

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of	)	
Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. for an	)	Case No. 17-0032-EL-AIR
Increase in Electric Distribution Rates	)	
	)	
In the Matter of the Application of	)	
Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. for Tariff	)	Case No. 17-0033-EL-ATA
Approval	)	
	)	
In the Matter of the Application of	)	
Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. for Approval	)	Case No. 17-0034-EL-AAM
to Change Accounting Methods	)	

---

**MOTION TO INTERVENE  
BY ENVIRONMENTAL DEFENSE FUND AND  
THE OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL**

---

Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code § 4903.22.1 and Ohio Administrative Code § 4901-1-11, Environmental Defense Fund (“EDF”) and the Ohio Environmental Council (“OEC”), move for leave to intervene in the above captioned case, in which Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. (“Duke” or “the Company”) submits its Application for an Increase in Electric Distribution Rates (“Application”). As more fully discussed in the accompanying Memorandum in Support, EDF and OEC have a real and substantial interest in this proceeding. The interests of EDF and OEC are not represented by any existing party, and participation in this proceeding will contribute to a just and expeditious resolution of the issues involved without unduly delaying the proceeding or unjustly prejudicing any existing party. EDF and OEC thereby move to intervene in this proceeding pursuant to R.C. 4903.221 and O.A.C. 4901-1-11.

WHEREFORE, EDF and OEC respectfully request that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio grant EDF and OEC's Motion to Intervene for these reasons and those set forth in the attached Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted,



---

Miranda Leppla (0086351)

**Counsel of Record**

Trent Dougherty (0079817)

1145 Chesapeake Avenue, Suite I

Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449

(614) 487-7506 - Telephone

(614) 487-7510 - Fax

[mleppla@theOEC.org](mailto:mleppla@theOEC.org)

[tdougherty@theOEC.org](mailto:tdougherty@theOEC.org)

***Counsel for the Ohio Environmental  
Council and Environmental Defense Fund***

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of	)	
Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. for an	)	Case No. 17-0032-EL-AIR
Increase in Electric Distribution Rates	)	
	)	
In the Matter of the Application of	)	
Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. for Tariff	)	Case No. 17-0033-EL-ATA
Approval	)	
	)	
In the Matter of the Application of	)	
Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. for Approval	)	Case No. 17-0034-EL-AAM
to Change Accounting Methods	)	

---

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

---

R.C. Section 4903.221 provides that any “person who may be adversely affected by a public utilities commission proceeding may intervene in such proceeding.”

EDF is a national nonprofit membership organization engaged in linking science, economics and law to create innovative, equitable and cost-effective solutions to society’s most urgent environmental problems. EDF has over 300,000 members nationwide and has 9,590 members in Ohio. EDF has been active in Ohio working on environmental policies including smart power, climate change, natural gas fracking and sustainable agriculture. EDF also supports state energy policies that reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

The OEC is a nonprofit, charitable organization comprised of a network of over 100 affiliated member groups whose mission is to secure healthy air, land, and water for all who call Ohio home. Throughout its 47-year history, OEC has been a leading advocate for fresh air, clean water, and sustainable energy use in Ohio. OEC was an active participant in the effort that led to

the passage of S.B. 221, and has intervened in scores of cases before this Commission to secure proper implementation of Ohio's clean energy law.

As discussed below, EDF and OEC have an interest in and may be adversely affected by the disposition of this case.

R.C. 4903.221(B) outlines four factors that the Commission shall consider when ruling on a motion to intervene in a proceeding. First, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(1), the Commission shall consider "the nature and extent of the prospective intervenor's interest." EDF and OEC have a real and substantial interest in the stability of retail electricity service and competitive energy markets, and the positive effect both have on the further deployment of cost-effective clean and efficient energy in Ohio. As environmental advocacy organizations, EDF and OEC have a special interest in the outcome of this case because of the direct impact that decisions on the Application and its included tariffs, riders, and rate increases will have on the current and future implementation and effectiveness of alternative energy resources, renewable energy generation, energy efficiency and demand response in the state. Accordingly, EDF and OEC's interest in this proceeding arise from the direct and indirect impacts that the issues presented will have on the environment of the state of Ohio and the region, and the electricity costs of their members in the Duke service territory.

Second, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(2), the Commission shall consider "[t]he legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case." EDF and OEC's members are potentially impacted by Duke's Application, and therefore both parties seek to properly scrutinize the Application to ensure that it complies with the letter and intent of the state's energy law and stated state energy policy.

Third, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(3), the Commission shall consider “[w]hether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceedings.” EDF and OEC have significant experience dealing with electric utilities questions before the Commission and their inclusion will not delay the proceeding. OEC has been consistently involved in the development and enactment of S.B. 221 and the associated rules, including as a party in numerous cases before the Commission, and EDF has litigated similar cases in Ohio, as well as in other Public Utility Commissions around the United States. Thus, intervention will not unduly prolong or delay these proceedings, but rather will add value to the development of the case.

Fourth, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(4), the Commission shall consider “[w]hether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.” EDF and OEC have developed expertise that will contribute to the full development of the legal questions involved in this proceeding. Further, as Ohio’s leading environmental advocates, EDF and OEC will be able to assure that the environmental impacts of the Company’s proposal are fully developed.

EDF and OEC also satisfy the intervention requirements outlined in the Commission’s rules. The criteria for intervention established by O.A.C. 4901-1-11(B) are identical to those provided by R.C. 4903.221, with the exception that the rules add a fifth factor that the Commission shall consider when ruling on a motion to intervene. Pursuant to O.A.C. 4901-1-11(B)(5), the Commission shall consider “[t]he extent to which the [intervenor’s] interest is represented by existing parties.” EDF and OEC’s interest is not fully represented by the existing parties, and therefore both parties should be permitted to intervene.

Finally, we point out that it is the Commission's stated policy "to encourage the broadest possible participation in its proceedings." *Cleveland Elec. Illum. Co.*, Case No. 85-675-EL-AIR, Entry dated January 14, 1986, at 2. The Commission should not apply its intervention criteria in a manner that would favor one environmental or consumer advocate to the exclusion of others.

EDF and OEC meet all the criteria established by R.C. 4903.221 and O.A.C. 4901-1-11 and therefore should be granted intervenor status in this proceeding.

WHEREFORE, EDF and OEC respectfully request that the Commission grant its Motion to Intervene in the above-captioned matter.

Respectfully submitted,



---

Miranda Leppla (0086351)

**Counsel of Record**

Trent Dougherty (0079817)

1145 Chesapeake Avenue, Suite I

Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449

(614) 487-7506 - Telephone

(614) 487-7510 - Fax

[mleppla@theOEC.org](mailto:mleppla@theOEC.org)

[tdougherty@theOEC.org](mailto:tdougherty@theOEC.org)

***Counsel for the Ohio Environmental  
Council and Environmental Defense Fund***

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing has been served upon the parties listed below by electronic mail this 22nd day of March, 2017.



---

Miranda Leppla

[amy.spiller@duke-energy.com](mailto:amy.spiller@duke-energy.com)  
[jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com](mailto:jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com)  
[elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com](mailto:elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com)  
[rocco.d'ascenzo@duke-energy.com](mailto:rocco.d'ascenzo@duke-energy.com)  
[stevene.beeler@ohioattorneygeneral.gov](mailto:stevene.beeler@ohioattorneygeneral.gov)  
[robert.eubanks@ohioattorneygeneral.gov](mailto:robert.eubanks@ohioattorneygeneral.gov)  
[ajay.kumar@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:ajay.kumar@occ.ohio.gov)  
[jodi.bair@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:jodi.bair@occ.ohio.gov)  
[christopher.healey@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:christopher.healey@occ.ohio.gov)  
[mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com](mailto:mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com)  
[kboehm@BKLawfirm.com](mailto:kboehm@BKLawfirm.com)  
[jkylerncohn@BKLawfirm.com](mailto:jkylerncohn@BKLawfirm.com)  
[cmooney@ohiopartners.org](mailto:cmooney@ohiopartners.org)  
[fdarr@mwncmh.com](mailto:fdarr@mwncmh.com)  
[mpritchard@mwncmh.com](mailto:mpritchard@mwncmh.com)  
[mfleischer@elpc.org](mailto:mfleischer@elpc.org)

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**3/22/2017 4:34:16 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 17-0032-EL-AIR, 17-0033-EL-ATA, 17-0034-EL-AAM**

Summary: Motion to Intervene by Environmental Defense Fund and the Ohio Environmental Council electronically filed by Ms. Miranda R Leppla on behalf of Ohio Environmental Council and Environmental Defense Fund