

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

<b>In the Matter of the Application of Ohio</b>	)	
<b>Power Company for Authority to</b>	)	
<b>Establish a Standard Service Offer</b>	)	<b>Case No. 16-1852-EL-SSO</b>
<b>Pursuant to R.C. 4928.143, in the Form</b>	)	
<b>of an Electric Security Plan.</b>	)	
	)	
<b>In the Matter of the Application of Ohio</b>	)	
<b>Power Company for Approval of Certain</b>	)	<b>Case No. 16-1853-EL-AAM</b>
<b>Accounting Authority.</b>	)	

---

**MOTION TO INTERVENE  
BY THE NATURAL RESOURCES DEFENSE COUNCIL**

---

For the reasons set forth in the accompanying Memorandum in Support, the Natural Resources Defense Council ("NRDC") moves the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio for leave to intervene in the above-captioned case pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 4903.221 and Ohio Administrative Code 4901-1-11, and to grant to the NRDC the full powers and rights specifically authorized by statute or by the provisions of the Ohio Administrative Code. Additionally, the interests of NRDC are not adequately represented by any other party to this matter, and its participation in this proceeding will contribute to a just and expeditious resolution of the issues and questions presented. Further, NRDC's participation will not unduly delay the proceeding or prejudice any other party.

NRDC respectfully requests that this Commission grant its motion to intervene for these reasons and those set forth in more detail in the attached Memorandum in Support.

*[Signature block on the next page.]*

Respectfully submitted,

/s/Robert Dove

Robert Dove (#0092019)

Attorney & Counselor at Law

PO Box 13442

Columbus, Ohio 43213

Phone: 614-286-4183

Email: [rdove@attorneydove.com](mailto:rdove@attorneydove.com)

(Willing to accept service by email)

**Attorney for the NRDC**

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

<b>In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to R.C. 4928.143, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan.</b>	) ) ) ) ) ) )	<b>Case No. 16-1852-EL-SSO</b>
<b>In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority.</b>	) ) ) )	<b>Case No. 16-1853-EL-AAM</b>

---

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF THE MOTION TO INTERVENE  
BY THE NATURAL RESOURCES DEFENSE COUNCIL**

---

**I. Introduction**

Ohio Revised Code (“ORC”) § 4903.221 states that “[a]ny other person who may be adversely affected by a public utilities commission proceeding may intervene in such proceeding” provided the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Commission”) makes certain determinations. The Natural Resources Defense Council (“NRDC”) seeks intervention in this proceeding in which Ohio Power Company (“AEP Ohio” or “the Company”) on November 23, 2016, filed an application (“Application”) to extend and modify its Electric Security Plan (“ESP”). NRDC is a national, non-profit environmental organization with more than 10,600 members in Ohio. Many of those members reside within AEP Ohio's service territory. NRDC's and its members' interests are not adequately represented by any other parties in this proceeding. As such, NRDC is entitled to intervene in the above captioned proceeding.

## II. Legal Standard

Ohio law states that a party may intervene in a Commission proceeding if that party “may be adversely affected by a public utilities commission proceeding.”<sup>1</sup> In the determination of whether a party may be adversely affected for purposes of intervention, the Commission is required to evaluate:

- (1) The nature and extent of the prospective intervenor’s interest;
- (2) The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case;
- (3) Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceedings;
- (4) Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.<sup>2</sup>

The Commission’s rules similarly provide that any person may intervene where “[t]he person has a real and substantial interest in the proceeding.”<sup>3</sup> The PUCO regulations set forth the same four standards that are established in Ohio Revised Code 4903.221(B) for determining whether a party may be “adversely affected,” and also purport to add a fifth factor regarding “the extent to which the person’s interest is represented by existing parties.”<sup>4</sup>

As the Ohio Supreme Court recently held, intervention in Commission proceedings “ought to be liberally allowed so that the positions of all persons with a real and substantial interest in the proceedings can be considered by the [Commission].”<sup>5</sup> The Commission has consistently maintained a policy to “encourage the broadest possible participation” in its

---

<sup>1</sup> R.C. 4903.221.

<sup>2</sup> R.C. 4903.221(B).

<sup>3</sup> Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(A)(2).

<sup>4</sup> Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(B).

<sup>5</sup> *Ohio Consumers’ Counsel v. Pub. Util Comm’n of Ohio* (2006), 111 Ohio St. 3d 384, 388, 2006 Ohio 5853, 856 N.E.2d 940.

proceedings, even under extenuating circumstances.<sup>6</sup> NRDC satisfies these liberal intervention standards and respectfully requests that its intervention be granted in these cases.

**III. NRDC is entitled to intervene under §4903.221 because the organization and its members “may be adversely affected” by the outcome of this proceeding.**

NRDC is entitled to intervene in this proceeding because NRDC satisfies each of the four statutory factors demonstrating that the organization and its members “may be adversely affected” by the outcome. First, the nature and extent of NRDC’s interests in the proceeding is real and substantial,<sup>7</sup> as the issues involved herein are directly related to NRDC’s interests in protecting its members’ interests within AEP Ohio’s service territory. NRDC regularly participates in proceedings before the Commission with an interest in advancing resource choices that minimize or eliminate pollutant emissions and maximize energy efficiency and renewable energy. Because rate determinations have a direct impact on both utility and consumer behavior and investment, NRDC has a real and substantial interest in this proceeding.

In particular, NRDC is a national, non-profit environmental organization that has worked for its 40 year history to, among other things, promote energy efficiency and renewable energy sources and to protect air and water quality. NRDC has more than 10,600 members in Ohio, many of whom reside in AEP Ohio’s service area. AEP Ohio’s Application will have an effect on rates, both in design and amount, which could impact the Company’s currently available clean energy options. Furthermore, no other Intervenor can adequately represent and protect the interests of NRDC’s members on these issues within the AEP Ohio’s territory except for NRDC.

---

<sup>6</sup> See e.g. *In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company*, 2009 WL 322883 at 1, Ohio PUC February 5, 2009 (Commission granted motion to intervene in light of policy to encourage participation, despite party’s failure to file within the deadline).

<sup>7</sup> R.C. 4903.221(B)(1).

Second<sup>8</sup>, because of the potential impacts on NRDC and its members in Ohio, NRDC wants to ensure that AEP Ohio's Application meets the applicable legal requirements, adequately protects the environment, and promotes environmentally sound policies in Ohio. NRDC intends to present testimony relating to AEP Ohio's proposed residential customer charge increase and provide evidence of alternative rate design options that encourage and incentivize energy conservation and renewable energy, as well as affordability. NRDC may also address in testimony the plug-in electric vehicle tariff issues raised in the Application.

Third, NRDC's intervention will not unduly prolong or delay the proceeding<sup>9</sup> as this motion is being filed before a deadline has been set for intervention and NRDC is able to comply with all case management deadlines that will be established by the Commission and/or agreed to by the parties.

Fourth, intervention by NRDC will significantly contribute to the full development of the record in this proceeding.<sup>10</sup> NRDC will bring significant expertise to bear in these proceedings. NRDC's staff and consultants have extensive experience in resource planning, analyzing the potential for energy efficiency, and in the laws and regulations related to rate design. Further, NRDC has intervened and/or provided testimony on these issues in similar proceedings in a number of states including Illinois, Minnesota, Wisconsin, New York, Oregon, California, New Jersey, and Iowa, and has been granted intervention in numerous cases before this Commission. NRDC has regularly presented testimony before the U.S. Congress and various state legislatures related to the electric utility industry, including energy efficiency, renewable energy, nuclear

---

<sup>8</sup> R.C. 4903.221(B)(3).

<sup>9</sup> R.C. 4903.221(B)(3).

<sup>10</sup> R.C. 4903.221(B)(4).

energy, and coal generation. As such, NRDC should be permitted to intervene pursuant to Ohio Revised Code §4903.221.

**IV. NRDC may intervene because NRDC and its members have a “real and substantial interest” in the proceeding as presented in Ohio Administrative Code 4901-1-11(B).**

NRDC may also intervene in these proceedings because it satisfies each of the five factors listed in the PUCO rules demonstrating that it has a “real and substantial interest” in these cases.<sup>11</sup> The first four factors are identical to those set forth under §4903.221(B) and, therefore, NRDC should be permitted to intervene for the same reasons as set forth in Section III above.

As for the fifth factor, NRDC’s interests in these proceedings will not be fully represented by other parties.<sup>12</sup> No other parties can adequately represent NRDC’s interests as a national environmental organization, with members in Ohio, that is interested in environmental protection, clean energy, and the promotion of energy efficiency. Because no other party to these proceedings advocates from a national platform at the intersection of these three issues, and no other party represents the interests of NRDC’s 10,600 members in Ohio, no other party can represent NRDC’s interests and the interests of its members.

**V. Conclusion**

For the foregoing reasons, NRDC respectfully request that its Motion to Intervene be granted, and NRDC be authorized to participate as full parties to this proceeding.

*[Signature block on the next page]*

---

<sup>11</sup> Ohio Adm.Code 4901-1-11(B).

<sup>12</sup> Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(B)(5).

Respectfully submitted,

/s/Robert Dove

Robert Dove (#0092019)

Attorney & Counselor at Law

PO Box 13442

Columbus, Ohio 43213

Phone: 614-286-4183

Email: [rdove@attorneydove.com](mailto:rdove@attorneydove.com)

(Willing to accept service by email)

**Attorney for the NRDC**



**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that a copy of the foregoing has been served via electronic mail upon the following counsel of record, this 13<sup>th</sup> day of December, 2016:

Bojko@carpenterlipps.com  
perko@carpenterlipps.com  
mfleisher@elpc.org  
cmooney@ohiopartners.org  
paul@carpenterlipps.com  
mleppa@theOEC.org  
tdougherty@theOEC.org  
lhawrot@spilmanlaw.com  
dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com  
charris@spilmanlaw.com  
dborchers@bricker.com  
mjsettineri@vorys.com  
glpetrucci@vorys.com  
ibatikov@vorys.com  
William.wright@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

stnourse@aep.com  
fdarr@mwncmh.com  
mpritchard@mwncmh.com  
Kurt.Helfrich@ThompsonHine.com  
Stephanie.Chmiel@ThompsonHine.com  
Michael.Austin@ThompsonHine.com  
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com  
kboehm@BKLawfirm.com  
jkylercohn@BKLawfirm.com  
rick.sites@ohiohospitals.org  
mwarnock@bricker.com  
dparram@bricker.com

**Attorney Examiner:**

Greta.see@puc.state.oh.us  
Sarah.parrot@puc.state.oh.us

/s/ Robert Dove  
Robert Dove

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**12/13/2016 10:47:43 AM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 16-1852-EL-SSO**

Summary: Motion to Intervene electronically filed by Mr. Robert Dove on behalf of The Natural Resources Defense Council