## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

- - -

In the Matter of the :

Application of The Dayton : Case No. 13-0833-EL-POR Power and Light Company for : Case No. 13-0837-EL-WVR

Approval of Its Energy:
Efficiency and Peak Demand:
Reduction Program Portfolio:
Plan for 2013 through 2015:

\_ \_ \_

## PROCEEDINGS

before Mr. Bryce McKenney, Attorney Examiner, at the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio, 180 East Broad Street, 11th Floor, Room 11-A, Columbus, Ohio, called at 10:02 a.m. on Tuesday, October 22, 2013.

- - -

ARMSTRONG & OKEY, INC.

222 East Town Street, Second Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-5201
(614) 224-9481 - (800) 223-9481
Fax - (614) 224-5724

- - -

		2
1	APPEARANCES:	
2	Williams Allwein & Moser, LLC	
3	By Mr. Christopher J. Allwein 1500 West Third Avenue, Suite 330	
4	Columbus, Ohio 43212	
5	On behalf of the Sierra Club.	
	Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP	
6 7	By Mr. Rebecca L. Hussey 280 North High Street, Suite 1300 Columbus, Ohio 43215	
8	On behalf of EMC Development Company,	
9	Inc.	
10	Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry By Ms. Jody Kyler Cohn 36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510	
11	Cincinnati, Ohio 45202	
12	On behalf of Ohio Energy Group.	
13	Ohio Attorney General Mike DeWine By Mr. Thomas G. Lindgren	
14	180 East Broad Street, Sixth Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215	
15	On behalf of the Staff of the Public	
16	Utilities Commission of Ohio.	
17	Ohio Consumers' Counsel Bruce J. Weston By Ms. Kyle L. Kern	
18	Ten West Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485	
19		
20	On behalf of the Office of Ohio Consumers' Counsel.	
21	Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy	
22	By Ms. Colleen L. Mooney 231 West Lima Street Findlay, Ohio 45389-1793	
23	1 111010y, O1110 40000 1100	
24	On behalf of the Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy.	
25		

```
3
 1
      APPEARANCES: (Continued)
             EnerNOC, Inc.
 2
             By Mr. Gregory J. Poulos
 3
             471 East Broad Street, Suite 1520
             Columbus, Ohio 43215
 4
                  On behalf of EnerNOC, Inc.
 5
             McNees Wallace Nurick LLC
 6
             By Mr. Matthew R. Pritchard
             21 East State Street, 17th Floor
 7
             Columbus, Ohio 43215-4228
                  On behalf of Industrial Energy Users
 8
                  of Ohio.
 9
             The Dayton Power and Light Company
             By Ms. Judi L. Sobecki
10
             1065 Woodman Drive
11
             Dayton, Ohio 45432
12
                  On behalf of The Dayton Power and Light
                  Company.
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
2.1
22
2.3
24
25
```

		4
1	INDEX TO WITNESSES	
2		
3	Witness	Page
4	Emily W. Rabb	0
5	Direct Examination by Ms. Sobecki	9
6	Wilson Gonzalez Direct Examination by Ms. Kern	12
7		
8	INDEX TO EXHIBITS	
9		
10	Exhibit Identifie	ed Admitted
11	JOINT	
12	1 Stipulation and Recommendation 7	11
13	COMPANY	
14	1 Application of The Dayton Power 7 and Light Company for Approval of	11
15		
16	2 Proof of Publication 8	11
17		
18	3 Testimony of Emily W. Rabb 8	11
19	OCC	
20	1 Direct Testimony of Wilson 13 Gonzalez	14
21	SIERRA CLUB	
22	1 Notice of an Additional Signatory 14	15
23	to the Field Stipulation by the Sierra Club	
24		
25		

Tuesday Morning Session,
October 22, 2013.

2.1

ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Let's go on the record at this time. Good morning. The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio calls for hearing at this time and place Case Nos. 13-0833-EL-POR and 13-0837-EL-WVR being In the Matter of The Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Its Energy Efficiency Portfolio Plan.

My name is Bryce McKenney, and I'm the attorney examiner assigned by the Commission to hear this case. At this time I'd like to take the appearances of the parties. Let's begin with the company, and then we'll move around the table.

MS. SOBECKI: Thank you, your Honor.

Judi Sobecki on behalf of The Dayton Power and Light

Company, 1065 Woodman Drive, Dayton, Ohio 45432.

MR. POULOS: Thank you, your Honor. Greg Poulos with EnerNOC, Columbus, Ohio.

MS. KERN: Thank you, your Honor. On behalf of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel, Bruce J.
Weston, 10 West Broad Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215.

I'm Kyle Kern, Assistant Consumers' Counsel.

ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Thank you.

MR. LINDGREN: On behalf of the Commission staff, Ohio Attorney General Mike DeWine, by Thomas Lindgren, Assistant Attorney General, 180 East Broad Street, Sixth Floor, Columbus, Ohio 43215.

2.1

ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Thank you.

MS. MOONEY: On behalf of Ohio Partners

for Affordable Energy, I'm Colleen Mooney, 231 West

Lima Street, Findlay, Ohio.

ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Thank you.

MS. KYLER COHN: On behalf of the Ohio

Energy Group, David Boehm, Michael Kurtz, I'm Jody

Kyler Cohn from the firm of Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry,

36 East Seventh Street, Cincinnati, Ohio 45202.

ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Thank you.

MR. PRITCHARD: On behalf of the Industrial Energy Users of Ohio, I am Matt Pritchard with the law firm of McNees, Wallace & Nurick, 21 East State Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215.

MS. HUSSEY: Good morning, your Honor.

On behalf of the EMC Development Company, Rebecca

Hussey, Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP, 280 North High

Street, Suite 1300, Columbus, Ohio 43215.

ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Thank you.

Is there anyone else here that would like to make an

appearance?

2.1

All right. At this time is the company prepared to present its first witness?

MS. SOBECKI: Yes, your Honor. I think as a preliminary matter, I'd like to mark my exhibits first. I have already provided them to the court reporter; and there's a stack in front of you, your Honor.

They are voluminous documents. All the parties have them. I have a few extra copies, but I saved some trees. And I'll indicate the date on which all of them have been filed so all the parties have ready access. If somebody wants copies, let me know.

The first one is Joint Exhibit No. 1, and that is the Stipulation and Recommendation.

The next exhibit would be Company Exhibit No. 1, and that is the Application of The Dayton

Power and Light Company for Approval of Its Energy

Efficiency and Peak Reduction Program Portfolio Plan.

That was filed on April 15, 2013.

And I apologize. I neglected to mention that the Joint Exhibit 1 stipulation was filed on October 2, 2013.

The next exhibit I'd like to have marked

```
1
     is Company Exhibit 2, which is the Proof of
2
     Publication that was filed yesterday, October 21,
3
     2013.
4
                  And the last exhibit would be Company
     Exhibit 3, which is the testimony of Emily W. Rabb.
5
     That was docketed on October 2, 2013.
6
7
                  ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: All right.
8
     They will each be so marked as Joint Exhibit 1, the
9
     Stipulation and Recommendation; Company Exhibit 1,
10
     the application; Company Exhibit 2, Proof of
     Publication; and Company Exhibit 3, the prefiled
11
12
     direct testimony of Emily Rabb.
13
                  (EXHIBITS MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.)
14
                  MS. SOBECKI: Yes, your Honor.
15
     you. With that, I would call Emily Rabb.
16
                  ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: All right.
17
     Ms. Rabb, would you please raise your right hand.
                  (Witness sworn.)
18
19
                  ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Thank you.
20
     Please be seated.
2.1
22
23
```

24

## EMILY W. RABB

being first duly sworn, as prescribed by law, was examined and testified as follows:

## DIRECT EXAMINATION

By Ms. Sobecki:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

2.1

22

23

24

- Q. Ma'am, can you please state your name for the record?
  - A. Emily Rabb.
- Q. And by whom are you employed, and what is your position?
- A. I'm employed by The Dayton Power and Light Company. I'm the Supervisor of Regulatory Operations.
- Q. And you have before you in your binder what has been marked as Joint Exhibit No. 1 and Company Exhibit No. 3. Do you have those?
  - A. Yes.
  - Q. And can you please identify those for us?
- A. Yes. Joint Exhibit 1 is the Stipulation and Recommendation In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Its Energy Efficiency Portfolio Plan.
- And Company Exhibit 3 is my testimony in support of the stipulation.
  - Q. Okay. And, ma'am, with respect to

- Exhibit 3, your testimony, do you have any changes or corrections you'd like to make to that?
- A. Yes. On page 5, line 49, I said that 12 of the 13 intervening parties were signatory parties to the stipulation. Subsequently, after I filed my testimony, the additional party indicated they would sign the stipulation; so that number should be updated from 12 to 13.
- Q. Okay. Thank you, ma'am. Do you have any other changes?
  - A. No.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

23

- Q. Okay. And if I were to ask you all of the questions as they appear in your prefiled testimony here today, would your answers be the same?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. And those would be true to the best of your knowledge?
  - A. Yes.

no questions. All right.

- MS. SOBECKI: I have nothing further.
- 20 ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Does anyone have cross-examination of this witness?
- Seeing none, thank you, Ms. Rabb. I have
- MS. SOBECKI: Your Honor, with that, I
- would move to admit Joint Exhibit No. 1 and Company

```
Exhibits 1, 2, and 3.
 1
 2
                  ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY:
 3
     objection to the admission of Joint Exhibit 1 or
 4
     Company Exhibits 1, 2, and 3? Seeing none, they will
     be so admitted.
 5
 6
                  (EXHIBITS ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE.)
 7
                  ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Mr. Allwein,
     would you like to make an appearance.
 8
 9
                  MR. ALLWEIN: Good morning, your Honor.
10
     I apologize for being late. Christopher J. Allwein,
     Williams Allwein & Moser, 1500 West Third Avenue,
11
12
     Suite 330, Columbus, Ohio 43212, on behalf of the
     Sierra Club. And I do have a motion that I wanted to
13
14
     make a move to have admitted this morning.
                  ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: We will
15
16
     address that issue when we finish with the testimony.
17
                  MR. ALLWEIN: Thank you, your Honor.
18
                  ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Thank you.
19
                  Does that conclude everything for the
20
     company?
                  MS. SOBECKI: Yes, your Honor.
2.1
22
     company has nothing further.
23
                  ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Thank you.
24
                  OCC.
```

MS. KERN: OCC would like to call Wilson

```
12
1
     Gonzalez. I've placed a copy of Mr. Gonzalez's
2
     testimony there, and I have copies if anyone needs
3
     it.
4
                  ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY:
5
                  Mr. Gonzalez, please raise your right
     hand.
6
7
                  (Witness sworn.)
8
                  ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Thank you.
     Please be seated.
9
10
                  Ms. Kern, you may proceed.
11
12
                         WILSON GONZALEZ
13
     being first duly sworn, as prescribed by law, was
     examined and testified as follows:
14
15
                        DIRECT EXAMINATION
16
     By Ms. Kern:
17
                Good morning, Mr. Gonzalez. Can you
     please identify yourself for the record?
18
                  Wilson Gonzalez.
19
             Α.
20
                 And are you the same Wilson Gonzalez
             Q.
2.1
     whose direct testimony was filed in this docket on
22
     October 21, 2013?
23
                 Yes, I am.
             Α.
24
                  MS. KERN: Your Honor, I would like to
25
     have marked for purposes of identification as OCC
```

13 Exhibit 1 the direct testimony of Wilson Gonzalez. 1 2 ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: It will be 3 so marked. 4 (EXHIBIT MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.) 5 Q. (By Ms. Kern) And on whose behalf do you 6 appear today? 7 Α. On behalf of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel. Do you have your prepared direct 8 Q. testimony with you on the stand? 9 10 Α. Yes, I do. And did you prepare this testimony or 11 Ο. 12 have it prepared at your direction? 13 Α. Yes. Do you have any changes or corrections to 14 your testimony? 15 16 Α. No, I don't. 17 If I asked you the same questions that Q. 18 appear in your direct testimony today, would your answers be the same? 19 20 Α. Yes. 2.1 MS. KERN: Your Honor, I tender 22 Mr. Gonzalez for cross-examination.

ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Does anyone

23

24

THE WITNESS: Thank you, your Honor.

ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: All right.

Ms. Kern.

2.1

MS. KERN: I would like to move OCC

5 Exhibit 1.

ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Any objection to the admission of OCC Exhibit 1? Seeing none, it will be so admitted.

(EXHIBIT ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE.)

ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Mr. Allwein, you indicated that you had something you wanted to address?

MR. ALLWEIN: Yes. Thank you, your Honor. Good morning. I received word from the Sierra Club's national litigation team. They went through the stipulation upon recommendation from the local chapter, and they approved the stipulation per their standards.

They made a request that the Sierra Club be added as a signatory party to the stipulation, so yesterday I filed in the docket a notice basically requesting that the Sierra Club be added as a signatory party to the stipulation. I labeled that notice as Sierra Club Exhibit 1, and I have copies of it.

	15
1	(EXHIBIT MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.)
2	ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Are you
3	seeking the admission of Sierra Club Exhibit 1?
4	MR. ALLWEIN: Pardon me?
5	ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Do you seek
6	the admission of Sierra Club Exhibit 1?
7	MR. ALLWEIN: Yes, your Honor. I would
8	move the Sierra Club Exhibit 1 into evidence.
9	ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Any
10	objection to the admission of Sierra Club Exhibit 1?
11	It will be so admitted.
12	(EXHIBIT ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE.)
13	ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Thank you,
14	Mr. Allwein.
15	Anything further?
16	MS. SOBECKI: Your Honor, the company has
17	nothing further.
18	ATTORNEY EXAMINER MCKENNEY: Anything
19	from the intervening parties? Seeing nothing, we are
20	adjourned.
21	Let's go off the record. Thank you,
22	everyone.
23	(The hearing was concluded at
24	10:12 a.m.)
25	

CERTIFICATE I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the proceedings taken by me in this matter on Tuesday, October 22, 2013, and carefully compared with my original stenographic notes. Margaret A. Marsh, Registered Professional Reporter. (73689-MM)

Armstrong & Okey, Inc., Columbus, Ohio (614) 224-9481

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on** 

11/5/2013 2:12:38 PM

in

Case No(s). 13-0833-EL-POR, 13-0837-EL-WVR

Summary: Transcript in the matter of The Dayton Power and Light Company hearing held on 10/22/13 electronically filed by Mrs. Jennifer Duffer on behalf of Armstrong & Okey, Inc. and Marsh, Margaret