

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio)	
Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric)	
Illuminating Company, and The Toledo)	
Edison Company for Authority to Provide for)	Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO
a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to)	
R.C. 4928.143 in the Form of an Electric)	
Security Plan.)	

**APPLICATION FOR REHEARING OF
THE RETAIL ENERGY SUPPLY ASSOCIATION**

Pursuant to Section 4903.10, Revised Code, and Rule 4901-1-35, Ohio Administrative Code, the Retail Energy Supply Association (“RESA”)¹ hereby files this Application for Rehearing from the May 25, 2016 Finding and Order issued by the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Commission”) in this matter.

RESA files this application for rehearing because the May 25, 2016 Finding and Order is unreasonable and unlawful in the following respect:

1. The Commission erred in adopting the Companies’ proposed Rider ELR tariff because such tariff contains a previously-undisclosed limitation requiring shopping customers to use consolidated billing, when such limitation is inconsistent with the Commission’s March 31, 2016 Opinion and Order, lacks support in the record and unduly discriminates against customers using dual billing.

¹ The comments expressed in this filing represent the position of RESA as an organization but may not represent the views of any particular member of the Association. Founded in 1990, RESA is a broad and diverse group of more than twenty retail energy suppliers dedicated to promoting efficient, sustainable and customer-oriented competitive retail energy markets. RESA members operate throughout the United States delivering value-added electricity and natural gas service at retail to residential, commercial and industrial energy customers. More information on RESA can be found at www.resausa.org.

The facts and arguments that support this ground for rehearing are set forth in the attached Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Michael J. Settineri

Michael Settineri (0073369), Counsel of Record

Gretchen L. Petrucci (0046608)

Ilya Batikov (0087968)

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 E. Gay Street

Columbus, Ohio 43215

614-464-5414

mjsettineri@vorys.com

glpetrucci@vorys.com

ibatikov@vorys.com

Attorneys for the Retail Energy Supply Association

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

RESA seeks rehearing of the May 25, 2016 Finding and Order to address the inclusion of a limitation in the Rider ELR tariffs requiring shopping customers to use consolidated billing.

The limitation in question provides:

This Economic Load Response Program Rider ("Program") is available to customers taking service from the Company at primary voltages or higher voltages provided that all of the following seven conditions are met at the time of initiation of service to the customer under this Rider and on a continuing basis thereafter: * *

* (iv) **the customer is taking generation service from the Company or a Competitive Retail Electric Service ("CRES") provider using consolidated billing; * * *.**²

This limitation should be stricken because it is inconsistent with the Commission's March 31, 2016 Opinion and Order ("Opinion and Order") and was not presented to the Commission in the Stipulation³ or other materials of record in this proceeding. Additionally, this limitation raises questions of undue discrimination against shopping customers who choose to participate in dual billing. For these reasons, the Commission should grant rehearing and strike this limitation from the Rider ELR tariffs submitted by the Companies.

To RESA's knowledge, the limitation in the Rider ELR tariffs requiring shopping customers to use consolidated billing first appeared in the Companies' May 13, 2016 tariff filings. This limitation did not appear in the Stipulation, which instead clearly provided that there was no specific restriction relating to participation by shopping customers in Rider ELR:⁴

Rider ELR will be available to shopping and non-shopping customers. The Companies will remove from Rider ELR the eligibility requirement that "the customer is taking generation service from the Company."

² See March 13, 2016 tariff filings by Companies (copy of Rider ELR tariff as redlined by Companies attached).

³ Unless otherwise noted, "Stipulation" refers, collectively, to the Companies' Stipulation filed on January 21, 2015, Supplemental Stipulation filed on May 28, 2015, Second Supplemental Stipulation filed on June 4, 2015, and Third Supplemental Stipulation filed on December 1, 2015.

⁴ January 21, 2015 Stipulation at 8.

The limitation, to RESA's knowledge, also was not included in the Companies' supporting testimony or in other of the Commission's materials of record in this proceeding. Likewise, the Commission did not acknowledge any such limitation in its Opinion and Order. Therefore, the Commission could not find the Rider ELR tariffs as being in compliance with the Commission's March 31 Opinion and Order, and without record support, the Commission could not approve this limitation. *See In re Comm'n Review of the Capacity Charges of Ohio Power Co.*, 2016-Ohio-1607, ¶ 53 ("The commission abuses its discretion if it decides an issue without record support."); *Ideal Trans. Co. v. Pub. Util. Comm.*, 42 Ohio St. 2d 195 at syllabus 2 (1975) ("The Public Utilities Commission must base its decision in each case upon the record before it."); R.C. 4903.09 (prohibiting Commission rulings that are not based on the record).

The Commission, however, approved the limitation through its May 25 Finding and Order. That approval is unreasonable and unlawful because the consolidated billing limitation in the Rider ELR tariffs directly contradicts the Commission's March 31, 2016 Opinion and Order, which directs the Companies to "[file] tariffs consistent with this Order."⁵ Dividing the class of shopping customers eligible for Rider ELR based on their participation in consolidated billing is inconsistent with the Opinion and Order, which approves of Rider ELR in part because it "remo[ves] the prohibition on shopping in order to allow all customers to participate on the Rider."⁶ The Rider ELR tariffs as currently written do not allow all shopping customers to participate, in direct contradiction to the Commission's Opinion and Order.

Also, limiting participation by shopping customers in Rider ELR to only those using consolidated billing is discriminatory. *See* R.C. 4905.35 (prohibiting a public utility from subjecting a person to any undue or unreasonable prejudice or disadvantage). There are many

⁵ Opinion and order at 99 (emphasis added).

⁶ *Id.* at 72 (emphasis added).

reasons why shopping customers, especially customers of the size that will be under the Rider ELR tariff, elect dual billing. Benefits include aggregating multiple sites or accounts on one invoice or other customer specific information that the customer asks the CRES provider to include on the bills.

There are also situations where dual billing is the only option for a shopping customer. That may be because the supplier does not offer consolidated billing, or when, the Companies' billing systems are unable to calculate a CRES providers' charges using the pricing format being used by the CRES provider.⁷ The Rider ELR tariffs, would prevent those shopping customers and other shopping customers using dual billing (or that in the future would like to switch to a supplier offering dual billing) from participating in Rider ELR, and could also limit a customer's ability to select the supplier of its choice depending on the interaction of the Companies' billing systems and the supplier's pricing format. That is discriminatory, and the Commission's approval of the Rider ELR tariffs containing discriminatory provisions is unreasonable and unlawful.

In response to RESA's arguments, the Companies will likely point to the tariffs' minimum bill requirement language as the reason why consolidated billing is necessary. RESA recognizes that each Rider ELR tariff contains a minimum bill amount that each customer participating in Rider ELR must pay. Prior to the expansion of the tariffs to shopping customers, all charges were on the customer's bill and that bill could be reviewed to enforce the minimum payment requirement. With the expansion, each Rider ELR tariff was revised as follows:⁸

⁷ See e.g. Ohio Edison Company Rules and Regulations Sheet 1, 1st Revised Page 22 of 49 (attached as Exhibit A).

⁸ See March 13, 2016 tariff filings by Companies (copy of Rider ELR tariff as redlined by Companies attached as Exhibit B).

Minimum Bill:

The application of the Program Credit shall not produce a total monthly bill for any customer, after including the effects of all rate schedules, ~~and~~ riders, and if applicable, the CRES consolidated billing, that results in an average price per kWh less than two (2) cents per kWh.

As the revision shows, the Companies wish to continue having all charges on one bill, and made the unilateral decision that the solution was to limit Rider ELR participation to only shopping customers that use consolidated billing. But the minimum bill requirement does not validate the Companies' unilateral decision to impose this new limitation on Rider ELR. First, although the Companies could have easily done so, they failed to include this limitation as part of the package of revisions to Rider ELR presented in the Stipulation. Had that been the case, the limitation could have been addressed by the parties, properly considered by the Commission, and accordingly reflected in the Commission's Opinion and Order. Instead, the Stipulation made Rider ELR available to shopping and non-shopping customers alike without regard to billing arrangements, and the Opinion and Order reflected that fact.

Moreover, the minimum bill requirement does not, in fact, impede the participation of shopping customers with dual billing arrangements. The Companies can just as easily require shopping customers to provide copies of their CRES invoices (read off the same meter cycle) to the Companies or alternatively, work with CRES providers to ensure the Companies receive a copy of the customer's bill when the CRES provider issues the bill to the customer. With only a few customers able to participate in Rider ELR, these alternatives are manageable and will ensure that all shopping customers eligible for Rider ELR retain the ability and choice to elect consolidated billing or dual billing as well as the supplier of their choice.

For all of the these reasons, the Commission should grant rehearing on its May 25, 2016

Finding and Order and strike the limitation in the Rider ELR tariff requiring shopping customers to use consolidated billing.

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Michael J. Settineri

Michael Settineri (0073369), Counsel of Record

Gretchen L. Petrucci (0046608)

Ilya Batikov (0087968)

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 E. Gay Street

Columbus, Ohio 43215

614-464-5414

mjsettineri@vorys.com

glpetrucci@vorys.com

ibatikov@vorys.com

Attorneys for the Retail Energy Supply Association

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document on the parties referenced in the service list of the docket card who have electronically subscribed to this case. In addition, the undersigned certifies that a courtesy copy of the foregoing document is also being served upon the persons below via electronic mail this 24th day of June, 2016.

s/ Michael J. Settineri
Michael J. Settineri

burkj@firstenergycorp.com
cdunn@firstenergycorp.com
jiang@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com
dakutik@jonesday.com
cmooney@ohiopartners.org
drinebolt@ohiopartners.org
tdoughtery@theoec.org
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com
mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com
kboehm@BKLlawfirm.com
jkylercohn@BKLlawfirm.com
larry.sauer@occ.ohio.gov
Maureen.willis@occ.ohio.gov
joliker@igsenergy.com
schmidt@sppgrp.com
ricks@ohanet.org
stnourse@aep.com
mjsatterwhite@aep.com
yalami@aep.com
wtpmlc@aol.com
mkl@smxblaw.com
gas@smxblaw.com
lhawrot@spilmanlaw.com
sdismukes@eckertseamans.com
campbell@whitt-sturtevant.com
glover@whitt-sturtevant.com

dclearfield@eckertseamans.com
sstoner@eckertseamans.com
dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com
meissnerjoseph@yahoo.com
trhayslaw@gmail.com
lesliekovacik@toledo.oh.gov
cynthia.brady@exeloncorp.com
david.fein@exeloncorp.com
lael.campbell@exeloncorp.com
christopher.miller@icemiller.com
gregory.dunn@icemiller.com
jeremy.grayem@icemiller.com
BarthRoyer@aol.com
athompson@taftlaw.com
Marilyn@wflawfirm.com
blanghenry@city.cleveland.oh.us
hmadorsky@city.cleveland.oh.us
kryan@city.cleveland.oh.us
bojko@carpenterlipps.com
gkrassen@bricker.com
dstinson@bricker.com
dborchers@bricker.com
mfleisher@elpc.org
kfield@elpc.org
matt@matthewcoxlaw.com
todonnell@dickinsonwright.com
jeffrey.mayes@monitoringanalytics.com
twilliams@snhsllaw.com
sechler@carpenterlipps.com

gpoulos@enernoc.com
mjsettineri@vorys.com
glpetrucci@vorys.com
thomas.mcnamee@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
thomas.lindgren@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
sfisk@earthjustice.org
msoules@earthjustice.org
tony.mendoza@sierraclub.org
laurac@chappelleconsulting.net
gthomas@gtpowergroup.com
stheodore@epsa.org
mdortch@kravitzllc.com
rparsons@kravitzllc.com
dparram@taftlaw.com
charris@spilmanlaw.com
dwolff@crowell.com
rlehfeldt@crowell.com
dfolk@akronohio.gov
Kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov
William.michael@oc.ohio.gov
rsahli@columbus.rr.com
ajay.kumar@occ.ohio.gov
callwein@keglerbrown.com
ghiloni@carpenterlipps.com
kristin.henry@sierraclub.org
rkelter@elpc.org
mwarnock@bricker.com
whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com

RULES AND REGULATIONS**X. BILLING SERVICES AND OBLIGATIONS****A. Customer Billing by the Company**

All Certified Supplier charges to Customers, if billed by the Company, shall be billed in accordance with the Electric Service Regulations and individual service tariffs and the following provisions:

B. Company Billing for Certified Supplier

Nothing in this Tariff shall require the Company to manually bill more Customers within a rate class than it bills manually for its distribution service Customers. Within this context, if the Company's billing system has the capability to bill the price plans offered by the Certified Supplier, the Certified Supplier may request the Company to do all or some of the billing for the Certified Supplier's Customers based on the Customers' preferences. Pricing must be compatible with existing metering.

In those situations where the Company's billing system is unable to calculate the Certified Supplier charges under the pricing format being used by the Certified Supplier, the Company will provide the Certified Supplier with sufficient meter data on a timely basis so that the Certified Supplier can bill the Customer directly under the two-bill method. The Company billing for Certified Suppliers will be done through a Rate Ready method only. Under the Rate Ready method, the Company bills the Customer under a rate schedule provided by the Certified Supplier.

In situations where the Certified Supplier elects to bill the customer directly using the Company's billing system, the Certified Supplier will deliver to the Company needed data to conduct this billing option. Under this billing option, the Certified Supplier shall provide all necessary data in its possession for the timely generation of bills. A failure of the Certified Supplier to provide necessary data to the Company in a timely fashion may delay production of a bill for the month to which the data pertains. In such instances, the Certified Supplier is responsible for all fines, penalties and all other liabilities and losses, if any, arising as a consequence of the Company's inability to render a timely bill.

C. Billing Files

Where the Certified Supplier has requested the Company to act as the Certified Supplier's billing agent, the Company shall electronically transmit files of billing detail daily to the Certified Supplier. Such files shall include the Customer account number, rate codes, usage information, demand and energy charges, sales tax, and other Certified Supplier charges.

D. Certified Supplier Logos

As set forth in the Commission Order in Case No. 12-3151-EL-COI, if a Certified Supplier has requested the Company to act as the Certified Supplier's billing agent and issue a consolidated bill, the Company must allow for the inclusion of Certified Supplier logos on the bill. Certified Suppliers electing to have the Company include their logo on the Company issued consolidated bill shall comply with the applicable process and procedures as provided on the Company website.

RIDER ELR
Economic Load Response Program Rider**APPLICABILITY:**

This Economic Load Response Program Rider ("Program") is available to customers taking service from the Company at primary voltages or higher voltages provided that all of the following seven conditions are met at the time of initiation of service to the customer under this Rider and on a continuing basis thereafter: (i) the customer took service under ~~an interruptible contract with the Company as of February 4, 2008~~ the Program as of May 31, 2016 or the customer was historically eligible for Rider ELR and provided written notice of intent to participate in the Program on or before May 31, 2015 for up to an additional 136,250 kW of Curtailable Load effective on or after June 1, 2016; (ii) the customer can successfully demonstrate to the Company that it can reduce its measured load to a pre-established contract Firm Load (as defined under Other Provisions, paragraph A., below) within two hours of notification provided by the Company without the need of a generator (A customer may intend to use a generator to reduce its usage to below its Firm Load, but if the generator does not operate, the customer must still reduce its usage to or below its Firm Load. Failure of a customer to reduce its usage to or below its Firm Load shall result in the consequences listed in the Emergency Curtailment Event Section herein.); (iii) the customer executes the Company's standard Program contract; (iv) the customer is taking generation service from the Company or a Competitive Retail Electric Service ("CRES") provider using consolidated billing; (v) the customer is not participating in any other load curtailment or demand response program, including without limitation a demand response program offered by PJM Interconnection, L.L.C. ("PJM") or any other independent system operator; (vi) the customer commits its demand response capability to Company for integration into Company's R.C. § 4928.66 compliance programs; and, (vii) the Commission finds that the demand response capabilities of customers electing service under this rider shall count towards the Company's compliance with the peak demand reduction benchmarks set forth in R.C. § 4928.66 as applied by the Commission's applicable rules and regulations and shall be considered incremental to interruptible load on the Company's system that existed in 2008. Nothing herein shall preclude a customer from requesting and receiving an exemption from any mechanism designed to recover the cost of energy efficiency and peak demand reduction programs to the extent the exemption is requested to reasonably encourage the commitment of customer-sited capabilities to the Company.

RATES:

In addition to any other charges under any other rate schedules applicable to customer's service, customers participating in the Program shall also pay the charges and receive the credit set forth below:

Charges:

Program Administrative Charge: \$150.00 per month

~~EBT Charge:~~

~~During an Economic Buy Through Option Event (as defined under Other Provisions, paragraph E., below), the portion of the customer's actual measured load that exceeds its pre-established contract Firm Load for any and all hours during such event shall be assessed an EBT Charge, which is calculated for each hour of the event as follows:~~

~~$$\text{EBT Charge} = (\text{AL} \times \text{MPD}) \times (1 + \text{LAF}) \times \{[1/(1 - \text{CAT})]\}$$~~

Filed pursuant to Orders dated August 25, 2010, July 18, 2012, ~~and~~ February 25, 2015 and March 31, 2016 in Case Nos.

10-388-EL-SSO, 12-1230-EL-SSO, ~~and~~ 14-2037-EL-ATA and 14-1297-EL-SSO, respectively, before

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

Issued by: Steven E. Strah, President

Effective: June 1, ~~2015~~ 2016

RIDER ELR
Economic Load Response Program Rider

Where:

~~AL = the customer's actual hourly load during an Economic Buy Through Option Event that exceeds the customer's pre-established contract Firm Load.~~

~~MPD = the market price differential, which shall be calculated by subtracting the applicable charges set forth in the Generation Service Rider (GEN) from the PJM LMP for the period in which the Economic Buy Through Option Event occurred for each hour that results in a MPD greater than zero.~~

~~PJM LMP is the final Day Ahead Locational Marginal Price as defined and specified by PJM at the appropriate pricing node during the applicable hour(s).~~

~~CAT = the Commercial Activity Tax rate as established in Section 5751.03 of the Ohio Revised Code.~~

~~LAF = Loss Adjustment Factor
3.0% for primary voltages
0.1% for subtransmission voltages
0.0% for transmission voltages~~

ECE Charge:

During an Emergency Curtailment Event (as defined under Other Provisions, paragraph D., below), the portion of the customer's actual measured load that exceeds its pre-established contract Firm Load for any and all hours during such event shall be assessed an ECE Charge which is calculated for each hour of the event as follows. Revenue collected by the Company as a result of any ECE Charge less amounts associated with the Commercial Activity Tax ("CAT") (as defined ~~above~~below) shall be credited towards costs to be collected through the DSE1 charge of Rider DSE:

$$\text{ECE Charge} = (\text{AL} \times \text{PJM LMP} \times 300\%) \times (1 + \text{LAF}) \times ([1/(1-\text{CAT})])$$

Where:

AL = the customer's actual hourly load during an Emergency Curtailment Event that exceeds the customer's pre-established contract Firm Load.

PJM LMP = the final Real-Time Locational Marginal Price as defined and specified by PJM at the appropriate pricing node during the applicable hour(s).

CAT = the Commercial Activity Tax rate as established in Section 5751.03 of the Ohio Revised Code.

LAF = Loss Adjustment Factor
3.0% for primary voltages
0.1% for subtransmission voltages
0.0% for transmission voltages

RIDER ELR
Economic Load Response Program Rider

Program Credit ("PC"):

Customers taking service under this Rider shall receive a monthly Program Credit which shall be calculated as follows:

$$PC = CL \times (\$5.00) / kW/month$$

Where:

CL is the Curtailable Load, which shall be calculated by the Company for each customer by subtracting the customer's contract Firm Load from its monthly highest thirty (30) minute integrated kW load occurring during the non-holiday weekday hours of 11 a.m. to 5 p.m. Eastern Standard Time (equivalent to noon to 6 p.m. EDT). In no circumstance can the CL be negative nor can the CL be in excess of a contract amount determined based upon the customers 12 month history as of February 1, 2008. Holidays are defined as New Year's Day, Memorial Day, Independence Day, Labor Day, Thanksgiving Day and Christmas Day.

RIDER ELR
Economic Load Response Program Rider

Minimum Bill:

The application of the Program Credit shall not produce a total monthly bill for any customer, after including the effects of all rate schedules, ~~and riders~~, and if applicable, the CRES consolidated billing, that results in an average price per kWh less than two (2) cents per kWh.

OTHER PROVISIONS:**A. Firm Load**

For purposes of this Rider, "Firm Load" shall be that portion of a customer's electric load that is not subject to curtailment. A customer may request a reduction to its contract Firm Load no more than once in any twelve month period. The Firm Load may be reduced to the extent that such reduction is consistent with other terms and conditions set forth in this Rider. Any such change in Firm Load shall be applied beginning with the customer's January bill immediately following the year in which the change has been approved by the Company, provided that advance written request is provided to the Company no less than thirty (30) days prior to the effective billing month of the change. The Company may increase the Firm Load at any time if the Company, at its sole discretion, determines the Firm Load is at a level that the customer fails to demonstrate that they can reach. The Company shall promptly notify the customer of any such change.

B. Load Response Program Contract

Customers taking service under this optional Rider shall execute the Company's standard Program contract which, among other things, will establish the Customer's Firm Load and commit the Customer's demand response capability to Company for purposes of Company's compliance with the peak demand reduction benchmarks set forth in R.C. § 4928.66 as applied by the Commission's applicable rules and regulations.

C. Metering

The customer must arrange for interval metering consistent with the Company's Miscellaneous Charges, Tariff Sheet 75.

RIDER ELR
Economic Load Response Program Rider

D. Emergency Curtailment Event

Upon advance notification provided by the Company, a customer taking service under this Rider must curtail all load above its Firm Load during an Emergency Curtailment Event consistent with the Company's instructions. For purposes of this Rider, an Emergency Curtailment Event shall be one in which the Company, a regional transmission organization and/or a transmission operator determines, in its respective sole discretion, that an emergency situation exists that may jeopardize the integrity of either the distribution or transmission system in the area. PJM, which is the regional transmission organization of which the Company is a member, may also initiate an Emergency Curtailment Event upon their sole determination that a pre-emergency situation exists.

If an Emergency Curtailment Event is requested solely by the Company or a transmission operator, a customer will be given no less two hours advance notification to curtail all load above its Firm Load during the Emergency Curtailment Event. An Emergency Curtailment Event requested solely by the Company or a transmission operator may occur anytime during the year with no restrictions on the number of events or the duration of an event.

If the Emergency Curtailment Event is requested by PJM, a customer will be notified by the Company of the start time of the Emergency Curtailment Event as determined by PJM. The start time of the Emergency Curtailment Event will be approximately thirty (30) minutes from the time the Company receives notification from PJM of the Emergency Curtailment Event. However, PJM at its sole discretion may grant a customer an exception to the thirty (30) minute advance notification time of either sixty (60) minutes or one hundred and twenty (120) minutes based on the customer's physical capability to provide load reduction. A customer wishing to seek such exception must submit to the Company a completed request form that the Company will then submit to PJM. If PJM approves the customer request for an exception for sixty (60) minutes, then the start time of any PJM-called Emergency Curtailment Events for that customer will be approximately sixty (60) minutes from the time the Company receives notification from PJM of the Emergency Curtailment Event. If PJM approves the customer request for an exception for one hundred and twenty (120) minutes, then the start time of any PJM-called Emergency Curtailment Events for that customer will be approximately one hundred and twenty (120) minutes from the time the Company receives notification from PJM of the Emergency Curtailment Event. The maximum duration that load must be curtailed when an Emergency Curtailment Event is called by PJM will be six (6) hours and shall be limited to ten events per planning year as defined by PJM and will only occur between 12:00 PM (Noon) to 8:00 PM (Eastern Prevailing Time) for the months of ~~May~~^{June} through September on weekdays other than PJM Holidays.

RIDER ELR
Economic Load Response Program Rider

During the entire period of an Emergency Curtailment Event, the customer's actual measured load must remain at or below its Firm Load with such load being measured every clock half hour. A customer's actual measured load shall be determined using the greater of the customer's highest lagging kVA or highest kW during the Emergency Curtailment Event.

If at any time during the Emergency Curtailment Event a customer's actual measured load exceeds its contract Firm Load, the Company may disconnect the customer from the transmission system for the duration of the Emergency Curtailment Event, at the customer's expense. The Company shall not be liable for any direct or indirect costs, losses, expenses, or other damages, special or otherwise, including, without limitation, lost profits that arise from such disconnection.

If at any time during the Emergency Curtailment Event a customer's actual measured load exceeds 110% of its Firm Load, the customer shall be subject to all four (4) of the following: (i) forfeit its Program Credit for the month in which the Emergency Curtailment Event occurred; (ii) pay the ECE Charge set forth in the Rates section of this Rider; (iii) pay the sum of all Program Credits received by the customer under the Program during the immediately preceding twelve billing months which shall include credits from this Rider and the Economic Development Rider; and (iv) the Company's right, at its sole discretion, to remove the customer from the Program for a minimum of 12 months.

If at any time during the Emergency Curtailment Event a customer's actual measured load is greater than 100% and less than or equal to 110% of its Firm Load during the Emergency Curtailment Event, the customer shall forfeit its Program Credit for the month in which the Emergency Curtailment Event occurred and shall pay the ECE Charge set forth in the Rates section of this Rider.

In no event shall the penalties for non-performance listed above be less than PJM's non-performance penalties plus ECE charge for a non-performing customer during the Emergency Curtailment Event.

In a calendar year when an Emergency Curtailment Event has not been requested of customers by PJM on this Rider between June 1 and ~~August 15~~September 7, the Company shall simultaneously interrupt all customers on this Rider by September 30 in order to meet the Company's PJM test obligations for Load Management Resources. The duration of this test will be one hour. The Company will schedule the test and Customers shall receive advance notification of the test. All provisions of this Rider shall apply to this test.

In the event of any conflict between the terms and conditions set forth in this Rider and other service reliability requirements and/or obligations of the Company, the latter shall prevail.

E. ~~Economic Buy Through Option Event~~

~~Upon no less than a 90 minute advance notification provided to the customer, the Company shall call an Economic Buy Through Option Event ("EBT") when a "Market Premium Condition" exists. A Market Premium Condition is defined as a point in time that the PJM LMP exceeds the product of 1.5 times the wholesale price resulting from the Company's competitive bid process held for generation service commencing on June 1, 2011 and updated anytime there is a price change in generation service. The number of hours of EBT cannot exceed 10% of the hours in any twelve month period beginning in June of each calendar year.~~

RIDER ELR
Economic Load Response Program Rider**E. Notification**

~~Customers served under this Rider shall be provided notification of Economic Buy Through Option Events by the Company. Customers shall be provided clock times of the beginning and ending of the Economic Buy Through Option Events.~~ Emergency Curtailment Event notifications called by PJM will be stated such that customers must curtail their actual measured load to Firm Load prior to the start time of the Emergency Curtailment Event set forth in the PJM notification to the Company. Emergency Curtailment Event notifications called for either by the Company or a transmission operator will be stated such that customers must curtail actual measured load to Firm Load within two hours of the time the Company sends such notification to the customer. The Company will provide customers a notification of when Emergency Curtailment Events have ended. Receipt of notifications set out in this paragraph shall be the sole responsibility of the customer.

Notification of an ~~Economic Buy Through Option Event and~~ Emergency Curtailment Event consists of an electronic message issued by the Company to a device or devices such as telephone, facsimile, pager or email, selected and provided by the customer and approved by the Company. Two-way information capability shall be incorporated by the Company and the customer in order to provide confirmation of receipt of notification messages. Operation, maintenance and functionality of such communication devices selected by the customer shall be the sole responsibility of the customer.

F. Term

This Rider shall become effective for service rendered beginning June 1, ~~2014~~²⁰¹⁶, and shall expire with service rendered through May 31, ~~2016~~²⁰²⁴.

A customer may terminate its participation in the Program ~~upon no less than thirty six (36) months advance consistent with other terms and conditions to be effective June 1st, so long as the customer provides~~ written notice to the Company ~~no less than 38 months prior to the requested June 1st date upon which the requested termination would become effective~~. Except as otherwise provided in this Rider, a qualifying customer may return to the Program after a hiatus from the Program of at least one (1) year on the first day of the customer's billing cycle upon at least thirty days prior written notice of the customer's intent to return.

G. Conditions

Payment by the customer of all charges herein is a condition of service under this Economic Load Response Program Rider.

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

6/24/2016 5:07:20 PM

in

Case No(s). 14-1297-EL-SSO

Summary: Application for Rehearing electronically filed by Mr. Michael J. Settineri on behalf of Retail Energy Supply Association