

BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for an Increase in its Electric Distribution Rates	:	Case No. 15-1830-EL-AIR
	:	
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Accounting Authority	:	Case No. 15-1831-EL-AAM
	:	
In the Matter of the Application of Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Revised Tariffs	:	Case No. 15-1832-EL-ATA
	:	
and		
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Its Electric Security Plan	:	Case No. 16-0395-EL-SSO
	:	
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Revised Tariffs	:	Case No. 16-0396-EL-ATA
	:	
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code § 4905.13	:	Case No. 16-0397-EL-AAM
	:	

**MOTION OF APPLICANT THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY
FOR CASE MANAGEMENT ORDER TO ESTABLISH
DEADLINES AND TO COORDINATE CASES**

Applicant The Dayton Power and Light Company ("DP&L") has filed both a distribution rate case and an Electric Security Plan case. To set deadlines and coordinate the

schedules in these two large cases, DP&L moves for an order (1) adopting its proposed schedule, attached as Exhibit 1; and (2) that (a) provides that the ESP case be tried first, and the distribution rate case be tried immediately thereafter, with post-hearing briefing occurring after the completion of both cases; (b) requires Intervenors to file their direct testimony in the ESP case four weeks before the ESP hearing starts; and (c) sets a discovery deadline for Intervenors to complete written discovery at least five weeks before the first hearing starts.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Charles J. Faruki

Charles J. Faruki (0010417)

(Counsel of Record)

D. Jeffrey Ireland (0010443)

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)

FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L.

110 North Main Street, Suite 1600

Dayton, OH 45402

Telephone: (937) 227-3705

Telecopier: (937) 227-3717

Email: cfaruki@ficlaw.com

djireland@ficlaw.com

jsharkey@ficlaw.com

As to Distribution Rate Case,
Nos. 15-1830-EL-AIR, 15-1831-EL-AAM,
and 15-1832-EL-ATA:

/s/ Michael J. Schuler

Michael J. Schuler (0082390)

THE DAYTON POWER AND

LIGHT COMPANY

1065 Woodman Drive

Dayton, OH 45432

Telephone: (937) 259-7358

Telecopier: (937) 259-7178

Email: michael.schuler@aes.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power and
Light Company

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION OF APPLICANT
THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY FOR CASE MANAGEMENT
ORDER TO ESTABLISH DEADLINES AND TO COORDINATE CASES**

With two large cases pending, 2016 will present significant challenges for the Staff of the Commission, DP&L, and the Intervenors in DP&L's cases. DP&L is filing this motion to facilitate coordination of the cases now, so that the Commission, the Intervenors and DP&L can work together to address the inevitable scheduling, discovery and logistical difficulties. DP&L's plan allows all parties to have ample notice and an opportunity for discovery and the filing of testimony before the two hearings in 2016. Absent early coordination, DP&L will not be able to put new rates in place on January 1, 2017, which will be necessary to maintain the financial integrity of DP&L and to ensure the ongoing reliability of generation service in this state.

The Commission should grant this motion for the following separate and independent reasons:

1. **Coordination of Case Schedules:** In addition to the distribution rate case, DP&L filed an ESP case in late February, which is also a large case. As shown by the Company's proof in the distribution rate case, DP&L needs rate relief to maintain its financial integrity, and DP&L needs the rates to go into effect on January 1, 2017. As shown by the Company's proof in the ESP case, the Commission should approve a Reliable Electricity Rider to ensure that reliable and reasonably-priced generation is available in Ohio, and the rider also needs to go into effect by January 1, 2017. The purpose of this motion is to ask the Commission to set deadlines to coordinate those cases.

Specifically, the best course is to try the ESP case first and to try the distribution rate case immediately after the hearing in the ESP case is completed. DP&L asks that all testimony be filed in both cases and that all discovery be completed in both cases before the hearing in the distribution rate case starts. So that the parties do not have to engage in briefing the ESP case while the distribution rate case is being tried, post-hearing briefing in both cases would start after the hearing in the distribution rate case was concluded. (The transcript for the ESP hearing would become available during the distribution rate case hearing.)

DP&L's proposed schedule (attached as Exhibit 1) is reasonable, for several reasons:

First, as the record will show in both cases, DP&L needs new rates from the cases to go into effect no later than January 1, 2017. DP&L asks the Commission to conduct the hearings in both cases to allow a decision in both cases before the end of 2016. It would be difficult or impossible for the Commission to decide both cases before the end of 2016 if there were a substantial delay between the two hearings.

Second, it would be very difficult for the parties to be filing testimony and conducting depositions in one case while another case is pending. To the extent possible, that work should be completed before the hearing in the ESP case begins.

Third, DP&L's request will not increase the workload for the Intervenors -- they will simply need to conduct discovery and prepare their testimony earlier than they might otherwise.

2. **Intervenor Testimony Deadline:** The Commission has sometimes required Intervenors to file their direct testimony only two weeks before a hearing. Although that schedule may be reasonable for smaller cases, it creates significant logistical problems in larger cases in which numerous pieces of utility and intervenor testimony are filed.

A utility cannot meaningfully conduct depositions of intervenor witnesses until after the intervenor testimony is filed. In the past, DP&L has sent interrogatories asking Intervenors to identify their witnesses and the topics of their testimony, but the answers that DP&L has consistently received are that a final decision will not be made until the deadline to submit testimony. When a large number of intervenor witness testimony is filed only two weeks before the hearing, counsel for the utility needs to conduct a large number of depositions in a short two-week time span. Further, the intervenor testimony frequently raises complex issues, which makes preparing for and conducting the depositions in a two-week span very difficult.

For example, in DP&L's most recent ESP case, Intervenors filed 26 pieces of testimony only two weeks before the hearing. Counsel for DP&L deposed those witnesses in the two weeks before the hearing, or after the hearing began. Such a compressed schedule is unreasonable and prejudicial to DP&L, as it made it substantially more difficult for counsel for DP&L to meet with their client and witnesses.

A deadline to file Intervenors' testimony in the ESP case four weeks before the hearing is reasonable because:

1. It would allow for a more orderly deposition schedule.
2. It would allow a reasonable time for utility counsel to obtain and review deposition transcripts, and prepare cross-examination questions.

3. Utility counsel should have a meaningful opportunity to meet with their client in the weeks immediately preceding hearing and during the hearing, which is very difficult if counsel is required to take numerous depositions in a two-week period and to prepare cross-examination questions during evenings and weekends.
4. The compressed time necessary to prepare for and conduct those depositions makes it difficult for DP&L's counsel to engage in pre-trial settlement discussions. The rush to complete discovery and the time necessary to do so prejudices the settlement process.
5. Intervenors would not be prejudiced by that deadline, as they will need to file their testimony earlier, but will have plenty of notice.

The Commission should thus require Intervenors to file their direct testimony in the ESP case at least four weeks before the distribution rate case hearing.

3. **Discovery Deadline:** The Commission should also establish a deadline, at least five weeks before the ESP case hearing for Intervenors to complete discovery in both cases. Responding to discovery requests is always very time consuming and burdensome in large Commission cases, and the time close to hearing should be used to prepare for the hearing and to depose Intervenor witnesses, not to respond to written discovery requests. Intervenors would not be prejudiced by this request; they would simply need to serve their discovery requests earlier.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Charles J. Faruki

Charles J. Faruki (0010417)

(Counsel of Record)

D. Jeffrey Ireland (0010443)

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)

FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L.

110 North Main Street, Suite 1600

Dayton, OH 45402

Telephone: (937) 227-3700

Telecopier: (937) 227-3717

Email: cfaruki@ficlaw.com

djireland@ficlaw.com

jsharkey@ficlaw.com

As to Distribution Rate Case,
Nos. 15-1830-EL-AIR, 15-1831-EL-AAM,
and 15-1832-EL-ATA:

/s/ Michael J. Schuler

Michael J. Schuler (0082390)

THE DAYTON POWER AND

LIGHT COMPANY

1065 Woodman Drive

Dayton, OH 45432

Telephone: (937) 259-7358

Telecopier: (937) 259-7178

Email: michael.schuler@aes.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power and
Light Company

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of the foregoing Motion of Applicant The Dayton Power and Light Company for Case Management Order to Establish Deadlines and to Coordinate Cases has been served via electronic mail upon the following counsel of record, this 15th day of April, 2016:

Thomas McNamee
Natalia Messenger
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 East Broad Street, 12th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: Thomas.McNamee@puc.state.ohio.us
Natalia.Messenger@puc.state.ohio.us

Joel E. Sechler
Danielle M. Ghiloni
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP
280 North High Street, Suite 1300
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: Sechler@carpenterlipps.com
Ghiloni@carpenterlipps.com

Attorneys for PUCO Staff

Attorneys for The Kroger Company

Jodi Bair (Counsel of Record)
Ajay Kumar
Christopher Healey
Assistant Consumers' Counsel
Office of The Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215-3485
Email: Jodi.bair@occ.ohio.gov
Ajay.kumar@occ.ohio.gov
Christopher.healey@occ.ohio.gov

David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Kurt J. Boehm
Jody Kyler Cohn
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
Email: dboehm@BKLawfirm.com
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com
kboehm@BKLawfirm.com
jkylercohn@BKLawfirm.com

Attorneys for the Office of the
Ohio Consumers' Counsel

Attorneys for Ohio Energy Group

Frank P. Darr (Counsel of Record)
Matthew R. Pritchard
McNees Wallace & Nurick
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

Kimberly W. Bojko (Counsel of Record)
Ryan P. O'Rourke
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP
280 North High Street, Suite 1300
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: Bojko@carpenterlipps.com
O'Rourke@carpenterlipps.com

Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users - Ohio

Attorneys for The Ohio Manufacturers'
Association Energy Group

Madeline Fleisher
Environmental Law & Policy Center
21 West Broad Street, Suite 500
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: mfleisher@elpc.org

Justin Vickers (Staff Attorney)
Environmental Law & Policy Center
55 East Wacker Drive, Suite 1600
Chicago, IL 60601
Email: jvickers@elpc.org

Attorneys for the Environmental Law &
Policy Center

Steven D. Lesser
James F. Lang
N. Trevor Alexander
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP
41 South High Street
1200 Huntington Center
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: slesser@calfee.com
jlang@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com

Attorneys for Honda America Mfg., Inc. and
The City of Dayton

Kurt P. Helfrich
Stephanie M. Chmiel
Michael D. Austin
Thompson Hine LLP
41 South High Street, Suite 1700
Columbus, OH 43215-6101
Email: Kurt.Helfrich@ThompsonHine.com
Stephanie.Chmiel@ThompsonHine.com
Michael.Austin@ThompsonHine.com

Attorneys for Buckeye Power, Inc.

Trent Dougherty (Counsel of Record)
1145 Chesapeake Avenue, Suite 1
Columbus, OH 43212
Email: tdougherty@theOEC.org

John Finnigan
Senior Regulatory Attorney
Environmental Defense Fund
128 Winding Brook Lane
Terrace Park, OH 45174
Email: jfinnigan@edf.com

Attorneys for the Ohio Environmental
Council and Environmental Defense Fund

Robert Dove
P.O. Box 13442
Columbus, OH 43213
Email: rdove@attorneydove.com

Samantha Williams (Staff Attorney)
Natural Resources Defense Council
20 N. Wacker Drive, Suite 1600
Chicago, IL 60606
Email: swilliams@nrdc.com

Attorneys for Natural Resources
Defense Council

Colleen L. Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
P.O. Box 1793
Findlay, OH 45839-1793
Email: cmooney@ohiopartners.org

Attorney for Ohio Partners for Affordable
Energy

Derrick Price Williamson
Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC
1100 Bent Creek Blvd., Suite 101
Mechanicsburg, PA 17050
Email: dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com

Carrie M. Harris
Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC
310 First Street, Suite 1100
P.O. Box 90
Roanoke, VA 24002-0090
Email: charris@spilmanlaw.com

Lisa M. Hawrot
Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC
Century Centre Building
1233 Main Street, Suite 4000
Wheeling, WV 26003
Email: lhawrot@spilmanlaw.com

Steve W. Chriss
Senior Manager, Energy Regulatory Analysis
Greg Tillman
Senior Manager, Energy Regulatory Analysis
Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.
2001 SE 10th Street
Bentonville, AR 72716-0550
Email: Stephen.Chriss@walmart.com
Greg.Tillman@walmart.com

Attorneys for Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
and Sam's East, Inc.

Joseph Olikier
IGS Energy
6100 Emerald Parkway
Dublin, OH 43016
Email: joliker@igsenergy.com

Attorney for IGS Energy

Jacob J. Schlesinger
Keyes, Fox & Wiedman, LLP
1580 Lincoln St. #880
Denver, CO 80203
Email: jschlesinger@kfwlaw.com

Dylan F. Borchers
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
Email: dborchers@bricker.com

Attorneys for Energy Freedom Coalition of
America, LLC

Lt Col John C. Degnan
Thomas A. Jernigan
Ebony M. Payton
Federal Executive Agencies (FAE)
139 Barnes Drive, Suite 1
Tyndall AFB FL 32403
Email: John.Degnan@us.af.mil
Thomas.Jernigan.3@us.af.mil
Ebony.Payton.ctr@us.af.mil

Attorney for Federal Executive Agencies

Ellis Jacobs
Advocates for Basic Legal Equality, Inc.
130 West Second Street, Suite 700 East
Dayton, OH 45402
Email: ejacobs@ablelaw.org

Attorney for The Edgemont Neighborhood
Coalition

William J. Michael
Kevin F. Moore
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215-3485
Email: William.Michael@occ.ohio.gov
Kevin.Moore@occ.ohio.gov

Attorneys for Ohio Consumers' Counsel

Ryan P. O'Rourke
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP
280 Plaza, Suite 1300
280 North High Street
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: O'Rourke@carpenterlipps.com

Attorney for The Kroger Company

Jeffrey W. Mayes
Monitoring Analytics, LLC
2621 Van Buren Avenue, Suite 160
Valley Forge Corporate Center
Eagleville, PA 19403
Email: Jeffrey.mayes@monitoringanalytics.com

Evelyn R. Robinson
PJM Interconnection, LLC
2750 Monroe Blvd
Audubon, PA 19403
Email: evelyn.robinson@pjm.com

Attorney for Monitoring Analytics, LLC as
The Independent Market Monitor for PJM

Kevin R. Schmidt
88 East Broad Street, Suite 1770
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: Schmidt@sppgrp.com

Attorney for The Energy Professionals of Ohio

Joseph Olikier
IGS Energy
6100 Emerald Parkway
Dublin, OH 43016
Email: joliker@igsenergy.com

Attorney for IGS Energy

Richard L. Sites
Ohio Hospital Association
155 East Broad Street, 3rd Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3620
Email: rick.sites@ohiohospitals.org

Thomas J. O'Brien
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
Email: tobrien@bricker.com

Attorneys for The Ohio Hospital Association

Michael J. Settineri
Stephen M. Howard
Gretchen L. Petrucci
Ilya Batikov
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 E. Gay Street
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: mjsettineri@vorys.com
smhoward@vorys.com
glpetrucci@vorys.com
ibatikov@vorys.com

Michelle Grant, Senior Corporate Counsel
Dynegy Inc.
601 Travis Street, Suite 1400
Houston, TX 77002
Email: michelle.d.grant@dynegy.com

Attorneys for Dynegy Inc.

Colleen Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
P.O. Box 1793
Findlay, OH 45839-1793
Email: cmooney@ohiopartners.org

Attorney for Ohio Partners for Affordable
Energy

Michael D. Dortch
Richard R. Parsons
Kravitz, Brown & Dortch, LLC
65 East State Street, Suite 200
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: mdortch@kravitzllc.com
rparsons@kravitzllc.com

Attorneys for Noble Americas Energy
Solutions LLC

Joel E. Sechler
Carpenter Lipps & Leland
280 N. High St., Suite 1300
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: Sechler@carpenterlipps.com

Gregory J. Poulos
EnerNOC, Inc.
P.O. Box 29492
Columbus, OH 43229
Email: gpoulos@enernoc.com

Attorneys for EnerNOC, Inc.

Richard C. Sahli
Richard C. Sahli Law Office, LLC
981 Pinewood Lane
Columbus, OH 43230-3662
Email: rsahli@columbus.rr.com

Attorney for Sierra Club

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey
Jeffrey S. Sharkey

**DP&L'S PROPOSAL FOR CASE SCHEDULE IN
DISTRIBUTION RATE CASE AND ELECTRIC SECURITY PLAN CASE**

Friday, July 1	Estimated Date of Staff Report (distribution rate case)
Friday, July 8	Written discovery cutoff (both cases)
Monday, July 18	Intervenor testimony due (ESP case)
Monday, August 1	Objections to Staff Report (distribution rate case) Intervenor Testimony due (distribution rate case)
Monday, August 15	Hearing 1 begins (ESP case)
Tuesday, September 6	Hearing 2 begins (distribution rate case)
Monday, October 17	Opening briefs (both cases)
Monday, October 31	Reply briefs (both cases)
January 1, 2017	Rates in effect (both cases)

These dates are estimated. DP&L estimated that the hearing for the distribution case would take three weeks, and opening briefs would be due three weeks after the hearing in the ESP case concludes.

1030794.2

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

4/15/2016 10:27:41 AM

in

Case No(s). 15-1830-EL-AIR, 15-1831-EL-AAM, 15-1832-EL-ATA, 16-0395-EL-SSO, 16-0396-EL-ATA, 1

Summary: Motion of Applicant The Dayton Power and Light Company for Case Management Order to Establish Deadlines and to Coordinate Cases electronically filed by Mr. Charles J. Faruki on behalf of The Dayton Power and Light Company