

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Fuel Adjustment)	
Clause of Columbus Southern Power)	Case No. 10-268-EL-FAC
Company and Ohio Power Company and)	Case No. 10-269-EL-FAC
Related Matters for 2010.)	

In the Matter of the Fuel Adjustment)	
Clauses for Columbus Southern Power)	Case No. 11-281-EL-FAC
Company and Ohio Power Company and)	
Related Matters.)	

**MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER
BY
THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL**

The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel ("OCC") hereby moves the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("PUCO") for a protective order regarding information asserted to be confidential by Ohio Power Company.¹ As part of discovery in this proceeding, Ohio Power provided information to OCC, subject to a protective agreement, and Ohio Power asserts that this information constitutes trade secret information under Ohio law.

OCC hereby requests that, in accordance with Ohio Adm. Code. 4901-1-02(E), the PUCO issue such order as is necessary to protect the undisclosed (redacted) portions of the Direct Testimony of Daniel J. Duann that Ohio Power asserts to be confidential.² Subject to OCC's rights under the protective agreement, OCC is filing the Direct

¹ Effective at the end of 2011, Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company merged, with Ohio Power becoming the successor in interest to Columbus Southern Power. See *In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company and Columbus Southern Power Company for Authority to Merge and Related Approvals*, Case No. 10-2376- EL-UNC, Entry (March 7, 2012) at 11.

² This Motion is filed pursuant to Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-02(E), 4901-1-12 and 4901-1-24(D).

Testimony of Daniel J. Duann under seal, and is also filing a public version that shows all information Ohio Power does not claim to be confidential.

By filing the instant Motion, OCC does not concede that the information constitutes trade secret information. However, OCC acknowledges that it has obtained this information pursuant to a protective agreement with Ohio Power that provides for such information to be treated as confidential and protected (subject to OCC's right under the protective agreement to initiate a process for the PUCO to rule whether the information deserves confidential treatment under Ohio law).

The grounds for this Motion are more fully described in the accompanying Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted,

BRUCE J. WESTON
OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

/s/ Terry L. Etter

Terry L. Etter, Counsel of Record
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485
Telephone: (614) 466-7964 (Etter Direct)
etter@occ.ohio.gov

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Fuel Adjustment)	
Clause of Columbus Southern Power)	Case No. 10-268-EL-FAC
Company and Ohio Power Company and)	Case No. 10-269-EL-FAC
Related Matters for 2010.)	

In the Matter of the Fuel Adjustment)	
Clauses for Columbus Southern Power)	Case No. 11-281-EL-FAC
Company and Ohio Power Company and)	
Related Matters.)	

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

OCC files this Motion for Protective Order (“Motion”) contemporaneously with the filing of the Direct Testimony of Daniel J. Duann. In filing this Motion, OCC does not concede that the information in the Direct Testimony of Daniel J. Duann is trade secret information pursuant to R.C. 1333.61(D) and does not concede that the information is deserving of protection from public revelation under Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-24(D).

OCC understands that Ohio Power considers the undisclosed (redacted) information to be confidential and deserving of the protection of trade secret information as defined in R.C. 1333.61(D). OCC’s understanding is based on claims by Ohio Power that the information (1) derives economic value, actual or potential, from not being known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by others, and (2) is the

subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.³ Under the assertions made by Ohio Power, at this time, confidential treatment of the redacted information in the Direct Testimony of Daniel J. Duann would be appropriate, subject to OCC's rights under its protective agreement with Ohio Power to initiate a process to determine whether the information should be protected.

In addition, OCC is filing a public version of the Direct Testimony of Daniel J. Duann so that all information Ohio Power does not claim to be confidential is accessible for the public's review. The public version does not contain information that was asserted by Ohio Power to be confidential.

For the foregoing reasons and subject to the foregoing reservations of rights, this Motion should be granted at this time.

Respectfully submitted,

BRUCE J. WESTON
OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

/s/ Terry L. Etter

Terry L. Etter, Counsel of Record
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485
Telephone: (614) 466-7964 (Etter Direct)
etter@occ.ohio.gov

³ See R.C. 1333.61(D).

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Motion for Protective Order* by the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel has been served upon those persons listed below via electronic mail this 8th day of November 2013.

/s/ Terry L. Etter

Terry L. Etter
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

SERVICE LIST

Thomas McNamee
Steven Beeler
Assistant Attorneys General
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Thomas.mcnamee@puc.state.oh.us
Steven.beeler@puc.state.oh.us

Samuel C. Randazzo
Frank P. Darr
Joseph E. Olikier
McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com

Philip B. Sineneng
Thompson Hine LLP
Duke Energy Commercial Asset
Management Inc.
41 S. High Street, Suite 1700
Columbus, OH 43215
Philip.Sineneng@ThompsonHine.com

Stephen T. Nourse
Matthew J. Satterwhite
Yazen Alami
American Electric Power Company
1 Riverside Plaza 29th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
stnourse@aep.com
mjsatterwhite@aep.com
yalami@aep.com

Amy B. Spiller
Rocco O. D'Ascenzo
Jeanne W. Kingery
Duke Energy Ohio Inc.
139 East Fourth Street 1303-Main
P.O. Box 961
Cincinnati, OH 45201-0960
amy.spiller@duke-energy.com
Rocco.DAscenzo@duke-energy.com
Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com

Attorney Examiners:

Sarah.parrot@puc.state.oh.us
Greta.see@puc.state.oh.us

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

11/8/2013 3:32:24 PM

in

Case No(s). 10-0268-EL-FAC, 10-0269-EL-FAC, 11-0281-EL-FAC

Summary: Motion Motion for Protective Order by the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel electronically filed by Ms. Deb J. Bingham on behalf of Etter, Terry L.