BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY

ATTORNEYS AT LAW 36 EAST SEVENTH STREET SUITE 1510 CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202 TELEPHONE (513) 421-2255

TELECOPIER (513) 421-2764

Via E-File

October 31, 2013

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio PUCO Docketing 180 E. Broad Street, 10th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215

In re: Case Nos. 12-426-EL-SSO, 12-427-EL-ATA, 12-428-EL-AAM, 12-429-EL-WVR,

12-672-EL-RDR

Dear Sir/Madam:

Please find attached the MEMORANDUM CONTRA OF THE OHIO ENERGY GROUP for filing in the above-referenced matter.

Copies have been served on all parties on the attached certificate of service. Please place this document of file.

Respectfully yours,

David F. Boehm, Esq. Michael L. Kurtz, Esq. Jody Kyler Cohn, Esq.

BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY

DFB/kew Encl.

Cc:

ALJ Bryce McKenney ALJ Gregory Price Certificate of Service

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

:

In the Matter of the Application of Dayton Power And Light Company For Approval of its Market Rate Offer Case No. 12-426-EL-SSO

In the Matter of the Application of Dayton Power And

Case No. 12-427-EL-ATA

Light Company For Approval of Revised Tariffs

: Case No. 12-428-EL-AAM

In the Matter of the Application of Dayton Power And Light Company For Approval of Certain Accounting Authority

In the Matter of the Application of Dayton Power And Light Company For Waiver of Certain Commission Rules Case No. 12-429-EL-WVR

Light Company For Waiver of Certain Commission Rules

Case No. 12-672-EL-RDR

In the Matter of the Application of Dayton Power And Light Company to Establish Tariff Riders

MEMORANDUM CONTRA OF THE OHIO ENERGY GROUP

The Ohio Energy Group ("OEG") hereby submits this Memorandum Contra the Applications for Rehearing filed by The Dayton Power and Light Company ("DP&L" or "Company") and the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel ("OCC") on October 4, 2013. OEG's decision not to respond to other arguments raised in the Applications for Rehearing submitted in this proceeding should not be construed as implicit agreement with those arguments.

I. The Commission Should Uphold Its Finding That the Entire Service Stability Rider Revenue Requirement Must be Allocated to DP&L's Rate Classes on a 1 CP Basis.

DP&L asks the Commission to "clarify" its September 4, 2013 Opinion & Order ("Order") by determining that only the portion of the Service Stability Rider ("SSR") revenue requirement that exceeds the current Rate Stabilization Charge ("RSC") should be allocated to customer classes on a 1

CP basis.¹ Under DP&L's proposal, the remainder of the SSR charge (the portion equal to the current RSC charge) would be allocated in the same manner as the RSC. This request should be rejected for multiple reasons.

As an initial matter, the Commission's finding regarding the allocation of the SSR revenue requirement among the DP&L rate classes was clear. The Commission expressly held that "the SSR revenues should be allocated using a 1 CP demand allocation method that reflects the underlying character of the SSR charges." Nowhere in the Order does the Commission indicate that it wished to adopt a hybrid methodology for allocating SSR costs between the rate classes. Hence, there is no need for the Commission to substantially modify its finding in order to "clarify" its Order. DP&L must accept that the Order means exactly what it says.

Moreover, as the Commission correctly found, it would be unreasonable to use the present RSC cost allocation to assign *any* portion of the SSR revenue requirement to rate classes. As OEG has already explained in detail, the nature of the RSC charge is markedly different than the nature of the SSR charge.³ The RSC was established to allow DP&L to recover costs "associated with fuel price increases or actions taken in compliance with environmental and tax laws, regulations or court or administrative orders, and costs associated with physical security and cyber security relating to the generation of electricity from plants owned by DP&L and its affiliates...."⁴

In contrast, the SSR is intended "[t]o permit DP&L to maintain its financial health and to give DP&L an opportunity to earn a reasonable return on equity." The Commission explicitly acknowledged this objective in its Order. Accordingly, the costs to be recovered under the SSR are 100% demand-related costs aimed at enhancing the return on equity the Company would otherwise earn

¹ DP&L Application for Rehearing at 14-15.

² Order at 26.

³ OEG Post-Hearing Brief at 12-15.

⁴ In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for the Creation of a Rate Stabilization Surcharge Rider and Distribution Rate Increase, Case No. 05-276-EL-AIR, Opinion & Order (December 28, 2005) at 2.

⁵ DP&L Second Revised Application (Dec. 12, 2012), Book I at 8.

⁶ Order at 26.

on its fixed assets over the Electric Security Plan ("ESP") period. Given that the purpose of the SSR and the nature of the costs collected through that rider are entirely unrelated to the RSC, it is not reasonable to use the RSC rate (11% of the January 2004 DP&L generation rates) as the basis for allocating any portion of the SSR revenue requirement to the rate classes.

Indeed, the Commission has already heard and rejected arguments that the current RSC cost allocation should be adopted for the SSR. For instance, Staff recommended allocating the entire SSR revenue requirement in the same manner as the RSC is currently allocated. But the Commission determined that the SSR and RSC costs should not be treated similarly for purposes of cost allocation among rate classes. Additionally, DP&L proposed a modified RSC approach for purposes of allocating SSR costs, which the Commission likewise rejected. There is no reason for the Commission to alter its decision now.

Though DP&L points to two lighting classes (Street Lighting and Private Outdoor Lighting) that would have an SSR rate of zero as a result of the Commission's 1 CP allocation, that outcome is not unreasonable since not every customer must pay every charge collected by a utility. What would be unreasonable, however, is fundamentally altering the way SSR costs are allocated among the rate classes merely to increase the lighting class charges by approximately \$231,000. The impact of pushing costs on the lighting classes merely for the sake of making every class pay an SSR charge would be significant increases in the SSR charges for nearly every other rate class. For example, the total SSR costs collected from the Primary Class would be approximately \$2.6 million higher as a result of DP&L's proposed allocation. Such rate increases would not only be unreasonable, but would also be contrary to the demand-related nature of the SSR charges. The Commission should therefore uphold its finding that the entire SSR revenue requirement should be allocated to the rate classes on a 1 CP basis.

⁷ Post-Hearing Brief of Staff at 22.

⁸ DP&L Brief at 60.

⁹ DP&L Brief at 14.

II. The Commission Should Again Reject OCC's Proposal to Allocate the SSR Revenue Requirement on a Per-kWh Basis.

The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel ("OCC") once again argues the SSR costs should be allocated on a per-kWh basis. And once again, the Commission should reject OCC's proposal. While OCC reiterates that customer switching is driving the need for the SSR, the Commission's Order recognizes that the real issue is DP&L's declining return on equity. Because the costs to be collected through the SSR are aimed at enhancing DP&L's return on equity on its fixed generation assets over the ESP period, those costs are 100% demand-related. The Commission has already explicitly agreed with OEG on the underlying character of the SSR charges.

OCC argues it would be inappropriate to allocate SSR costs based upon peak demand since the SSR does not and cannot collect generation-related costs.¹⁴ But the Commission's Order reflects that the SSR is intended to ensure the financial integrity of DP&L's generation business, along with its other lines of business. The Commission explained:

Although generation, transmission, and distribution rates have been unbundled, DP&L is not a structurally separated utility; thus, the financial losses in the generation, transmission, or distribution business of DP&L are financial losses for the entire utility. Therefore, if one of the businesses suffers financial losses, it may impact the entire utility, adversely affecting its ability to provide stable, reliable, or safe retail electric service.¹⁵

Hence, the SSR does collect generation-related costs. OCC's argument ignores the plain language of the Commission's Order and should be rejected.

The Commission should again disregard OCC's attempt to discredit OEG witness Lane Kollen.¹⁶
As his lengthy resume reflects, Mr. Kollen has participated in a tremendous variety of complex regulatory matters in a multitude of states and is certainly capable of understanding the fundamental

¹⁰ OCC Application for Rehearing at 52-55.

¹¹ OCC Application for Rehearing at 53.

¹² Order at 17.

¹³ Order at 26.

¹⁴ OCC Application for Rehearing at 52-54.

¹⁵ Order at 22. •

¹⁶ OCC Application for Rehearing at 54-55.

principles of cost allocation. Neither should the Commission give any credence to OCC's to attempt to scare the Commission into adopting its per-kWh allocation by harkening back to a previous AEP Ohio case.¹⁷ The Commission can confirm that the rate impacts of adopting a 1 CP allocation for the SSR costs are reasonable by examining Exhibit A to DP&L's Application for Rehearing.

III. Conclusion

Given that DP&L and OCC have failed to present any valid reason why the Commission should alter its decision to allocate the entire SSR revenue requirement to the rate classes on a 1 CP basis, the Commission should uphold its finding.

Respectfully submitted,

David F. Boehm, Esq. Michael L. Kurtz, Esq.

Jody Kyler Cohn, Esq.

BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY 36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510

Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Ph: (513) 421-2255 Fax: (513) 421-2764

E-Mail: Dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com

Mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com Jkylercohn@BKLlawfirm.com

October 31, 2013

COUNSEL FOR OHIO ENERGY GROUP

¹⁷ OCC Application for Rehearing at 54-55.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that true copy of the foregoing was served by electronic mail (when available) or ordinary mail, unless otherwise noted, this 31ST day of October, 2013 to the following:

Davider. Boehm, Esq. Michael L. Kurtz, Esq. Jody Kyler Cohn, Esq.

DAYTON POWER & LIGHT COMPANY DONA SEGER-LAWSON 1065 WOODMAN DRIVE DAYTON OH 45432

OMA ENERGY GROUP THOMAS SIWO BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 S THIRD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215

THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY
JUDI L. SOBECKI
1065 WOODMAN DRIVE
DAYTON OH 45432

*MCBRIDE, LAURA C. MS.
ULMER & BERNE LLP
SKYLIGHT OFFICE TOWER
1660 WEST 2ND STREET, SUITE 1100
CLEVELAND OH 44113

*PETRICOFF, M HOWARD VORYS SATER SEYMOUR AND PEASE LLP 52 E. GAY STREET P.O. BOX 1008 COLUMBUS OH 43216-1008

*COX, MATTHEW R MR. MATTHEW COX LAW, LTD. 4145 ST. THERESA BLVD AVON OH 44011

*BINGHAM, DEB J. MS.
OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL
10 W. BROAD ST., 18TH FL.
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*FLAHIVE, CAROLYN S THOMPSON HINE LLP 41 SOUTH HIGH STREET SUITE 1700 COLUMBUS OH 43215-6101

*JACOBS, ELLIS MR.
ADVOCATES FOR BASIC LEGAL EQUALITY
333 W. FIRST ST., SUITE 500
DAYTON OH 45402

*RABB, EMILY W
DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT
1065 WOODMAN DRIVE
DAYTON OH 45432

*HIGHT, DEBRA
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO
180 E. BROAD STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43231

*HOWARD, STEPHEN M MR.
VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE LLP
52 E. GAY STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215

HAQUE, ASIM Z. ASSISTANT COUNSEL HONDA OF AMERICA MFG., INC. 24000 HONDA PARKWAY MARYSVILLE OH 43040 *MALLARNEE, PATTI
THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS COUNSEL
10 W. BROAD ST. SUITE 1800
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*SHARKEY, JEFFREY S MR.
FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L.
500 COURTHOUSE PLAZA, S.W., 10 N. LUDLOW ST.
DAYTON OH 45402

STARKOFF, ALAN G. ICE MILLER LLP 250 WEST STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215 *LONG, M. ANTHONY MR. HONDA OF AMERICA MFG., INC. 24000 HONDA PARKWAY MARYSVILLE OH 43040

*HINDERS, IRDA HOXHA
DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT
1065 WOODMAN DRIVE
DAYTON OH 45432

GRADY, MAUREEN
OFFICE OF CONSUMERS' COUNSEL
10 W. BROAD STREET
SUITE 1800
COLUMBUS OH 43215-3485

YOST, MELISSA R.
THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL
10 WEST BROAD STREET 18TH FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*CHMIEL, STEPHANIE M MS. THOMPSON HINE 41 S. HIGH STREET, SUITE 1700 COLUMBUS OH 43215

PRITCHARD, MATTHEW R
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC
21 E STATE ST 17TH FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*MOONEY, COLLEEN L OPAE 231 WEST LIMA STREET FINDLAY OH 45840

*SINENENG, PHILIP B MR.
THOMPSON HINE LLP
41 S. HIGH STREET SUITE 1700
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*SHERMAN, STEVEN M. MR. KRIEG DEVAULT LLP ONE INDIANA SQUARE SUITE 2800 INDIANAPOLIS IN 46204 SOLBERG, SCOTT C EIMER STAHL LLP 224 S. MICHIGAN AVENUE SUITE 1100 CHICAGO IL 60604

*LONG, M. ANTHONY MR. HONDA OF AMERICA MFG., INC. 24000 HONDA PARKWAY MARYSVILLE OH 43040

*THOMPSON, CHRIS C MR
AIR FORCE AFLOA/JACL-ULFSC
USAF UTILITY LAW FIELD SUPPORT CENTER 139
BARNES DR STE 1
TYNDAL AFB FL 32403-5319

*LOUCAS, CATHRYN N. MS.
THE OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL
1207 GRANDVIEW AVENUE
COLUMBUS OH 43212

HAEDT, ALLISON E. ATTORNEY AT LAW JONES DAY 325 JOHN H. MCCONNELL BLVD., SUITE 600 COLUMBUS OH 43215-2673

*JOHNSON, JENNA C. MS.
THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY
1065 WOODMAN DRIVE
DAYTON OH 45432

HAGUE, JOSHUA D. KREIG DEVAULT LLP ONE INDIANA SQUARE, SUITE 2800 INDIANOPOLIS IN 46204

*ORAHOOD, TERESA BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 SOUTH THIRD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215-4291

*SCOTT, TONNETTA Y MRS. OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL 180 EAST BROAD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215 *MILLER, VESTA R
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO
180 EAST BROAD STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215

SECHLER, JOEL E
CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP
280 PLAZA, SUITE 1300
280 NORTH HIGH STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*DUFFER, JENNIFER MRS.
ARMSTRONG & OKEY, INC.
222 EAST TOWN STREET 2ND FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*MILLER, CHRISTOPHER L. MR. ICE MILLER LLP
250 WEST STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*JADWIN, JAY E MR.
AEP RETAIL ENERGY PARTNERS LLC
155 NATIONWIDE BLVD STE 500
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*SOBECKI, JUDI L MS
THE DAYTON POWER & LIGHT COMPANY
1065 WOODMAN DRIVE
DAYTON OH 45432

CHMIEL, STEPHANIE M. ESQ. THOMPSON HINE LLP 41 SOUTH HIGH STREET, SUITE 1700 COLUMBUS OH 432 OH

*KUHNELL, DIANNE
DUKE ENERGY BUSINESS SERVICES
139 E. FOURTH STREET EA025 P.O. BOX 960
CINCINNATI OH 45201

*COFFEY, SANDRA
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO
180 E. BROAD ST.
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*FARUKI, CHARLES J. MR.
FARUKI IRELAND & COX PLL
500 COURTHOUSE PLAZA, S.W.
10 NORTH LUDLOW STREET
DAYTON OH 45402

FARUKI, CHARLES
FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L.
500 COURTHOUSE PLAZA, S.W.
10 NORTH LUDLOW STREET
DAYTON OH 45402

DUNN, GREGORY H ICE MILLER LLP 250 WEST STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215

*POULOS, GREGORY J. MR. ENERNOC, INC. 47I EAST BROAD STREET SUITE 1520 NEW ALBANY OH 43215

*KRAVITZ, ZACHARY D. MR.
TAFT, STETTINIUS & HOLLISTER, LLP
65 E. STATE STREET, SUITE 1000
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*OLIKER, JOSEPH E. MR.
INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO
21 EAST STATE STREET SUITE 1700
COLUMBUS OH 43215

BERGER, EDMUND J. ATTORNEY
OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL
10 W BROAD STREET, STE 1800
COLUMBUS OH 43215

CHMIEL, STEPHANIE M. ESQ.
THOMPSON HINE LLP
41 SOUTH HIGH STREET, SUITE 1700
COLUMBUS OH 432 OH

*PRITCHARD, MATTHEW R. MR. MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK 21 EAST STATE STREET #1700 COLUMBUS OH 43215

*CLARK, JOSEPH
DIRECT ENERGY
21 E STATE ST
19TH FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*ALBERT, JAMIE D MR.
SOLARVISION LLC
5131 POST ROAD SUITE 285
DUBLIN OH 43017

*COCHERN, CARYS
DUKE ENERGY
155 EAST BROAD ST 21ST FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*ALEXANDER, NATHANIEL TREVOR MR. CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD, LLP 21 E. STATE ST., SUITE 1100 COLUMBUS OH 43215

*SATTERWHITE, MATTHEW J MR.
AMERICAN ELECTRIC POWER SERVICE
CORPORATION
1 RIVERSIDE PLAZA, 29TH FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215

SHERMAN, STEVEN M.
KRIEG DEVAULT LLP
ONE INDIANA SQUARE, SUITE 2800
INDIANOPOLIS IN 46204-2079

AEP RETAIL ENERGY PARTNERS LLC ANNE M. VOGEL I RIVERSIDE PLAZA, 29TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215

BORDER ENERGY ELECTRIC SERVICES INC PRES ANDREW MITREY 4145 POWELL ROAD POWELL OH 43065-8066

CONSTELLATION ENERGY COMMODITIES GROUP M.H. PETRICOFF, ATTORNEY 52 EAST GAY STREET P O BOX 1008 COLUMBUS OH 43216-1008 *WILLIAMS, GREGORY L. MR.
WHITT STURTEVANT LLP
THE KEYBANK BUILDING
88 EAST BROAD STREET, SUITE 1590
COLUMBUS OH 43215

DILLARD, MICHAEL L. JR. ATTORNEY AT LAW BORDER ENERGY ELECTRIC SERVICES, INC. 41 S. HIGH STREET, SUITE 1700 COLUMBUS OH 43215

*MICHAEL, CHRISTOPHER W. MR. ICE MILLER LLP
250 WEST STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215

WELLS, BILL C MR AFMCLO/CL INDUSTRIAL FACILITIES DIVISION BLDG 266 AREA A WRIGHT PATTERSON AFB OH 45433

*KUTIK, DAVID A MR. JONES DAY

901 LAKESIDE AVENUE CLEVELAND OH 44114

BOJKO, KIMBERLY W
CARPENTER LIPPS & LELAND LLP
280 NORTH HIGH STREET, SUITE 1300
COLUMBUS OH 43215

OHIO CONSUMERS COUNSEL

10 WEST BROAD STREET STE 1800

COLUMBUS OH 43215-3485

CHMIEL, STEPHANIE M. ESQ.
THOMPSON HINE LLP
41 SOUTH HIGH STREET, SUITE 1700
COLUMBUS OH 432 OH

CITY OF DAYTON 101 W. THIRD STREET DAYTON OH 45402 CONSTELLATION NEWENERGY INC SR COUNSEL CYNTHIA FONNER BRADY P.O. BOX 1125 CHICAGO IL 60690-1125

*PETRICOFF, M HOWARD VORYS SATER SEYMOUR AND PEASE LLP 52 E. GAY STREET P.O. BOX 1008 COLUMBUS OH 43216-1008

COUNCIL OF SMALLER ENTERPRISES 1240 HURON RD E STE 200 CLEVELAND OH 44115-1717 *COX, MATTHEW R MR.
MATTHEW COX LAW, LTD.
4145 ST. THERESA BLVD
AVON OH 44011

DIRECT ENERGY SERVICES, LLC AND DIRECT ENERGY BUSINESS, LLC JOSEPH CLARK 21 E STATE STREET FL 19 COLUMBUS OH 43215-4252 DUKE ENERGY COMMERCIAL ASSET MANAGEMENT, INC. 139 E. FOURTH STREET, 1303-MAIN P.O. BOX 961 CINCINNATI OH 45201-0960

DUKE ENERGY RETAIL SALES LLC ACCT EXEC JOHN FINNIGAN 139 E FOURTH ST CINCINNATI OH 45202 ENERNOC INC SR DIR REG AFFAIRS KENNETH SCHISLER 101 FEDERAL ST STE 1100 BOSTON MA 02110

EXELON ENERGY COMPANY ENVIRONMENTAL & FUEL POLICY MGR
LISA M SIMPKINS
100 CONSTELLATION WAY STE 500C
BALTIMORE MD 21202

*PETRICOFF, M HOWARD VORYS SATER SEYMOUR AND PEASE LLP 52 E. GAY STREET P.O. BOX 1008 COLUMBUS OH 43216-1008

FEDERAL EXECUTIVE AGENCIES ATTY MAJOR CHRISTOPHER C THOMP 139 BARNES DR STE 1 TYNDALL AFB FL 32403-5319 *PETRICOFF, M HOWARD VORYS SATER SEYMOUR AND PEASE LLP 52 E. GAY STREET P.O. BOX 1008 COLUMBUS OH 43216-1008

HONDA OF AMERICA MFG, INC. MR. BARRY MCCLELLAND 24000 HONDA PARKWAY MARYSVILLE OH 43040-9251

*THOMPSON, CHRIS C MR
AIR FORCE AFLOA/JACL-ULFSC
USAF UTILITY LAW FIELD SUPPORT CENTER
139 BARNES DR STE I
TYNDAL AFB FL 32403-5319

INTERSTATE GAS SUPPLY
DBA COLUMBIA RETAIL ENERGY
6100 EMERALD PKWY
DUBLIN OH 43016-3248

*WHITT, MARK A
WHITT STURTEVANT LLP
THE KEY BANK BLDG 88 E BROAD ST STE 1590
COLUMBUS OH 43215

KROGER CO LINDA VIENS 60 WORTHINGTON MALL WORTHINGTON OH 43085

YURICK, MARK S.
TAFT STETTINIUS & HOLLISTER LLP
65 EAST STATE STREET SUITE 1000
COLUMBUS OH 43215-4213

PHONE: 513-762-1578

OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL 1207 GRANDVIEW AVE. SUITE 201 COLUMBUS OH 43212-3449

OHIO HOSPITAL ASSOCIATION RICHARD L. SITES 155 E. BROAD STREET 15TH FLOOR COLUMBUS OH 43215-3620

PEOPLE WORKING COOPERATIVELY INC 4612 PADDOCK RD CINCINNATI OH 45229

RETAIL ENERGY SUPPLY ASSOCIATION (RESA) STEPHEN HOWARD 52 E. GAY ST. COLUMBUS OH 43215

OMA ENERGY GROUP THOMAS SIWO BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 S THIRD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215 PHONE: 614-221-4000

*LOUCAS, CATHRYN N. MS.
THE OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL
1207 GRANDVIEW AVENUE
COLUMBUS OH 43212

OHIO PARTNERS FOR AFFORDABLE ENERGY MOONEY COLLEEN L 1431 MULFORD RD COLUMBUS OH 43212

CHRISTENSEN, MARY W. ATTORNEY AT LAW CHRISTENSEN & CHRISTENSEN LLP 8760 ORION PLACE, SUITE 300 COLUMBUS OH 43240-2109

*PETRICOFF, M HOWARD VORYS SATER SEYMOUR AND PEASE LLP 52 E. GAY STREET P.O. BOX 1008 COLUMBUS OH 43216-1008

BOJKO, KIMBERLY W 6930 MARGARUM BEND NEW ALBANY OHIO 43054

SIWO, J. THOMAS ATTORNEY AT LAW BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 SOUTH THIRD STREET COLUMBUS OH 43215-4291 This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

10/31/2013 4:28:26 PM

in

Case No(s). 12-0426-EL-SSO, 12-0427-EL-ATA, 12-0428-EL-AAM, 12-0429-EL-WVR, 12-0672-EL-RDR

Summary: Memorandum Ohio Energy Group (OEG) Memorandum Contra electronically filed by Mr. David F. Boehm on behalf of Ohio Energy Group