



Ohio Adm.Code 4901:1-40-05(C), states:

Staff shall review each electric utility's or electric services company's alternative energy portfolio status report and any timely filed comments, and file its findings and recommendations and any proposed modifications thereto.

The findings and recommendations in this document pertain to the company's compliance status. This document does not address such matters as cost recovery or status relative to the statutory 3% cost provision.

## **II. Company Filing Summarized**

Energy Plus Holdings LLC (Energy Plus or Company) filed its RPS compliance status report for the 2015 compliance year on April 12, 2016. Staff determined that this initial filing was not clear with respect to the Company's 2015 baseline, and therefore the Company filed an amended 2015 compliance status report on January 3, 2017. In its revised filing, the Company proposed a baseline of 11,317 megawatt-hours (MWhs), which it indicated was its actual Ohio retail electric sales for 2015. Applying the statutory benchmarks to its proposed baseline, the Company calculated its 2015 compliance obligations to be as follows:

- 14 Solar MWhs
- 269 Non-Solar<sup>1</sup> MWhs

## **III. Filed Comments**

No persons filed comments in this proceeding.

## **IV. Staff Findings**

Following its review of the Energy Plus 2015 annual status report and any timely comments submitted in this proceeding, Staff makes the following findings:

- (1) Energy Plus is an electric services company in Ohio with retail electric sales in the state of Ohio during 2015, and therefore the Company had an RPS obligation for 2015.
- (2) The Company initially filed its 2015 RPS compliance status report on April 12, 2016. The Company subsequently filed a revised compliance status report on January 3, 2017.

---

<sup>1</sup> "Non-solar" in this context refers to the total renewable requirement net of the specific solar carve-out. Staff acknowledges that there is not a specific "non-solar" requirement in the applicable statute.

- (3) The Company's initial compliance status report contains inconsistent information with respect to its proposed sales baseline for 2015. The report indicates that the Company's 2015 baseline of 11,317 MWh was calculated as an average of the retail sales number for the preceding three years. However, the 2012, 2013 and 2014 sales values as indicated in the report, do not result in an average value of 11,317 MWh.
- (4) During subsequent communications with Company representatives, they confirmed that the 11,317 MWh baseline is the Company's actual Ohio retail electric sales for 2015. Energy Plus filed its revised compliance status report to clarify this point.
- (5) The baseline proposed by the Company in its amended filing is reasonable, and given the proposed baseline and the 2015 statutory benchmarks, the Company has accurately calculated its RPS compliance obligations.<sup>2</sup>
- (6) Following a review of the Company's reserve subaccount data on GATS, Staff finds that for Ohio compliance purposes, the Company has transferred S-RECs and RECs to its 2015 GATS reserve subaccount in the following quantities:
  - 14 S-RECs
  - 269 RECs
- (7) The S-RECs and RECs that the Company transferred to its 2015 GATS reserve subaccount were sourced from generating facilities certified by the Commission and were appropriately associated with electricity generated between August 1, 2008, and December 31, 2015.
- (8) The Company has not applied the 5 S-RECs that were in excess of its 2014 solar requirement<sup>3</sup> towards its 2015 solar requirement. Likewise, the Company has not applied the 105 RECs that were in excess of its 2014 non-solar requirement<sup>3</sup> towards its 2015 non-solar requirement.
- (9) The excess retirement from 2014, combined with the Company's retirement for 2015, exceeds its 2015 compliance obligations as illustrated by Exhibit 1. After satisfying its 2015 obligations, the Company is still left with an excess retirement of 5 S-RECs and 105 RECs.

---

<sup>2</sup> Solar obligation:  $11,317 \text{ MWh} \times 0.12\% = 13.5804 \text{ MWh}$ , which Staff rounds to 14 MWh  
Non-solar obligation:  $11,317 \text{ MWh} \times 2.38\% = 269.3446 \text{ MWh}$ , which Staff rounds to 269 MWh

<sup>3</sup> Case No. 15-0740-EL-ACP, Findings and Recommendations of the PUCO Staff, April 7, 2016, page 3, Finding (7).

## **V. Staff Recommendations**

Following its review of the information submitted in this proceeding and other relevant data, Staff recommends the following:

- (1) Energy Plus is found to have satisfied its 2015 RPS compliance obligations.
- (2) The excess S-REC and REC retirement detailed in Staff Finding (9) be applied towards the Company's RPS compliance obligations for 2016, provided that the timing of such application does not conflict with Ohio Adm.Code 4901:1-40-04(D)(3).
- (3) For future compliance years in which the Company is utilizing GATS to demonstrate its Ohio compliance efforts, the Company initiates the transfer of the appropriate RECs and S-RECs to its GATS reserve subaccount between March 1<sup>st</sup> and April 15<sup>th</sup> so as to precede the filing of its Ohio annual compliance status report with the Commission.

# Exhibit 1

Compliance Plan Status Report for Compliance Year 2015 Summary Sheet						
	Sales Unadjusted (MWHs)	Proposed Adjustments (MWHs)	Sales Adjusted (MWHs)	Source of Sales Volume Data		
2012		0	2,062	(A)		
2013		0	8,084	(B)		
2014		0	18,299	(C)		
Baseline for 2015 Compliance Obligation (MWHs)			11,317	(D) = Actual 2015 Sales		
(Note: If using 2015 sales as your baseline, insert that figure in cell I14 and indicate in box to right if 2015 sales are adjusted or not.					Not Adjusted	
2.50%	2015 Statutory Compliance Obligation					
	2015 Non-Solar Renewable Benchmark		2.38%	(E)		
	2015 Solar Renewable Benchmark		0.12%	(F)		
	Per R.C., 4928.64(B)(2)					
	2015 Compliance Obligation					
	Non-Solar RECs Needed for Compliance		269	(G) = (D) * (E)		
	Solar RECs Needed for Compliance		14	(H) = (D) * (F)		
	Carry-Over from Previous Year(s), if applicable					
	Non-Solar (RECs)		-105	(I)		
	Solar (S-RECs)		-5	(J)		
	Total 2015 Compliance Obligations					
	Non-Solar RECs Needed for Compliance		164	(K) = (G) + (I)		
	Solar RECs Needed for Compliance		9	(L) = (H) + (J)		
	2015 Performance (Per GATS and/or MRETS Data)					
	Non-Solar (RECs)		269	(M)		
	Solar (S-RECs)		14	(N)		
	Under Compliance in 2015, if applicable					
	Non-Solar (RECs)		-105	(O) = (K) - (M)		
	Solar (S-RECs)		-5	(P) = (L) - (N)		
	2015 Alternative Compliance Payments					
	Non-Solar, per REC (Refer to Case 15-0461-EL-ACP)		\$49.96	(Q)		
	Solar, per S-REC (Refer to R.C. 4928.64(C)(2)(a))		\$300.00	(R)		
	2015 Payments, if applicable					
	Non-Solar Total		\$0.00	(S) = (O) * (Q)		
	Solar Total		\$0.00	(T) = (P) * (R)		
	TOTAL		\$0.00	(U) = (S) + (T)		

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**2/9/2017 4:49:50 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 16-0779-EL-ACP**

Summary: Staff Review and Recommendation electronically filed by Ms. Mahila Christopher  
on behalf of PUCO Staff