

VORYS

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP Legal Counsel 614.464.6400 | www.vorys.com

Founded 1909

Stephen M. Howard Direct Dial (614) 464-5401 Direct Fax (614) 719-4772 Email smhoward@vorys.com

April 18, 2017

Ms. Barcy F. McNeal, Secretary Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 180 E. Broad St., 11th Floor Columbus, OH 43215-3793

Re:

Case No. 17-1085-EL-ACP

CenStar Energy Corp.

Public Version of 2016 Alternative Energy Annual Status Report

Dear Ms. McNeal:

I am submitting to you a redacted version of the Alternative Energy Annual Status Report for calendar year 2016 on behalf of CenStar Energy Corp. Certain portions of information have been redacted because they contain confidential and proprietary information. A motion for protective order is also being filed today seeking protection of such information. Pursuant to Rule 4901-1-24(D) of the Ohio Administrative Code, I will be submitting under seal two copies of the confidential version of the Alternative Energy Annual Status Report for calendar year 2016 for CenStar Energy Corp.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely yours,

Stephen M. Howard

Attorneys for CenStar Energy Corp.

Stephen M. Howard

SMH/jaw Enclosures

COMPETITIVE RETAIL ELECTRIC SERVICE PROVIDER RENEWABLE PORTFOLIO STANDARD (RPS) REPORT FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2016

| | 543 AN | Star Energy Corp (hereinafter "CRES") in accordance with Sections 4928.64, D 4928.65, Ohio Revised Code and Commission Rules 4901:1-40-03 and 4901:1-40-05 ts this RPS Report detailing compliance with the Ohio Renewable Portfolio Standards. |
|-------|---------|--|
| Check | this bo | x if applicable: |
| | | This RPS Report also addresses the compliance obligations of an additional CRES provider, |
| I. | Deterr | nination that an Alternative Energy Resource Report is Required (check one) During calendar year 2016 the CRES states that it conducted retail sales of generation to customers who utilized the generation in a load center located located within the state of Ohio. |
| | | During calendar year 2016 the CRES states that it did not conduct retail sales of generation to customers who utilized the generation in a load center located within the state of Ohio. (If this block is checked proceed to the signature line) |
| II. | Detern | nination of the sales baseline for 2016 |
| | | RES will mark only one of the applicable options below in the determination of the sales ne for 2016. |
| | a. | The baseline is computed as an average of the three preceding calendar years (listed below) of the total annual number of kilowatt-hours of electricity sold to any and all retail electric consumers served by the CRES in Ohio, based upon the kilowatt-hours sales in the CRES' most recent quarterly market-monitoring reports or reporting forms. That average isMWh. |
| | | 2013 MWh 2014 MWh 2015 MWh |
| | b. | The CRES has not been continuously supplying Ohio retail electric customers during the preceding three calendar years; therefore, the baseline shall be computed as an average of annual sales data for all calendar years during the preceding three years (listed below) in which the CRES was serving retail customers. That average of annual sales data for all such calendar years is is23,434 |
| | | 2013 <u>1,000 MWh</u> 2014 <u>25,189 MWh</u> 2015 <u>44,013 MWh</u> |
| | c. | Beginning with compliance year 2014, a CRES may choose for its baseline the total |

kilowatt hour sold during the compliance year to any and all applicable retail consumers

located in Ohio who are served by the CRES. Such actual sales in 2016 was ______ MWh.

- d. A CRES may file an application requesting a reduced baseline to reflect new economic growth in its service territory or service area. Any such application shall include a justification including why timely compliance based on the unadjusted baseline is not feasible, a schedule for achieving compliance based on its unadjusted baseline, quantification of a new change in the rate of economic growth, and a methodology for measuring economic activity, including objective measurement parameters and quantification methodologies.
- III. Determination of the number of Solar and Total Renewable Energy Credits (RECs) Required and Statement of the Number of RECs Claimed

| RENEWABLE ENERGY | CREDITS REQUI | RED AND RETIRI | ED FOR 2016 |
|------------------|---------------|----------------|--------------|
| Types | No. of RECs | No. of RECs | Registry (c) |
| | Required (a) | Retired (b) | |
| Solar | 28 | 28 | |
| Non Solar | <u>558</u> | <u>558</u> | |
| Total | <u>586</u> | <u>586</u> | H |

- a. Column a above lists the unadjusted number of Solar and Total RECs Required for the CRES in 2016. The determinations were calculated by multiplying the Baseline Sales BY 12 hundredths of one per cent (.12%) for Solar RECs and 238 hundredths percent (2.38%) for non-Solar RECs. Total RECs include both Solar and Non Solar RECs.
- b. The CRES states that it has retired in accordance with the Commission's Rules the number of Solar and Non Solar RECs listed in column b above for 2016.
- c. The CRES used the PJM GATS and/or M-RETS registry as listed in column (c) for the RECs detailed above.
- d. CRES states that it did not seek and did not receive a force majeure determination for Solar RECs.

| IV. | Compliance | (check | one) |) |
|-----|------------|--------|------|---|
| | | | | |

required for 2016.

| M | without adjustments permitted pursuant to Rule 4901:1-40-05(A)(3). |
|---|--|
| | CRES states that it has retired the required number of Solar RECs and Total RECs after adjustments permitted pursuant to Rule 4901:1-40-05(A)(3). The type adjustment, reason for the adjustment and merit for making the requested adjustment of the proposed adjustments are detailed in an exhibit attached to this Report. |
| | CRES states that it is not in compliance with number of Solar RECs or Total RECs |

V. Ten Year Forecast

a. Ten Year Forecast of Solar and Non-Solar RECs

In accordance with Rule 4901:1-40-03(C) the CRES hereby provides a projection for the next 10 years for RECs and Solar RECs.

| Year | Solar RECs | Non-solar RECs | Total RECs |
|------|------------|----------------|------------|
| 2017 | | | |
| 2018 | | | |
| 2019 | | | |
| 2020 | - | - | ** |
| 2021 | | - | - |
| 2022 | - | No. | ** |
| 2023 | •• | - | ₩ |
| 2024 | *** | - | • |
| 2025 | - | - | - |
| 2026 | - | - | - |

- b. The Supply Portfolio projection is based upon: Projection is based on forecasted load.
- c. The Methodology used to evaluate compliance is based upon:

 <u>CenStar plans to purchase RECs to meet our RPS requirements.</u>
- d. Optional comments on any perceived impediment(s) to achieving compliance with the Solar and Non Solar REC requirements, as well as any discussion addressing such impediments.

COMPETITIVE RETAIL ELECTRIC SERVICE PROVIDER RENEWABLE PORTFOLIO STANDARD (RPS) REPORT FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2016

| my knowledge all the information contained in the foregoing report including any exhibits attachments are true, accurate and complete. Signature | |
|---|--|
| Any questions from the Commission Staff regarding this report should be directed to: | |
| Edwin Dearman at 832-320-2928 or Name Phone Number | |
| edearman@sparkenergy.com. E-Mail Address | |

Compliance Plan Status Report for Compliance Year 2016 Summary Sheet

| | Sales Unadjusted (MWHs) | Proposed Adjustments (MWHs) | Sales Adjusted (MWHs) | Source of Sales Volume Data | |
|--------------|--|--|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------|
| 2013 | | 0 | 1,100 | | (A) |
| 2014 | | 0.000 | 25,189 | | (B) |
| 2015 | | 0 | 44,013 | | <u>](c)</u> |
| seline for | 2016 Compliance Obligation (MWH | is) | 23,434 | 7 | (D) = AvgABC |
| ote: If usir | ig 2016 sales os your baseline, insert | that figure in cell 124 and indicate i | n call k16 if 2016 soles are udj | iusted or not, | i.e., Not Adjus |
| 2.50% | 2016 Statutory Compliance Oblig | ation | | | |
| | 2016 Non-Solar Renewable Bench | mark | 2.38% | | (E) |
| | 2016 Solar Renewable Benchmari | • | 0.12% | | (F) |
| | Per R.C., 4928.64(B)(2) | | | _ | |
| | 2016 Compliance Obligation | | | | |
| | Non-Solar RECs Needed for Co | mpliance | 55 | 8 | (G) = (D) * (E) |
| | Solar RECs Needed for Complia | ince | | 18 | (H) = (D) * (F) |
| | Carry-Over from Previous Year(s) | , if applicable | | | |
| | Non-Solar (RECs) | | | | (1) |
| | Solar (S-RECs) | | | 0 | (J) |
| | Total 2016 Compliance Obligation | ns | | | |
| | Non-Solar RECs Needed for Co | | 55 | 8 | (K) = (G) + (I) |
| | Solar RECs Needed for Complia | nce | 2 | 8 | (L) = (H) + (J) |
| | 2016 Performance (Per GATS and | or MRETS Data) | | | |
| | Non-Solar (RECs) | | 55 | 8 | (M) |
| | Solar (S-RECs) | | 2 | 8 | (N) |
| | Under Compliance in 2016, if app | licable | | | |
| | Non-Solar (RECs) | ı | | <u>ं</u> | (O) = (K) - (M) |
| | Solar (S-RECs) | | | <u> </u> | (P) = (L) - (N) |
| | 2016 Alternative Compliance Pays | ments | | | |
| | Non-Solar, per REC (Refer to Ca | se 16-0714-EL-ACP) | \$49.7 | 5 | (Q) |
| | Solar, per S-REC (Refer to R.C. 4 | 928.64(C)(2)(a)) | \$300.0 | ! | (R) |
| | 2016 Payments, if applicable | | | | |
| | Non-Solar Total | ſ | \$0.0 | 0 | (S) = (O) * (Q) |
| | Solar Total | | \$0.0 | | (T) = (P) * (R) |
| | TOTAL | ľ | \$0.0 | - 1 | (U) = (S) + (T) |

compliance status report for the 2016 compliance year. Your company is not required to include this form in its filing, but that is an option. If using this form, your company should insert data in the blue shaded boxes (as applicable). The remaining cells should auto-calculate. However, you should still independently verify the

occuracy of the calculations. Questions concerning this worksheet can be addressed to Stuart. Siegfried@puc.state.oh.us

For details on determining your compliance baseline, please refer to 4928.643, Ohio Revised Code (ORC), and 4901:1-40-03 of the Ohio Administrative Code (OAC).

Questions may also be posed to Staff at the following email address:

AEPS@puc.state.oh.us

CenStar Energy Corp - My RPS Compliance - OH - Jan 2016 - Dec 2016

| Account Name | Subaccount Name | Zone Name | GATS Load | RIS Find | Delete | Total Generation for Subaccount | OH Solar | OH Renewable | Total Certificates Used for RPS |
|---------------------|--------------------|--------------|--------------|-------------|--------|--|-------------|-----------------|---|
| CenStar Energy Corp | Default | AEP Ohio | 14,203 | | | 92 | 4 | 88 | 92 |
| CenStar Energy Corp | Default | DEOK | 32,732 | | | 91 | 4 | 87 | 91 |
| CenStar Energy Corp | Default | FEOH | 38,066 | | | 403 | 20 | 383 | 403 |
| Total | | | 85,001 | | | 586 | 28 | 558 | 586 |

4/11/2017 4:12 PM Page 1

CenStar Energy Corp - Subaccount Details - OH - Jan 2016 - Dec 2016

| Subsection Name | Zone Name | Month Vest | i finit ID i si i | Pacifity Name | State | Fuel Type | Certificate Serial Numbers | Quantity | State Certification Number | OH Solat |
|--------------------|--------------|---------------|----------------------|---|-------|--------------|----------------------------------|----------|----------------------------------|-------------|
| Default | AEP Ohio | 10/2014 | NON45372 | Ashland Solar 01 LLC - Ashland Solar 01 LLC | ОН | SUN | 1236372 - 1 to 4 | 4 | 11-SPV-OH-GATS-0301 | Yes |
| Default | AEP Ohio | 11/2014 | MSET89634101 | Belleville - 1 | wv | WAT | 1239019 - 1504 to 1591 | 88 | 10-HYD-WV-GATS-0040 | |
| Default | DEOK | 10/2014 | NON45372 | Ashland Solar 01 LLC - Ashland Solar 01 LLC | ОН | SUN | 1236372 - 5 to 8 | 4 | 11-SPV-OH-GATS-0301 | Yes |
| Default | DEOK | 11/2014 | MSET89634101 | Belleville - 1 | wv | WAT | 1239019 - 1592 to 1678 | 87 | 10-HYD-WV-GATS-0040 | |
| Default | FEOH | 03/2014 | NON45372 | Ashland Solar 01 LLC - Ashland Solar 01 LLC | ОН | SUN | 1118196 - 1 to 10 | 10 | 11-SPV-OH-GATS-0301 | Yes |
| Default | FEOH | 06/2014 | NON45372 | Ashland Solar 01 LLC - Ashland Solar 01 LLC | OH | SUN | 1120488 - 1 to 10 | 10 | 11-SPV-OH-GATS-0301 | Yes |
| Default | FEOH | 11/2014 | MSET89634101 | Belleville - 1 | wv | WAT | 1239019 - 1679 to 2061 | 383 | 10-HYD-WV-GATS-0040 | |
| Total | | | | | | | | 586 | | |

4/11/2017 4:19 PM Page 1

CenStar Energy Corp - Subaccount Details - OH - Jan 2016 - Dec 2016

| oli Renewable | HPS | | i eta | Deposit Date |
|------------------|-----|---------|-------------|-----------------|
| | Yes | \$16.00 | STATE STATE | 04/11/2017 |
| Yes | Yes | \$2.00 | | 04/11/2017 |
| _+screen | Yes | \$16.00 | 2016 | 04/11/2017 |
| Yes | Yes | \$2.00 | 2016 | 04/11/2017 |
| | Yes | \$16.00 | 2016 | 04/11/2017 |
| | Yes | \$16.00 | 2016 | 04/11/2017 |
| Yes | Yes | \$2.00 | 2016 | 04/11/2017 |
| | | | | |

4/11/2017 4:19 PM Page 2

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

4/18/2017 9:50:10 AM

in

Case No(s). 17-1085-EL-ACP

Summary: Report Public Version of 2016 Alternative Energy Annual Status Report electronically filed by Mr. Stephen M Howard on behalf of CenStar Energy Corp.