

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland)	Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO
Electric Illuminating Company, and)	
The Toledo Edison Company for)	
Authority to Provide for a Standard)	
Service Offer Pursuant to R.C.)	
4928.143 in the Form of an Electric)	
Security Plan.)	

**MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER
BY
THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL**

The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel ("OCC") hereby moves the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("PUCO") for a protective order regarding information asserted to be confidential and/or competitively sensitive by Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company (collectively "FirstEnergy" or "the Utilities").¹

As part of discovery in this proceeding, FirstEnergy provided information to OCC, subject to a protective agreement, and FirstEnergy asserts that this information is confidential and/or competitively sensitive under Ohio law. OCC's Rehearing Reply Brief discusses information that is deemed by the Utilities to be subject to the protective agreement.

OCC requests that, in accordance with Ohio Adm. Code. 4901-1-02(E), the PUCO issue such order as is necessary to protect portions of the Rehearing Reply Brief

¹ This Motion is filed pursuant to Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-02(E), 4901-1-12 and 4901-1-24(D).

that contains information that is asserted to be confidential and/or competitively sensitive by FirstEnergy. Subject to OCC's rights under the protective agreement, OCC is filing a portion of the Rehearing Reply Brief under seal.

By filing the instant Motion, OCC does not concede that the information is confidential and/or competitively sensitive. However, OCC acknowledges that it has obtained this information under a protective agreement with FirstEnergy. That protective agreement provides for such information to be treated as confidential and/or competitively sensitive and protected (subject to OCC's right to initiate a process for the PUCO to rule whether the information deserves confidential treatment under Ohio law).

The grounds for this Motion are more fully described in the accompanying Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted,

BRUCE J. WESTON (0016973)
OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

/s/ Maureen R. Willis

Larry S. Sauer, (0039223),
Counsel of Record
Maureen R. Willis (0020847)
William J. Michael (0070921)
Kevin F. Moore (0089228)
Ajay Kumar (0092208)
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485
Telephone [Sauer]: (614) 466-1312
Telephone [Willis]: (614) 466-9567
Telephone [Michael]: (614) 466-1291
Telephone [Moore]: (614) 387-2965
Telephone [Kumar]: (614) 466-1292

larry.sauer@occ.ohio.gov
maureen.willis@occ.ohio.gov
William.michael@occ.ohio.gov
Kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov
Ajay.kumar@occ.ohio.gov

(All attorneys will accept service via email)

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland)	Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO
Electric Illuminating Company, and)	
The Toledo Edison Company for)	
Authority to Provide for a Standard)	
Service Offer Pursuant to R.C.)	
4928.143 in the Form of an Electric)	
Security Plan.)	

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

OCC files this Motion for Protective Order (“Motion”) contemporaneously with the filing of the Rehearing Reply Brief under seal. OCC understands that FirstEnergy considers some of the undisclosed information to be confidential and/or competitively sensitive and deserving of protection under Ohio law. OCC’s understanding is based on claims by FirstEnergy that some of the information (1) derives economic value, actual or potential, from not being known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by others, and (2) is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy. *See* R.C. 1333.61(D).

In filing this Motion, OCC does not concede that any of the information in its Rehearing Reply Brief is trade secret information under R.C. 1333.61(D). Nor does OCC concede that any of the information is deserving of protection from public disclosure under Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-24(D). Under the assertions made by FirstEnergy, at this time, confidential treatment of some of the information contained in the Rehearing Reply Brief could be appropriate, subject to OCC’s rights under its protective agreement with

FirstEnergy to initiate a process to determine whether the information should be protected.

For the foregoing reasons and subject to the foregoing reservations of rights, this Motion should be granted at this time.

Respectfully submitted,

BRUCE J. WESTON (0016973)
OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

/s/ Maureen R. Willis

Larry S. Sauer, (0039223),
Counsel of Record
Maureen R. Willis (0020847)
William J. Michael (0070921)
Kevin F. Moore (0089228)
Ajay Kumar (0092208)
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485
Telephone [Sauer]: (614) 466-1312
Telephone [Willis]: (614) 466-9567
Telephone [Michael]: (614) 466-1291
Telephone [Moore]: (614) 387-2965
Telephone [Kumar]: (614) 466-1292

larry.sauer@occ.ohio.gov

maureen.willis@occ.ohio.gov

William.michael@occ.ohio.gov

Kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov

Ajay.kumar@occ.ohio.gov

(All attorneys will accept service via email)

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Motion for Protective Order* by the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel has been served upon those persons listed below via electronic service this 29th day of August 2016.

/s/ Maureen R. Willis
Maureen R. Willis
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

SERVICE LIST

mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com
kboehm@BKLawfirm.com
jkylercohn@BKLawfirm.com
stnourse@aep.com
mjsatterwhite@aep.com
yalami@aep.com
czdebski@eckertseamans.com
dparram@taftlaw.com
Schmidt@sppgrp.com
ricks@ohanet.org
mkl@smxblaw.com
gas@smxblaw.com
wttplmc@aol.com
lhawrot@spilmanlaw.com
dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com
blanghenry@city.cleveland.oh.us
hmadorsky@city.cleveland.oh.us
kryan@city.cleveland.oh.us
mdortch@kravitzllc.com
rparsons@kravitzllc.com
gkrassen@bricker.com
dstinson@bricker.com
dborchers@bricker.com
DFolk@akronohio.gov
sechler@carpenterlipps.com
gpoulos@enernoc.com
dwolff@crowell.com
rlehfeldt@crowell.com
rkelter@elpc.org
evelyn.robinson@pjm.com

burkj@firstenergycorp.com
cdunn@firstenergycorp.com
jlang@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com
dakutik@jonesday.com
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com
cmooney@ohiopartners.org
callwein@keglerbrown.com
joliker@igsenergy.com
mwhite@igsenergy.com
Bojko@carpenterlipps.com
ghiloni@carpenterlipps.com
barthroyer@aol.com
athompson@taftlaw.com
Christopher.miller@icemiller.com
Gregory.dunn@icemiller.com
Jeremy.grayem@icemiller.com
blanghenry@city.cleveland.oh.us
hmadorsky@city.cleveland.oh.us
kryan@city.cleveland.oh.us
tdougherty@theOEC.org
jfinnigan@edf.org
Marilyn@wflawfirm.com
todonnell@dickinsonwright.com
matt@matthewcoxlaw.com
mfleisher@elpc.org
drinebolt@ohiopartners.org
meissnerjoseph@yahoo.com

mhpetricoff@vorys.com
mjsettineri@vorys.com
glpetrucci@vorys.com
mwarnock@bricker.com

LeslieKovacik@toledo.oh.gov
trhayslaw@gmail.com
Jeffrey.mayes@monitoringanalytics.com
msoules@earthjustice.org
sfisk@earthjustice.org
Thomas.mcnamee@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
Thomas.lindgren@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
Steven.beeler@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

Attorney Examiners:

Gregory.price@puc.state.oh.us
Mandy.willey@puc.state.oh.us
Megan.addison@puc.state.oh.us

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

8/29/2016 4:34:52 PM

in

Case No(s). 14-1297-EL-SSO

Summary: Motion Motion for Protective Order by the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel electronically filed by Ms. Deb J. Bingham on behalf of Willis, Maureen R Mrs.