

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

- - -

In the Matter of the :  
Application of Ohio Edison:  
Company, The Cleveland :  
Electric Illuminating :  
Company, and The Toledo :  
Edison Company for : Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO  
Authority to Provide for :  
a Standard Service Offer :  
Pursuant to R.C. 4928.143 :  
in the Form of an Electric:  
Security Plan. :

- - -

PROCEEDINGS

before Mr. Gregory Price, Ms. Mandy Chiles, and  
Ms. Megan Addison, Attorney Examiners, at the Public  
Utilities Commission of Ohio, 180 East Broad Street,  
Room 11-A, Columbus, Ohio, called at 9:00 a.m. on  
Friday, September 11, 2015.

- - -

VOLUME IX

- - -

ARMSTRONG & OKEY, INC.  
222 East Town Street, Second Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-5201  
(614) 224-9481 - (800) 223-9481  
Fax - (614) 224-5724

- - -

## 1 APPEARANCES:

2 FirstEnergy Corp.  
3 By Mr. James W. Burk  
4 and Ms. Carrie M. Dunn  
5 76 South Main Street  
6 Akron, Ohio 44308

7 Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP  
8 By Mr. James Lang  
9 and Mr. N. Trevor Alexander  
10 The Calfee Building  
11 1405 East Sixth Street  
12 Cleveland, Ohio 44114

13 Jones Day  
14 By Mr. David A. Kutik  
15 901 Lakeside Avenue  
16 Cleveland, Ohio 44114

17 On behalf of the Applicants.

18 Bruce E. Weston, Ohio Consumers' Counsel  
19 By Mr. Larry Sauer  
20 Ms. Maureen R. Grady  
21 Mr. William J. Michael  
22 Mr. Kevin F. Moore  
23 Ms. Ajay K. Kumar  
24 Assistant Consumers' Counsel  
25 10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485

On behalf of the Residential Consumers of  
Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland  
Electric Illuminating Company, and The  
Toledo Edison Company.

Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy  
By Ms. Colleen L. Mooney  
231 West Lima Street  
Findlay, Ohio 45840

On behalf of the Ohio Partners for  
Affordable Energy.

## 1 APPEARANCES: (Continued)

2 Bricker & Eckler, LLP  
3 By Mr. Dane Stinson  
4 and Mr. Dylan Borchers  
5 100 South Third Street  
6 Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291

7 Bricker & Eckler, LLP  
8 By Mr. Glenn S. Krassen  
9 1001 Lakeside Avenue East, Suite 1350  
10 Cleveland, Ohio 44114

11 On behalf of the Northeast Ohio Public  
12 Energy Council, Ohio Schools Council, and  
13 Power for the Schools.

14 Earthjustice  
15 By Mr. Shannon Fisk  
16 Northeast Office  
17 1617 John F. Kennedy Boulevard, Suite 1675  
18 Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103

19 Earthjustice  
20 By Mr. Michael Soules  
21 1625 Massachusetts Avenue NW, Suite 702  
22 Washington, D.C. 20036

23 Sierra Club Environmental Law Program  
24 Mr. Tony Mendoza  
25 85 Second Street, 2nd Floor  
San Francisco, California 94105

Richard Sahli Law Office, LLC  
By Mr. Richard C. Sahli  
981 Pinewood Lane  
Columbus, Ohio 43230-3662

On behalf of the Sierra Club.

McNees, Wallace & Nurick LLC  
By Mr. Frank P. Darr  
and Mr. Samuel C. Randazzo  
21 East State Street, 17th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

On behalf of the Industrial Energy Users  
of Ohio.

## 1 APPEARANCES: (Continued)

2 IGS Energy  
3 By Mr. Joseph Olikier  
4 6100 Emerald Parkway  
5 Dublin, Ohio 43016

6 On behalf of IGS Energy.

7 Taft, Stettinius & Hollister LLP  
8 By Mr. Mark S. Yurick  
9 and Mr. Devin D. Parram  
10 65 East State Street, Suite 1000  
11 Columbus, Ohio 43215

12 On behalf of The Kroger Company.

13 Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease, LLP  
14 By Mr. M. Howard Petricoff  
15 Ms. Gretchen Petrucci  
16 Mr. Stephen M. Howard  
17 and Mr. Michael J. Settineri  
18 52 East Gay Street  
19 Columbus, Ohio 43215

20 On behalf of Retail Energy Supply  
21 Association, PJM Power Providers Group,  
22 Electric Power Supply Association,  
23 Constellation NewEnergy, and Exelon  
24 Generation, LLC.

25 Mike DeWine, Ohio Attorney General  
By Mr. William L. Wright,  
Section Chief  
Mr. Thomas G. Lindgren  
Mr. Thomas W. McNamee  
Mr. Steven L. Beeler  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Public Utilities Section  
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

On behalf of the Staff of the PUCO.

## 1 APPEARANCES: (Continued)

2 Kravitz, Brown & Dortch, LLC  
3 By Mr. Michael D. Dortch  
4 and Mr. Richard R. Parsons  
5 65 East State Street, Suite 200  
6 Columbus, Ohio 43215

7 On behalf of Dynegy, Inc.

8 Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP  
9 By Ms. Kimberly W. Bojko  
10 Ms. Rebecca L. Hussey  
11 280 North High Street, Suite 1300  
12 Columbus, Ohio 43215

13 On behalf of the Ohio Manufacturers'  
14 Association Energy Group.

15 Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP  
16 By Mr. Joel E. Sechler  
17 280 North High Street, Suite 1300  
18 Columbus, Ohio 43215

19 On behalf of EnerNOC, Inc.

20 Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry  
21 By Mr. Michael L. Kurtz  
22 Mr. Kurt J. Boehm  
23 Ms. Jody Kyler Cohn  
24 36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510  
25 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

On behalf of the Ohio Energy Group.

Environmental Law & Policy Center  
By Ms. Madeline Fleisher  
21 West Broad Street, Suite 500  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

On behalf of the Environmental Law &  
Policy Center.

## 1 APPEARANCES: (Continued)

2 Stone Mattheis Xenopoulos & Brew, PC  
3 By Mr. Michael Lavanga  
4 Mr. Garrett A. Stone  
5 Mr. Owen J. Kopon  
6 1025 Thomas Jefferson Street, N.W.  
7 Eighth Floor West Tower  
8 Washington, D.C. 20007-5201

9 On behalf of the Nucor Steel Marion, Inc.

10 Barth E. Royer, LLC  
11 By Mr. Barth E. Royer  
12 2740 East Main Street  
13 Bexley, Ohio 43209

14 and

15 Taft, Stettinius & Hollister LLP  
16 By Mr. Adrian D. Thompson  
17 200 Public Square, Suite 3500  
18 Cleveland, Ohio 44114-2300

19 On behalf of the Cleveland Municipal  
20 School District.

21 Spilman, Thomas & Battle, PLLC  
22 By Mr. Derrick Price Williamson  
23 Ms. Carrie Harris  
24 Ms. Lisa Hawrot  
25 1100 Bent Creek Boulevard, Suite 101  
Mechanicsburg, Pennsylvania 17050

On behalf of Wal-Mart Stores East, LP,  
and Sam's East, Inc.

Mr. Richard L. Sites  
155 East Broad Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Bricker & Eckler, LLP  
By Mr. Thomas J. O'Brien  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291

On behalf of the Ohio Hospital  
Association.

## 1 APPEARANCES: (Continued)

2 Ohio Environmental Council  
3 By Mr. Trent A. Dougherty  
4 and Mr. John Finnigan  
5 1145 Chesapeake Avenue, Suite I  
6 Columbus, Ohio 43212

7 On behalf of the Ohio Environmental  
8 Council and the Environmental Defense  
9 Fund.

10 Mr. Thomas R. Hays  
11 8355 Island Lane  
12 Maineville, Ohio 45039

13 On behalf of the Northwest Ohio  
14 Aggregation Coalition and the Individual  
15 Communities.

16 Ice Miller, LLP  
17 By Mr. Christopher Miller,  
18 250 West Street, Suite 700  
19 Columbus, Ohio 43215-7509

20 On behalf of the Association of  
21 Independent Colleges and Universities of  
22 Ohio.

23 American Electric Power  
24 By Mr. Steven T. Nourse  
25 Mr. Matthew J. Satterwhite  
One Riverside Plaza  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

On behalf of the Ohio Power Company.

Mr. Craig I. Smith  
15700 Van Aken Boulevard #26  
Shaker Heights, Ohio 44120

On behalf of Material Sciences  
Corporation.

Meissner and Associates Law Firm  
By Mr. Joseph Patrick Meissner  
5400 Detroit Avenue  
Cleveland, Ohio 44102

1 APPEARANCES: (Continued)

2 Kegler, Brown, Hill & Ritter  
3 By Mr. Christopher J. Allwein  
4 and Ms. Margeaux Kimbrough  
5 Capitol Square, Suite 1800  
6 65 East State Street  
7 Columbus, Ohio 43215-4294

8 On behalf of the EverPower Wind Holdings,  
9 Incorporated.

10 - - -  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25



1791

## INDEX

- - -

## WITNESSES

## PAGE

Jason Lisowski

Cross-Examination (Continued) by Mr. Soules 1794

Cross-Examination by Mr. Michael 1887

Cross-Examination by Mr. Oliker 1908

Cross-Examination by Ms. Fleisher 1949

Cross-Examination by Mr. Settineri 1970

Cross-Examination by Mr. Hays 2000

- - -

## COMPANIES EXHIBITS

## IDENTIFIED ADMITTED

25 - Workpapers of J. Lisowski 1886 --  
 (Confidential)

26 - Actual PJM Auction Results  
 Comparison to Filed  
 Workpapers JJL (Confidential) 1990 --

## SIERRA CLUB EXHIBITS

## IDENTIFIED ADMITTED

37 - Sierra Club's discovery  
 request, SC Set 1 INT-49,  
 (Confidential) 1796 --

38 - Sierra Club Discovery Request  
 SC Set 1-INT-16 (Confidential) 1818 --

39 - Response to Discovery Requests  
 P3-EPSC Set 1-INT-9, INT-10,  
 INT-11 and INT-12 (Confidential) 1825 --

40 - Response to Discovery Request  
 SC Set 2-INT-74 (Confidential) 1828 --

41 - Response to Discovery Request  
 SC Set-4-INT-95 (Confidential) 1853 --

42 - Response to Sierra Club  
 Set 1-RPD-12 (Confidential) 1856 --

43 - Unregulated Station Level  
 Income Statements and Cash

1792

## INDEX

- - -

## SIERRA CLUB EXHIBITS IDENTIFIED ADMITTED

44 - Station Income Statement and Cash Flow (Confidential)	1875	--
---	------	----

45 - ICAP Document - Coal (Confidential)	1878	--
---	------	----

## IGS EXHIBITS IDENTIFIED ADMITTED

7 - Email from M. Hayden, 7/6/14(Confidential)	1918	--
---	------	----

## ELPC EXHIBITS IDENTIFIED ADMITTED

6 - Companies' Response to IGS Set 1-INT-3 (Confidential)	1969	--
--	------	----

- - -

1793

1 Friday Morning Session,

2 September 11, 2015.

3 - - -

4 EXAMINER CHILES: Let's go on the record.

5 The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
6 has called for hearing at this time Case No.  
7 14-1297-EL-SSO being In the Matter of the Application  
8 of Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric  
9 Illuminating Company, and, the Toledo Edison Company  
10 for Authority to Provide for a Standard Service Offer  
11 pursuant to Revised Code 4928.143 in the Form of an  
12 Electric Security Plan.

13 My name is Mandy Chiles, and with me are  
14 Gregory Price and Megan Addison, and we are the  
15 Attorney Examiners assigned to hear this case.

16 At this time we will waive appearances  
17 this morning.

18 EXAMINER PRICE: Mr. Alexander, you have  
19 one bit of housekeeping for us?

20 MR. ALEXANDER: Yes, your Honor.  
21 Yesterday at the end of the public session, Mr.  
22 Lisowski inadvertently mentioned some confidential  
23 information at the end of the public session, so the  
24 companies would move to move page 1737, line 18,  
25 through page 1738, line 11, into the confidential

1       portion of the transcript.

2               EXAMINER PRICE: Any objections?

3               MR. MCNAMEE: No.

4               EXAMINER PRICE: The Bench will direct  
5       the reporters to put that section on the confidential  
6       portion of the transcript.

7               MR. ALEXANDER: Thank you, your Honor.

8               (CONFIDENTIAL PORTION EXCERPTED.)  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

2020

CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is  
a true and correct transcript of the proceedings  
taken by me in this matter on Friday, September 11,  
2015, and carefully compared with my original  
stenographic notes.

---

Carol A. Kirk, RPR, RMR.

(CAK-79262)

- - -

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**9/25/2015 2:36:05 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 14-1297-EL-SSO**

Summary: Transcript In the Matter of the application of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company hearing held on 09/11/15 - Volume IX electronically filed by Mr. Ken Spencer on behalf of Armstrong & Okey, Inc. and Anderson, Rosemary Foster Mrs.