

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of The)	
Dayton Power and Light Company For)	Case No. 16-395-EL-SSO
Approval of Its Electric Security Plan.)	
)	
In the Matter of the Application of The)	
Dayton Power and Light Company for)	Case No. 16-396-EL-ATA
Approval of Revised Tariffs.)	
)	
In the Matter of the Application of The)	
Dayton Power and Light Company for)	Case No. 16-397-EL-AAM
Approval of Certain Accounting Authority)	
Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code § 4905.13.	

THE KROGER CO.'S MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER

Pursuant to Rules 4901-1-02(D)(2), 4901-1-12, and 4901-1-24(D), Ohio Administrative Code (O.A.C.), The Kroger Co. (Kroger) hereby files this motion for protective order with the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Commission), seeking a protective order regarding information asserted to be confidential by The Dayton Power and Light Company (DP&L or the Company). As part of discovery, including its submission of direct testimony, in this proceeding, DP&L provided certain information to Kroger, subject to a protective agreement, which DP&L asserts constitutes trade secret information under Ohio law.

Kroger hereby requests that, in accordance with Rule 4901-1-02(D)(2), O.A.C., the Commission issue such order as is necessary to protect the information contained in the redacted portions of the Direct Testimony of Kevin C. Higgins, which are asserted to be confidential by DP&L. Pursuant to Kroger's rights under the protective agreement, Kroger is filing the Direct Testimony of Kevin C. Higgins under seal, and is also filing a public version of Mr. Higgins' testimony which includes all information not claimed by DP&L to be confidential.

By filing this motion for protective order, Kroger does not concede that the information for which protection is sought constitutes trade secret information; however, Kroger acknowledges that it has obtained said information pursuant to a protective agreement with DP&L that provides for such information to be treated as confidential and protected (subject to Kroger's right under the protective agreement to initiate a process by which the Commission may determine whether the information should be afforded confidential treatment under Ohio law). The grounds for this motion are more fully discussed in the accompanying memorandum in support.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Angela Paul Whitfield
Angela Paul Whitfield (0068774)
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP
280 North High Street, Suite 1300
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Telephone: (614) 365-4100
Email: paul@carpenterlipps.com
(willing to accept service by email)

Counsel for The Kroger Co.

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of The)	
Dayton Power and Light Company For)	Case No. 16-395-EL-SSO
Approval of Its Electric Security Plan.)	
)	
In the Matter of the Application of The)	
Dayton Power and Light Company for)	Case No. 16-396-EL-ATA
Approval of Revised Tariffs.)	
)	
In the Matter of the Application of The)	
Dayton Power and Light Company for)	Case No. 16-397-EL-AAM
Approval of Certain Accounting Authority)	
Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code § 4905.13.	

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

Kroger files its motion for protective order contemporaneously with the Direct Testimony of Kevin C. Higgins in this proceeding. In filing this motion, Kroger does not concede that the information in the Direct Testimony of Kevin C. Higgins is trade secret information pursuant to R.C. 1333.61(D), and further does not concede that the information is deserving of protection from public disclosure under Rule 4901-1-24(D), O.A.C.

Kroger understands that DP&L considers the information contained in the redacted portions of the Direct Testimony of Kevin C. Higgins to be confidential and deserving of protection as trade secret information pursuant to R.C. 1333.61(D). Kroger's understanding is based on claims by DP&L that the information (1) derives economic value, actual or potential, from not being known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by others, and (2) is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.¹

¹ See R.C. 1333.61.

Under the assertions made by DP&L, at this time, confidential treatment of the information contained in the redacted portions of the Direct Testimony of Kevin C. Higgins would be appropriate, subject to Kroger's rights under its protective agreement with DP&L to initiate a process to determine whether the information should be protected. In addition, Kroger is filing a public version of the Direct Testimony of Kevin C. Higgins so that all information not claimed by DP&L to be confidential is accessible to the public.

For the aforementioned reasons, the Commission should grant the motion for protective order sought herein.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Angela Paul Whitfield

Angela Paul Whitfield (0068774)

Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP

280 North High Street, Suite 1300

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Telephone: (614) 365-4100

Email: paul@carpenterlipps.com

(willing to accept service by email)

Counsel for The Kroger Co.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing was served electronically upon those persons listed below this 21st day of November, 2016.

/s/ Angela Paul Whitfield
Angela Paul Whitfield

michael.schuler@aes.com
cfaruki@ficlaw.com
djieland@ficlaw.com
jsharkey@ficlaw.com
mfleisher@elpc.org
jeffrey.mayes@monitoringanalytics.com
evelyn.robinson@pjm.com
schmidt@sppgrp.com
dboehm@bkllawfirm.com
mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com
jkylerncohn@bkllawfirm.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com
mjsettineri@vorys.com
smhoward@vorys.com
glpetrucci@vorys.com
ibatikov@vorys.com
Bojko@carpenterlipps.com
ghiloni@carpenterlipps.com

Debra Gaunder

From: Danielle M. Ghiloni
Sent: Monday, November 21, 2016 4:10 PM
To: Debra Gaunder
Subject: copies
Attachments: Motion for Protective Order.DOCX; Higgins Testimony in DPL ESP 16-395 - Attachment KCH-1 (676893).DOCX; Higgins Testimony in DPL ESP 16-395 - Attachment KCH-2 (676894).DOCX; Higgins Testimony DPL ESP 16-395 - PUBLIC.docx

These will need to be filed electronically on behalf of Kroger:

1. The protective order
2. The public version of the testimony with the 2 attachments

Danielle Ghiloni Walter
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP
Columbus ▪ New York ▪ Chicago
280 N. High Street, Suite 1300
Columbus, Ohio 43215
614.365.4104
ghiloni@carpenterlipps.com

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE

The sender intends this message to be used exclusively by the addressee. This message may contain information that is privileged, confidential and exempt from disclosure under applicable law. Unauthorized disclosure or use of this information is strictly prohibited. If you received this communication in error please dispose of the message and reply to or contact (614) 365-4100.

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

11/21/2016 4:38:55 PM

in

Case No(s). 16-0395-EL-SSO, 16-0396-EL-ATA, 16-0397-EL-AAM

Summary: Motion The Kroger Co.'s Motion For Protective Order electronically filed by Ms. Cheryl A Smith on behalf of The Kroger Co.