

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of )  
Ludlow Natural Gas Company, LLC for ) Case No.17-0910-GA-ACE  
Authority to Operate as a Natural Gas )  
Company )

**LUDLOW NATURAL GAS COMPANY, LLC'S  
MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Ludlow Natural Gas Company, LLC, by and through its attorneys, and pursuant to Section 4901-1-24(D) of the Commission's rules moves for a protective order keeping confidential Exhibit E to its Application for Authority to Operate as a Natural Gas Company, which contains the Company's consolidated financial information. The reasons underlying this motion are detailed in the attached Memorandum in Support. Consistent with the requirements of Section 4901-1-24(D) of the Commission's rules, an original and two unredacted copies of the confidential information which is the subject of this motion will be hand-filed under seal.

Respectfully submitted:

/s/ Michael D. Dortch  
Michael D. Dortch (0043897)  
Richard R. Parsons (0082270)  
KRAVITZ, BROWN, & DORTCH, LLC  
65 East State Street, Suite 200  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Tel: (614) 464-2000  
Fax: (614) 464-2002  
E-mail: [rparsons@kravitzllc.com](mailto:rparsons@kravitzllc.com)

ATTORNEYS FOR  
LUDLOW NATURAL GAS COMPANY, LLC

## **MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

Ohio Admin. Code §4901-1-24(D) provides that the Commission or certain designated employees may issue an order necessary to protect the confidentiality of information contained in documents filed with the Commission's Docketing Division to the extent that state or federal law prohibits the release of the information and where non-disclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code. While the Commission has expressed its preference for open proceedings, the Commission also long ago recognized its statutory obligations with regard to trade secrets:

The Commission is of the opinion that the "public records" statute must also be read in *pari materia* with Section 1333.31, Revised Code ("trade secrets" statute). The latter statute must be interpreted as evincing the recognition, on the part of the General Assembly, of the value of trade secret information.

*In re: General Telephone Co.*, Entry, PUCO Case No, 81-383-TP-AIR (Feb. 17, 1982).

Likewise, the Commission has facilitated the protection of trade secrets in its rules. *See, e.g.*, Ohio Admin. Code §4901-1-24(A)(7).

Ohio Rev. Code §1133.61(D) defines "trade secret" as:

[I]nformation including the whole or any portion of phase of any scientific or technical information, design, process, procedure, formula, pattern, compilation, program, device, method, technique, or improvement, or any business information or plans, financial information, or listing of names, addresses, or telephone numbers, that satisfies both of the following:

- (1) It derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by, other persons who can obtain economic value from its disclosure or use.
- (2) It is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.

Ohio Rev. Code §1333.61(D). This definition clearly reflects the state policy favoring the protection of trade secrets such as the confidential financial and proprietary information which is the subject of this motion.

Ludlow Natural Gas Company, LLC (“Ludlow Natural Gas”) first respectfully that Exhibit E to its Application for Authority to Operate as a Natural Gas Company be maintained as confidential because it contains Ludlow Natural Gas’s confidential and proprietary financial information. (the “Designated Information.”) In the ordinary course of Ludlow Natural Gas’s business, the Designated Information is deemed confidential, is treated as proprietary and confidential by Ludlow Natural Gas’s employees, and is not disclosed to anyone other than as part of a legal proceeding and, even then, only pursuant to a protective order. Ludlow Natural Gas does not disclose the Designated Information and make reasonable efforts to maintain its secrecy. For these reasons, the Designated Information falls directly within the definition of “trade secret” or is otherwise entitled to confidential treatment.

In addition, non-disclosure of the Designated Information will not impair the purposes of Title 49. The Commission and its Staff have full access to the Designated Information in order to review Ludlow Natural Gas’s Application, and no purpose of Title 49 would be served by the public disclosure of the Designated Information.

For the foregoing reasons, Ludlow Natural Gas respectfully requests that the Designated Information be protected from the public disclosure.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Michael D. Dortch

Michael D. Dortch (0043897)

Richard R. Parsons (0082270)

KRAVITZ, BROWN, & DORTCH, LLC

65 East State Street, Suite 200

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Tel: (614) 464-2000

Fax: (614) 464-2002

E-mail: rparsons@kravitzllc.com

ATTORNEYS FOR

LUDLOW NATURAL GAS COMPANY, LLC

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**4/4/2017 4:52:31 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 17-0910-GA-ACE**

Summary: Motion Motion for Protective Order electronically filed by Mr. Michael D. Dortch on behalf of Ludlow Natural Gas Company, LLC