

On August 31, 2016, Suburban filed its Application in this case to adjust its IRP Rider for costs incurred from July 1, 2015 through June 30, 2016. Suburban proposes to decrease the monthly IRP Rider rate from \$0.26 to \$0.07 and that the new rate become effective on November 1, 2016.

BACKGROUND

In the Opinion and Order in Case No. 15-1048-GA-RDR, the Commission approved a Stipulation between Staff and Suburban which acknowledged that all costs related to the replacement of prone-to-fail risers had been incurred and that as of June 30, 2015, any further repair or replacement of customer service lines would not be subject to recovery through the IRP Rider. The Commission also found that there was no need to implement an accelerated bare steel main replacement program. Pursuant to this Opinion and Order, the IRP Rider is to continue the collection of the remaining balance of the 50 percent portion of the capital investment by the Company associated with the previously completed riser replacement program and replacement of leaking customer service lines, which was excluded from plant accounts and subject to accelerated recovery, including the cost of debt, and amortized over four years. It also collects the revenues associated with the expense incurred for the 50 percent portion of the capital investment, including a return at the rate approved in the 2007 Rate Case¹, associated with previously completed

¹ *In the Matter of the Application of Suburban Natural Gas Company for Authority to Increase its Rates and Charges in Certain Areas of its Service Territory*, Case No. 07-689-GA-AIR (Opinion and Order at 4) (Mar. 19, 2008).

replacement of prone-to-fail risers and leaking customer service lines, which was included in the appropriate plant accounts and not eligible for accelerated recovery. Lastly, the IRP Rider is to automatically terminate on October 31, 2020.

These Comments present a summary of the Staff's investigation of Suburban's Application as well as Staff's findings and recommendations.

SUBURBAN'S APPLICATION

Suburban filed its Application in this case on August 31, 2016. Suburban proposes to decrease the IRP Rider rate from \$0.26 to \$0.07 and that the new rate become effective on November 1, 2016.

Suburban filed three schedules and the testimony of its outside consultant, Nichole Clement, in support of its Application. The three schedules detail the progress and costs associated with the IRP Program. Schedule 1 provides the overall program costs and cost recovery calculation. Schedule 2 details the cost of debt calculation used in the four-year recovery of 50 percent of the Program's cost. Schedule 3 provides the rate of return calculation that is used in the calculation for recovery of the remaining fifty percent of Program costs which will be recovered over a 45-year period. In accordance with the initial development of Suburban's IRP Program, the Application does not include a provision for recovery of costs associated with taxes.

STAFF'S INVESTIGATION SUMMARY AND COMMENTS

The Staff's investigation was designed to determine if Suburban's Application and exhibits justify the requested IRP revenue requirement and support the proposed annual adjustment to the IRP Rider rate.

Staff began its investigation by reviewing the documentation supporting all costs included in Suburban's Rider IRP Application. Based on its examination of such documentation, Staff identified no inappropriate costs.

Staff then reviewed Suburban's 50-50 split of costs, including the cost of debt and overall rate of return used and any tax inclusions. In the Staff's opinion, Suburban properly excluded gross receipts tax and applied the correct cost of debt and rate of return to the costs of replacing prone-to-fail risers and the repair and replacement of customer service lines. Additionally, no expenses were included for testing service lines, as these expenses are already recovered through base rates. The Staff also confirmed that Suburban properly applied the 45-year depreciation life provided for in the Commission-approved IRP program.

STAFF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

After a thorough review of Suburban's Application and supporting documentation, Staff has determined that Suburban included the appropriate costs and cost estimates for recovery through its IRP Rider and that it provided reliable data to support the proposal. As a result, the Staff believes that Suburban's Application will result in a just and reason-

able IRP Rider Rate and recommends that the monthly Rate of \$0.07 per bill be permitted to go into effect on November 1, 2016 and remain in effect until October 31, 2017.

Respectfully submitted,

Michael DeWine
Ohio Attorney General

William L. Wright
Section Chief

/s/ Robert A. Eubanks

Robert A. Eubanks
Thomas G. Lindgren
Assistant Attorney General
Public Utilities Section
30 East Broad Street, 16th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3414
614.466.4397 (telephone)
614.644.8764 (fax)
robert.eubanks@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
thomas.lindgren@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

PROOF OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing **Comments and Recommendations** submitted on behalf of the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio was served via electronic mail upon applicant's counsel, Christopher Allwein (callwein@kelgerbrown.com), this 27th day of September, 2016.

/s/ Robert A. Eubanks

Robert A. Eubanks
Assistant Attorney General

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

9/27/2016 9:35:02 AM

in

Case No(s). 16-1212-GA-RDR

Summary: Comments and Recommendations submitted by Assistant Attorney General Robert Eubanks on behalf of the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio. electronically filed by Kimberly L Keeton on behalf of Public Utilities Commission of Ohio