BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

ADVANCED INNOVATIVE)	
MANUFACTURING, INC. d/b/a A.I.M.)	
)	Case No. 16-2340-EL-CSS
v.)	
)	
CHAMPION ENERGY SERVICES, LLC)	

CHAMPION'S MOTION TO DISMISS

In accordance with Rule 4901-9-01(C)(1) of the Administrative Code, respondent Champion Energy Services, LLC ("Champion") hereby moves the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission") to dismiss the formal complaint filed by complainant Advanced Innovative Manufacturing, Inc. d/b/a A.I.M. ("AIM") on December 8, 2016 (the "PUCO Complaint") on the basis of res judicata, which acts to divest the Commission of subject matter jurisdiction.

As detailed in the attached Memorandum in Support, AIM had previously filed a claim, identical in all material respects to the PUCO Complaint, with the Portage County Municipal Court. After a trial on the merits, that court found against AIM in a judgment that only recently became final and non-appealable. As such, Champion's ability to assert the defense of res judicata is newly arisen and could not have been previously asserted. As explained in detail in the attached Memorandum in Support, Champion's Motion to Dismiss should be granted.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Michael R. Nelson

Michael R. Nelson (0078987) MikeNelson@eversheds-sutherland.com EVERSHEDS SUTHERLAND (US) LLP 1114 6th Avenue New York, NY 10036

T: (212) 389-5061 F: (212) 389-5099

Joshua L. Belcher, Counsel of Record (PHV-15067-2017) JoshuaBelcher@eversheds-sutherland.com EVERSHEDS SUTHERLAND (US) LLP 1001 Fannin Street, Suite 3700 Houston, TX 77002

T: (713) 470-6118 F: (713) 654-1301

Attorneys for Champion Energy Services, LLC

DATED: March 3, 2017

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

ADVANCED INNOVATIVE)	
MANUFACTURING, INC. d/b/a A.I.M.)	
)	Case No. 16-2340-EL-CSS
v.)	
)	
CHAMPION ENERGY SERVICES, LLC)	

CHAMPION'S MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

I. FACTUAL BACKGROUND

- 1. On October 28, 2016, AIM filed a claim against Champion in the Portage County Municipal Court (Case No. 2016CVI02903R) (the "Civil Complaint"). Attachment A. AIM filed the Civil Complaint over one month *before* filing the PUCO Complaint with the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission").
- 2. The Civil Complaint was identical in all material respects to the PUCO Complaint. Specifically, the "statement of claim" in the Civil Complaint is nearly identical to the body of "Item A" to the PUCO Complaint, with the exception of some revised figures and minor editing. AIM's substantive legal claims and the alleged basis of those claims are otherwise the same.
 - 3. A trial on the merits was held in the Civil Complaint on December 16, 2016.
- 4. After the trial on the merits, the Magistrate for the Portage County Municipal Court issued a decision on December 23, 2016, dismissing the claim in its entirety on the basis that AIM had "failed to prove by a preponderance of the evidence the allegations in the [Civil Complaint]." The Magistrate's decision was for Champion, the case was dismissed and costs were assessed to AIM. Attachment B.

- 5. On January 5, 2017, AIM filed timely objections to the Magistrate's decision and attempted to submit additional information in support of its claim.
- 6. On January 20, 2017, the Portage County Municipal Court overruled AIM's objections as an impermissible effort to supplement the record after trial. The court entered a final and appealable decision adopting the Magistrate's decision as the order of the court and dismissing AIM's claim (the "Civil Judgment"). The Civil Judgment was served by the clerk of the court on the parties on January 23, 2017. Attachment C.
- 7. The deadline for filing an appeal of the Civil Judgment occurred on or about February 20, but no later than February 23, 2017. Ohio Rules of Appellate Procedure, Rule 4.
- 8. As of this filing, AIM has not filed an appeal of the Civil Judgment. The Civil Judgment is thus a valid, final and non-appealable judgment to which AIM is bound.

II. ARGUMENT

9. In Ohio, the doctrine of res judicata encompasses both "claim preclusion" and "issue preclusion." *In re Application of Ohio Power Co.*, 144 Ohio St.3d 1, 2015-Ohio-2056; *see O'Nesti v. DeBartolo Realty Corp.*, 113 Ohio St.3d 59, 2007-Ohio-1102, 862 N.E.2d 803, ¶ 6, citing *Grava v. Parkman Twp.*, 73 Ohio St.3d 379, 381, 653 N.E.2d 226 (1995). "These doctrines operate to preclude the relitigation of a point of law or fact that was at issue in a former action between the same parties and was passed upon by a court of competent jurisdiction." *Consumers' Counsel v. Pub. Util. Comm.*, 16 Ohio St.3d 9, 10, 475 N.E.2d 782 (1985). In other words, "a valid, final judgment rendered upon the merits bars all subsequent actions based upon any claim arising out of the transaction or occurrence that was the subject matter of the previous action." *Grava v. Parkman Twp.*, 73 Ohio St.3d 379, 382, 653 N.E.2d 226, 1995-Ohio-331.

- 10. Res judicata, whether claim preclusion or issue preclusion, applies to administrative proceedings that are of a judicial nature. *State ex rel. Schachter v. Ohio Pub. Emps. Retirement Bd.*, 121 Ohio St.3d 526, 2009-Ohio-1704, 905 N.E.2d 1210, ¶ 29; *Consumers' Counsel*, 16 Ohio St.3d at 10. Thus, res judicata applies to the instant proceeding and the PUCO Complaint.
- 11. As previously stated, the Civil Complaint filed by AIM against Champion was identical in all material respects to its PUCO Complaint and is based on the same alleged events.
- 12. AIM had a full and fair opportunity to prove at trial each point of law and fact alleged in the Civil Complaint. AIM did not prevail on the merits, as evidenced by the Civil Judgment in Champion's favor. AIM is therefore precluded by the doctrine of res judicata from re-litigating the matter before the Commission.

III. CONCLUSION

- 13. As a "valid, final judgment rendered upon the merits," the Civil Judgment definitively adjudicates all of the claims raised by AIM and acts to bar the PUCO Complaint, which is based on the same "transaction or occurrence." The Civil Judgment, through the application of the doctrine of res judicata, effectively divests the Commission of subject matter jurisdiction in this matter.
- 14. Based on the foregoing, the doctrine of res judicata thus merits dismissal of the PUCO Complaint in its entirety. To hold otherwise would prejudice Champion and give AIM the very "second bite at the apple" that the doctrine of res judicata is meant to preclude.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Michael R. Nelson

Michael R. Nelson (0078987) MikeNelson@eversheds-sutherland.com EVERSHEDS SUTHERLAND (US) LLP 1114 6th Avenue New York, NY 10036

T: (212) 389-5061 F: (212) 389-5099

Joshua L. Belcher, Counsel of Record (PHV-15067-2017) JoshuaBelcher@eversheds-sutherland.com EVERSHEDS SUTHERLAND (US) LLP 1001 Fannin Street, Suite 3700 Houston, TX 77002

T: (713) 470-6118 F: (713) 654-1301

Attorneys for Champion Energy Services, LLC

DATED: March 3, 2017

ATTACHMENT A

Civil Complaint

PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT

203 WEST MAIN STREET PO BOX 958 RAVENNA, OHIO 44266-0958 PHONE (330) 297-3635 FAX (330) 297-3526 www.co.portage.oh.us

FILED

PORTAGE COUNTY

MUNICIPAL COURT

11/2/2016

JILL FANKHAUSER, CLERK

RAVENNA, OH

NOTICE AND SUMMONS IN ACTION FOR MONEY ONLY SMALL CLAIM DIVISION

CASE NO. 2016CVI02903R

ADVANCED INNOVATIVE MANUFACTING INC DBA AIM 116 LENA DRIVE MARK J HAWALD CFO AURORA, OH 44202

Plaintiff (s)

VS

CHAMPION ENERGY SERVICES INC, 1500 RANKIN RD SUITE 200 HOUSTON, TX 77073 **Defendant (s)**

Name and address of the Attorney for the Plaintiff: PRO SE

ADVANCED INNOVATIVE MANUFACTING INC ASKS JUDGMENT IN THIS COURT AGAINST CHAMPION ENERGY SERVICES INC, ET AL FOR: FOUR THOUSAND NINE HUNDRED FORTY EIGHT AND 91/100 DOLLARS (\$4,948.91) PLUS INTEREST FROM 09/01/2016 AT THE RATE OF 2% AND COSTS UPON THE ABOVE STATED CLAIM.

THE COURT WILL HOLD TRIAL ON THIS CLAIM IN THE SMALL CLAIMS DIVISION LOCATED AT: THE PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT, 203 WEST MAIN STREET, RAVENNA OHIO, COURTROOM C.

TRIAL DATE AND TIME: 12/16/2016, 8:30 am

IF YOU DO NOT APPEAR AT THE TRIAL, JUDGMENT MAY BE ENTERED AGAINST YOU BY DEFAULT, AND YOUR EARNINGS MAY BE SUBJECTED TO GARNISHMENT OR YOUR PROPERTY MAY BE ATTACHED TO SATISFY SAID JUDGMENT. IF YOUR DEFENSE IS SUPPORTED BY WITNESSES, ACCOUNT BOOKS, RECEIPTS, OR OTHER DOCUMENTS YOU MUST PRODUCE THEM AT THE TRIAL. SUBPOENAS FOR WITNESSES, IF REQUESTED BY A PARTY, WILL BE ISSUED BY THE CLERK. IF YOU ADMIT THE CLAIM BUT DESIRE TIME TO PAY, YOU MAY MAKE SUCH A REQUEST AT THE TRIAL. IF YOU BELIEVE YOU HAVE A CLAIM AGAINST THE PLAINTIFF, YOU MUST FILE A COUNTERCLAIM AND SERVE IT ON ALL OTHER PARTIES AT LEAST SEVEN DAYS PRIOR TO THE DATE OF THE TRIAL OF THE PLAINTIFF'S CLAIM.

PLEASE CONTACT COURT A DAY BEFORE HEARING TO CONFIRM THAT CASE WILL GO FORWARD (330) 297.3635

JILL FANKHAUSER, CLERK OF COURT

DEPUTY CLERK

Tracking # 91 7190 0005 5664 0037 3116 CHAMPION ENERGY SERVICES INC

2400

PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT KENT BRANCH **303 EAST MAIN STREET KENT OH 44240** 330.678.9170

FILED PORTAGE COUNTY ALINICIDAL COURT OCT 282016 JILL FANKHAUSER, Clerk RAVENNA, OH

PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT RAVENNA BRANCH 203 WEST MAIN STREET PO BOX 958 RAVENNA OH 44266 330.297.3635

SMALL CLAIM COMPLAINT AND STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Plaintiff_Advanced Innovative Manufacting, Inc. (Di	£290	CASE IC.
FIMILIA AUVANCEU INNOVALIVE MIANDIACUNO. IIII. 113.		Champion Energy Services, Inc.
Address 116 Lena Drive	Address	1500 Rankin Rd. Suite 200
Aurora, Ohio 44202	_ Address	Houston, TX 77073
Mark J. Hawald, CFO		ribusion, TX TTOTO
Phone No. 440-759-2034 Fax No.	PhoneNo.	888-653-0090
Email address: mark.j.hawald@a-i-mfg.com	_	
Di-i-4:0f	-Vs-	
Plaintiff	_ Defendant	
Address	_ Address	
Phone No Fax No	PhoneNo	
Email address:	. гпонено.	
5.1011 for May (\$1295/1/2808 KWH = \$.1011) (ITEM 6). Prior to switching to Chan isage increased. The rep ensured me our savings would be huge and our cost back to the rate so it would never be above \$.0922. He indicated based upon our previous espelled out in the contract. As he indicated, basically instead of paying Ohio Ed 24-33). When we received the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were duped \$1529/11200 KWH - \$.1385) (ITEM 7)]. This was never broken out before but alwortion used and was reported differently after we signed the contract. We were all and if I signed up he would receive a commission & we would be end up paying out MIM was only paying \$.0623 with First Energy (ITEM 6). There is no way anyone we service. If the rep called me and said, I work for a great company and we are getting anyone else with a sound mind would ever switch. The only reason is switched.	sed upon the total bill amorbus bills we would save 10- ison we would pay Champ of and the \$.0922 was not be vays showed as a total (ITI ready only paying \$.0623 p ver 47% more for our electr void agree to pay 48% more ong people to switch from the d was because I trusted the	unt would only be \$.0922 (Total bill amount /kWH=\$.0922). He said he would .30%. Unfortunately, he would not put any of this in writing and said it would a ion Energy. I said this was a no brainer & signed the contract on Apr. I (ITEM ased on the total bill like previous bills but only on the KWH used [June EM 3, 4, 5). The \$.0922 was not based open the total bill but only on the KWH ber KWH used (ITEM 6). The rep knew he was intentionally misleading me icity and not save anything at all as he promised. This was never disclosed bere (\$.0922 Champion Price versus \$.0623 First Energy Price) for the same electricity erep was an expert in his field and after analyzing our bills was being truthful
when he said we would have a huge savings if we switched to Champion. I was alwas true, except I found out that if I cancelled there was a large cancel fee. I have was true, except I found out that if I cancelled there was a large cancel fee. I have was the constant of the constant was duped & mislead, they told me I signed a contract & if I cancelled the constant is a lower and reasonable rate. They said there is no way that they would bo go. After revisiting and adding up the electric bills, I was shocked when I discovere though I would have been forced to pay \$1,200-\$2,400 to cancel. I should have catcost. The fact that the company mislead me, falsely presented information and will in the amount of \$4,348.91 + waive the \$600 cancel fee as already promised (ITEI detailing what we were paying them as compared to what we should be paying they would not work with me to pay back any portion of the overcharge and were only vertically the contraction of the overcharge and were only vertically the contraction of the overcharge and were only vertically the cancel fee.	an email (ITEM 34) from a ompared to what other con ontract, it would cost me obe wer my rate and basically is at that we significantly over encelled the account 13 montheld information to encount M 23). I invoiced Champion woice 2151, supporting do	nother energy supplier from June 2015 and they also knew the \$.0922 rate npanies were charging for electric usage. When I called Champion to explain wheen \$1,200 and \$2,400. I asked Champion Energy to adjust my rate to indicated I was a sucker and was stuck with rny contract I was upset & let it read for 13 months & it was a significant amount totaling \$4,348.91. Even withs ago and filed a formal complaint with PUCO to recover my cancel fee rage me to sign their contract, I am requesting a full refund for the overcharge in Energy for \$4,948.91 and provided a copy of all our bills and a spreadsheet currents ITEM I-22). I tried to settle with Champion duriside of court and they
was true, except I found out that if I cancelled there was a large cancel fee. I have was not a fair & reasonable rate and that it was apparent we were being gouged on the large of the was duped & mislead, they told me I signed a contract & if I cancelled the composition of the contract of the contrac	an email (ITEM 34) from a ompared to what other constract, it would cost me be wer my rate and basically it ad that we significantly over encelled the account 13 montheld information to encount 23). I invoiced Champior vivice 2151, supporting do willing to waive the cancel for EASIER READIN	nother energy supplier from June 2015 and they also knew the \$.0922 rate npanies were charging for electric usage. When I called Champion to explain these structures \$1,200 and \$2,400. I asked Champion Energy to adjust my rate to indicated I was a sucker and was stuck with my contract. I was upset & let it read for 13 months & it was a significant amount totaling \$4,348.91. Even, with ago and filed a formal complaint with PUCO to recover my cancel fee rage me to sign their contract, I am requesting a full refund for the overcharge in Energy for \$4,948.91 and provided a copy of all our bills and a spreadsheet cuments ITEM 1-22). I tried to settle with Champion outside or court and they see (EMAILS ITEM 35-50). Thank you for your consideration in this matter.
vas true, except I found out that if I cancelled there was a large cancel fee. I have vas not a fair & reasonable rate and that it was apparent we were being gouged convolved to the convolve was duped & mislead, they told me I signed a contract & if I cancelled the conceceive a flower and reasonable rate. They said there is no way that they would how to. After revisiting and adding up the electric bills, I was shocked when I discovere though I would have been forced to pay \$1,200-\$2,400 to cancel. I should have cancet. The fact that the company mislead me, falsely presented information and with the amount of \$4,348.91 + waive the \$600 cancel fee as already promised (ITEI letailing what we were paying them as compared to what we should be paying the would not work with me to pay back any portion of the overcharge and were only very the state of the paying them as compared to what we should be paying the would not work with me to pay back any portion of the overcharge and were only very the same transfer of the overcharge and were only very the paying them as compared to what we should be paying the would not work with me to pay back any portion of the overcharge and were only very the paying them as compared to what we should be paying them.	an email (ITEM 34) from a ompared to what other construct, it would cost me be wer my rate and basically it at that we significantly over encelled the account 13 montheld information to encound 23). I invoiced Champior whice 2151, supporting document of the wallength of the cancel of EASIER READINGS \$4,948.9	nother energy supplier from June 2015 and they also knew the \$.0922 rate npanies were charging for electric usage. When I called Champion to explain tween \$1,200 and \$2,400. I asked Champion Energy to adjust my rate to redicated I was a sucker and was stuck with my contract. I was upset & let it reaid for 13 months & it was a significant amount totaling \$4,348.91. Even, with ago and filed a formal complaint with PUCO to recover my cancel fee rage me to sign their contract, I am requesting a full refund for the overchargen Energy for \$4,948.91 and provided a copy of all our bills and a spreadsheet cuments ITEM 1-22). I tried to settle with Champion duside of court and they see (EMAILS ITEM 35-50). Thank you for your consideration in this matter.

Clerk, Deputy Clerk, Notary-Public

PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT KENT BRANCH **303 EAST MAIN STREET KENT OH 44240** 330.678.9170

PURTAGE COUNTY AUNICIDATE COURT OCT 28 2016

PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT RAVENNA BRANCH 203 WEST MAIN STREET PO BOX 958 **RAVENNA OH 44266** 330.297,3635

JILL FANKHAUSER, Clerk SMALL CLAIM COMPLAINT AND STATEMENT OF CLAIM

			~~ ## <i>P</i>	
Plaintiff Advanced Innovative Manufacting, Inc.	DBA AIIV	Defendant	Charles Energy Services, Inc.	
Address 116 Lena Drive		Address	1500 Rankin Rd. Suite 200	
Aurora, Ohio 44202			Houston, TX 77073	
Mark J. Hawald, CFO				
Phone No. 440-759-2034 Fax No.		PhoneNo	888-653-0090	
Email address: mark.j.hawald@a-i-mfg.com				
Plaintiff	-VS-	D. C		
PlaintiffAddress		Detendant_		
		Audi ess		
Phone No Fax No Fax No	<u> </u>	PhoneNo		
STATEMENT OF CLA	•	•	•	n was assistant ?
0 11 for May (\$1295/12000 KWH = \$.1011) (ITEM 0). Prior to switching to Cl ge increased. The rep ensured me our savings would be huge and our cost	⟨WH = \$.127; hampion Energy based upon the	2) (ITEM 4), averagency, our average K the total bill amoun	would only be \$ 0922 (Total bill amount /KWH#\$ 092)	5) & averaged oing down as our 2) He said be wou
205/3600 KWH = \$.3347) (TEM 3), averaged \$.1272 for Mar. (\$967/7600 Polit for May (\$1295/12006 KWH = \$.1011) (ITEM 0). Prior to switching to Old ge increased. The rep ensured me our savings would be huge and our costing rate so it would never be above \$.0922. He indicated based upon our prespelled out in the contract. As he indicated, basically instead of paying Ohio 33. When we received the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were due to the state of the second of second of the second of second of the second of second	WH = \$.127: nampion Ener based upon to based	2) (ITEM 4), average (control of the total bill amount expected by the total bill amount expected by the total bill amount expected by the total (ITEM or paying \$.0623 perore for our electrical expected by the total (ITEM 34) from the total expected by the total basically incompanies and basically incompanies are to switch from the total expected by the total basically incompanies are total basically incompanies account 13 montrol basically overpage account 13 montrol encourage of the total basically account 13 montrol encourage account 13 montrol encourage account 13 montrol encourage enc	ed \$.1151 for Apr. (\$1105/9600 KWH= \$.1151) (ITEM WH cost was based upon total cost & was continually give would only be \$.0922 (Total bill amount /KWH=\$.0922 & .Unfortunately, he would not put any of this in writin Energy, I said this was a no brainer & signed the conled on the total bill like previous bills but only on the KV 3, 4, 5). The \$.0922 was not based upon the total bill KWH used (ITEM 6). The rep knew he was intentionally and not save anything at all as he promised. This we (\$.0922 Champion Price versus \$.0623 First Energy Fournert provider and only charging them 48% more for previous and supplier from June 2015 and they also known as dissatisfied, I could cancel and switch back ther energy supplier from June 2015 and they also known in the same of the same supplier from June 2015 and they also known in the same supplier from June 2015 and they also known in the same succer and was stuck with my contracted from 31,200 and \$2,400. I asked Champion Energy to a cated 1 was a sucker and was stuck with my contracted for 13 months & it was a significant amount totaling is ago and filed a formal complaint with PUCO to recover me to sign their contract, I am requesting a full refurency for \$4,948.91 and provided a copy of all our bills ments iTEM 1-22). I tried to settle with Champion outsit (EMAILS ITEM 35-50). Thank you for your considerations.	5) & averaged oring down as our 2). He said he would and said it would ract on Apr.1 (ITEI IH used [June but only on the KW light of the same electricis swas being truthful at any time. This aw the \$.0922 rate champion to explain djust my rate to twas upset & let it \$4,348.91. Even, we my cancel fee d for the overcharge and a spread the it and the it in the same and the it is a supper the in the overcharge and a spread the in the court and the it is a supper the in the court and the in the court and the in the said and a spread the in the court and the in the said and a spread the in the court and the in the said and a spread the in the court and the interest a
of the or May (\$1286/12860 kWil = \$.1811) (ITEM 6). Prior to switching to 61 ge increased. The rep ensured me our savings would be huge and our cost the rate so it would never be above \$.0922. He indicated based upon our prespelled out in the contract. As he indicated, basically instead of paying Ohio 33). When we received the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted to the state of the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted to the state of the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted to the state of the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted to the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted to the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted to the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted to the 1st bill from Champion were suffered to the 1st bill from Champion were dusted to the 1st bill from Champion were suffered to the same of the 1st bill from Champion were dusted to	WH = \$.127: nampion Ener based upon to called upon to the search only to over 47% m to would agree the would agree the and the search only to over 47% m to an email (d compared to to contract, it w thower my rate the to cancelled the withheld infor TEM 23). I in (finvoice 215* by willing to w R EASIE the sum of	2) (ITEM 4), average (it the total bill amount would be would save 10-3) ould pay Champios 5.0922 was not based as a total (ITEM or paying \$.0623 per ore for our electricite to pay 48% more to switch from their ause i trusted their did not like the ser (ITEM 34) from any owhat other compound cost me between the same the same the same the same the same the same than the same	ed \$.1151 for Apr. (\$1105/9600 KWH= \$.1151) (ITEM WH cost was based upon total cost & was continually give would only be \$.0922 (Total bill amount /KWH=\$.0922 & Unfortunately, he would not put any of this in writin Energy, I said this was a no brainer & signed the conled on the total bill like previous bills but only on the KV \$.4,5). The \$.0922 was not based upon the total bill KWH used (ITEM 6). The rep knew he was intentional y and not save anything at all as he promised. This we (\$.0922 Champion Price versus \$.0623 First Energy Fourrent provider and only charging them 48% more for the was an expert in his field and after analyzing our bill rice or was dissatisfied, I could cancel and switch back ther energy supplier from June 2015 and they also know the energy supplier from June 2015 and they also know the energy supplier from June 2015 and they also know that he was also sucker and was stock with my contract, if for 13 months & it was a significant amount totaling is ago and filed a formal complaint with PUCO to recover the total significant amount total formal significant signifi	5) & averaged one down as our 2). He said he wou or and said it would ract on Apr. 1 (ITE) H used [June but only on the KV ly misleading me is never disclosed trice) for the same received the same electrics was being truth at any time. This withe \$.0922 rate thampion to explain dijust my rate to twee upset & let it \$43.48.91. Even, we my cancel fee of court and the on in this matter.
of the May (\$1280/1200 KWI) = \$.1011) (ITEM 0). Prior to switching to Olige increased. The rep ensured me our savings would be huge and our cost the rate so it would never be above \$.0922. He indicated based upon our prespelled out in the contract. As he indicated, basically instead of paying Ohio 33). When we received the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were duponed to the state of the state of the state of paying Ohio 33). When we received the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were duponed to the state of	WH = \$.127: nampion Ener based upon to called upon to the search only to over 47% m to would agree the would agree the and the search only to over 47% m to an email (d compared to to contract, it w thower my rate the to cancelled the withheld infor TEM 23). I in (finvoice 215* by willing to w R EASIE the sum of	2) (ITEM 4), average (it the total bill amount would be would save 10-3) ould pay Champios 5.0922 was not based as a total (ITEM or paying \$.0623 per ore for our electricite to pay 48% more to switch from their ause i trusted their did not like the ser (ITEM 34) from any owhat other compound cost me between the same the same the same the same the same the same than the same	ed \$.1151 for Apr. (\$1105/9600 KWH= \$.1151) (ITEM WH cost was based upon total cost & was continually g would only be \$.0922 (Total bill amount /KWH=\$.0922 %. Unfortunately, he would not put any of this in writin Energy. I said this was a no brainer & signed the conled on the total bill like previous bills but only on the KV 3, 4, 5). The \$.0922 was not based upon the total bill KWH used (ITEM 6). The rep knew he was intentionally and not save anything at all as he promised. This was (\$.0922 Champion Price versus \$.0623 First Energy F current provider and only charging them 48% more for the was an expert in his field and after analyzing our bill rice or was dissatisfied, I could cancel and switch back ther energy supplier from June 2015 and they also known was an expert in his field and after analyzing our bill rice or was dissatisfied, I could cancel and switch back there energy supplier from June 2015 and they also known the same sucker and was stuck with my contract, and for 13 months & it was a significant amount totaling as ano and filed a formal complaint with PUCO to recover the regy for \$4,948.91 and provided a copy of all our bills ments if EM 1-22). I tried to settle with Champion outsit (EMAILS ITEM 35-50). Thank you for your consideration of the provided and the provided at the consideration of the provided and the provideration of the provided and the provided and the provideration of the provided and the provide	5) & averaged oing down as our 2). He said he would as a did it would ract on Apr. 1 (ITE /H used [June but only on the KV] by misteading me is never disclosed rice) for the same received rice) for the same rate any time. This was being truthfat any time. This withe \$.0922 rate champion to explaid just my rate to twas upset & let it \$4,348.91. Even, wer my cancel fee of court and the on in this matter.
ge increased. The rep ensured me our savings would be huge and our cost he rate so it would never be above \$.0922. He indicated based upon our prespelled out in the contract. As he indicated, basically instead of paying Ohio 33). When we received the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted to see the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted to see the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted to see the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted to see the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted to see the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted to see the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were dusted to see the 1st bill from Champion, we would be end up paying the second of the 1st bill from Champion and the 1st bill from Champion were dusted to see the second of the 1st bill from Champion were dusted to the second of the 1st bill from Champion were dusted to the	WH = \$.127: nampion Ener based upon it exious bills we Edison we we ped and the \$ always show the exious bills we are adversed to the exious become a also told if I we an email (do compared to exious become a contract, it we hower my rate ered that we concelled the withheld infor TEM 23). I in (finvoice 215) by willing to we REASIE the sum of the of 29 AFFI vom, on oal	2) (ITEM 4), average (item), our average (item) amount would save 10-31 ould pay Champios 5.0922 was not based as a total (ITEM) or paying \$.0623 per ore for our electricities to pay 48% more to switch from their ause i trusted their did not like the ser (ITEM 34) from any to what other compound cost me between the significantly overpage account 13 month mation to encourative the carried Champion Eth, supporting docuraive the cancel feet. CRREADING \$ \$4,948.91	ed \$.1151 for Apr. (\$1105/9600 KWH= \$.1151) (ITEM WH cost was based upon total cost & was continually give would only be \$.0922 (Total bill amount /KWH=\$.0922 & Unfortunately, he would not put any of this in writin Energy, I said this was a no brainer & signed the conled on the total bill like previous bills but only on the KV \$.4,5). The \$.0922 was not based upon the total bill KWH used (ITEM 6). The rep knew he was intentional y and not save anything at all as he promised. This we (\$.0922 Champion Price versus \$.0623 First Energy Fournet provider and only charging them 48% more for the was an expert in his field and after analyzing our bill rice or was dissatisfied, I could cancel and switch back ther energy supplier from June 2015 and they also know the energy supplier from June 2015 and they also know the energy supplier from June 2015 and they also know the energy supplier from June 2015 and they also know the energy supplier from June 2015 and they also know that was a sucker and was stuck with my contract, it of or 13 months & it was a significant amount totaling is ago and filed a formal complaint with PUCO to recover the total filed a formal complaint with PUCO to recover the total filed a formal complaint with PUCO to recover the total filed a formal complaint with Champion outsit (EMAILS ITEM 35-50). Thank you for your considerating the public interest from the	5) & averaged oing down as our 2). He said he would and said it would ract on Apr. 1 (ITEI/H used [June but only on the KVI ly misleading me is never disclosed trice) for the same electrics was being truthful at any time. This withe \$.0922 rate champion to explaid diust my rate to was upset & let it \$4,348.91. Even, for my cancel feed for the overchant and a spreadshed to oil this matter.
of the or May (\$1295/12006 KWH = \$.1011) (ITEM 0). Prior to switching to Olige increased. The rep ensured me our savings would be huge and our cost the rate so it would never be above \$.0922. He indicated based upon our prespelled out in the contract. As he indicated, basically instead of paying Ohio 33). When we received the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were duponed to the state of the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were duponed to the state of the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were duponed to the state of the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were duponed to the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were duponed to the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were duponed to the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were duponed to the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were duponed to the 1st bill from Champion were duponed to the 1st	WH = \$.127: nampion Ener nampion Ener based upon in evious bills we Edison we we ped and the \$ always show we would agree atting people the would agree atting people as also told if 1 we an email (d compared t e contract, it we hower my rad ered that we cancelled the withheld infor throtos 215: by willing to we R EASIE AFFI worn, on oal iff's demand	2) (ITEM 4), average (item), our average (item) amount e would save 10-31 ould pay Champion 6.0922 was not based as a total (ITEM) of paying \$.0623 per one for our electricie to pay 48% more to switch from their ause it trusted their did not like the ser (ITEM 34) from any owhat other compound cost me between the save of the states of the cancel feed account 13 month mation to encourative the cancel feed account 13 month of the cancel feed account 13 month o	ed \$.1151 for Apr. (\$1105/9600 KWH= \$.1151) (ITEM WH cost was based upon total cost & was continually give would only be \$.0922 (Total bill amount /KWH=\$.0922 & Unfortunately, he would not put any of this in writin Energy, I said this was a no brainer & signed the conled on the total bill like previous bills but only on the KV \$.4,5). The \$.0922 was not based upon the total bill KWH used (ITEM 6). The rep knew he was intentional y and not save anything at all as he promised. This we (\$.0922 Champion Price versus \$.0623 First Energy Fournet provider and only charging them 48% more for the was an expert in his field and after analyzing our bill rice or was dissatisfied, I could cancel and switch back ther energy supplier from June 2015 and they also know the energy supplier from June 2015 and they also know the energy supplier from June 2015 and they also know the energy supplier from June 2015 and they also know the energy supplier from June 2015 and they also know that was a sucker and was stuck with my contract, it of or 13 months & it was a significant amount totaling is ago and filed a formal complaint with PUCO to recover the total filed a formal complaint with PUCO to recover the total filed a formal complaint with PUCO to recover the total filed a formal complaint with Champion outsit (EMAILS ITEM 35-50). Thank you for your considerating the public interest from the	5) & averaged cing down as our 2). He said he would and said it would ract on Apr. 1 (ITEI H used [June but only on the KW ly misleading me is never disclosed. Trice) for the same electrics is was being truthful at any time. This withe \$.0922 rate champion to explain dijust my rate to twas upset & let it \$4,348.91. Even, for my cancel fee of court and the on in this matter.

Clerk, Deputy Clerk, Notary Public

Mark Hawald, CFO of AIM was contacted by Champion Energy as a cold call to convince AIM to change our electric provider. I did not want to be bothered but the rep was persistent & insisted he would save us money & guaranteed we would after he reviewed our bills. Based upon the total Ohio Edison Consumption & total bill amount, AIM averaged \$.3347 for Feb. (\$1205/3600 KWH = \$.3347) (ITEM 3), averaged \$.1272 for Mar. (\$967/7600 KWH = \$.1272) (ITEM 4), averaged \$.1151 for Apr. (\$1105/9600 KWH= \$.1151) (ITEM 5) & averaged \$.1011 for May (\$1295/12800 KWH = \$.1011) (ITEM 6). Prior to switching to Champion Energy, our average KWH cost was based upon total cost & was continually going down as our usage increased. The rep ensured me our savings would be huge and our cost based upon the total bill amount would only be \$.0922 (Total bill amount /KWH=\$.0922). He said he would fix the rate so it would never be above \$.0922. He indicated based upon our previous bills we would save 10-30%. Unfortunately, he would not put any of this in writing and said it would all be spelled out in the contract. As he indicated, basically instead of paying Ohio Edison we would pay Champion Energy. I said this was a no brainer & signed the contract on Apr.1 (ITEM 24-33). When we received the 1st bill from Champion, we realized we were duped and the \$.0922 was not based on the total bill like previous bills but only on the KWH used [June (\$1529/11200 KWH = \$.1365) (ITEM 7)]. This was never broken out before but always showed as a total (ITEM 3, 4, 5). The \$.0922 was not based upon the total bill but only on the KWH portion used and was reported differently after we signed the contract. We were already only paying \$.0623 per KWH used (ITEM 6). The rep knew he was intentionally misleading me and if I signed up he would receive a commission & we would be end up paying over 47% more for our electricity and not save anything at all as he promised. This was never disclosed. AIM was only paying \$.0623 with First Energy (ITEM 6). There is no way anyone would agree to pay 48% more (\$.0922 Champion Price versus \$.0623 First Energy Price) for the same service. If the rep called me and said, I work for a great company and we are getting people to switch from their current provider and only charging them 48% more for the same electricity, I nor anyone else with a sound mind would ever switch. The only reason I switched was because I trusted the rep was an expert in his field and after analyzing our bills was being truthful when he said we would have a huge savings if we switched to Champion. I was also told if I did not like the service or was dissatisfied, I could cancel and switch back at any time. This was true, except I found out that if I cancelled there was a large cancel fee. I have an email (ITEM 34) from another energy supplier from June 2015 and they also knew the \$.0922 rate was not a fair & reasonable rate and that it was apparent we were being gouged compared to what other companies were charging for electric usage. When I called Champion to explain how I was duped & mislead, they told me I signed a contract & if I cancelled the contract, it would cost me between \$1,200 and \$2,400. I asked Champion Energy to adjust my rate to receive a lower and reasonable rate. They said there is no way that they would lower my rate and basically indicated I was a sucker and was stuck with my contract. I was upset & let it go. After revisiting and adding up the electric bills, I was shocked when I discovered that we significantly overpaid for 13 months & it was a significant amount totaling \$4,348.91. Even, though I would have been forced to pay \$1,200-\$2,400 to cancel, I should have cancelled the account 13 months ago and filed a formal complaint with PUCO to recover my cancel fee cost. The fact that the company mislead me, falsely presented information and withheld information to encourage me to sign their contract, I am requesting a full refund for the overcharge in the amount of \$4,348.91 + waive the \$600 cancel fee as already promised (ITEM 23). I invoiced Champion Energy for \$4,948.91 and provided a copy of all our bills and a spreadsheet detailing what we were paying them as compared to what we should be paying (Invoice 2151, supporting documents ITEM 1-22). I tried to settle with Champion outside of court and they would not work with me to pay back any portion of the overcharge and were only willing to waive the cancel fee (EMAILS ITEM 35-50). Thank you for your consideration in this matter.

CALL THE COURT A DAY OR TWO BEFORE YOUR HEARING DATE TO MAKE SURE YOUR TRIAL IS GOING FORWARD

PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT
203 WEST MAIN STREET
RAVENNA OHIO 44266
330.297.3635
www.co.portage.oh.us

NOTICE TO DEFENDANT

IF YOU FEEL YOU OWE THE AMOUNT CLAIMED BY THE PLAINTIFF AND YOU WISH TO PAY, YOU MAY DO SO BY:

- 1. CONTACTING THE ATTORNEY FOR THE PLAINTIFF AND MAKE PAYMENT DIRECTLY TO HIM. YOU SHOULD BE PREPARED TO PAY THE AMOUNT OF THE CLAIM, INTEREST (IF ANY IS CLAIMED), AND ALL COURT COSTS INCURRED IN FILING THE CLAIM.
- 2. CONTACTING THE PLAINTIFF (ONLY IF THERE IS NO ATTORNEY FOR THE PLAINTIFF). YOU SHOULD ALSO BE PREPARED TO PAY THE AMOUNT OF THE CLAIM, INTEREST (IF ANY IS CLAIMED), AND ALL COURT COSTS INCURRED IN FILING THE CLAIM.
- 3. THE PLAINTIFF OR THE PLAINTIFF'S ATTORNEY AT THEIR DISCRETION MAY ACCEPT PAYMENTS.

YOU MAY PAY EITHER BEFORE THE COURT DATE OR AFTER

IF YOU ASK FOR A CONTINUANCE, AND IT IS GRANTED, IT IS YOUR RESPONSIBILITY TO CONTACT THE OTHER PARTY TO LET THEM KNOW THE CASE WILL NOT GO FORWARD

IF YOU FIND THAT YOU NEED TO REPRESENT YOURSELF, THERE IS USEFUL INFORMATION AVAILABLE ON THE OHIO JUDICIAL CONFERENCE WEBSITE:

http://www.ohiojudges.org/citizen-guide-brochures

THE CLERK'S STAFF IS NOT PERMITTED TO GIVE ANY LEGAL ADVICE.

U.S. POSTAGE ≫ PITNEY BOWES

ZIP 44266 \$ 005,325 02 4W 0000339429 NOV 04 2016

#65 JILL FANKHAUSER, CLERK OF COURTS PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT CIVIL DIVISION P.O. Box 958 RAVENNA, OHIO 44266-0958



CHAMPION ENERGY SERVICES INC 1500 RANKIN RD SUITE 200 HOUSTON, TX 77073

2016CVI02903R

77073\$4807 CCO6

ATTACHMENT B

Magistrate's Decision

PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT

203 WEST MAIN STREET PO BOX 958 **RAVENNA, OHIO 44266-0958** PHONE (330) 297-3635 FAX (330) 297-3526

www.co.portage.oh.us

FILED PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT DEC 23 2016 JILL FANKHAUSER, CIERK RAVENNA. OH

ADVANCED INNOVATIVE MANUFACTING **INC DBA AIM PLAINTIFF** VS CHAMPION ENERGY SERVICES INC

CASE NO: 2016CVI02903R

DEFENDANT

DECISION OF THE MAGISTRATE

The above action came on for hearing before the Magistrate, on this December 16, 2016, and the Magistrate decides as follows: Defendant failed to appear. Plaintiff appeared, presented evidence. Default judgment for Plaintiff for \$ ______ and costs. Plus interest at _____ % from Neither party appeared. Case dismissed for want of prosecution. Costs assessed to Plaintiff. Both parties appeared: Trial held. Judgment for Plaintiff in the amount of \$_____ and costs. (Plus interest at _______% from _______.) Both parties appeared. Trial held. Plaintiff failed to prove by a preponderance of the evidence the allegations in the complaint Judgment for Defendant. Case dismissed. Costs assessed to Plaintiff. Both parties appeared. Defendant admitted claim in open court. Judgment for Plaintiff in the amount of \$_____ and costs. (Plus interest at ______% from ______.)) Execution stayed if Defendant complies with the following deferred payment order: Defendant to pay (Plaintiff) or (Court) \$_____on and \$____each _____thereafter until claim and costs are paid. Case dismissed. Costs assessed to Plaintiff.) For good cause shown, case continued. Re-assign for trial. Case ordered transferred to regular civil docket. Magistrate EITHER PARTY MAY OBJECT TO THE ABOVE DECISION BY FILING WRITTER OBJECTIONS WITH THE CLERK OF COURTS WITHIN FOURTEEN (14) DAYS AFTER THE DATE TIME STAMPED ABOVE, OR WITHIN

FOURTEEN (14) DAYS AFTER WRITTEN FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW ARE ISSUED, IF REQUESTED. A PARTY SHALL NOT ASSIGN AN ERROR ON APPEAL THE COURT'S ADOPTION OF ANY FACTUAL FINDING OR LEGAL CONCLUSION, WHETHER OR NOT SPECIFICALLY DESIGNATED AS A FINDING OF FACT OR CONCLUSION OF LAW UNDER CIV. R. 53(D)(3)(a)(iii), UNLESS THE PARTY TIMELY AND SPECIFICALLY OBJECTS TO THAT FACTUAL FINDING OR LEGAL CONCLUSION AS REQUIRED BY CIV.

FRSC R.DOC

R.53(D)(3)(b).

PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT

203 WEST MAIN STREET PO BOX 958 RAVENNA, OHIO 44266-0958 PHONE (330) 297-3635 FAX (330) 297-3526 www.co.portage.oh.us

PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT

DEC 2 3 2016

JILL FANKHAUSER, CIERK
RAVENNA, OH

CASE #:2016CVI02903R

ADVANCED INNOVATIVE MANUFACTING INC DBA AIM PLAINTIFF

vs

JUDGMENT ENTRY

CHAMPION ENERGY SERVICES INC DEFENDANT

THE COURT, HAVING REVIEWED THE DECISION OF THE MAGISTRATE, APPROVES

AND HEREBY ORDERS, ADJUDGES, AND DECREES THAT THE SAME BE ENTERED OF

RECORD AND MADE AN ORDER OF THE COURT. EITHER PARTY MAY FILE OBJECTIONS

TO THE MAGISTRATE'S DECISION WITHIN 14 DAYS OF THE FILING DATE OF THE

MAGISTRATE'S DECISION.

THIS IS A FINAL APPEALABLE ORDER. THE CLERK SHALL JOURNALIZE THIS JUDGMENT AND DATE OF SUCH JOURNALIZATION AND SHALL NOTIFY ALL PARTIES NOT IN DEFAULT OF SAID JUDGMENT IN ACCORDANCE WITH CIV. R 58 (B).

IT IS SO ORDERED.

JUDGE

PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT

ATTACHMENT C

Civil Judgment

PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT RAVENNA DIVISION

PORTAGE COUNTY MUNICIPAL COURT

JAN 20 2017

JILL FANKHAUSER, Clerk

RAVENNA, OH

ADVANCED INNOVATIVE MANUFACURING INC.) CASE NO. R 2016 CVI 2903
PLAINTIFF)) JUDGE BARBARA R. OSWICK
-VS-	JUDGMENT ENTRY
CHAMPION ENERGY SERVICES INC.))
DEFENDANT))

Plaintiff's Objections to Magistrate's Findings are an effort to supplement the record after trial. No grounds exist in this case to permit supplementation.

Therefore, the Court overrules Plaintiff's Objections.

Judgment stands.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

BARBARA R. OSWICK, JUDGE

January 20, 2017

This Order or Decision was mailed by ordinary mail/fax/e-mail to attys/parties by the clerk on 12317

Jill Fankhauser, Clerk of Courts

By Co Deputy Clerk

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Advanced Innovative Manufacturing, Inc. d/b/a A.I.M. v. Champion Energy Services, LLC Case No. 16-2340-EL-CSS

I certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing *Motion to Dismiss* was served via First Class Mail, postage prepaid, on this 3rd day of March, 2017, to the following:

ADVANCED INNOVATIVE MANUFACTURING, INC. d/b/a A.I.M. 116 Lena Drive Aurora, OH 44202 mark.j.hawald@a-i-mfg.com

> /s/ Michael R. Nelson Michael R. Nelson

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

3/3/2017 2:11:49 PM

in

Case No(s). 16-2340-EL-CSS

Summary: Motion Champion Energy Services, LLC's Motion to Dismiss electronically filed by Ms. Sarah K Merrick on behalf of Champion Energy Services, LLC