#### BEFORE THE OHIO POWER SITING BOARD

)

)

)

)

)

In the Matter of the Application of NRG Ohio Pipeline Company, LLC, for a Letter of Notification to Construct, Own, and Operate a Natural Gas Pipeline to be Located in Lorain County, Ohio

Case No. 14-1717-GA-BLN

#### MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE DIRECT TESTIMONY OF BRANDON & MARY THORNE, *INSTANTER*

Brandon and Mary Thorne by and through undersigned counsel respectfully move the Ohio Power Siting Board or Administrative Law Judge for permission to submit their direct testimony. Mr. and Mrs. Thorne submitted their testimony in a timely manner on April 13, 2015. On April 15, 2015, the undersigned filed their Notice of Filing Direct Testimony on Behalf of Lorain County Property Owners and attached the direct testimony of 16 Property Owners.<sup>1</sup> The testimony of Mr. and Mrs. Thorne was inadvertently not included in the April 15, 2015, filing.

Mr. and Mrs. Thorne have made special arrangements to be present at the hearing on Friday, April 24, 2015, and Mrs. Thorne is prepared to give her live testimony. The undersigned respectfully request that they be allowed to file the Direct Testimony of Brandon and Mary Thorne, *instanter*. The Direct Testimony of Brandon and Mary

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Lorain County Property Owners who submitted their Direct Testimony were: Louis and Gail Betzel; Charles Borling; Richard and Ellen Braatz; Gary and Kathleen Conlin; Wesley A. Parker; Samuel Dennis; Father Lorenzo Tosco; Mark D. Julius; Tom and Johanna Julius; John Eavenson on behalf of K. Hovnanian Homes; Tom Oster on behalf of K. Hovnanian Homes; Martins and Irene Kaulins; Robert Kubasak; Mary B. Miller; Stephanie Kay Unger; and Sheryl L. Vajda.

Thorne is attached hereto as Exhibit "A" and incorporated herein by referenced as if fully rewritten.

Respectfully submitted,

GOLDMAN & BRAUNSTEIN, LLP

/s/ Michael Braunstein Michael Braunstein (0060898) Braunstein@GBlegal.net

/s/ William A. Goldman William A. Goldman (0031362) Goldman@GBlegal.net

Clinton P. Stahler (0092560) <u>Stahler@GBlegal.net</u> Of-Counsel to Crabbe, Brown & James, LLP 500 South Front Street, Suite 1200 Columbus, OH 43215 (614) 229-4540/Telephone (614) 229-4568/Facsimile *Attorneys for Lorain County Property Owners* 

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing *MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE DIRECT TESTIMONY OF BRANDON & MARY THORNE, INSTANTER* has been filed with the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio and has been served upon the following parties via electronic mail this 22<sup>ND</sup> day of April 2015.

> <u>/s/\_Michael Braunstein</u> Michael Braunstein (0060898)

## PARTIES SERVED [SEE FOLLOWING PAGE]

John Jones Ohio Power Siting Board 180 East Broad Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215 John.Jones@puc.state.oh.us

Sally W. Bloomfield Dylan F. Borchers Teresa Orahood Thomas O'Brien Bricker & Eckler, LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291 <u>sbloomfield@bricker.com</u> <u>dborchers@bricker.com</u> <u>torahood@bricker.com</u> <u>tobrien@bricker.com</u>

Robert J. Schmidt, Jr. Lawrence Bradfield Hughes Porter, Wright, Morris & Arthur, LLP 41 South High Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 <u>rschmidt@porterwright.com</u> <u>bhughes@porterwright.com</u>

Anne Rericha First Energy Service Company 76 South Main Street Akron, Ohio 44308 arericha@firstenergycorp.com

Matt Butler Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 180 East Broad Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 <u>Matthew.Butler@puc.state.oh.us</u>

Sandra Coffey Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 180 East Broad Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 Sandra.Coffey@puc.state.oh.us

## BEFORE THE OHIO POWER SITING BOARD

)

)

)

)

In the Matter of the Application of NRG Ohio Pipeline Company LLC for Approval of a Letter of Notification For the Avon Lake Gas Addition Project in Lorain County, Ohio

Case No. 14-1717-GA-BLN

## DIRECT TESTIMONY OF

# Brandon & Mary Thorne

April 13, 2015



1	(1)	Please state your name.	
2		Brandon and Mary Thorne	
3	(2)	What is your address?	
4		37570 Eagle Nest Dr. Grafton, OH 44044	
5	(3)	Has NRG filed an appropriation suit against you?	
6		Yes	
7	(4)	Do you own the property NRG seeks to acquire?	
8		Yes	
9	(5)	Do you currently have a mortgage on that property?	
10		Yes	
11	(6)	Is there a house on the property?	
12		Yes	
13	(7)	Do you reside on that property?	
14		Yes	
15	(8)	How long have you resided there?	
16		5 years 8 months	
17	(9)	Who else resides there?	
18		Our children.	
19	(10)	Have you been shown diagrams of the proposed pipeline right-of-way on your	
20 property?			
21		Yes	
22	(11)	What are your primary concerns regarding NRG's use of your property for a	
23	pipeline right-of-way?		

•

24		a. Safety – family, children, personal property;
25		b. Real Property value;
26		c. Aesthetic damage, tree removal, etc.;
27		d. Disruption during construction; and
28		e. Future disruption.
29	(12)	In your opinion, how will the pipeline positively or negatively impact you and your
30	pr	operty?
31		It will negatively affect our property value and make it difficult to sell our house to a
32		future homebuyer. Also the aesthetic value will decrease because currently the trees block
33		the power lines, which will further decrease devalue our property. Furthermore, it will
34		affect our children, as they will not have all the trees and grassy areas to play. It will
35		disrupt their daily lives while trying to sleep with loud noises during the construction.
36	(13)	Have you had any direct contact with NRG or its land agents regarding the pipeline
37	pr	roject?
38		Yes, until we hired a lawyer.
39	(14)	Describe those conversations.
40		Conversations involved informing us that we have to allow them to take our property,
41		price negotiations, and diagrams of our property and where they want to work.
42	(15)	Did NRG demonstrate receptiveness to the concerns you raised? Please explain.
43		No. They are not offering a fair price. They want to take our entire back yard where are
44		children play, trees and privacy. They also want to put a temporary access road in our
45		yard for which we refuse due to our young children.
46	(16)	Do you have any further comments?

47		It's a shame that the company insists tearing up this small, quiet neighborhood when	
48		there are other routes around the neighborhood that they can go instead, which also would	
49		involve less amounts of trees and personal property being destroyed permanently.	
50	(17)	Please indicate whether your property has woodlands that will be affected by the	
51	l pipeline.		
52		Yes, we have plenty of woodlands affected by this pipeline.	
53	(18)	Please indicate whether your property has wetlands that will be affected by the	
54	pipeline.		
55	N	o, I do not believe we have wetlands.	

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

4/22/2015 2:15:12 PM

in

Case No(s). 14-1717-GA-BLN

Summary: Testimony MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE DIRECT TESTIMONY OF BRANDON AND MARY THORNE, INSTANTER electronically filed by Mr. MICHAEL BRAUNSTEIN on behalf of Thorne, Brandon & Mary