BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

_ _ _

In the Matter of the :
Application of Ohio Edison:
Company, The Cleveland :
Electric Illuminating :
Company, and The Toledo :
Edison Company for :

Edison Company for : Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO

Authority to Provide for: a Standard Service Offer: Pursuant to R.C. 4928.143: in the Form of an Electric: Security Plan.:

- - -

PROCEEDINGS

before Mr. Gregory Price, Ms. Mandy Chiles, and Ms. Megan Addison, Attorney Examiners, at the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio, 180 East Broad Street, Room 11-A, Columbus, Ohio, called at 9:00 a.m. on Friday, September 11, 2015.

- - -

VOLUME IX

- - -

ARMSTRONG & OKEY, INC.

222 East Town Street, Second Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-5201
(614) 224-9481 - (800) 223-9481
Fax - (614) 224-5724

_ _ _

```
1784
 1
      APPEARANCES:
 2
             FirstEnergy Corp.
             By Mr. James W. Burk
 3
             and Ms. Carrie M. Dunn
             76 South Main Street
             Akron, Ohio 44308
 4
 5
             Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP
             By Mr. James Lang
             and Mr. N. Trevor Alexander
 6
             The Calfee Building
 7
             1405 East Sixth Street
             Cleveland, Ohio 44114
 8
             Jones Day
 9
             By Mr. David A. Kutik
             901 Lakeside Avenue
10
             Cleveland, Ohio 44114
11
                  On behalf of the Applicants.
12
             Bruce E. Weston, Ohio Consumers' Counsel
             By Mr. Larry Sauer
             Ms. Maureen R. Grady
13
             Mr. William J. Michael
             Mr. Kevin F. Moore
14
             Ms. Ajay K. Kumar
15
             Assistant Consumers' Counsel
             10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
16
             Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485
17
                  On behalf of the Residential Consumers of
                  Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland
                  Electric Illuminating Company, and The
18
                  Toledo Edison Company.
19
             Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
2.0
             By Ms. Colleen L. Mooney
             231 West Lima Street
21
             Findlay, Ohio 45840
22
                  On behalf of the Ohio Partners for
                  Affordable Energy.
2.3
24
25
```

| | 1785 |
|----|--|
| 1 | APPEARANCES: (Continued) |
| 2 | Bricker & Eckler, LLP By Mr. Dane Stinson |
| 3 | and Mr. Dylan Borchers 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291 |
| 5 | Bricker & Eckler, LLP By Mr. Glenn S. Krassen |
| 6 | 1001 Lakeside Avenue East, Suite 1350 Cleveland, Ohio 44114 |
| 7 | On behalf of the Northeast Ohio Public |
| 8 | Energy Council, Ohio Schools Council, and Power for the Schools. |
| 9 | |
| 10 | Earthjustice By Mr. Shannon Fisk Northeast Office |
| 11 | 1617 John F. Kennedy Boulevard, Suite 1675 Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103 |
| 12 | |
| 13 | Earthjustice By Mr. Michael Soules 1625 Massachusetts Avenue NW, Suite 702 |
| 14 | Washington, D.C. 20036 |
| 15 | Sierra Club Environmental Law Program Mr. Tony Mendoza |
| 16 | 85 Second Street, 2nd Floor San Francisco, California 94105 |
| 17 | Richard Sahli Law Office, LLC |
| 18 | By Mr. Richard C. Sahli 981 Pinewood Lane |
| 19 | Columbus, Ohio 43230-3662 |
| 20 | On behalf of the Sierra Club. |
| 21 | McNees, Wallace & Nurick LLC By Mr. Frank P. Darr |
| 22 | and Mr. Samuel C. Randazzo |
| 23 | 21 East State Street, 17th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215 |
| 24 | On behalf of the Industrial Energy Users of Ohio. |
| 25 | |

| | 1786 |
|-----|---|
| 1 | APPEARANCES: (Continued) |
| 2 | IGS Energy |
| 3 | By Mr. Joseph Oliker |
| 3 | 6100 Emerald Parkway Dublin, Ohio 43016 |
| 4 | |
| 5 | On behalf of IGS Energy. |
| 6 | Taft, Stettinius & Hollister LLP By Mr. Mark S. Yurick |
| O | and Mr. Devin D. Parram |
| 7 | 65 East State Street, Suite 1000 |
| | Columbus, Ohio 43215 |
| 8 | On bobalf of The Krager Company |
| 9 | On behalf of The Kroger Company. |
| | Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease, LLP |
| 10 | By Mr. M. Howard Petricoff |
| 11 | Ms. Gretchen Petrucci Mr. Stephen M. Howard |
| ТТ | and Mr. Michael J. Settineri |
| 12 | 52 East Gay Street |
| | Columbus, Ohio 43215 |
| 13 | On hehelf of Detail Drawns Comple |
| 14 | On behalf of Retail Energy Supply Association, PJM Power Providers Group, |
| 11 | Electric Power Supply Association, |
| 15 | Constellation NewEnergy, and Exelon |
| 1.0 | Generation, LLC. |
| 16 | Mike DeWine, Ohio Attorney General |
| 17 | By Mr. William L. Wright, |
| | Section Chief |
| 18 | Mr. Thomas G. Lindgren |
| 1 0 | Mr. Thomas W. McNamee |
| 19 | Mr. Steven L. Beeler Assistant Attorneys General |
| 20 | Public Utilities Section |
| | 180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor |
| 21 | Columbus, Ohio 43215 |
| 22 | On behalf of the Staff of the PUCO. |
| 23 | |
| 24 | |
| 25 | |

| | | 1787 |
|-------------|---|------|
| 1 | APPEARANCES: (Continued) | |
| 2 3 4 | Kravitz, Brown & Dortch, LLC By Mr. Michael D. Dortch and Mr. Richard R. Parsons 65 East State Street, Suite 200 Columbus, Ohio 43215 | |
| 5 | On behalf of Dynegy, Inc. | |
| 6 | Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP | |
| 7 | By Ms. Kimberly W. Bojko Ms. Rebecca L. Hussey 280 North High Street, Suite 1300 | |
| 8 | Columbus, Ohio 43215 | |
| 9 | On behalf of the Ohio Manufacturers' Association Energy Group. | |
| 10 | Carportor Linna (Ioland IID | |
| 11 | Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP By Mr. Joel E. Sechler 280 North High Street, Suite 1300 | |
| 12 | Columbus, Ohio 43215 | |
| 13 | On behalf of EnerNOC, Inc. | |
| 14 15 | Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry By Mr. Michael L. Kurtz Mr. Kurt J. Boehm | |
| 16 | Ms. Jody Kyler Cohn 36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510 | |
| 17 | Cincinnati, Ohio 45202 | |
| | On behalf of the Ohio Energy Group. | |
| 18 | Environmental Law & Policy Center | |
| 19 | By Ms. Madeline Fleisher 21 West Broad Street, Suite 500 | |
| 20 | Columbus, Ohio 43215 | |
| 21 | On behalf of the Environmental Law & Policy Center. | |
| 22 | <u> </u> | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |

| | 1788 |
|----|--|
| 1 | APPEARANCES: (Continued) |
| 2 | Stone Mattheis Xenopoulos & Brew, PC By Mr. Michael Lavanga |
| 3 | Mr. Garrett A. Stone Mr. Owen J. Kopon |
| 4 | 1025 Thomas Jefferson Street, N.W. Eighth Floor West Tower |
| 5 | Washington, D.C. 20007-5201 |
| 6 | On behalf of the Nucor Steel Marion, Inc. |
| 7 | Barth E. Royer, LLC By Mr. Barth E. Royer 2740 East Main Street |
| O | Bexley, Ohio 43209 |
| 9 | and |
| 10 | |
| 11 | Taft, Stettinius & Hollister LLP By Mr. Adrian D. Thompson 200 Public Square, Suite 3500 |
| 12 | Cleveland, Ohio 44114-2300 |
| 13 | On behalf of the Cleveland Municipal School District. |
| 14 | Spilman, Thomas & Battle, PLLC |
| 15 | By Mr. Derrick Price Williamson Ms. Carrie Harris |
| 16 | Ms. Lisa Hawrot 1100 Bent Creek Boulevard, Suite 101 |
| 17 | Mechanicsburg, Pennsylvania 17050 |
| 18 | On behalf of Wal-Mart Stores East, LP, and Sam's East, Inc. |
| 19 | Mr. Richard L. Sites |
| 20 | 155 East Broad Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 |
| 21 | · |
| 22 | Bricker & Eckler, LLP By Mr. Thomas J. O'Brien 100 South Third Street |
| 23 | Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291 |
| 24 | On behalf of the Ohio Hospital Association. |
| 25 | |

| | 1789 |
|----|--|
| 1 | APPEARANCES: (Continued) |
| 2 | Ohio Environmental Council By Mr. Trent A. Dougherty |
| 3 | and Mr. John Finnigan 1145 Chesapeake Avenue, Suite I Columbus, Ohio 43212 |
| 5 | On behalf of the Ohio Environmental |
| 6 | Council and the Environmental Defense Fund. |
| 7 | Mr. Thomas R. Hays 8355 Island Lane |
| 8 | Maineville, Ohio 45039 |
| 9 | On behalf of the Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition and the Individual |
| 10 | Communities. |
| 11 | Ice Miller, LLP By Mr. Christopher Miller, |
| 12 | 250 West Street, Suite 700 Columbus, Ohio 43215-7509 |
| 13 | On behalf of the Association of |
| 14 | Independent Colleges and Universities of Ohio. |
| 15 | |
| 16 | American Electric Power By Mr. Steven T. Nourse |
| 17 | Mr. Matthew J. Satterwhite One Riverside Plaza Columbus, Ohio 43215 |
| 18 | CO1umbus, 01110 43213 |
| 19 | On behalf of the Ohio Power Company. |
| 20 | Mr. Craig I. Smith 15700 Van Aken Boulevard #26 Shaker Heights, Ohio 44120 |
| 21 | 0.1.6.1.02 1.02 g.1.00 , 0.1.20 1.120 |
| 22 | On behalf of Material Sciences Corporation. |
| 23 | Meissner and Associates Law Firm By Mr. Joseph Patrick Meissner |
| 24 | 5400 Detroit Avenue Cleveland, Ohio 44102 |
| 25 | |

```
1790
 1
      APPEARANCES: (Continued)
 2
             Kegler, Brown, Hill & Ritter
             By Mr. Christopher J. Allwein
             and Ms. Margeaux Kimbrough
 3
             Capitol Square, Suite 1800
 4
             65 East State Street
             Columbus, Ohio 43215-4294
 5
                  On behalf of the EverPower Wind Holdings,
 6
                   Incorporated.
 7
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

| | | 1791 |
|----------------|---|--------------|
| 1 | INDEX | |
| 2 | - | |
| 3 | WITNESSES | PAGE |
| 4 | Jason Lisowski | |
| 5 | Cross-Examination (Continued) by Mr. Soules Cross-Examination by Mr. Michael | 1794 1887 |
| 6 | Cross-Examination by Mr. Oliker Cross-Examination by Ms. Fleisher | 1908 1949 |
| | Cross-Examination by Mr. Settineri | 1970 |
| 7 | Cross-Examination by Mr. Hays | 2000 |
| 8 | | |
| 9 | COMPANIES EXHIBITS IDENTIFIED AD | MITTED |
| 10 | 25 - Workpapers of J. Lisowski 1886 (Confidential) | |
| 11 | | |
| 12 | 26 - Actual PJM Auction Results Comparison to Filed | |
| 13 | Workpapers JJL (Confidential) 1990 | |
| 14 | SIERRA CLUB EXHIBITS IDENTIFIED A | DMITTED |
| 1 1 | 37 - Sierra Club's discovery | |
| 15 | request, SC Set 1 INT-49, (Confidential) 1796 | |
| 16 | | |
| 17 | 38 - Sierra Club Discovery Request SC Set 1-INT-16 (Confidential) 1818 | |
| 18 | 39 - Response to Discovery Requests | |
| 19 | P3-EPSA Set 1-INT-9, INT-10, INT-11 and INT-12 (Confidential) 1825 | |
| 20 | 40 - Response to Discovery Request | |
| 21 | SC Set 2-INT-74 (Confidential) 1828 | |
| 22 | 41 - Response to Discovery Request SC Set-4-INT-95 (Confidential) 1853 | |
| 23 | 42 - Response to Sierra Club | |
| 24 | Set 1-RPD-12 (Confidential) 1856 | |
| 25 | 43 - Unregulated Station Level Income Statements and Cash | |
| | | |

| | | | 1792 |
|----|--|------------|---------------|
| 1 | INDEX | | |
| 2 | | | |
| 3 | SIERRA CLUB EXHIBITS | IDENTIFIED | ADMITTED |
| 4 | 44 - Station Income Statement and Cash Flow (Confidential) | 1875 | |
| 5 | 45 - ICAP Document - Coal (Confidential) | 1878 | |
| 7 | IGS EXHIBITS | IDENTIFIED | ADMITTED |
| 8 | 7 - Email from M. Hayden, 7/6/14(Confidential) | 1918 | |
| 9 | ELPC EXHIBITS | IDENTIFIED | N DM T TT F D |
| 10 | | IDENTIFIED | ADMITIED |
| 11 | 6 - Companies' Response to IGS Set 1-INT-3 (Confidential) | 1969 | |
| 12 | | | |
| 13 | | | |
| 14 | | | |
| 15 | | | |
| 16 | | | |
| 17 | | | |
| 18 | | | |
| 19 | | | |
| 20 | | | |
| 21 | | | |
| 22 | | | |
| 23 | | | |
| 24 | | | |
| 25 | | | |
| | | | |

1793

1 Friday Morning Session, September 11, 2015. 2 3 4 EXAMINER CHILES: Let's go on the record. 5 The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 6 has called for hearing at this time Case No. 7 14-1297-EL-SSO being In the Matter of the Application 8 of Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric 9 Illuminating Company, and, the Toledo Edison Company 10 for Authority to Provide for a Standard Service Offer pursuant to Revised Code 4928.143 in the Form of an 11 12 Electric Security Plan. 13 My name is Mandy Chiles, and with me are 14 Gregory Price and Megan Addison, and we are the 15 Attorney Examiners assigned to hear this case. 16 At this time we will waive appearances 17 this morning. 18 EXAMINER PRICE: Mr. Alexander, you have 19 one bit of housekeeping for us? 2.0 MR. ALEXANDER: Yes, your Honor. 2.1 Yesterday at the end of the public session, Mr. 22 Lisowski inadvertently mentioned some confidential 23 information at the end of the public session, so the 24 companies would move to move page 1737, line 18,

through page 1738, line 11, into the confidential

25

```
1794
      portion of the transcript.
 1
                  EXAMINER PRICE: Any objections?
 2
 3
                  MR. MCNAMEE: No.
                  EXAMINER PRICE: The Bench will direct
 4
 5
      the reporters to put that section on the confidential
      portion of the transcript.
 6
 7
                  MR. ALEXANDER: Thank you, your Honor.
 8
                   (CONFIDENTIAL PORTION EXCERPTED.)
 9
10
11
12
1.3
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
2.1
22
23
24
25
```

CERTIFICATE I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the proceedings taken by me in this matter on Friday, September 11, 2015, and carefully compared with my original stenographic notes. Carol A. Kirk, RPR, RMR. (CAK - 79262)

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

9/25/2015 2:36:05 PM

in

Case No(s). 14-1297-EL-SSO

Summary: Transcript In the Matter of the application of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company hearing held on 09/11/15 - Volume IX electronically filed by Mr. Ken Spencer on behalf of Armstrong & Okey, Inc. and Anderson, Rosemary Foster Mrs.