

FILE

13-0990-EL-BGN

14

From: Adam.Schwiebert@ohiohouse.gov [mailto:Adam.Schwiebert@ohiohouse.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, August 20, 2014 3:51 PM
To: Keegan, Jack
Subject: Ohio Power Siting Board Documents

Hey Jack,

I'm about to forward a few emails that we received from a constituent regarding a pending issue at the Ohio Power Siting Board. The constituent, Ms. Malicki, would like to have these documents considered as part of the Power Siting Board's deliberations. Our office has agreed to pass along these documents, and I believe that she has submitted them independently to the Board as well.

If you could make sure the emails find their way to the Power Siting Board, we would greatly appreciate it. The specific project under consideration is the Greenwich Windpark, case number 13-0990-EL-BGN.

Thank you!

Adam Schwiebert
Legislative Aide
State Representative Terry Boose
(614) 466-9628
adam.schwiebert@ohiohouse.gov

RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV
2014 AUG 21 AM 11:34
PUCO

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.
Technician FL Date Processed AUG 21 2014

From: Rep57@ohiohouse.gov [mailto:Rep57@ohiohouse.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, August 20, 2014 3:56 PM
To: Keegan, Jack
Subject: FW: Medical doctor sees Wind Turbine Syndrome in his patients (Vermont)

Email 1 regarding Greenwich Windpark

Adam Schwiebert

Legislative Aide
State Representative Terry Boose
(614) 466-9628
adam.schwiebert@ohiohouse.gov

From: Valerie Malicki [mailto:valeriechristina@rocketmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 20, 2014 12:55 PM
To: Rep57; connieoney@frontier.com; kaledet1@gmail.com
Subject: Medical doctor sees Wind Turbine Syndrome in his patients (Vermont)

Check this out: <http://www.windturbinesyndrome.com/2014/medical-doctor-sees-wind-turbine-syndrome-in-his-patients-vermont/>

Mr. Boose,

This is the article, hi Dr Sandy Reider, Harvard graduate, practicing medicine for 42 years.

"I have no doubt at all that these large turbines can and do cause serious health problems in a significant number of persons living nearby..."

"There is simply no clinical justification for ignoring harm being done to individuals and communities..."

" A 1 to 2 kilometers setback is not nearly sufficient significant low frequency sound pressure measurements have been recorded in homes 3-6 miles..."

The decibel prediction/"requirement" for our project is not nearly sufficient as the chart in the article shows it must be less than 35 decibels. Audible sound should not exceed 35 decibels, period. Our project is rated for an ambient 51 decibels, meaning it can go much more above this.

Again I send in attachment the graph by acoustic engineers that shows the response in our community will be strong appeals to stop the noise and vigorous community action. This noise level actually goes above the Vermont noise limit.

Thank you for your attention to this immediate, pressing matter in the lives of your constituents.

We tried to get another meeting that failed. Please help us.

Respectfully,

Valerie C. Malicki, MA, LPCC

Sent from Yahoo Mail on Android

From: Rep57@ohiohouse.gov [mailto:Rep57@ohiohouse.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, August 20, 2014 3:57 PM
To: Keegan, Jack
Subject: FW: case#13-0990-EL-BGN Comments from Ted Hartke

Email # 2 from constituent regarding Greenwich Windpark

Adam Schwiebert

Legislative Aide
State Representative Terry Boose
(614) 466-9628
adam.schwiebert@ohiohouse.gov

From: Valerie Malicki [mailto:valeriechristina@rocketmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 20, 2014 1:30 PM
To: valeriemalicki@gmail.com; Rep57
Subject: Re: case#13-0990-EL-BGN Comments from Ted Hartke

Mr. Boose,

Ensuring this sent accurately also.

Thank you, Valerie Malicki

Sent from Yahoo Mail on Android

From: Ted Hartke <tedhartke@hartke.pro>;
To: <contactOPSB@puc.state.oh.us>;
Subject: case#13-0990-EL-BGN Comments from Ted Hartke
Sent: Wed, Aug 20, 2014 3:55:46 AM

Dear Mr. Johnson, Mr. Daniels, Mr. Goodman, Mr. Butler, Mr. Hodges, Mr. Zehringer, Mr. Lechak, and other Ohio Power Siting Board Leaders,

My name is Ted Hartke. I am an Illinois Licensed Professional Engineer and also an Illinois Professional Land Surveyor. I was the president of the Illinois Professional Land Surveyors Association and I am the sole owner of Hartke Engineering and Surveying, Inc. I was raised on a farm in a small rural farming community. My parents, grandparents, and great grandparents were all farmers. My brother, David Hartke, was the president of the Illinois Soybean Association and serves on the National Soybean Board. My wife, father, 3 uncles, and grandfather all possess the American Farmer Degree. This is the highest service award given by the FFA. My Uncle, Charles "Chuck" Hartke was the Illinois Secretary of Agriculture. My wife, Dr. Jessica Hartke, has a PhD from the University of Illinois Division of Nutritional Sciences. I am providing you with this background information with the hopes that you understand I come from a family which has a strong public service, agricultural, and professional

backgrounds which are highly regarded and respected here in Illinois.

When we first learned of the project to be constructed near our home, I never feared the possibility that wind turbines would negatively affect me and my family. I made a visit to a wind farm near Bloomington (Illinois) during the daytime for a 20 minute "experience" to see how big they were and how much noise they made. My wife and I mistakenly thought everything was going to be "just fine," and we had no worries about the possible impacts these turbines around our house would have on us. We, along with our county board who approved the InvEnergy project here, dismissed the "anti-wind activists" as "crazy fear mongering people with baseless accusations." Based on our visit to this existing wind farm, with much smaller turbines than what are being constructed now, we supported the idea of wind energy up until the wind turbines located near my home started producing electricity.

The nearest industrial wind turbines are now 1665' and 2225' from the foundation of my house. Immediately, when the turbines began operating, my wife, myself, our 9 year old son, and 6 year old daughter all began having severe sleep deprivation from wind turbine low frequency noise. This issue affects us and approximately 20 households in our neighborhood within InvEnergy's wind farm. We have not been successful with finding any resolution through soundproofing our home or any other offset to make it possible to sleep in our home. We have tried earplugs, headphones, box fans, ceiling fans, noise machines, moving our beds into our living room (in the center of the house), but none of these things we tried solved the issue of wind turbine noise which enters into our house and disturbs sleep.

Our health immediately deteriorated, our children started getting bad grades in school, I was having memory problems and issues which kept me from being productive at work. My wife suffered the most with severe health complications. Our marriage suffered while Jess and I argued about what we were going to do to address this new problem caused by wind turbines. We have endured sleepless nights, headaches, nausea, vomiting, episodes of irritability and extreme discomfort.

Now, I have a perfectly wonderful home which we cannot use for its intended purposes. (See attachment.) We abandoned it, and we now live in a temporary home so our kids could continue to attend the same school. Our house has been for sale for months, and we have no takers. Our neighbors have had appraisals done on their homes, and all of those appraisals have had severe property value losses with wind turbine proximity listed as the reason for the deduction. It is hard to describe the hurt and anger we feel each time we pass by our perfectly wonderful home (except for the nearby wind turbines) on our way to and from work each day.

For the sake of protecting the health of rural residents and to protect the investment of land and homes, please do not approve any wind turbine placements within a half mile of a home. This low frequency noise issue has become the unsolved unintended consequence which causes a great health impact for neighbors. Our experience is not unique in any way as there are hundreds of households who have reported the same or amazingly similar experiences in their homes. Please follow the World Health Organization and US EPA noise standards for the noise limits to maintain healthy sleep for children. Please consider the noise reports from Steve Ambrose, Rob Rand, Rick James, Dr. Moeller, Dr. Salt, and others who have proven that the low

frequency noise is a common denominator to the sleep deprivation health impacts. If you do not follow those tried and true standards, you will be allowing an industry to have rubber-stamped permission to take the health of Greenwich residents. Other wind turbine noise victims who have been outspoken like us include DaveENZ, Cary Shineldecker, Gina Isabelli, Dave and Jean Miles, Barbara Draper, LuAnne Therrien, Sue Hobart, etc, etc.

The wind industry still cloaks themselves in a layer of denial. Human populations have recognized the connection with cigarette smoke, lead paint, PCB's, asbestos, DDT, and other harmful things which started out as "harmless/helpful/enjoyable" things which satisfied us with entertainment, non-fading long lasting surface paint, helpful chemical compounds, pesticides, etc. In these cases, it took too long for the general population to demand a corrective action to protect ourselves and the environment around us.

After reading this, ask yourself if you would live within a wind energy complex and expose yourselves and your loved ones to the constant presence of wind turbines and their negative affects. Please be compelled to accept my personal experience as the truth. I have nothing to gain by contacting you, financially or otherwise, except to make my best effort to convince you to NOT hurt families by condemning them with industrial wind turbine noise. I am not paid and have not received any promises of payment for any of my efforts to share the details and facts about our situation. I do this so that the sacrifices of my family are used to help others.

My contact information is below if you have any questions or would like to verify any of this information and statements. I attached a handout which shows photos and explanations of more specific details about the issues we encountered. Please do not approve any wind turbine placements near anyone's home. Doing this to them is absolutely wrong.

Best regards,

Ted

Theodore P. Hartke, PE, PLS
President
Hartke Engineering and Surveying, Inc.
117 S. East Avenue P.O. Box 123
Ogden, Illinois 61859 217.840.1612
tedhartke@hartke.pro

From: Rep57@ohiohouse.gov [mailto:Rep57@ohiohouse.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, August 20, 2014 3:57 PM
To: Keegan, Jack
Subject: FW: Physician calls for 10 km setbacks (Australia)

Email # 3 regarding Greenwich Windpark

Adam Schwiebert

Legislative Aide

State Representative Terry Boose

(614) 466-9628

adam.schwiebert@ohiohouse.gov

From: Valerie Malicki [mailto:valeriemalicki@gmail.com]
Sent: Sunday, July 06, 2014 6:08 PM
To: main@hccommissioners.com; Rep57
Subject: Physician calls for 10 km setbacks (Australia)

Check this out: <http://www.windturbinesyndrome.com/2011/physician-calls-for-10-km-setbacks-australia/>

From: Rep57@ohiohouse.gov [mailto:Rep57@ohiohouse.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, August 20, 2014 3:58 PM
To: Keegan, Jack
Subject: FW: "Imagine being bombarded day & night by volleys of acoustic artillery, much of it low frequency and infrasonic" (Dr. Pierpont)

Email #4 regarding Greenwich Windpark

Adam Schwiebert

Legislative Aide
State Representative Terry Boose
(614) 466-9628
adam.schwiebert@ohiohouse.gov

From: Valerie Malicki [mailto:valeriemalicki@gmail.com]
Sent: Friday, July 04, 2014 2:23 PM
To: main@hccommissioners.com; Rep57
Subject: "Imagine being bombarded day & night by volleys of acoustic artillery, much of it low frequency and infrasonic" (Dr. Pierpont)

Check this out: <http://www.windturbinesyndrome.com/2014/imagine-being-bombarded-day-and-night-by-volleys-of-acoustic-artillery-nina-pierpont/>

From: Rep57@ohiohouse.gov [mailto:Rep57@ohiohouse.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, August 20, 2014 3:59 PM
To: Keegan, Jack
Subject: FW: "Wind Turbines Caused 1600 Miscarriages On Fur Farm"

Email #6

Adam Schwiebert
Legislative Aide
State Representative Terry Boose
(614) 466-9628
adam.schwiebert@ohiohouse.gov

From: valeriechristina via PrintFriendly [mailto:no-reply@printfriendly.com]
Sent: Wednesday, June 11, 2014 5:39 PM
To: Rep57
Subject: "Wind Turbines Caused 1600 Miscarriages On Fur Farm"

valeriechristina@rocketmail.com sent you an article

Wind turbine deadly effects
"Wind Turbines Caused 1600 Miscarriages On Fur Farm"

. . Editor's note: We reported on this story the other day. It's going viral — as it should! Writes Mark Duchamp on behalf of the World Council for Nature, which broke the story on worldwide media: This scandal is likely to mark a turning point in the struggle against wind turbines. Because it is no longer a question of "noise," "nuisance," or "quality of life." There is now...

[Read More](#) [Print & PDF](#)

▪

From: Rep57@ohiohouse.gov [mailto:Rep57@ohiohouse.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, August 20, 2014 3:59 PM
To: Keegan, Jack
Subject: FW: turbines

Email #7

Adam Schwiebert

Legislative Aide
State Representative Terry Boose
(614) 466-9628
adam.schwiebert@ohiohouse.gov

From: valeriechristina@rocketmail.com [mailto:valeriechristina@rocketmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, June 11, 2014 6:21 PM
To: Sarah Laurie
Cc: vogelja@frontier.com; Rep57
Subject: Re: turbines

These are article(s) from australian and ceo of waubra foundation, dr sarah laurie. She is keenly aware, unfortunately, of all the health issues people living near turbines have. Also, have you contacted opsB yet? I see "chief david siedel" sent in two more letters of support for his self centered irresponsible project. The public record is public. Trying to inform as many people of that as possible. The email is: contactOPSB@puc.state.oh.us Fyi.
Valerie :)

From: Sarah Laurie <sarahlaurie63@gmail.com>;
To: Valerie Malicki <valeriechristina@rocketmail.com>;
Subject: Re: DOWN WIND purchase
Sent: Fri, Jun 6, 2014 11:35:11 PM

Dear Valerie

its a pleasure. Its the momma bear thing in us all

I just hate the thought of so many people suffering so badly.

This is another even more recent summary which brings in the human rights abuse issue:

and below is an extract from someone else's letter which might also be useful for you to use - there are other links up on our website which could be useful for you. (the details about other breaches of human rights are here: <http://waubrafoundation.org.au/resources/un-convention-rights-child-and-canadas-role/>)

and this letter from a Canadian lawyer is still useful and

detailed: <http://waubrafoundation.org.au/resources/gillespie-e-letter-canadian-prime-minister-premiers-attorneys-general-re-human-rights-wind-facilities/>

Below is part of a letter sent by someone else about this human rights issue with a relevant quote from the "Leave no marks" document which may also be useful for you to use - Sleep deprivation is the commonest complaint of residents living near wind turbines around the world:

Perhaps it will help if I point out that what we have here is information which outlines and demonstrates why this is actually a *human rights* issue. In this respect it would also be informative to examine the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and Canada's Role Part 1 of 6 Competence, Safety, Health. Also: <http://physiciansforhumanrights.org/library/reports/leave-no-marks-report-2007.html> which very clearly describes the effects of sleep deprivation, a common effect experienced reported upon and measured, by those forced to live in proximity to wind farms.

Extracts. ¹⁸⁹ It causes significant cognitive impairments including deficits in memory, learning, logical reasoning, complex verbal processing, and decision-making; sleep appears to play an important role in processes such as memory and insight formation.¹⁹⁰ Sleep deprivation may also result in decreases in psychomotor performance as well as alterations in mood.¹⁹¹ In recent years, a growing body of research has emerged that points to the complex and bidirectional relationships between sleep disturbance and psychiatric disorders. For example, evidence suggests that sleep disturbance is not only a symptom of major depression¹⁹² but it also independently affects the clinical outcome and the course of the disorder.¹⁹³ Moreover, sleep disturbance seems to be associated with an independent increase in the risk of suicidal ideation and actions.

Physical Pain or Suffering

Even sleep restriction of four hours per night for less than a week can result in physical harm, including hypertension, cardiovascular disease, altered glucose tolerance and insulin resistance.¹⁹⁵ Sleep deprivation can impair immune function and result in increased risk of infectious diseases.¹⁹⁶ Further, chronic pain syndromes are associated with alterations in sleep continuity and sleep patterns.¹⁹⁷

Legal Analysis

The psychological impact of sleep deprivation supports the conclusion that it would constitute torture cruel or inhuman treatment for the purposes of criminal prosecution. Sleep deprivation is known to cause mental harm — such as the deleterious psychological and neurological effects of depression and anxiety disorders — that is both prolonged and non-transitory. Sleep deprivation also is calculated to “disrupt the senses or personality” because it is designed to break down the subject’s resistance, affect mood, and disrupt memory. Moreover, known physical effects of sleep deprivation suggest that even its limited use may cause “severe” or “serious” physical harm and therefore may amount to “torture” or “cruel or inhuman treatment.” Indeed, during the floor debate of the MCA, Senator Durbin stated that the Act’s amendments to the WCA would criminalize prolonged sleep deprivation.¹⁹⁸ U.S. federal courts have also recognized sleep deprivation by other countries as torture.²⁰² Subsequently, U.S. federal courts have held that sleep deprivation constitutes a violation of the Eighth Amendment’s protection from cruel and inhuman punishment because sleep is “considered a basic life necessity.” On Jun 7, 2014, at 8:22 AM, Valerie Malicki wrote:

Awesome! just printed your article, so others could read it, March 18th, 2014 open letter.

you all have been so helpful and I'm grateful :)

From: Sarah Laurie <sarahlaurie63@gmail.com>;
To: Valerie Malicki <valeriechristina@rocketmail.com>;
Subject: Fwd: DOWN WIND purchase
Sent: Fri, Jun 6, 2014 11:09:06 PM

here you go

Begin forwarded message:

From: Sherri Lange <kodaisl@rogers.com>
Date: June 7, 2014 1:48:52 AM GMT+09:30
To: undisclosed recipients: ;
Subject: DOWN WIND purchase
Reply-To: Sherri Lange <kodaisl@rogers.com>

<http://sunnewsnetwork.myshopify.com/products/downwind-a-sun-news-documentary-digital-download>

DOWN WIND can be purchased for \$9.99

CD or digital download as per this link.

SL

Sherri Lange
CEO, NA-PAW, North American Platform Against Wind Power
416-567-5115
kodaisl@rogers.com
www.na-paw.org

From: Rep57@ohiohouse.gov [mailto:Rep57@ohiohouse.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, August 20, 2014 4:00 PM
To: Keegan, Jack
Subject: FW: Children suffering

Email #8

Adam Schwiebert

Legislative Aide
State Representative Terry Boose
(614) 466-9628
adam.schwiebert@ohiohouse.gov

From: valeriechristina@rocketmail.com [mailto:valeriechristina@rocketmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, June 25, 2014 10:04 AM
To: Rep57
Cc: memawledet@gmail.com
Subject: Children suffering

Mr Boose, this is an article about a child and family suffering because of the turbines. what if this were one of our children?!? Would it be dismissed as "these things are not real and the government would not allow it if it were this bad?"

www.waubrafoundation.com.au

this entire organization was developed pro bono by professionals, medical and otherwise, because of the abuses that are taking place in Australia.

ironically our company (windlab) is from Australia and they don't want to build there anymore because they are required to have an over 6,000 feet setback there now in northern Australia.

You could personally write a letter to the OPSB. It is possible. Don't allow your silence to give consent. Please remember the people who voted for you. I look forward to hearing what your thoughts are after reading more about real people suffering, and what you will do to prevent suffering in greenwich Ohio.

Many thanks,
Valerie Malicki

From: Keegan, Jack
Sent: Wednesday, August 20, 2014 5:01 PM
To:
Cc: Donlon, Patrick
Subject: Comments on Greenwich case

Hi

Could you add these to the record for the Greenwich wind farm case?

Thanks,

Jack