear their interests are to
11 benefit their shareholders rather than the people
12 they serve fairly.

13 And when you consider there are like
14 491 million shares outstanding, the increase, if you
15 do the math, a 3 cent increase in the dividend payout
16 is roughly \$51 million. So, I mean, I'm saying to
17 you if they can afford to increase the dividend, they
18 must be fairly confident of getting this measure
19 pushed through.

20 It's been noted by I think Standard &
21 Poor's that their increase in their dividend payout
22 puts it at about a 70 percent rate. So I'm just
23 saying I don't see the need. They could do other
24 measures to secure their financial well-being.

25 That's all I have to say.

1 EXAMINER SEE: Ms. Shaw, hold on just a
2 second.

3 Any cross-examination for this witness?
4 Counsel for the company? Mr. Kumar?

5 MR. KUMAR: No questions, your Honor.

6 EXAMINER SEE: Counsel?

7 MS. LEPPLA: No. Thank you.

8 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you very much,
9 Ms. Shaw.

10 Lee Blackburn.

11 - - -

12 LEE BLACKBURN

13 presented himself as a public witness, and being
14 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

15 DIRECT EXAMINATION

16 EXAMINER SEE: State and spell your name
17 for the record.

18 THE WITNESS: My name is Lee Blackburn;
19 and it's B-L-A-C-K-B-U-R-N, first name is spelled
20 L-E-E. I live at 148 Pincott, P-I-N-C-O-T-T, Street
21 Southwest in Pataskala, Ohio.

22 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

23 THE WITNESS: I have a prepared
24 statement, and I would like to thank the members of
25 the Commission for listening to what I have to say

1 this evening.

2 AEP is seeking an increase of \$10 per
3 month to its customer charge from \$8.40 to \$18.40, an
4 enormous increase of almost 120 percent. My
5 background is in finance, and I could quote you from
6 their 10-K report, tell you their return on
7 investment, show you AEP just doesn't need this rate
8 increase. It's just another way to squeeze more
9 money out of their ratepayers.

10 Instead, however, I would rather make
11 this a bit more personal. I represent one of the
12 many seniors that reside in AEP's service area, and
13 many of those elderly live on a small fixed income.
14 To them \$120 truly represents food on the table, a
15 doctor's appointment, or a prescription that goes
16 unfilled.

17 So let's put this 120 percent rate
18 increase in perspective. Social Security increased
19 just 3/10 of 1 percent this year and didn't increase
20 at all last year, not at all. The Consumer Price
21 Index, referred to as the CPI, tracks the cost of
22 goods and services, hence, the rate of inflation to
23 Consumer Price increase -- pardon me, the Consumer
24 Price Index increased by just 1.3 percent last year
25 and barely increased at all the year before.

1 My bank offers a savings account that
2 pays a microscopic .01 percent. That's a penny for
3 every \$100, a penny. You would need well over a
4 million dollars just to generate enough income to pay
5 for AEP's proposed rate increase.

6 Before I came here tonight, I looked at
7 my electric bills over the past year and found AEP
8 had been granted 10 rate increases. Let me say that
9 again, 10 rate increases, 10. And those rate
10 increases cost a typical ratepayer \$5.67 per month.

11 After doing a little math and removing
12 the generation charge, I determined that that \$5.67
13 amounted to more than an 8 percent increase for AEP,
14 8 percent, not the 3/10 of 1 percent in Social
15 Security, nor the 1.3 percent increase in the CPI but
16 something more than 6 times that at over 8 percent.
17 And, now, AEP wants a 120 percent rate increase?
18 They just don't need it.

19 Thank you.

20 EXAMINER SEE: Any cross-examination for
21 Mr. Blackburn?

22 MR. NOURSE: No.

23 MR. KUMAR: No questions, your Honor.

24 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

25 Rachael Belz.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

RACHAEL BELZ

presented herself as a public witness, and being
first duly sworn, testified as follows:

DIRECT EXAMINATION

EXAMINER SEE: State and spell your name
for the record and give us your address.

THE WITNESS: My name is Rachael Belz,
R-A-C-H-A-E-L B-E-L-Z. I work at 2330 Victory
Parkway, Cincinnati, Ohio 45206.

My name is Rachael Belz. I'm the
executive director of Ohio Citizen Action. Ohio
Citizen Action organizes and mobilizes people
throughout Ohio to advocate for public interests on
consumer and environmental issues.

I'm here to speak on behalf of the over
5,000 Ohio Citizen Action members who live in the AEP
service territory as well as the 25,000 Ohio Citizen
Action members who live in Duke, FirstEnergy, and
Dayton Power and Light combined territories who are
also closely watching whether the PUCO approves or
denies these huge increases.

The fixed charge, or customer charge, is
a portion of the electric bill consumers pay
regardless of what volume of electricity they use, a
billing tactic that typically disadvantages those who

1 use the least energy, lower income families who can
2 least afford to pay more, and households that want to
3 support or invest in efficiency upgrades or solar.

4 AEP Ohio is proposing a 120 percent hike
5 on its fixed charge from 8.40 a month to 18.40 a
6 month, or \$120 a year. For most residential
7 ratepayers this amounts to adding a 13th or even a
8 14th bill in a year. Other utilities in Ohio also
9 have proposals for significant monthly fixed charge
10 hikes including FirstEnergy, Duke, and Dayton Power
11 and Light with proposals that, if approved, can
12 triple or quadruple the fixed rate fees.

13 As we've been speaking with AEP
14 residential customers at their door and on the phone
15 over the past six months, let me take you on a little
16 tour of what we have been hearing. People are so
17 upset of the prospect of what amounts to an extra one
18 or two utility bills per year that they are writing
19 personal letters to the PUCO, speaking out at public
20 hearings like this to urge denial of the rate
21 increase.

22 Here is what they're saying: In
23 Grandview Heights AEP Ohio customer Michelle Peterson
24 highlighted the hardship for working and lower income
25 families who would be hardest hit by the increases.

Fixed-fee rate hikes typically consume a larger share of the incomes of those who are least able to pay forcing unacceptable compromises.

Her letter said "I am a widow, and a mother of one minor child, who recently became ill with a chronic condition. I am a social worker. I work full time clinically assessing and treating persons in mental health crisis. My daughter's illness has reduced my work hours, and if my electric bill with AEP rises, it reduces from my budget of food, medication, hospital bills, treatment costs, clothing, and any other expense you'd expect to have as a mother. Having electric is not an optional expense like cable or vacations. It is necessary, sometimes even radically so.

"I would ask that it be advocated that AEP not raise their rates. There are so many people living paycheck to paycheck and just trying to get by."

AEP Ohio Columbus customer Jeana Wigglesworth made a similar point very succinctly. Her letter to PUCO says, in part, "I live on a fixed income. Please don't let this pass. I can't pay all my bills now. As the saying goes 'you have to rob Peter to pay Paul.'"

Fixed-fee hikes take away bill payer's freedom to control electric bills and their ability to recoup energy-saving investments. When you must pay more each month, even if you don't use more electricity, it's harder to control your household energy costs. It also makes it harder to save as much money from investments that reduce the energy you need from your utility, such as efficient appliances, better insulation, or even a home solar system.

AEP Ohio customer in Columbus Rebecca J. Huffman talked about the hardship for a senior on a fixed income who is already doing everything she can to conserve energy. Her letter to the Public Utilities Commission says, in part, "I am a senior citizen who can ill-afford to pay higher rates for my utilities as I am on a fixed income. My thermostat is set at 66 degrees in winter; my air conditioning at 82 or 80 in summer. My furnace and air conditioner are fairly new and rate energy efficient, as are my washer and dryer and gas range and refrigerator. All my windows have been replaced within the past two years. I have done everything I can to help reduce the cost of utilities and now you want to nearly double your fees. I say enough is

1 enough."

2 And, finally, AEP Ohio Columbus customer
3 Sara Balderston also expressed concern about
4 undercutting her efforts to use energy efficiently.
5 Her letter says "The idea of increasing fixed fees is
6 ill-conceived because it discourages conserving
7 energy. My family tries hard to remember to turn off
8 lights, minimize use of our air conditioning and
9 clothes dryer, and we and others who conserve
10 electricity should be rewarded not discouraged by
11 having to pay mandatory fixed fees. Additionally,
12 many households are on fixed incomes, and for them
13 this increase will especially be a burden."

14 As regulators, you know that your role is
15 to essentially pick winners and losers in any
16 decision you make. Please ask yourself who most
17 deserves your protection, the utility company that's
18 losing generation income due to energy efficiency and
19 competition or the low-income and senior customers I
20 quoted here tonight. Please deny AEP's fixed rate
21 increase and deny the increases requested by the
22 other Ohio utilities as well.

23 Thank you.

24 EXAMINER SEE: Cross-examination for this
25 witness?

1 MR. NOURSE: No.

2 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

3 Amanda Hoyt.

4 - - -

5 AMANDA HOYT

6 presented herself as a public witness, and being
7 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

8 DIRECT EXAMINATION

9 EXAMINER SEE: State and spell your name
10 for the record and provide us your address.

11 THE WITNESS: Amanda Hoyt, A-M-A-N-D-A
12 H-O-Y-T, 35 Webster Park Avenue, Columbus, Ohio
13 43214. Clintonville. Thank you for the -- I'm
14 sorry, just messed someone's thing up.

15 EXAMINER SEE: Can everyone hear her?

16 THE WITNESS: Thank you for the
17 opportunity to testify before the PUCO against the
18 proposed fixed charge increases around the State of
19 Ohio. I am the director of a statewide nonprofit
20 that serves faith leaders. The faith community of
21 Ohio is charged with picking up the pieces for
22 everyday Ohioans when our state governmental system
23 is not there to support them. Many churches and
24 charities try to fill the vast vacuum of need, and it
25 is my role to help leaders in these communities find

1 their voice.

2 First, I would like to say this is my
3 first time testifying before the PUCO on any issue,
4 first time ever visiting your website or anything,
5 and I tried to find out more information about this
6 hearing and was unsuccessful, so I just wanted to
7 flag that. Maybe it could be a little bit easier.

8 Second, I am simply stunned at the
9 unrighteous justification of the utility companies
10 who wish to take their pound of flesh from a starving
11 constituency. This increase is so out of touch and
12 out of sync with the households they serve. It quite
13 literally reminds me of the many -- moneychangers in
14 front of the Holy Temple when Jesus flips the tables.
15 Jesus's righteous anger of those who are taking
16 advantage of the poor should invoke us to step back
17 and ask ourselves the question are we making our
18 state a den of robbers?

19 What is making our state struggle? Is it
20 some kind of tax structure that benefits the few and
21 condemns the many? Is it our unfunded education
22 system? Is it the lack of manufacturing jobs? Is it
23 our struggle with the heroine epidemic? It is none
24 of these and all of these at the same time. Charging
25 \$20 more on an electric bill is just one more way we

1 are damaging our state. We dismiss this kind of
2 small bill robbery and ask the question later why do
3 so many Ohioans financially struggle.

4 Do not be the ones who condone the last
5 paper cut that causes the economic death of our
6 citizens.

7 EXAMINER SEE: Just a moment. Any
8 cross-examination for this witness?

9 MR. NOURSE: No.

10 MR. KUMAR: No, your Honor.

11 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

12 Gerald Newsom or --

13 MR. NEWSOM: That's it.

14 EXAMINER SEE: Is that correct?

15 MR. NEWSOM: Yep.

16 - - -

17 GERALD NEWSOM

18 presented himself as a public witness, and being
19 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

20 DIRECT EXAMINATION

21 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you. Spell your
22 name --

23 THE WITNESS: First name is Gerald,
24 G-E-R-A-L-D. Last name is Newsom, N-E-W-S-O-M.

25 EXAMINER SEE: Address, sir.

1 THE WITNESS: 46 West Weisheimer Road,
2 that's W-E-I-S-H-E-I-M-E-R Road, Columbus.
3 Clintonville.

4 A little over five years ago, I put solar
5 panels on our garage. The reason being I am just
6 highly concerned about global warming. Anything I
7 can do to cut the carbon footprint for our children
8 and grandchildren is a social good.

9 At the time I put them in the price was
10 much more expensive than it is now. Payback time was
11 about 10 years. The main way of getting the payback
12 from the solar panels was the sale of SRECs which is
13 solar renewable energy credit. AEP was paying
14 \$262.50 for each SREC which is a megawatt-hour. That
15 was the main incentive, but less than a year and a
16 half after that, they stopped paying for the SRECs.
17 So the last two SRECs were \$6.51. The market tanked.
18 Payback time is about 27 years. At my age I'm never
19 going to get my money back. But I'm glad I did it
20 because this is -- it's something I think is a
21 concern, should be a concern to all of us.

22 To their credit AEP has been doing a lot
23 to try to encourage efficiency. Utilities have
24 subsidized home energy audits. AEP recently had an
25 exchange program you could exchange incandescent

1 lightbulbs for LED lights, give a rebate if you get
2 energy efficient appliances, so the goal here is to
3 reduce electric usage which I think is a wonderful
4 thing. I really appreciate that.

5 But this proposal is designed to put a
6 higher fraction of the cost of the electricity on the
7 people who use the least electricity. I think this
8 is exactly opposite to what they are doing with their
9 other incentives for energy efficiency.

10 So most of the speakers here have been
11 explaining the hardships that this rate increase
12 would be on low-income people. I think they made an
13 excellent case, and I am all in favor of that, but I
14 would also like to put the plug in what we should be
15 doing is trying to encourage efficiency. Reward the
16 people who use less electricity. Don't make their
17 percentage of the electric bill go up. So I hope
18 that this proposal will be defeated.

19 So thank you.

20 EXAMINER SEE: Any cross for this
21 witness?

22 MR. NOURSE: No.

23 MR. KUMAR: No, your Honor.

24 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

25 Bradley Alistair.

1 MR. ALISTAIR: Yes. Alistair Bradley,
2 A-L -- oh.

3 (Witness sworn.)

4 - - -

5 ALISTAIR BRADLEY

6 presented himself as a public witness, and being
7 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

8 DIRECT EXAMINATION

9 EXAMINER SEE: Go ahead, Mr. Bradley.

10 THE WITNESS: Alistair Bradley,
11 A-L-I-S-T-A-I-R B-R-A-D-L-E-Y, 3243 Prairie Gardens
12 Drive, that's Hilliard, 43026.

13 I'm a homeowner and really this is going
14 to be exactly what the previous testimony was about,
15 illustration of my personal case. I have been an AEP
16 Ohio customer for 11 years, and through energy
17 efficiency measures we got our household electricity
18 usage down to 2,100 kilowatt hours per year which I'm
19 told is about a fifth of what a lot of American
20 households can consume.

21 So with the customer charge at \$4.52 at
22 that time in 2012, that put our yearly bill at \$251,
23 \$54 of which were just this fixed charge. Then in
24 2012, we installed 2 kilowatt solar panels on our
25 roof at a cost of \$8,000 to try to do our bit in the

1 transition to sustainable energy sources and through
2 net metering, which AEP charged us \$54 to enter into
3 a contract with them for net metering, was grateful
4 for that because we can then feed back onto the grid,
5 especially during the daytime and in the summer
6 months when AEP is using the dirtiest energy sources
7 for powering our -- when the demand is the most so
8 for powering air conditioning, that sort of thing so.
9 That's when solar benefits the most. And that's --
10 in this climate that's really important in both and
11 obviously for climate change.

12 So then though in 2015, AEP put up our
13 customer charge to \$8.40 so that's now \$100 per year.
14 So, now, at this point our bill is \$256 a year which
15 is right back where we started without having solar
16 panels. So if PUCO allows this increase in the
17 customer charge, which is effectively going to be
18 \$220 per year in just fixed charges, this makes my
19 system completely uneconomical. I've lost, and you
20 squashed the little guy.

21 So aside from my own position, I am very
22 concerned that this customer charge is going to
23 drastically limit the power that individuals have to
24 make economically viable choices about where their
25 income comes from and how much they pay for it which

1 should be based on how much they use.

2 I thought that America was all about
3 giving opportunity to the individual, not levying big
4 fixed charges, taxes essentially on people. So if I
5 can say this as a Brit, I think it's very un-American
6 of American Electric Power to be doing this.

7 EXAMINER SEE: Any cross-examination of
8 Mr. Bradley? Thank you.

9 Grant Eckhart.

10 - - -

11 GRANT ECKHART

12 presented himself as a public witness, and being
13 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

14 DIRECT EXAMINATION

15 EXAMINER SEE: State and spell your name
16 for the record and give us your address.

17 THE WITNESS: Grant Eckhart, G-R-A-N-T
18 E-C-K-H-A-R-T. And my Clintonville address is 392
19 Crestview Road, that's Columbus, 43202.

20 I'm an ordained Lutheran pastor of the
21 Evangelical Lutheran Church of America, and I serve
22 Jacobs Porch as pastor there that serves the campus
23 community at Ohio State, also The Sanctuary Church in
24 North Linden. And today I'm speaking in opposition
25 to this rate increase or maybe to quote United

1 Airlines can we say this rate reaccommodation.

2 While my privilege prevents this
3 reaccommodation from really hurting me too much, this
4 isn't about me but the people I serve. And for them
5 this is kind of a bloody ordeal. This rate
6 reaccommodation disproportionately affects the
7 poorest among us for whom this monthly increased
8 financial obligation to AEP is a hardship.

9 And this isn't my normal pulpit but if I
10 can quote scripture just for a few moments, I would
11 appreciate that indulgence. Luke 21 Jesus looked up
12 and saw rich people putting their gifts into the
13 treasury. He also saw a poor widow put in two small
14 copper coins, and he said "Truly, I tell you, this
15 poor widow has put in more than all of them. For all
16 of them have contributed out of their abundance, but
17 she out of her poverty has put in all that she had to
18 live on."

19 You know, this woman wanted to give her
20 two small copper coins for the work of God. And good
21 thing AEP wasn't there because she wouldn't have had
22 one of those coins to give.

23 Luke 15 or what woman having 10 silver
24 coins, if she loses one of them, does not light a
25 lamp, sweep the house, and search carefully until she

1 finds it? When she has found it, she calls together
2 her friends and her neighbors and saying "Rejoice
3 with me. I have found this lost coin." But good
4 thing AEP wasn't there because that lost coin would
5 have already been taken.

6 And, finally, Matthew 13 the kingdom of
7 heaven is like treasure hidden in a field which
8 someone found and hid; then in his joy he goes and
9 sells all that he has to buy the field. And, of
10 course, good thing AEP wasn't there because that
11 treasure would have already been scooped up.

12 The point is this I get that it costs
13 money to build and maintain the wires that connect
14 homes and businesses to the grid. I understand that
15 you want to expand and increase your energy resources
16 and capacity in the state. This makes sense.

17 I know that you want to remain
18 competitive. I mean, nearly every week it seems I
19 have your competitors knocking on my door trying to
20 sell me their product. In fact, I recently switched
21 to one of them. But for me as a consumer and as a
22 Christian, there is more to my monthly bill than the
23 bottom line price. And even if it was just about the
24 money, I wonder if AEP, if you all have considered
25 other alternatives.

1 We more than doubling the monthly
2 baseline fixed rate price is such a blunt instrument
3 tactic that it tells me your leadership is anxious
4 and did not seriously try to work on other creative
5 solutions that would have taken the poor into
6 account. Why would you not maybe increase the rates
7 on homes over a certain value amount or increase
8 rates for Ohio users with larger square footage homes
9 or charge those with higher income a higher level
10 increased rate?

11 I don't know much about this. I am sure
12 your executives could come up with a better, more
13 effective alternative, but solutions that are more
14 surgical in nature not a blunt instrument and more
15 compassionate in expression. In fact, if I knew a
16 company was taking the poor into account into their
17 decision making, even if done through a marketing
18 strategy to illuminate that fact, I would think here
19 is a company that cares finally not just about the
20 bottom line but about people who are hurting.

21 And I would switch back to you all. I
22 really would. Market me with that. If you back it
23 up, I am going to switch over. But please do the
24 hard work to come up with a solution that serves not
25 only your bottom line but the poorest among us

1 because I believe in AEP. You can do this. I think
2 you really can. Thank you.

3 Do you want to cross-examine the Bible
4 versus?

5 EXAMINER SEE: I don't think that...
6 Matt Crouch.

7 - - -

8 MATTHEW CROUCH
9 presented himself as a public witness, and being
10 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

11 DIRECT EXAMINATION

12 EXAMINER SEE: State and spell your name
13 for the record and give us your address.

14 THE WITNESS: Yes. It's Matthew,
15 M-A-T-T-H-E-W, initial J, last name Crouch,
16 C-R-O-U-C-H. I'm just going to give you some numbers
17 on my life to show you that this -- this increase,
18 what it means for me. I live in a house I bought in
19 2012 for about \$11,900. It has the original -- it
20 had the original 1964 aluminum windows that I have
21 held together for the past few years with duct tape
22 and screws. I drive a car that costs \$2,900. My
23 tires are threadbare. Last week at work I made \$150.
24 I have a chronic gut disease and mental health
25 condition.

1 The amount of money we are talking here
2 is another bill that I need to make, you know, car
3 and house, insurance, gasoline. If gasoline prices
4 go up like they did in the past, I mean, that wipes
5 me out. So I'm barely functioning. I live -- I
6 guess I didn't give you my address. Sorry. I live
7 at 1965 Genessee, G-E-N-E-S-S-E-E, Avenue, Columbus,
8 Ohio. I live in what's called the Mul-Bur Heights of
9 no man's land between North Linden and Mifflin
10 Township just across the freeway from here. Our
11 roads connect to the infamous Clintonville but are
12 bisected by 71.

13 I see a nuance here in this building's
14 brutalist architecture and the corporate equation my
15 life is up against and, yeah, these are just my
16 numbers, so, and I'm kind of like in the realm of the
17 corner of America that lives with the freedom from
18 religion aspect. I just want to put that out.

19 Thank you for your time. I would love a
20 question.

21 EXAMINER SEE: Are there any for
22 Mr. Crouch? Thank you, sir.

23 Craig Renkert. Close?

24 MR. RENKERT: Close.

25 EXAMINER SEE: Renkert?

1 MR. RENKERT: Renkert.

2 EXAMINER SEE: Renkert, okay.

3 - - -

4 CRAIG RENKERT

5 presented himself as a public witness, and being
6 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

7 DIRECT EXAMINATION

8 EXAMINER SEE: State and spell your name
9 for the record and give us your address.

10 THE WITNESS: It's Craig Renkert,
11 C-R-A-I-G R-E-N-K-E-R-T, 4611 Coolbrook Drive,
12 Hilliard, Ohio.

13 I would like to start off by supporting
14 AEP for their plan to build a 400-megawatt solar
15 project in southern Ohio. I think that will do a lot
16 to encourage jobs to replace the coal jobs that are
17 out of date and provide work for low-income people
18 there.

19 But I would also like to oppose the fixed
20 rate increase. This is, as many other people have
21 said, a very extreme burden on our lowest income
22 individuals. I'm a Golden Buckeye holder -- Golden
23 Buckeye Cardholder and on a fixed income. And I find
24 it objectionable that this plan would discourage
25 investments in renewable energy, discourage

1 investments in energy conservation appliances.

2 And this plan goes against what other
3 states have decided. It's my understanding that the
4 majority of other states that have been faced with
5 this decision have rejected a plan like this and have
6 opted for more progressive plans that would encourage
7 investment in renewable energy. Renewable energy and
8 those types of progressive energy resources are what
9 will provide jobs to Ohio, that will provide
10 progressive jobs for the future, not a regression of
11 burdening people on fixed incomes with additional
12 fixed charges.

13 Several others have talked about --
14 tonight have talked about the burden they have of
15 this fixed charge would cause to them and discourage
16 their previous investments in renewable energy. We
17 need to encourage that type of investment, encourage
18 that because it will protect the planet from climate
19 change. It will encourage jobs in Ohio, encourage
20 renewing our environment.

21 I would also like to encourage AEP to
22 follow the lead of Chugach Electric who has stated
23 they have three bottom lines. One is profits, one is
24 social responsibility, and the third is environmental
25 responsibility. These plans -- this plan that as AEP

1 proposed obviously is not promoting those three
2 responsibilities. It's only promoting their profits,
3 not the profits of consumers, not responsible energy
4 consumption, not responsible energy usage by
5 consumers.

6 So I encourage the Public Utilities
7 Commission to reject this increase and encourage AEP
8 to do more plans like the 400-megawatt plan to build
9 solar power in southwestern -- southeastern Ohio.

10 Thank you for the opportunity to testify.

11 EXAMINER SEE: Any cross? Thank you.

12 Danielle Poling.

13 MS. POLING: Hello.

14 EXAMINER SEE: Hi, Ms. Poling.

15 - - -

16 DANIELLE POLING

17 presented herself as a public witness, and being
18 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

19 DIRECT EXAMINATION

20 EXAMINER SEE: State and spell your name
21 for the record and give us your address.

22 THE WITNESS: Sure. Danielle Poling,
23 D-A-N-I-E-L-L-E P-O-L-I-N-G. My address is 6710
24 McVey Boulevard, Columbus, Ohio 43235.

25 EXAMINER SEE: Go ahead.

1 THE WITNESS: Okay. So I was not
2 planning on testifying today, but as a -- as a
3 citizen who really cares about these things, I wanted
4 to come out. So thank you for your patience while I
5 get through this.

6 I'm a public school teacher, and I guess
7 what was really getting me fired up about this was
8 that we have a levy and bond issue coming up in the
9 fall at my school district and, you know, there is a
10 lot of emotions about people voting "yes" or "no" on,
11 you know, increased rates or taxes or, you know, we
12 all start to feel the pinch because we don't really
13 see our salaries going up.

14 We see these things happening, and as a
15 public school teacher, I feel so proud that I am
16 that. And when I hear that the energy company is
17 going to, you know, increase the rates, I'm thinking
18 to myself, well, you know, let's see what we are
19 going to pay for.

20 And so I've tried to do some research on
21 this and I am reading through here and I am not
22 seeing on this how this adds up so I would like some
23 more information before I could ever agree with this.
24 I feel in strong opposition at this point because
25 when I am reading through this, I'm thinking, okay,

1 okay.

2 EXAMINER SEE: Ms. Poling, sorry to
3 interrupt you. So that the record is clear you are
4 referring to "this." Indicate what "this" is. Could
5 you read the title.

6 THE WITNESS: Blue pamphlet, AEP Ohio
7 Electric Security Plan.

8 EXAMINER SEE: It's created by whom?

9 THE WITNESS: I assume them.

10 EXAMINER SEE: "Them"?

11 THE WITNESS: The energy company. Us
12 versus them.

13 EXAMINER SEE: Who does it indicate in
14 the title?

15 THE WITNESS: Ohio Public Utilities
16 Commission. But this is where I'm concerned is that
17 I see these costs are suggested here or these plans
18 are suggested here, but I don't really see the
19 numbers. And I'm making a comparison to the school
20 bond levy issue because as teachers, we are obviously
21 going to advocate for these, you know, our voters to
22 support our schools and our programs and our
23 educational programming spaces.

24 And so I'm getting as informed as I can
25 about the numbers of how much this will cost and that

1 will cost and how it will divide out to different
2 households and why everybody should vote for this,
3 and I feel like this is -- this is just so confusing
4 because I don't see this on the ballot. Like this
5 is -- this is just going to happen to people. This
6 is our bill. Our bill is just going to go up.

7 And I think that's where I feel very
8 confused for children and for education. We're
9 taking this to the ballot, and people have -- can
10 make a decision about whether or not, you know, the
11 school district will have adequate money to pay for
12 things. But for, you know, this type of thing it
13 just seems to be happening to consumers versus us
14 being in control of it. Like I can turn my lights
15 off every day, but it doesn't matter. My AEP price
16 will just go up either way, and I think that's what's
17 upsetting and getting the emotions on this.

18 So I'm a mother. I'm a teacher. I'm a
19 homeowner. I care about sustainable energy sources,
20 and until I feel like more informed on where these
21 costs are going, I will feel a sense of that I am
22 being misled or sold on this, so I'm just testifying
23 on this feeling of frustration, I guess.

24 Also I have a couple more questions but I
25 know this isn't really a Q and A but I would like

1 these questions to be on the record just for so if --
 2 I was looking at the shared -- the stock price on
 3 AEP, and it's like steadily going up. So today it
 4 looks like it closed at 67.74; and it looks like
 5 it -- ever since around 2010, it has been on a steady
 6 rise. So at one point it was, you know -- in
 7 April 4, 2014, it closed at 50.78; and March 11,
 8 2011, it closed at 35.81. You know, we had that --
 9 we had that slump in 2009 and 2008, so March 6, 2009,
 10 it was 24.81. It was pretty low then, but it seems
 11 like it has been steadily rising for the most part;
 12 and, now, it's in the -- in the 60s. It was 70s last
 13 week -- or I guess last year. I'm sorry.

14 So my confusion is why we're paying more.
 15 If the stock prices are going up, that's indicative
 16 of increased profits. Maybe I'm -- maybe I'm
 17 misinformed though so that's where I am feeling very
 18 frustrated.

19 So that's it. I did not write that out.
 20 Sorry.

21 EXAMINER SEE: Any cross-examination for
 22 this witness? Thank you.

23 Next person I have on the list to testify
 24 is Lois Hornbostel. How far off was I, ma'am?
 25 Hornbostel?

1 MS. HORNBOSTEL: My maiden name Krejci
2 was even worse. Do you want copies?

3 EXAMINER SEE: You can use it if you need
4 it.

5 MS. HORNBOSTEL: No. I have more. Wait.
6 There's more. I want everybody to hear me. Is this
7 working?

8 EXAMINER SEE: No. There is nothing
9 there.

10 - - -

11 LOIS HORNBOSTEL
12 presented herself as a public witness, and being
13 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

14 DIRECT EXAMINATION

15 EXAMINER SEE: Please state and spell
16 your name for the record and give us your address.

17 THE WITNESS: Lois Hornbostel, L-O-I-S
18 H-O-R-N-B-O-S-T-E-L.

19 EXAMINER SEE: Ms. Hornbostel, I am going
20 to need you to speak up.

21 THE WITNESS: 5050 Forest Trail,
22 Columbus, Ohio 43230. I am a proud -- I am proud to
23 be a member and supporter of Interfaith Power and
24 Light -- where did he go -- and the Sierra Club. As
25 such, clean, renewable energy is a priority for me,

1 and it should be for you. 99 percent of the world's
2 climate scientists have proven that the earth is
3 experiencing the impacts of global warming as never
4 before in the history of the world. I worked in
5 health care for 44 years as a clinical laboratory
6 scientist. Doing business as usual is not an option
7 for any of us, let alone American Electric Power.

8 Under the AEP proposal the average
9 consumer could see his or her fixed monthly change
10 increased by nearly 120 percent. I am 78 years old,
11 and as a senior living on a fixed income, this rate
12 increase will fall disproportionately on me at a time
13 when I can least afford it, and the impact of such an
14 increase on low-income Ohioans is much worse and
15 simply unfair. This rate increases -- this rate
16 increase adds no value for AEP customers, only for
17 company shareholders.

18 As a final point, fixed rate increases
19 will penalize those who are trying to increase their
20 energy efficiency and discourage AEP from needed
21 investments in renewable energy.

22 For these reasons I urge PUCO to reject
23 the rate proposal before you and force AEP to return
24 to you with a more reasonable and justifiably
25 proposal.

1 Thank you for your attention.

2 EXAMINER SEE: Ms. Hornbostel. Any
3 cross? And if you have another copy of your
4 statement, can I get one, please?

5 THE WITNESS: Yes. I have more.

6 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

7 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

8 EXAMINER SEE: Kelsey Starr.

9 - - -

10 KELSEY STARR

11 presented herself as a public witness, and being
12 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

13 DIRECT EXAMINATION

14 EXAMINER SEE: State and spell your name
15 for the record.

16 THE WITNESS: My name is Kelsey Starr,
17 K-E-L-S-E-Y S-T-A-R-R. My address is 115 North Ogden
18 Avenue in Columbus, Ohio 43204.

19 I just have a really brief statement to
20 make. So as I just stated, my name is Kelsey Starr.
21 I am 25, and I am a single mother. And I come from a
22 background of poverty as a child and today still I am
23 working to surpass its grip like 43 percent of single
24 mother households in Ohio and the over 1.5 million
25 people in Ohio who are living in poverty now.

1 And I also have a personal account that I
2 have witnessed from people in the areas which I live,
3 and it's not -- it's not very far from here. I live,
4 as I mentioned, you know, very close to West Broad
5 Street if you guys are familiar with the Hilltop
6 area, not a very rich, you know, area.

7 And I have personally witnessed my
8 neighbors last year walking to the corner store, and
9 they returned with only two packs of Ramen Noodles
10 and this is a household with no less than four
11 children living there. So this really posed some
12 very emotional questions in my mind as for what type
13 of standard of living these people have.

14 I know the challenges that I personally
15 face, but it's evident all around us. So I am coming
16 here as a consumer and, you know, somebody who
17 understands the struggles, you know, that we face
18 already.

19 So with these things in mind, I sincerely
20 believe that raising costs for Ohioans, costs which
21 cannot be affected by energy use monitoring would be
22 detrimental to the poor families of Ohio; and just to
23 echo everything that's been stated by the people who
24 have been testifying today, the current and future
25 generations expect and deserve affordable, clean,

1 renewable power.

2 So I would like to urge all energy
3 companies to continue making investments and, you
4 know, responsible moves toward clean energy and not
5 take away the incentives as other people have
6 testified up here to move in that direction.

7 I saw an article the other day that said,
8 you know, many scientists believe we have about
9 approximately 10 years to make really steadfast and
10 big changes to quote-unquote save the planet, save
11 humans basically because, you know, science is out
12 there. Seems that everyone who has been speaking is
13 in agreement with this.

14 So I would just like to see our money
15 being spent in a good way rather than just some --
16 some fee that's going to be a standard on our bill
17 that we are not going to see any benefit from.
18 That's all I have to say. Thank you.

19 EXAMINER SEE: Any cross? Thank you,
20 Ms. Starr.

21 Ted Klupinski.

22 - - -

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

TED KLUPINSKI

presented himself as a public witness, and being first duly sworn, testified as follows:

DIRECT EXAMINATION

EXAMINER SEE: State and spell your name for the record and give us your address.

THE WITNESS: Ted Klupinski, T-E-D K-L-U-P-I-N-S-K-I. I live at 950 Palmer Road, Grandview Heights.

EXAMINER SEE: Go ahead with your testimony.

THE WITNESS: Thank you. I am a professional scientist. I have a Bachelor's degree and a Master's degree in chemistry. I work in contract research. In short that means that clients pay me to solve problems. I have no current or recent involvement in energy research or any other research closely related to AEP's interests.

I'm speaking here today as a citizen, not as a scientist. However, I provided my professional background because the -- the area that I work in provides contacts for me to provide the economics relevant to AEP's request.

In 12 years working in contract research my charge-out rate, what I charge on average to

1 clients, has increased by less than 100 percent. I
2 work in a competitive market. My clients know their
3 specific needs, and they know who can provide them
4 specific services and at what costs. If I charge
5 more, that would make me less competitive. In the
6 reality that I work in, sometimes my clients choose
7 me, and sometimes they don't. That's what the market
8 is like.

9 By contrast AEP has nearly a captive
10 market. The vast majority of people in Ohio never
11 think about who provides their electricity and
12 whether they are paying a fair price.

13 AEP currently is proposing an increase in
14 fixed charges by 119 percent in the time period of
15 less than six years. And, again, these are fixed
16 charges. Anybody who receives electric power from
17 AEP would be obligated to pay these increased fixed
18 charges regardless of how much electricity he or she
19 uses. That idea is an attempted abuse of power by a
20 powerful power company.

21 Economics is not just a college course;
22 it's a way of understanding reality. The reality
23 that I work in is in fairness pretty good for me. I
24 know that other people, including people who have
25 testified today, have different economic realities

1 that affect them in different ways that I don't
2 personally understand. And it's the Commission's
3 responsibility to understand the broad public
4 interest which, of course, includes the economy that
5 affects all of us in the public.

6 When proposed rate changes are out of
7 line with the real economy that affects the public,
8 they must be rejected and this is such a case. I
9 urge the Commission to reject the request.

10 Thank you.

11 EXAMINER SEE: Any cross? Thank you.

12 Amy R. Ivanoff.

13 MS. IVANOFF: Ivanoff?

14 EXAMINER SEE: I'm sorry?

15 MS. IVANOFF: Ivanoff, I-V-A-N-O-F-F?

16 EXAMINER SEE: Yes. Thank you for the
17 save. Thank you for saving me because I was about to
18 really butcher that.

19 MS. IVANOFF: It's butchered regularly.

20 - - -

21 AMY R. IVANOFF

22 presented herself as a public witness, and being
23 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

24 DIRECT EXAMINATION

25 EXAMINER SEE: Please state and spell

1 your name for the record.

2 THE WITNESS: My name is Amy Ivanoff,
3 I-V-A-N-O-F-F, first name A-M-Y. I live at 1049
4 South Washington Avenue, Columbus, Ohio, Merion
5 Village area, and I'm here as a retiree. My partner
6 is also a retiree. We were both affiliated with the
7 City of Columbus. We were recreation employees.

8 And he came home one evening and said,
9 you know, "I don't quite understand what's going on,
10 what the thinking is behind this dilemma that I am
11 looking at." I love Scioto Mile. I think it's
12 beautiful. However, what happened with the Scioto
13 Mile that probably a lot of people don't know is that
14 AEP donated 11 million plus dollars to that project.
15 Now, that's fine. My feeling is charity begins at
16 home. I am a very giving person. This seems out of
17 line with the fact that they are asking us for more
18 money and did right after that whole project was
19 completed.

20 The other part of that project that I
21 disagreed with, as did my partner who is in
22 maintenance, was that beautiful spray park sculpture
23 thing that we have down there increased our energy
24 usage from 2 pumps with the old Bicentennial Park to
25 50 plus at a time when all of us were ringing our

1 hands over the environment. And, darn it, you know,
2 because the rich people got their tax writeoff.

3 And by the way I did contact PUCO at that
4 time not quite understanding what was going on and
5 what PUCO did, et cetera, et cetera. I am also a
6 retired school teacher. As a teacher, everybody in
7 here should know that teachers are exhausted, so it
8 took a lot out of me to even take the time to do
9 that.

10 But I just feel like what's going on here
11 is another example of the sports arena that we voted
12 down how many times. Three? Four? And we are now
13 still supporting it. In the end we are supporting
14 it. I've never been inside it. So, you know, I'm a
15 little bit upset. You can probably tell that. It's
16 my Hungarian ire. I apologize.

17 EXAMINER SEE: Any cross-examination for
18 this witness? Thank you, Ms. Ivanoff.

19 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

20 EXAMINER SEE: Next witness is Spencer
21 Dennis.

22 MR. DENNIS: Is it okay if my daughter
23 stands with me?

24 EXAMINER SEE: Of course, it is.

25 MR. DENNIS: Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPENCER DENNIS

presented himself as a public witness, and being
first duly sworn, testified as follows:

DIRECT EXAMINATION

EXAMINER SEE: Please state and spell
your name for the record and provide us your address.

THE WITNESS: Spencer Dennis,
S-P-E-N-C-E-R D-E-N-N-I-S, I live at 2590 Muskingum
Court, Columbus, Ohio 43210.

EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Go ahead with your
testimony.

THE WITNESS: I would just like to point
out the proposal is clearly regressive in at least
two important ways. It's economically regressive.
It will impact low-income residents the most as well
as senior residents on a fixed income.

And in terms of conservation it's also
regressive. People who use less energy will pay more
of an increase, so as a per kilowatt rate, their
rates go up more than anyone else's.

Just to put that in some raw numbers, if
you are paying \$100 a month, a \$10 increase is a 10
percent increase. If you are wasteful with your
energy and are paying \$500 a month, you are looking
at a 2 percent increase, so you are much less

1 affected. I don't think this is the kind of proposal
2 we need. We need progressive policies, not
3 regressive policies.

4 So that's all. Thank you.

5 EXAMINER SEE: Any cross? Thank you.

6 THE WITNESS: Thank you very much.

7 EXAMINER SEE: Cindy Gildersleeve?

8 - - -

9 CINDY GILDERSLEEVE

10 presented herself as a public witness, and being
11 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

12 DIRECT EXAMINATION

13 EXAMINER SEE: State and spell your name
14 for the record and give us your address.

15 THE WITNESS: Cindy, C-I-N-D-Y,
16 Gildersleeve, G-I-L-D-E-R then sleeve like a
17 shirtsleeve, S-L-E-E-V-E, 2695 Bristol Road, Upper
18 Arlington.

19 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

20 THE WITNESS: I wasn't really planning on
21 speaking tonight, but I kind of walked in, and I felt
22 moved. So I just kind of have been struck by the
23 120 percent increase. I think about cost of living
24 increases. And, I don't know, like in the last eight
25 years, we've been frozen where I work. I'm a school

1 teacher. We have had those frozen quite often. And
2 when we have gotten them, it's been 1 percent, 1-1/2,
3 2 percent. 120 percent I think, wow, I would like
4 that. I don't think anyone is going to give it to
5 me.

6 I understand the need for increases.
7 Everything costs more. I just think 120 percent is
8 very steep. I'm a single parent. I have two
9 children. One is going off to college, and I've
10 offered to help her with it. I'm thinking -- we play
11 this game at home. It's called the penny pincher
12 game. The kids are very tired of it, and I'm
13 thinking we are going to have to kind of go back to
14 that a little bit more intensely. That's going to be
15 tough.

16 And then I think, okay, so I'm really in
17 kind of an okay space, and I have got some privilege
18 going on in my life. What about the people who
19 don't? They are probably already playing that penny
20 pincher game, and to take more from them just as a
21 blanket this is what it is, I struggle with that.

22 I kind of believe in the general welfare
23 of everyone. And, yes, I taught that today. But as
24 an educator, I participated in AEP's program that
25 teaches teachers to teach children so they can go

1 home and teach their families about energy
2 conservation. And there's a -- this beautiful pack
3 that goes with it with LED lights and fluorescent
4 lights and the weatherstripping. And I think so we
5 are going to send this home with children to talk
6 about conservation, but prices will still go up. I'm
7 missing the logic.

8 I really think that we need to encourage
9 energy efficiency. I think we need to reward those
10 who are being efficient with their energy. One of my
11 students the other day, I teach 4th grade, turned to
12 me, we were talking, I said something, I don't know,
13 "I have issues with plastic." She said "I've got
14 really big issues with climate change."

15 And, you know, I have a daughter going to
16 college and she wants to be a marine biologist and
17 she said "What if there is no planet left?" And I'm
18 like, "Well, then I guess it doesn't matter what you
19 do."

20 I really, really like the solar farm I
21 guess that you're planning for southeastern Ohio. I
22 think that's a very positive move. It's one that
23 will benefit, you know, our children, our children's
24 children, the people in an area that's been so hit
25 hard economically. I think it will reduce our carbon

1 footprint. I think it will create great jobs and
2 careers and stability for families.

3 So I would really like to encourage you
4 to continue with that and perhaps other options of
5 energy and to really look closely at this 120 percent
6 increase.

7 So that's all I have to say. Thank you.

8 EXAMINER SEE: Any cross? Thank you very
9 much.

10 Robin Craft.

11 - - -

12 ROBIN CRAFT

13 presented herself as a public witness, and being
14 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

15 DIRECT EXAMINATION

16 EXAMINER SEE: State and spell your name
17 for the record and give us your address.

18 THE WITNESS: It's Robin Craft, R-O-B-I-N
19 Craft, C-R-A-F-T, and my home address is 8678 U.S.
20 Highway 42 North, Plain City, Ohio.

21 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

22 THE WITNESS: I wanted to speak today
23 because my husband and I own two commercial
24 buildings, one in Columbus and one in West Jefferson,
25 that receive our energy through AEP. And both of

1 those buildings house pharmacies. My husband and I
2 are both pharmacists.

3 As pharmacists, we see every day the
4 poorest of the poor who come in who are on Medicaid
5 who are trying to buy their prescription medication
6 to keep themselves alive and often have to choose
7 between buying that prescription or eating. By
8 having to have just one more charge with this
9 increased rate of 120 percent, it's just going to add
10 further burden to these people who are already just
11 barely making it.

12 My husband and I are very blessed but we
13 have two uncles who are in this very situation who we
14 often supplement their incomes because they get less
15 than \$1,000 a month to live on and they cannot afford
16 an increase like this and it might seem miniscule to
17 others but it is a great deal to them.

18 Additionally, I want to ask AEP to please
19 move towards all they can do for renewables. My
20 husband and I try to do everything we can with our
21 businesses to try to support renewable energy. We've
22 done geothermal in one of our businesses. We also
23 have looked into solar panels, and we actually sent
24 our IT person to learn how to install solar panels so
25 he could start doing some of this at our businesses.

1 And he was excited because this gives him a whole new
2 job that he can promote himself to be able to do.

3 And that's what we need to be doing, not
4 more towards the past but moving forward towards
5 clean energy, renewables, and jobs that are really
6 going to help people get back on their feet, not
7 moving backwards. But as a pharmacist and as a
8 consumer, I just would like to ask you to not
9 consider this rate increase and to please consider
10 renewables.

11 Thank you.

12 EXAMINER SEE: Is there any
13 cross-examination for Ms. Craft? Thank you.

14 Those were all the witnesses that signed
15 up to offer testimony. Is there anybody present that
16 did not offer testimony that wishes to do so now?

17 Okay. Then I would like to explain to
18 you some of the next steps in the Commission's
19 process. As I indicated earlier, there is one more
20 local hearing. It will be held at the Commission's
21 offices on April 25 at 12:30.

22 After that, there is an evidentiary
23 hearing where the 28 parties that I mentioned earlier
24 and the staff will have an opportunity to have -- to
25 present expert testimony.

After that evidentiary hearing is concluded, the Commission will review the briefs and reply briefs filed by those parties, and usually about three to four months later the Commission will issue its decision on the AEP Ohio application.

With that I would like to thank you all for coming out and giving us your time this evening and expressing your opinion about the application. Thank you.

(Thereupon, at 7:21 p.m., the hearing was adjourned.)

- - -

CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is
a true and correct transcript of the proceedings
taken by me in this matter on Monday, April 17, 2017,
and carefully compared with my original stenographic
notes.

Karen Sue Gibson, Registered
Merit Reporter.

(KSG-6346)

- - -

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

4/21/2017 9:34:55 AM

in

Case No(s). 16-1852-EL-SSO, 16-1853-EL-AAM

Summary: Transcript In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to R.C. 4928.143 in the Form of an Electric Security Plan and In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority, hearing held on April 17, 2017. electronically filed by Mr. Ken Spencer on behalf of Armstrong & Okey, Inc. and Gibson, Karen Sue Mrs.