

BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of : Case No. 16-0395-EL-SSO  
The Dayton Power and Light Company for  
Approval of Its Electric Security Plan :

In the Matter of the Application of : Case No. 16-0396-EL-ATA  
The Dayton Power and Light Company for  
Approval of Revised Tariffs :

In the Matter of the Application of : Case No. 16-0397-EL-AAM  
The Dayton Power and Light Company for  
Approval of Certain Accounting Authority :  
Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code § 4905.13

---

**THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY'S  
MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER**

---

Pursuant to Ohio Admin. Code § 4901-1-24(D), The Dayton Power and Light Company ("DP&L") moves for the entry of a Protective Order to exempt from public disclosure certain information that is confidential, proprietary, and competitively sensitive trade secret information. The information at issue is Confidential Information relating to DP&L's financial information and forecasts, and it is included in the testimony and exhibits of R. Jeffrey Malinak in support of the March 13, 2017 Amended Stipulation and Recommendation.

The information at issue is maintained as confidential by DP&L, and constitutes proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret material, the public disclosure of which would subject DP&L to an unfair competitive disadvantage. In accordance with Ohio Admin. Code § 4901-1-24(D)(2), an original and two unredacted copies of the Confidential Information are to be filed under seal with the Commission.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey

Charles J. Faruki (0010417)

(Counsel of Record)

D. Jeffrey Ireland (0010443)

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)

FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L.

110 North Main Street, Suite 1600

Dayton, OH 45402

Telephone: (937) 227-3705

Telecopier: (937) 227-3717

Email: cfaruki@ficlaw.com

djireland@ficlaw.com

jsharkey@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power  
and Light Company

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF THE DAYTON POWER AND  
LIGHT COMPANY'S MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Pursuant to Ohio Admin. Code § 4901-1-24(D), The Dayton Power and Light Company ("DP&L") moves for the entry of a Protective Order to exempt from public disclosure certain information as confidential, proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret information. Specifically, DP&L requests that certain confidential information contained in the testimony and exhibits of R. Jeffrey Malinak in support of the March 13, 2017 Amended Stipulation and Recommendation be exempted from public disclosure as confidential, proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret information ("Confidential Information"). The Confidential Information contains confidential financial information and confidential forecasts.

Section 4901-1-24(D) of the Ohio Administrative Code provides that the Commission may issue an order which is necessary to protect the confidentiality of information contained in documents filed with the Commission's Docketing Division to the extent that state or federal law prohibits the release of the information, and where non-disclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code. Accord: Ohio Rev. Code § 4905.07 (providing that "[e]xcept as provided in section 149.43 of the Revised Code and as consistent with the purposes of Title XLIX [49] of the Revised Code, all facts and information in the possession of the public utilities commission shall be public").

The release of trade secret information by the Commission is prohibited by state law. In the Matter of the Joint Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Integration of an Energy Efficiency or Peak-Demand Reduction Program with Honda of Am. Mfg., Inc., PUCO Case No. 10-2205-EL-EEC, 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1313, at \*6 (Finding and Order, Dec. 7, 2011) ("Section 149.43, Revised Code, specifies that the term 'public records'

excludes information which, under state or federal law, may not be released. The Ohio Supreme Court has clarified that the 'state or federal law' exemption is intended to cover trade secrets.") (citing State ex rel. Besser v. Ohio State Univ., 89 Ohio St.3d 396, 399, 732 N.E.2d 373 (2000)). The definition of a "trade secret" includes "any business information or plans [and] financial information." Ohio Rev. Code § 1333.61(D).

"A company's determination of its costs, overhead and volume of sales, and particularly its calculation of profit margins on customers' purchases may be the kind of information that the trade secret statute seeks to protect." Kenker Box Co. v. Riemeier Lumber Co., 1st Dist. Hamilton Nos. C-990803 and C-990824, 2000 Ohio App. LEXIS 6198, at \*10 (Dec. 29, 2000). Accord: Alpha Benefits Agency, Inc. v. King Ins. Agency, Inc., 134 Ohio App. 3d 673, 683, 731 N.E.2d 1209 (8th Dist.1999) (holding that trial court should have ordered plaintiff to produce its "profitability information" to defendant subject to a protective order); Vanguard Transp. Sys. v. Edwards Transfer & Storage Co. Gen. Commodities Div., 109 Ohio App. 3d 786, 789-90, 673 N.E.2d 182 (10th Dist.1996) (affirming trial court order that held that various information including "corporate financial information" constituted a trade secret).

This definition reflects the state policy favoring the protection of trade secrets such as the information that is the subject of this Motion. The Commission has issued protective orders in numerous prior proceedings to prevent the public disclosure of trade secrets, e.g., In the Matter of the Application of Midwest Utility Consultants, Inc. for Certification as a Competitive Retail Natural Gas Aggregator/Broker, PUCO Case No. 09-893-GA-AGG, 2012 Ohio PUC LEXIS 103 (Entry, Jan. 30, 2012) (forecasted financial statements were trade secrets and granted protective treatment); In the Matter of the Application of the Ohio Power Co. and Columbus S. Power Co. for Authority to Merge and Related Approvals, et al., PUCO Case No. 10-2376-EL-

UNC, et al., 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1325, at \*22-23 (Opinion and Order, Dec. 14, 2011) (forecasted fuel expenditures were trade secrets and granted protective treatment); In the Matter of the Joint Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Integration of an Energy Efficiency or Peak-Demand Reduction Program with Honda of Am. Mfg., Inc., PUCO Case No. 10-2205-EL-EEC, 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1313, at \*2-5 (Finding and Order, Dec. 7, 2011) (release of trade secrets prohibited by state law).

Here, the Confidential Information constitutes "business information or plans, [and] financial information" under Ohio Rev. Code § 1333.61(D). This Confidential Information is confidential, proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret information under Ohio Rev. Code § 1333.61(D). The Confidential Information is not known outside of DP&L, and is not disseminated to internal employees unless those employees have a legitimate business need to know the information. Maintaining the confidentiality of this information will prevent an undue competitive disadvantage to DP&L, as well as assisting in fostering the interests of maintaining a fair and robust competitive marketplace within Ohio.

The Commission (and its Staff) will have full access to the Confidential Information in order to fulfill its statutory obligations. Further, DP&L was careful to redact from the publicly-filed testimony and exhibits only those portions that are essential to prevent disclosure of Confidential Information.

For these foregoing reasons, DP&L requests that the Commission issue a Protective Order that permits the Confidential Information to be designated as confidential and to remain under seal.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey

---

Charles J. Faruki (0010417)

(Counsel of Record)

D. Jeffrey Ireland (0010443)

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)

FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L.

110 North Main Street, Suite 1600

Dayton, OH 45402

Telephone: (937) 227-3705

Telecopier: (937) 227-3717

Email: cfaruki@ficlaw.com

djireland@ficlaw.com

jsharkey@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power  
and Light Company

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that a copy of the foregoing The Dayton Power and Light Company's  
Motion for Protective Order has been served via electronic mail upon the following counsel of  
record, this 22nd day of March, 2017:

Thomas McNamee  
Natalia Messenger  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
30 East Broad Street, 16th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-3793  
Email:  
thomas.mcnamee@ohioattorneygeneral.gov  
natalia.messenger@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

Attorneys for PUCO Staff

William J. Michael (Counsel of Record)  
Andrew S. Garver  
Kevin F. Moore  
Ajay Kumar  
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel  
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, OH 43215-3485  
Email: william.michael@occ.ohio.gov  
andrew.garver@occ.ohio.gov  
kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov  
ajay.kumar@occ.ohio.gov

Attorneys for the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

Kimberly W. Bojko  
James D. Perko, Jr.  
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP  
280 North High Street, Suite 1300  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Email: bojko@carpenterlipps.com  
perko@carpenterlipps.com

Attorneys for The Ohio Manufacturers'  
Association Energy Group

Frank P. Darr (Counsel of Record)  
Matthew R. Pritchard  
McNees Wallace & Nurick  
21 East State Street, 17th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Email: fdarr@mwncmh.com  
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users – Ohio

David F. Boehm  
Michael L. Kurtz  
Kurt J. Boehm  
Jody Kyler Cohn  
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry  
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
Email: dboehm@BKLawfirm.com  
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com  
kboehm@BKLawfirm.com  
jkylercohn@BKLawfirm.com

Attorneys for The Ohio Energy Group

Joseph Olikier (Counsel of Record)  
Matthew White  
Evan Betterton  
IGS Energy  
6100 Emerald Parkway  
Dublin, OH 43016  
Email: joliker@igsenergy.com  
mswhite@igsenergy.com  
Ebetterton@igsenergy.com

Attorney for IGS Energy

Kevin R. Schmidt  
88 East Broad Street, Suite 1770  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Email: schmidt@sppgrp.com

Attorney for The Energy Professionals of Ohio

Evelyn R. Robinson  
2750 Monroe Boulevard  
Audubon, PA 19403  
Email: evelyn.robinson@pjm.com

Attorney for PJM Interconnection, L.L.C.

Jeffrey W. Mayes  
Monitoring Analytics, LLC  
2621 Van Buren Avenue, Suite 160  
Valley Forge Corporate Center  
Eagleville, PA 19403  
Email: jeffrey.mayes@monitoringanalytics.com

Attorneys for Monitoring Analytics, LLC as  
The Independent Market Monitor for PJM

Joel E. Sechler (Counsel of Record)  
Carpenter Lipps & Leland  
280 N. High St., Suite 1300  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Email: sechler@carpenterlipps.com

Gregory J. Poulos  
EnerNOC, Inc.  
P.O. Box 29492  
Columbus, OH 43229  
Email: gpoulos@enernoc.com

Attorneys for EnerNOC, Inc.

Trent Dougherty  
1145 Chesapeake Ave., Suite 1  
Columbus, OH 43212-3449  
Email: tdougherty@the OEC.org

Attorney for Ohio Environmental  
Council

Angela Paul Whitfield  
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP  
280 Plaza, Suite 1300  
280 North High Street  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Email: paul@carpenterlipps.com

Attorney for The Kroger Co.

Miranda Leppla  
Ohio Environmental Council  
1145 Chesapeake Ave., Suite 1  
Columbus, OH 43212-3449  
Email: mleppla@the OEC.org

Attorney for the Environmental Defense Fund

Colleen Mooney  
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy  
231 West Lima Street  
P.O. Box 1793  
Findlay, OH 45839-1793  
Email: cmooney@ohiopartners.org

Attorney for Ohio Partners for Affordable  
Energy



Michael D. Dortch  
Richard R. Parsons  
Kravitz, Brown & Dortch, LLC  
65 East State Street, Suite 200  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Email: mdortch@kravitzllc.com  
rparsons@kravitzllc.com

Attorneys for Calpine Energy Solutions LLC

Richard C. Sahli  
Richard C. Sahli Law Office, LLC  
981 Pinewood Lane  
Columbus, OH 43230-3662  
Email: rsahli@columbus.rr.com

Christopher M. Bzdok (pro hac vice)  
Olson Bzdok & Howard, P.C.  
420 East Front Street  
Traverse City, MI 49686  
chris@envlaw.com

Tony G. Mendoza, Staff Attorney (pro hac vice)  
Kristin Henry, Senior Staff Attorney (pro hac vice)  
Sierra Club Environmental Law Program  
2101 Webster Street, 13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Oakland, CA 94612  
Email: tony.mendoza@sierraclub.org  
kristin.henry@sierraclub.org

Attorneys for Sierra Club

Michelle Grant  
Dynergy Inc.  
601 Travis Street, Suite 1400  
Houston, TX 77002  
Email: michelle.d.grant@dynergy.com

Attorneys for Dynergy Inc.

Madeline Fleisher  
Kristin Field  
Environmental Law & Policy Center  
21 West Broad Street, Suite 500  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Email: mfleisher@elpc.org  
kfield@elpc.org

Attorneys for The Environmental Law & Policy Center

Lisa M. Hawrot  
Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC  
Century Centre Building  
1233 Main Street, Suite 4000  
Wheeling, WV 26003  
Email: lhawrot@spilmanlaw.com

Derrick Price Williamson  
Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC  
1100 Bent Creek Blvd., Suite 101  
Mechanicsburg, PA 17050  
Email: dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com

Carrie M. Harris  
Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC  
310 First Street, Suite 1100  
P.O. Box 90  
Roanoke, VA 24002-0090  
Email: charris@spilmanlaw.com

Steve W. Chriss  
Senior Manager, Energy Regulatory Analysis  
Greg Tillman  
Senior Manager, Energy Regulatory Analysis  
Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.  
2001 SE 10th Street  
Bentonville, AR 72716-0550  
Email: Stephen.Chriss@walmart.com  
Greg.Tillman@walmart.com

Attorneys for Wal-Mart Stores East, LP  
and Sam's East, Inc.

Michael J. Settineri  
Stephen M. Howard  
Gretchen L. Petrucci  
Ilya Batikov  
William A. Sieck  
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP  
52 E. Gay Street  
Columbus, OH 43215

Email: [mjsettineri@vorys.com](mailto:mjsettineri@vorys.com)  
[smhoward@vorys.com](mailto:smhoward@vorys.com)  
[glpetrucci@vorys.com](mailto:glpetrucci@vorys.com)  
[ibatikov@vorys.com](mailto:ibatikov@vorys.com)  
[wasiack@vorys.com](mailto:wasiack@vorys.com)

Attorneys for Dynegy Inc.,  
PJM Power Providers Group, and  
Retail Energy Supply Association  
Glen Thomas  
1060 First Avenue, Suite 400  
King of Prussia, PA 19406  
Email: [gthomas@gtpowergroup.com](mailto:gthomas@gtpowergroup.com)

Sharon Theodore  
Electric Power Supply Association  
1401 New York Ave. NW 11th Floor  
Washington, DC  
Email: [stheodore@epsa.org](mailto:stheodore@epsa.org)

Laura Chappelle  
201 North Washington Square, Suite 910  
Lansing, MI 48933  
Email: [laurac@chappelleconsulting.net](mailto:laurac@chappelleconsulting.net)

Attorneys for PJM Power Providers Group

Ellis Jacobs  
Advocates for Basic Legal Equality, Inc.  
130 West Second Street, Suite 700 East  
Dayton, OH 45402  
Email: [ejacobs@ablelaw.org](mailto:ejacobs@ablelaw.org)

Attorney for Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition

Steven D. Lesser  
James F. Lang  
N. Trevor Alexander  
Mark T. Keaney  
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP  
41 South High Street  
1200 Huntington Center  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Email: [slesser@calfee.com](mailto:slesser@calfee.com)  
[jang@calfee.com](mailto:jang@calfee.com)  
[talexander@calfee.com](mailto:talexander@calfee.com)  
[mkeaney@calfee.com](mailto:mkeaney@calfee.com)

Attorneys for The City of Dayton and  
Honda of America Mfg., Inc.

John R. Doll  
Matthew T. Crawford  
Doll, Jansen & Ford  
111 West First Street, Suite 1100  
Dayton, OH 45402-1156  
Email: [jdoll@djflawfirm.com](mailto:jdoll@djflawfirm.com)  
[mcrawford@djflawfirm.com](mailto:mcrawford@djflawfirm.com)

Attorneys for Utility Workers of  
America Local 175

Richard L. Sites  
Ohio Hospital Association  
155 East Broad Street, 3rd Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-3620  
Email: [rick.sites@ohiohospitals.org](mailto:rick.sites@ohiohospitals.org)

Matthew W. Warnock  
Dylan F. Borchers  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, OH 43215-4291  
Email: [mwarnock@bricker.com](mailto:mwarnock@bricker.com)  
[dborchers@bricker.com](mailto:dborchers@bricker.com)

Attorneys for The Ohio Hospital Association

Amy B. Spiller  
Jeanne W. Kingery  
Elizabeth H. Watts  
Duke-Energy Ohio, Inc.  
139 East Fourth Street  
1303-Main  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
Email: amy.spiller@duke-energy.com  
jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com  
elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com

Attorneys for Duke-Energy Ohio, Inc.

Carl Tamm, President  
Classic Connectors, Inc. 382 Park Avenue East  
Mansfield, OH 44905  
Email: crtamm@classicconnectors.com

John F. Stock  
Orla E. Collier  
Benesch, Friedlander, Coplan & Aronoff LLP  
41 South High Street, 26th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Email: jstock@beneschlaw.com  
ocollier@beneschlaw.com

Attorneys for Murray Energy Corporation and  
Citizens to Protect DP&L Jobs

Terrence N. O'Donnell  
Raymond D. Seiler  
Christine M.T. Pirik  
William V. Vorys  
Dickinson Wright PLLC  
150 East Gay Street, Suite 2400  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Email: todonnell@dickinsonwright.com  
rseiler@dickinsonwright.com  
cpirik@dickinsonwright.com  
wvorys@dickinsonwright.com

Attorneys for Mid-Atlantic Renewable  
Energy Coalition

C. David Kelley, Prosecutor  
Dana N. Whalen  
110 West Main Street  
West Union, OH 45693  
Email: prosecutorkelley@usa.com  
dana.whalen@adamscountyoh.gov

Attorneys for Adams County, Ohio,  
Monroe Township, Ohio, Sprigg Township,  
Manchester Local School District, and Adams  
County Ohio Valley School District

Devin D. Parram  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, OH 43215-4291  
Email: dparram@bricker.com

Attorney for People Working  
Cooperatively, Inc.

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Jeffrey S. Sharkey

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**3/22/2017 2:50:10 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 16-0395-EL-SSO, 16-0396-EL-ATA, 16-0397-EL-AAM**

Summary: Motion The Dayton Power and Light Company's Motion for Protective Order electronically filed by Mr. Jeffrey S Sharkey on behalf of The Dayton Power and Light Company