

**BEFORE THE
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio)	
Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric)	
Illuminating Company and The Toledo)	
Edison Company for Authority to Provide for)	
a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to R.C.)	Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO
4928.143 in the Form of and Electric Security)	
Plan.)	
)	

**JOINT MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL LAW
AND POLICY CENTER, ENVIRONMENTAL DEFENSE FUND, AND OHIO
ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL**

Pursuant to Rule 4901-1-24(D), Ohio Administrative Code, the Environmental Law & Policy Center, Environmental Defense Fund, and Ohio Environmental Council (“Environmental Intervenors”) jointly file this Motion for a Protective Order seeking confidential treatment of certain designated portions included in the redacted (public) version of their Joint Reply Brief, which is being filed this same day by said Environmental Intervenors in this case. This Joint Motion seeks confidential treatment of information deemed confidential by Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company (“the Companies”) and given confidential treatment during the evidentiary hearing. The underlying reasons are detailed in the attached memorandum.

Environmental Intervenors hereby request that, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code 4901-1-24(E), the PUCO issue such order as is necessary to protect the undisclosed (redacted) portions of Environmental Intervenors’ Joint Reply Brief that are asserted to be confidential by the Companies. Consistent with the Public Utilities Commission (“Commission”) rules, unredacted copies of the testimony are submitted under seal.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Madeline Fleisher

Madeline Fleisher
Environmental Law & Policy Center
21 West Broad St., Suite 500
Columbus, OH 43215
(614) 670-5586
mfleisher@elpc.org

*Counsel for the Environmental Law &
Policy Center*

/s/ Trent Dougherty

Trent Dougherty
Ohio Environmental Council
1145 Chesapeake Avenue, Suite I
Columbus, OH 43212
(614) 487-5823
tdougherty@theOEC.org

*Counsel for Environmental Defense Fund
and Ohio Environmental Council*

**BEFORE THE
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio)	
Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric)	
Illuminating Company and The Toledo)	
Edison Company for Authority to Provide for)	
a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to R.C.)	Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO
4928.143 in the Form of and Electric Security)	
Plan.)	
)	

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF JOINT MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER OF
THE ENVIRONMENTAL LAW AND POLICY CENTER, ENVIRONMENTAL
DEFENSE FUND, AND OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL**

The Environmental Intervenors file this Motion for Protective Order (“Motion”) contemporaneously with the filing of their Reply Brief in this proceeding. By filing this Motion, Environmental Intervenors do not concede, and take no position on, the assertion that the information in the document is in fact trade secret information pursuant to R.C. 1333.61(D), or that the information is deserving of protection from public revelation under Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-24(D).

Ohio Administrative Code Section 4901-1-24(D) provides that the Commission or certain designees may issue an order which is necessary to protect the confidentiality of information contained in documents filed with the Commission’s Docketing Division to the extent that state or federal law prohibits the release of the information. That protection extends to information where non-disclosure of said information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code. The Companies consider the information Environmental Intervenors have left undisclosed (redacted) in the public version of Environmental Intervenors’ Joint Reply Brief to be confidential and deserving of the protection of trade secret information. The Attorney

Examiners have given confidential treatment of certain testimony during the evidentiary hearing, and consistent with that confidential treatment, Environmental Intervenors respectfully request that the Commission grant their Joint Motion for Protective Order and maintain the subject portions of their Joint Reply Brief under seal.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Madeline Fleisher
Madeline Fleisher
Environmental Law & Policy Center
21 West Broad St., Suite 500
Columbus, OH 43215
(614) 670-5586
mfleisher@elpc.org

*Counsel for the Environmental Law &
Policy Center*

/s/ Trent Dougherty
Trent Dougherty
Ohio Environmental Council
1145 Chesapeake Avenue, Suite I
Columbus, OH 43212
(614) 487-5823
tdougherty@theOEC.org

*Counsel for Environmental Defense Fund
and Ohio Environmental Council*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio's e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this Motion on the parties referenced on the service list of the docket card who have electronically subscribed to the case. In addition, the undersigned certifies that a courtesy copy of the foregoing document is also being served (via electronic mail) on February 26, 2016 upon all persons/entities listed below.

/s/ Madeline Fleisher

Madeline Fleisher

anorris@dickinson-wright.com
asonderman@keglerbrown.com
barthroyer@aol.com
bhutter@crowell.com
bingham@occ.state.oh.us
bojko@carpenterlipps.com
brenda.carnahan@duke-energy.com
brigner@occ.State.oh.us
callwein@keglerbrown.com
carys.cochem@duke-energy.com
cdunn@firstenergycorp.com
cdunn@firstenergygroupcorp.com
charris@spilmanlaw.com
christopher.miller@icemiller.com
cmooney@ohiopartners.org
craigismith@aol.com
dakutik@jonesday.com
dawnh@oaima.org
debra.hight@puc.state.oh.us
dfolk@akronohio.gov
dianne.kuhnell@duke-energy.com
don.wathen@duke-energy.com
donielle.hunter@puc.state.oh.us
dparram@taftlaw.com
drine@aol.com
drinebolt@ohiopartners.org
dstinson@bricker.com
dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com
dwolff@crowell.com
evelyn.robinson@pjm.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com
felecia.burdett@puc.state.oh.us
gaunder@carpenterlipps.com
ghiloni@carpenterlipps.com
ghull@eckertseamans.com
gkrassen@bricker.com
glpetrucci@vorys.com
jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com
jeffrey.mayes@monitoringanalytics.com
jennifer.spinosi@directenergy.com
jlang@calfee.com
joliker@igsenergy.com
josephclark@nisource.com
jpmeissn@lasclev.org
jscheaf@mcdonaldhophkins.com
karen.boman@dplinc.com
kdearbom@dearbornreporting.com
kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov
kim.keeton@puc.state.oh.us
kristinhenry@sierraclub.org
kryan@city.cleveland.oh.us
kspencer@aando.com
lael.campbell@constellation.com
laurac@chappelleconsulting.net
lehfeldtr@dicksteinshapiro.com
maeve.tibbetts@monitoringanalytics.com
mallame@occ.state.oh.us
marilyn@wflawfirm.com
matt@matthewcoxlaw.com
mdortch@kravitzllc.com

mhpetricoff@vssp.com
mitch.dutton@fpl.com
mjsatterwhite@aep.com
mjsettineri@vorys.com
mkimbrough@keglerbrown.com
mkl@bbrslaw.com
mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com
myurick@cwslaw.com
ohioenergygroup@bkllawfirm.com
oma@ohiomfb.com
ricks@ohanet.org
ricks@uhand.org
rkelter@elpc.org
rparsons@kravitzllc.com
sam@mwncmh.com
sandra.coffey@puc.state.oh.us
sandra.ritchie@pjm.com
sbloomfield@bricker.com
scasto@firstenergycorp.com

schmidt@sppgrp.com
schuhart@wrightlaw.com
sechler@carpenterlipps.com
sfisk@earthjustice.org
singletont@firstenergycorp.com
smillard@cose.org
smith@carpenterlipps.com
stnourse@aep.com
suzette.krausen@monitoringanalytics.com
talexander@calfee.com
teresa.ringenbach@directenergy.com
toddm@wamenergylaw.com
tonnetta.scott@puc.state.oh.us
tony.mendoza@sierraclub.org
torahood@bricker.com
trent@theoec.org
trhayslaw@gmail.com
vesta.miller@puc.state.oh.us
vfuller@enernoc.com
vleach-payne@mwncmh.com

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

2/26/2016 2:33:07 PM

in

Case No(s). 14-1297-EL-SSO

Summary: Motion Motion for Protective Order by Environmental Law and Policy Center, Ohio Environmental Council, and Environmental Defense Fund electronically filed by Madeline Fleisher on behalf of Environmental Law and Policy Center and Ohio Environmental Council and Environmental Defense Fund