

BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Its Electric Security Plan	:	Case No. 16-0395-EL-SSO
	:	
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Revised Tariffs	:	Case No. 16-0396-EL-ATA
	:	
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code § 4905.13	:	Case No. 16-0397-EL-AAM
	:	

**THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY'S
MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Pursuant to Ohio Admin. Code § 4901-1-24(D), The Dayton Power and Light Company ("DP&L") moves for the entry of a Protective Order to exempt from public disclosure certain information that is confidential, proprietary, and competitively sensitive trade secret information. The information at issue is Confidential Information relating to DP&L's financial information and forecasts, and it is included in the testimony and exhibits of R. Jeffrey Malinak in support of the January 30, 2017 Stipulation and Recommendation.

The information at issue is maintained as confidential by DP&L, and constitutes proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret material, the public disclosure of which would subject DP&L to an unfair competitive disadvantage. In accordance with Ohio Admin. Code § 4901-1-24(D)(2), an original and two unredacted copies of the Confidential Information are to be filed under seal with the Commission.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey

Charles J. Faruki (0010417)

(Counsel of Record)

D. Jeffrey Ireland (0010443)

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)

FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L.

110 North Main Street, Suite 1600

Dayton, OH 45402

Telephone: (937) 227-3705

Telecopier: (937) 227-3717

Email: cfaruki@ficlaw.com

djireland@ficlaw.com

jsharkey@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power
and Light Company

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF THE DAYTON POWER AND
LIGHT COMPANY'S MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Pursuant to Ohio Admin. Code § 4901-1-24(D), The Dayton Power and Light Company ("DP&L") moves for the entry of a Protective Order to exempt from public disclosure certain information as confidential, proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret information. Specifically, DP&L requests that certain confidential information contained in the testimony and exhibits of R. Jeffrey Malinak in support of the January 30, 2017 Stipulation and Recommendation be exempted from public disclosure as confidential, proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret information ("Confidential Information"). The Confidential Information contains confidential financial information and confidential forecasts.

Section 4901-1-24(D) of the Ohio Administrative Code provides that the Commission may issue an order which is necessary to protect the confidentiality of information contained in documents filed with the Commission's Docketing Division to the extent that state or federal law prohibits the release of the information, and where non-disclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code. Accord: Ohio Rev. Code § 4905.07 (providing that "[e]xcept as provided in section 149.43 of the Revised Code and as consistent with the purposes of Title XLIX [49] of the Revised Code, all facts and information in the possession of the public utilities commission shall be public").

The release of trade secret information by the Commission is prohibited by state law. In the Matter of the Joint Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Integration of an Energy Efficiency or Peak-Demand Reduction Program with Honda of Am. Mfg., Inc., PUCO Case No. 10-2205-EL-EEC, 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1313, at *6 (Finding and Order, Dec. 7, 2011) ("Section 149.43, Revised Code, specifies that the term 'public records' excludes information which, under state or federal law, may not be released. The Ohio Supreme

Court has clarified that the 'state or federal law' exemption is intended to cover trade secrets.") (citing State ex rel. Besser v. Ohio State Univ., 89 Ohio St.3d 396, 399, 732 N.E.2d 373 (2000)). The definition of a "trade secret" includes "any business information or plans [and] financial information." Ohio Rev. Code § 1333.61(D).

"A company's determination of its costs, overhead and volume of sales, and particularly its calculation of profit margins on customers' purchases may be the kind of information that the trade secret statute seeks to protect." Kenker Box Co. v. Riemeier Lumber Co., 1st Dist. Hamilton Nos. C-990803 and C-990824, 2000 Ohio App. LEXIS 6198, at *10 (Dec. 29, 2000). Accord: Alpha Benefits Agency, Inc. v. King Ins. Agency, Inc., 134 Ohio App. 3d 673, 683, 731 N.E.2d 1209 (8th Dist.1999) (holding that trial court should have ordered plaintiff to produce its "profitability information" to defendant subject to a protective order); Vanguard Transp. Sys. v. Edwards Transfer & Storage Co. Gen. Commodities Div., 109 Ohio App. 3d 786, 789-90, 673 N.E.2d 182 (10th Dist.1996) (affirming trial court order that held that various information including "corporate financial information" constituted a trade secret).

This definition reflects the state policy favoring the protection of trade secrets such as the information that is the subject of this Motion. The Commission has issued protective orders in numerous prior proceedings to prevent the public disclosure of trade secrets, e.g., In the Matter of the Application of Midwest Utility Consultants, Inc. for Certification as a Competitive Retail Natural Gas Aggregator/Broker, PUCO Case No. 09-893-GA-AGG, 2012 Ohio PUC LEXIS 103 (Entry, Jan. 30, 2012) (forecasted financial statements were trade secrets and granted protective treatment); In the Matter of the Application of the Ohio Power Co. and Columbus S. Power Co. for Authority to Merge and Related Approvals, et al., PUCO Case No. 10-2376-EL-UNC, et al., 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1325, at *22-23 (Opinion and Order, Dec. 14, 2011)

(forecasted fuel expenditures were trade secrets and granted protective treatment); In the Matter of the Joint Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Integration of an Energy Efficiency or Peak-Demand Reduction Program with Honda of Am. Mfg., Inc., PUCO Case No. 10-2205-EL-EEC, 2011 Ohio PUC LEXIS 1313, at *2-5 (Finding and Order, Dec. 7, 2011) (release of trade secrets prohibited by state law).

Here, the Confidential Information constitutes "business information or plans, [and] financial information" under Ohio Rev. Code § 1333.61(D). This Confidential Information is confidential, proprietary and competitively sensitive trade secret information under Ohio Rev. Code § 1333.61(D). The Confidential Information is not known outside of DP&L, and is not disseminated to internal employees unless those employees have a legitimate business need to know the information. Maintaining the confidentiality of this information will prevent an undue competitive disadvantage to DP&L, as well as assisting in fostering the interests of maintaining a fair and robust competitive marketplace within Ohio.

The Commission (and its Staff) will have full access to the Confidential Information in order to fulfill its statutory obligations. Further, DP&L was careful to redact from the publicly-filed testimony and exhibits only those portions that are essential to prevent disclosure of Confidential Information.

For these foregoing reasons, DP&L requests that the Commission issue a Protective Order that permits the Confidential Information to be designated as confidential and to remain under seal.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey

Charles J. Faruki (0010417)

(Counsel of Record)

D. Jeffrey Ireland (0010443)

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)

FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L.

110 North Main Street, Suite 1600

Dayton, OH 45402

Telephone: (937) 227-3705

Telecopier: (937) 227-3717

Email: cfaruki@ficlaw.com

djireland@ficlaw.com

jsharkey@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power
and Light Company

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of the foregoing The Dayton Power and Light Company's Motion for Protective Order has been served via electronic mail upon the following counsel of record, this 6th day of February, 2017:

Thomas McNamee
Natalia Messenger
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
30 East Broad Street, 16th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3793
Email:
thomas.mcnamee@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
natalia.messenger@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

Attorneys for PUCO Staff

Kimberly W. Bojko
James D. Perko, Jr.
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP
280 North High Street, Suite 1300
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: bojko@carpenterlipps.com
perko@carpenterlipps.com

Attorneys for The Ohio Manufacturers'
Association Energy Group

Kevin R. Schmidt
88 East Broad Street, Suite 1770
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: schmidt@sppgrp.com

Attorney for The Energy Professionals of Ohio

Frank P. Darr (Counsel of Record)
Matthew R. Pritchard
McNees Wallace & Nurick
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users – Ohio

David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Kurt J. Boehm
Jody Kyler Cohn
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
Email: dboehm@BKLawfirm.com
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com
kboehm@BKLawfirm.com
jkylercohn@BKLawfirm.com

Attorneys for The Ohio Energy Group

Joseph Olikier (Counsel of Record)
Matthew White
Evan Betterton
IGS Energy
6100 Emerald Parkway
Dublin, OH 43016
Email: joliker@igsenergy.com
mswhite@igsenergy.com
Ebetterton@igsenergy.com

Attorney for IGS Energy

Jeffrey W. Mayes
Monitoring Analytics, LLC
2621 Van Buren Avenue, Suite 160
Valley Forge Corporate Center
Eagleville, PA 19403
Email: jeffrey.mayes@monitoringanalytics.com

Attorneys for Monitoring Analytics, LLC as
The Independent Market Monitor for PJM

Trent Dougherty (Counsel of Record)
Miranda Leppla
Ohio Environmental Council
1145 Chesapeake Ave., Suite 1
Columbus, OH 43212-3449
Email: tdougherty@the OEC.org
mleppla@the OEC.org

Attorney for the Ohio Environmental
Council and Environmental Defense Fund

William J. Michael (Counsel of Record)
Kevin F. Moore
Ajay Kumar
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215-3485
Email: william.michael@occ.ohio.gov
kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov
ajay.kumar@occ.ohio.gov

Attorneys for the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

Michael D. Dortch
Richard R. Parsons
Kravitz, Brown & Dortch, LLC
65 East State Street, Suite 200
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: mdortch@kravitzllc.com
rparsons@kravitzllc.com

Attorneys for Calpine Energy Solutions LLC

Joel E. Sechler (Counsel of Record)
Carpenter Lipps & Leland
280 N. High St., Suite 1300
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: sechler@carpenterlipps.com

Gregory J. Poulos
EnerNOC, Inc.
P.O. Box 29492
Columbus, OH 43229
Email: gpoulos@enernoc.com

Attorneys for EnerNOC, Inc.

Angela Paul Whitfield
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP
280 Plaza, Suite 1300
280 North High Street
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: paul@carpenterlipps.com

Attorney for The Kroger Co.

Colleen Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
P.O. Box 1793
Findlay, OH 45839-1793
Email: cmooney@ohiopartners.org

Attorney for Ohio Partners for Affordable
Energy

Madeline Fleisher
Kristin Field
Environmental Law & Policy Center
21 West Broad Street, Suite 500
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: mfleisher@elpc.org
kfield@elpc.org

Attorneys for The Environmental Law &
Policy Center

Richard C. Sahli
Richard C. Sahli Law Office, LLC
981 Pinewood Lane
Columbus, OH 43230-3662
Email: rsahli@columbus.rr.com

Christopher M. Bzdok (pro hac vice)
Olson Bzdok & Howard, P.C.
420 East Front Street
Traverse City, MI 49686
chris@envlaw.com

Tony G. Mendoza, Staff Attorney (pro hac vice)
Kristin Henry, Senior Staff Attorney (pro hac vice)
Sierra Club Environmental Law Program
2101 Webster Street, 13th Floor
Oakland, CA 94612
Email: tony.mendoza@sierraclub.org
kristin.henry@sierraclub.org

Attorneys for Sierra Club

Michael J. Settineri
Stephen M. Howard
Gretchen L. Petrucci
Ilya Batikov
William A. Sieck
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 E. Gay Street
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: mjsettineri@vorys.com
smhoward@vorys.com
glpetrucci@vorys.com
ibatikov@vorys.com
wasieck@vorys.com

Attorneys for Dynegy Inc.,
PJM Power Providers Group, and
Retail Energy Supply Association

Michelle Grant
Dynegy Inc.
601 Travis Street, Suite 1400
Houston, TX 77002
Email: michelle.d.grant@dynegy.com

Attorneys for Dynegy Inc.

Steven D. Lesser
James F. Lang
N. Trevor Alexander
Mark T. Keaney
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP
41 South High Street
1200 Huntington Center
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: slesser@calfee.com
jlang@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com
mkeaney@calfee.com

Attorneys for The City of Dayton and
Honda of America Mfg., Inc.

Lisa M. Hawrot
Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC
Century Centre Building
1233 Main Street, Suite 4000
Wheeling, WV 26003
Email: lhawrot@spilmanlaw.com

Derrick Price Williamson
Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC
1100 Bent Creek Blvd., Suite 101
Mechanicsburg, PA 17050
Email: dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com

Carrie M. Harris
Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC
310 First Street, Suite 1100
P.O. Box 90
Roanoke, VA 24002-0090
Email: charris@spilmanlaw.com

Steve W. Chriss
Senior Manager, Energy Regulatory Analysis
Greg Tillman
Senior Manager, Energy Regulatory Analysis
Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.
2001 SE 10th Street
Bentonville, AR 72716-0550
Email: Stephen.Chriss@walmart.com
Greg.Tillman@walmart.com
Attorneys for Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
and Sam's East, Inc.

Glen Thomas
1060 First Avenue, Suite 400
King of Prussia, PA 19406
Email: gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Sharon Theodore
Electric Power Supply Association
1401 New York Ave. NW 11th Floor
Washington, DC
Email: stheodore@epsa.org

Laura Chappelle
201 North Washington Square, Suite 910
Lansing, MI 48933
Email: laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

Attorneys for PJM Power Providers Group

Ellis Jacobs
Advocates for Basic Legal Equality, Inc.
130 West Second Street, Suite 700 East
Dayton, OH 45402
Email: ejacobs@ablelaw.org

Attorney for Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition

Amy B. Spiller
Jeanne W. Kingery
Elizabeth H. Watts
Duke-Energy Ohio, Inc.
139 East Fourth Street
1303-Main
Cincinnati, OH 45202
Email: amy.spiller@duke-energy.com
jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com
elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com

Attorneys for Duke-Energy Ohio, Inc.

Evelyn R. Robinson
2750 Monroe Boulevard
Audubon, PA 19403
Email: evelyn.robinson@pjm.com

Attorney for PJM Interconnection, L.L.C.

Richard L. Sites
Ohio Hospital Association
155 East Broad Street, 3rd Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3620
Email: rick.sites@ohiohospitals.org

Matthew W. Warnock
Dylan F. Borchers
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
Email: mwarnock@bricker.com
dborchers@bricker.com

Attorneys for The Ohio Hospital Association

Terrence N. O'Donnell
Raymond D. Seiler
Christine M.T. Pirik
William V. Vorys
Dickinson Wright PLLC
150 East Gay Street, Suite 2400
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: todonnell@dickinsonwright.com
rseiler@dickinsonwright.com
cpirik@dickinsonwright.com
wvorys@dickinsonwright.com

Attorneys for Mid-Atlantic Renewable
Energy Coalition

Devin D. Parram
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
Email: dparram@bricker.com

Attorney for People Working
Cooperatively, Inc.

Carl Tamm
President
Classic Connectors, Inc.
382 Park Avenue East
Mansfield, OH 44905
Email: crtamm@classicconnectors.com

John R. Doll
Matthew T. Crawford
Doll, Jansen & Ford
111 West First Street, Suite 1100
Dayton, OH 45402-1156
Email: jdoll@djflawfirm.com
mcrawford@djflawfirm.com

Attorneys for Utility Workers of
America Local 175

C. David Kelley, Prosecutor
Dana N. Whalen
110 West Main Street
West Union, OH 45693
Email: prosecutorkelley@usa.com
dana.whalen@adamscountyoh.gov

Attorneys for Adams County, Ohio,
Monroe Township, Ohio, Sprigg Township,
Manchester Local School District, and Adams
County Ohio Valley School District

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey
Jeffrey S. Sharkey

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

2/6/2017 4:19:51 PM

in

Case No(s). 16-0395-EL-SSO, 16-0396-EL-ATA, 16-0397-EL-AAM

Summary: Motion The Dayton Power and Light Company's Motion for Protective Order electronically filed by Mr. Jeffrey S Sharkey on behalf of The Dayton Power and Light Company