

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio	)	
Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric	)	
Illuminating Company and The Toledo	)	
Edison Company for Authority to Provide for	)	Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO
a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to R.C.	)	
4928.143 in the Form of and Electric Security	)	
Plan.	)	

---

**JOINT MOTION TO INTERVENE  
BY THE  
OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL and ENVIRONMENTAL DEFENSE FUND**

---

Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code § 4903.22.1 and Ohio Admin. Code § 4901-1-11, the Environmental Defense Fund (“EDF”) and the Ohio Environmental Council (“OEC”), move for leave to intervene in the above captioned case, in which Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company (“First Energy” or “the Companies”) submit its Application for Authority to Provide a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to ORC §4928.143, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan (“Application”). As more fully discussed in the accompanying memorandum, EDF and OEC have a real and substantial interest in this proceeding. The interests of EDF and OEC are not represented by any existing party; participation in this proceeding will contribute to a just and expeditious resolution of the issues involved without unduly delaying the proceeding or unjustly prejudicing any existing party; and thereby move to intervene in this proceeding pursuant to R.C. 4903.221 and O.A.C. 4901-1-11.

WHEREFORE, EDF and OEC respectfully request that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio grant EDF and OEC’s motion to intervene for these reasons and those set forth in the attached Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/Trent Dougherty

---

Trent Dougherty, **Counsel of Record**  
(0079817)

1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201

Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449

(614) 487-7506 - Telephone

(614) 487-7510 - Fax

[tdougherty@theOEC.org](mailto:tdougherty@theOEC.org)

John Finnigan (0018689)

128 Winding Brook Lane

Terrace Park, Ohio 45174

(513) 226-9558

[jfinnigan@edf.org](mailto:jfinnigan@edf.org)

**Counsel for the Ohio Environmental  
Council and Environmental Defense  
Fund**

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio	)	
Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric	)	
Illuminating Company and The Toledo	)	
Edison Company for Authority to Provide for	)	Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO
a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to R.C.	)	
4928.143 in the Form of and Electric Security	)	
Plan.	)	

---

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

---

R.C. Section 4903.221 provides that any “person who may be adversely affected by a public utilities commission proceeding may intervene in such proceeding.”

EDF is a national non-profit membership organization engaged in linking science, economics and law to create innovative, equitable and cost-effective solutions to society’s most urgent environmental problems. EDF has over 300,000 members nationwide and has 9,590 members in Ohio. EDF has been active in Ohio working on environmental policies including smart power, climate change, natural gas fracking and sustainable agriculture. EDF also supports state energy policies that reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

The OEC is a non-profit, charitable organization comprised of a network of over 100 affiliated member groups whose mission is to secure healthy air, land, and water for all who call Ohio home. Throughout its 44-year history, OEC has been a leading advocate for fresh air, clean water, and sustainable energy use in Ohio. OEC was an active participant in the effort that led to the passage of S.B. 221, and has intervened in scores of cases before this Commission to secure proper implementation of Ohio’s clean energy laws.

As discussed below, EDF and OEC have an interest in and may be adversely affected by the disposition of this case.

R.C. 4903.221(B) outlines four factors that the Commission shall consider when ruling on a motion to intervene in a proceeding. First, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(1), the Commission shall consider “the nature and extent of the prospective intervenor’s interest.” EDF and OEC have a real and substantial interest in the stability of retail electricity service and competitive energy markets, and the positive effect both have on the further deployment of cost-effective clean and efficient energy in Ohio. As environmental advocacy organizations, EDF and OEC have a special interest in the outcome of this case because of the direct impact that decisions on the Application and its included tariffs and riders will have on the current and future implementation and effectiveness of alternative energy resources, renewable energy generation, energy efficiency and demand response in the state. Accordingly, EDF and OEC’s interest in this proceeding arise from the direct and indirect impacts that the issues presented will have on the environment of the state of Ohio and the region, and the electricity costs of their members in the First Energy service territory.

Second, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(2), the Commission shall consider “The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case.” Although EDF and OEC do not outline detailed legal arguments in this section, OEC maintains that First Energy’s Application should be properly scrutinized by interested parties to ensure that it complies with the letter and intent of the state’s energy law and stated state energy policies.

Third, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(3), the Commission shall consider “Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceedings.” EDF

and OEC have significant experience dealing with electric utilities questions before the Commission and will not seek to delay the proceeding. OEC has been consistently involved in the development and enactment of S.B. 221 and the associated rules, including as a party in numerous cases before the Commission, and EDF has litigated such cases in Ohio as well as in other Public Utility Commissions around the United States. Thus, intervention will not unduly prolong or delay these proceedings, but will add value to the development of this case.

Fourth, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(4), the Commission shall consider “Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.” EDF and OEC have developed expertise that will contribute to the full development of the legal questions involved in this proceeding. Further, as Ohio’s leading environmental advocates, EDF and OEC will be able to assure that the environmental impacts of the Companies’ proposal are fully developed.

EDF and OEC also satisfy the intervention requirements outlined in the Commission’s rules. The criteria for intervention established by O.A.C. 4901-1-11(A) are identical to those provided by R.C. 4903.221, with the exception that the rules add a fifth factor that the Commission shall consider when ruling on a motion to intervene. Pursuant to O.A.C. 4901-1-11(A)(5), the Commission shall consider “The extent to which the [intervenor’s] interest is represented by existing parties.” EDF and OEC’s interest is not fully represented by the existing parties.

Finally, we point out that it is the Commission’s stated policy “to encourage the broadest possible participation in its proceedings.”<sup>1</sup> The Commission should not apply its intervention criteria in a manner that would favor one environmental or consumer advocate to the exclusion of others.

---

<sup>1</sup> *Cleveland Elec. Illum. Co.*, Case No. 85-675-EL-AIR, Entry dated January 14, 1986, at 2.

OEC meets all the criteria established by R.C. 4903.221 and O.A.C. 4901-1-11(A)(5) and therefore should be granted intervenor status in this proceeding.

WHEREFORE, OEC respectfully requests that the Commission grant its motion to intervene in the above captioned matter.

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/Trent Dougherty

Trent Dougherty, Counsel of Record  
(0079817)

1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201

Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449

(614) 487-7506 - Telephone

(614) 487-7510 - Fax

[tdougherty@theOEC.org](mailto:tdougherty@theOEC.org)

John Finnigan (0018689)

128 Winding Brook Lane

Terrace Park, Ohio 45174

(513) 226-9558

[jfinnigan@edf.org](mailto:jfinnigan@edf.org)

**Counsel for the Ohio Environmental  
Council and Environmental Defense  
Fund**

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing has been served upon the following parties by electronic mail this 26th day of September, 2014.

/s/Trent Dougherty

Trent Dougherty

James W. Burk  
Carrie M. Dunn  
FirstEnergy Service Company  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, OH 44308  
[burkj@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:burkj@firstenergycorp.com)  
[cdunn@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:cdunn@firstenergycorp.com)

David A. Kutik  
Jones Day  
901 Lakeside Avenue  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
[dakutik@jonesday.com](mailto:dakutik@jonesday.com)

James F. Lang  
N. Trevor Alexander  
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP  
The Calfee Building  
1405 East Sixth Street  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
[jang@calfee.com](mailto:jang@calfee.com)  
[tallexander@calfee.com](mailto:tallexander@calfee.com)

Michael L. Kurtz  
Kurt J. Boehm  
Jody Kyler Cohn  
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry  
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
[mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com](mailto:mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com)  
[kboem@BKLawfirm.com](mailto:kboem@BKLawfirm.com)  
[jkylercohn@BKLawfirm.com](mailto:jkylercohn@BKLawfirm.com)

Attorney General's Office  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
180 E. Broad St., 6th Fl.  
Columbus, OH 43215  
[William.Wright@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:William.Wright@puc.state.oh.us)

Samuel C. Randazzo  
Frank P. Darr  
Matthew R. Pritchard  
McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC  
21 East State Street, 17th Fl.  
Columbus, OH 43215  
[sam@mwncmh.com](mailto:sam@mwncmh.com)  
[fdarr@mwncmh.com](mailto:fdarr@mwncmh.com)  
[mpritchard@mwncmh.com](mailto:mpritchard@mwncmh.com)

Steven T. Nourse  
Matthew J. Satterwhite  
Yazen Alami  
AEP Service Corporation  
1 Riverside Plaza 29th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
[stnourse@aep.com](mailto:stnourse@aep.com)  
[mjsatterwhite@aep.com](mailto:mjsatterwhite@aep.com)  
[yalami@aep.com](mailto:yalami@aep.com)

Christopher J. Allwein  
Nolan M. Moser  
Williams Allwein and Moser, LLC  
1500 West Third Ave, Suite 330  
Columbus, Ohio 43212  
[callwein@wamenergylaw.com](mailto:callwein@wamenergylaw.com)

Larry Sauer  
Kevin Moore  
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel  
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
[Larry.sauer@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:Larry.sauer@occ.ohio.gov)  
[Kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:Kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov)

Colleen L. Mooney  
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy  
231 West Lima Street  
Findlay, OH 45839-1793  
[cmooney@ohiopartners.org](mailto:cmooney@ohiopartners.org)

Joseph M. Clark  
21 East State Street, 19th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
[joseph.clark@directenergy.com](mailto:joseph.clark@directenergy.com)

Gerit F. Hull  
Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC  
1717 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., 12th  
Floor  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
[ghull@eckertseamans.com](mailto:ghull@eckertseamans.com)

Joseph Olikier  
Matthew White  
IGS Energy  
6100 Emerald Parkway  
Dublin, Ohio 43016  
[joliker@igsenergy.com](mailto:joliker@igsenergy.com)  
[mswhite@igsenergy.com](mailto:mswhite@igsenergy.com)

O. Judson Scheaf, III  
McDonald Hopkins LLC  
240 North Fifth Street  
Suite 300  
Columbus, OH 43215  
[jscheaf@mcdonaldhopkins.com](mailto:jscheaf@mcdonaldhopkins.com)

Barbara A. Langhenry  
Harold Madorsky  
Kate E. Ryan  
601 Lakeside Ave, Room 106  
Cleveland, OH 44114-1077  
[blanghenry@city.cleveland.oh.us](mailto:blanghenry@city.cleveland.oh.us)  
[hmadorsky@city.cleveland.oh.us](mailto:hmadorsky@city.cleveland.oh.us)  
[kryan@city.cleveland.oh.us](mailto:kryan@city.cleveland.oh.us)

Lisa M. Hawrot  
Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC  
Century Centre Building  
1233 Main Street, Suite 4000  
Wheeling, WV 26003  
[lhawrot@spilmanlaw.com](mailto:lhawrot@spilmanlaw.com)

Derrick Price Williamson  
Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC  
1100 Bent Creek Blvd., Suite 101  
Mechanicsburg, PA 17050  
[dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com](mailto:dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com)

Christopher L. Miller  
Gregory H. Dunn  
Jeremy M. Grayem  
Ice Miller LLP  
250 West Street  
Columbus, OH 43215  
[Christopher.Miller@icemiller.com](mailto:Christopher.Miller@icemiller.com)  
[Gregory.Dunn@icemiller.com](mailto:Gregory.Dunn@icemiller.com)  
[Jeremy.Grayem@icemiller.com](mailto:Jeremy.Grayem@icemiller.com)

Craig I. Smith  
Attorney at Law  
15700 Van Aken Boulevard  
Suite 26  
Shaker Heights, OH 44120  
[wttplmce@aol.com](mailto:wttplmce@aol.com)

Barth E. Royer  
Bell & Royer Co., LPA  
33 South Grant Avenue  
Columbus, OH 43215-3927  
[barthroyer@aol.com](mailto:barthroyer@aol.com)

Adrian Thompson  
Taft Stettinius & Hollister LLP  
200 Public Square, Suite 3500  
Cleveland, OH 44114-2302  
[athompson@taftlaw.com](mailto:athompson@taftlaw.com)

Attorney Examiners:  
[Gregory.Price@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:Gregory.Price@puc.state.oh.us)  
[Mandy.Willey@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:Mandy.Willey@puc.state.oh.us)

Kimberly W. Bojko  
Jonathon A. Allison  
Rebecca Hussey  
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP  
280 North High Street  
280 Plaza, Suite 1300  
Columbus, OH 43215  
[Bojko@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:Bojko@carpenterlipps.com)  
[Allison@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:Allison@carpenterlipps.com)  
[Hussey@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:Hussey@carpenterlipps.com)

Thomas J. O'Brien  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, OH 43215-4291  
[tobrien@bricker.com](mailto:tobrien@bricker.com)

Richard L. Sites  
General Counsel & Senior Director of  
Health Policy  
Ohio Hospital Association  
155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-3620  
[ricks@ohanet.org](mailto:ricks@ohanet.org)

Mark S. Yurick  
Zachary D. Kravitz  
Taft Stettinius & Hollister LLP  
65 E. State Street, Suite 1000  
Columbus, OH 43215  
[myurick@taftlaw.com](mailto:myurick@taftlaw.com)  
[zkravitz@taftlaw.com](mailto:zkravitz@taftlaw.com)

Kevin R. Schmidt  
Energy Professionals of Ohio  
88 East Broad Street, Suite 1770  
Columbus, OH 43215  
[Schmidt@sppgrp.com](mailto:Schmidt@sppgrp.com)

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**9/26/2014 9:44:43 AM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 14-1297-EL-SSO**

Summary: Motion JOINT MOTION TO INTERVENE AND MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT BY  
THE OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL & ENVIRONMENTAL DEFENSE FUND

electronically filed by Mr. Trent A Dougherty on behalf of Ohio Environmental Council and  
Environmental Defense Fund