

**BEFORE THE  
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio	)	
Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric	)	
Illuminating Company and The Toledo	)	
Edison Company for Authority to Provide for	)	
a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to R.C.	)	Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO
4928.143 in the Form of and Electric Security	)	
Plan.	)	
	)	

---

**JOINT MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL LAW  
AND POLICY CENTER, ENVIRONMENTAL DEFENSE FUND, AND OHIO  
ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL**

---

Pursuant to Rule 4901-1-24(D), Ohio Administrative Code, the Environmental Law & Policy Center, Environmental Defense Fund, and Ohio Environmental Council (“Environmental Intervenors”) jointly file this Motion for a Protective Order seeking confidential treatment of certain designated portions included in the redacted (public) version of their Joint Initial Brief, which is being filed this same day by said Environmental Intervenors in this case. This Joint Motion seeks confidential treatment of information deemed confidential by Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company (“the Companies”) and given confidential treatment during the evidentiary hearing. The underlying reasons are detailed in the attached memorandum.

Environmental Intervenors hereby request that, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code 4901-1-24(E), the PUCO issue such order as is necessary to protect the undisclosed (redacted) portions of Environmental Intervenor’s Joint Initial Brief that are asserted to be confidential by the Companies. Consistent with the Public Utilities Commission (“Commission”) rules, unredacted copies of the testimony are submitted under seal.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Madeline Fleisher

Madeline Fleisher  
Environmental Law & Policy Center  
21 West Broad St., Suite 500  
Columbus, OH 43215  
(614) 670-5586  
[mfleisher@elpc.org](mailto:mfleisher@elpc.org)

*Counsel for the Environmental Law &  
Policy Center*

/s/ Trent Dougherty

Trent Dougherty  
Ohio Environmental Council  
1145 Chesapeake Avenue, Suite I  
Columbus, OH 43212  
(614) 487-5823  
[tdougherty@theOEC.org](mailto:tdougherty@theOEC.org)

*Counsel for Environmental Defense Fund  
and Ohio Environmental Council*

**BEFORE THE  
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio	)	
Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric	)	
Illuminating Company and The Toledo	)	
Edison Company for Authority to Provide for	)	
a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to R.C.	)	Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO
4928.143 in the Form of and Electric Security	)	
Plan.	)	
	)	

---

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF JOINT MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER OF  
THE ENVIRONMENTAL LAW AND POLICY CENTER, ENVIRONMENTAL  
DEFENSE FUND, AND OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL**

---

The Environmental Intervenors file this Motion for Protective Order (“Motion”) contemporaneously with the filing of its Initial Brief in this proceeding. By filing this Motion, Environmental Intervenors do not concede, and take no position on, the assertion that the information in the document is in fact trade secret information pursuant to R.C. 1333.61(D), or that the information is deserving of protection from public revelation under Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-24(D).

Ohio Administrative Code Section 4901-1-24(D) provides that the Commission or certain designees may issue an order which is necessary to protect the confidentiality of information contained in documents filed with the Commission’s Docketing Division to the extent that state or federal law prohibits the release of the information. That protection extends to information where non-disclosure of said information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code. The Companies consider the information Environmental Intervenors have left undisclosed (redacted) in the public version of Environmental Intervenors’ Joint Initial Brief to be confidential and deserving of the protection of trade secret information. The Attorney

Examiners have given confidential treatment of certain testimony during the evidentiary hearing, and consistent with that confidential treatment, Environmental Intervenors respectfully request that the Commission grant their Joint Motion for Protective Order and maintain the subject portions of their Joint Initial Brief under seal.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Madeline Fleisher  
Madeline Fleisher  
Environmental Law & Policy Center  
21 West Broad St., Suite 500  
Columbus, OH 43215  
(614) 670-5586  
[mfleisher@elpc.org](mailto:mfleisher@elpc.org)

*Counsel for the Environmental Law &  
Policy Center*

/s/ Trent Dougherty  
Trent Dougherty  
Ohio Environmental Council  
1145 Chesapeake Avenue, Suite I  
Columbus, OH 43212  
(614) 487-5823  
[tdougherty@theOEC.org](mailto:tdougherty@theOEC.org)

*Counsel for Environmental Defense Fund  
and Ohio Environmental Council*

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio's e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this Motion on the parties referenced on the service list of the docket card who have electronically subscribed to the case. In addition, the undersigned certifies that a courtesy copy of the foregoing document is also being served (via electronic mail) on February 16, 2016 upon all persons/entities listed below.

/s/ Madeline Fleisher  
Madeline Fleisher

anorris@dickinson-wright.com  
asonderman@keglerbrown.com  
barthroyer@aol.com  
bhutter@crowell.com  
bingham@occ.state.oh.us  
bojko@carpenterlipps.com  
[brenda.carnahan@duke-energy.com](mailto:brenda.carnahan@duke-energy.com)  
[brigner@occ.State.oh.us](mailto:brigner@occ.State.oh.us)  
callwein@keglerbrown.com  
carys.cochem@duke-energy.com  
[cdunn@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:cdunn@firstenergycorp.com)  
cdunn@firstenergygroupcorp.com  
charris@spilmanlaw.com  
christopher.miller@icemiller.com  
cmooney@ohiopartners.org  
craigismith@aol.com  
dakutik@jonesday.com  
dawnh@oaima.org  
debra.hight@puc.state.oh.us  
dfolk@akronohio.gov  
dianne.kuhnell@duke-energy.com  
don.wathen@duke-energy.com  
donielle.hunter@puc.state.oh.us  
dparram@taftlaw.com  
drine@aol.com  
drinebolt@ohiopartners.org

dstinson@bricker.com  
dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com  
dwolff@crowell.com  
evelyn.robinson@pjm.com  
fdarr@mwncmh.com  
[felecia.burdett@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:felecia.burdett@puc.state.oh.us)  
gaunder@carpenterlipps.com  
ghiloni@carpenterlipps.com  
ghull@eckertseamans.com  
gkrassen@bricker.com  
glpetrucci@vorys.com  
jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com  
jeffrey.mayes@monitoringanalytics.com  
jennifer.spinosi@directenergy.com  
jlang@calfee.com  
joliker@igsenergy.com  
[josephclark@nisource.com](mailto:josephclark@nisource.com)  
jpmeissn@lasclev.org  
jscheaf@mcdonaldhopkins.com  
karen.boman@dplinc.com  
kdearbom@dearbornreporting.com  
[kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov)  
kim.keeton@puc.state.oh.us  
kristinhenry@sierraclub.org  
kryan@city.cleveland.oh.us  
kspencer@aando.com

lael.campbell@constellation.com  
laurac@chappelleconsulting.net  
lehfeldtr@dicksteinshapiro.com  
maeve.tibbetts@monitoringanalytics.com  
mallame@occ.state.oh.us  
marilyn@wflawfirm.com  
matt@matthewcoxlaw.com  
mdortch@kravitzllc.com  
mhpetricoff@vssp.com  
mitch.dutton@fpl.com  
mjsatterwhite@aep.com  
mjsettineri@vorys.com  
mkimbrough@keglerbrown.com  
mkl@bbrslaw.com  
mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com  
mpritchard@mwncmh.com  
myurick@cwslaw.com  
ohioenergygroup@bkllawfirm.com  
[oma@ohiomfb.com](mailto:oma@ohiomfb.com)  
[ricks@ohanet.org](mailto:ricks@ohanet.org)  
ricks@uhand.org  
[rkelter@elpc.org](mailto:rkelter@elpc.org)  
rparsons@kravitzllc.com  
sam@mwncmh.com  
sandra.coffey@puc.state.oh.us  
[sandra.ritchie@pjm.com](mailto:sandra.ritchie@pjm.com)  
sbloomfield@bricker.com  
scasto@firstenergycorp.com  
schmidt@sppgrp.com  
[schuhart@wrightlaw.com](mailto:schuhart@wrightlaw.com)  
[sechler@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:sechler@carpenterlipps.com)  
[sfisk@earthjustice.org](mailto:sfisk@earthjustice.org)  
singletont@firstenergycorp.com  
smillard@cose.org  
smith@carpenterlipps.com  
stnourse@aep.com  
[suzette.krausen@monitoringanalytics.com](mailto:suzette.krausen@monitoringanalytics.com)  
tallexander@calfee.com  
teresa.ringenbach@directenergy.com  
toddm@wamenergylaw.com  
tonnetta.scott@puc.state.oh.us  
tony.mendoza@sierraclub.org  
torahood@bricker.com  
trent@theoec.org

trhayslaw@gmail.com  
vesta.miller@puc.state.oh.us  
vfuller@enernoc.com  
vleach-payne@mwncmh.com  
[wzigli@cpp.org](mailto:wzigli@cpp.org)

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**2/16/2016 5:09:32 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 14-1297-EL-SSO**

Summary: Motion Motion for Protective Order by Environmental Law and Policy Center, Ohio Environmental Council, and Environmental Defense Fund electronically filed by Madeline Fleisher on behalf of Environmental Law and Policy Center and Ohio Environmental Council and Environmental Defense Fund