Public Utilities Case Number Commission RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

2013 OCT -2 PM 12: 37

Attn: Docketing 180 E. Broad St. Columbus, OH 43215

Formal Complaint Form 13-2031-EL-CSS

4461 Powder Horn Drive		
Customer Address		
Beavercreek	OH 45432	
City	State Zip	
3154719158		
Account Number		
Customer Service Address (if different from above)		
City	State Zip	
	Customer Address Beavercreek City 3154719158 Account Number Customer Service Addre	

Please describe your complaint. (Attach additional sheets if necessary)

On May 22, 2013 I applied for electric service online at FES Solutions (FES) website for a \$.0536/KWh rate for three years. On May 30, 2013 I received a letter in the mail saying FES was having difficulty enrolling my account and requested that I call FES at my earliest convenience. I called FES on May 31, 2013 and talked to Steve, answered all his questions including who my current service provider was (Dayton Power and Light (DP&L)) and confirmed the website rate of \$.0536/KWh was still valid and that service at that rate would start in June 2013 (FES recorded this conversation and the Public Utility Commission of Ohio (PUCO) and I have a copy of that recording). Actually, if you listen to this conversation Steve first brings up the fact that I'm a DP&L customer before I'm asked to confirm I'm a DP&L customer. Based on this conversation, I believed electric service with FES would start on June 20, 2013 (next meter reading date) at \$.0536/KWh for three years. FES did not contact or inform me to expect anything different.

I received my June - July 2013 DP&L bill on July 28, 2013 and noted that my electric provider had not changed to FES as expected. I contacted FES on July 29, 2013 and was informed that the problem would be taken care of and I would be enrolled as soon as possible. FES gave me a

See attached continuation sheet.

937 405-3642

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business

Date Processed OCT 0 2 Vertated September 29, 2013

(614) 466-3016 www.PUCO.ohio.gov

Continuation sheet

confirmation number of 1446043 for this exchange. I also told FES I would be looking for them to reimburse me the difference in rates since June 20, 2013 since they led me to believe that service at the lower rate would begin at that time. I didn't hear anything back from FES as expected so I called FES again on August 5, 2013 and spoke to Toniquia and initially received a response similar to the one I received on July 29th. After a very lengthy time on hold I was informed that the offer I applied for was only valid for Duke Energy customers (FES recorded this conversation and the PUCO and I have a copy of that recording). I referred Toniquia to the May 31, 2013 conversation where I was certain that I informed FES that I was a DP&L customer. I also informed FES that DP&L gave me until 12 days prior to the next meter reading date (August 22, 2013) to change providers otherwise DP&L would become my default provider at a much higher rate. I advised FES that they would have to resolve any problems and sign me up at the promised rate prior to this time in order to start service. FES said they would perform an investigation and get back to me. FES didn't get back to me so I continued to call them and this process repeated itself over and over again for the next month with most of the additional calls I made to FES listed below:

August 9, 2013, spoke to Lisa
August 9, 2013, spoke to Kim and Terri (supervisor)
August 16, 2013, spoke to Fred Maurer
August 16, 2013, spoke to Matt
August 20, 2013, spoke to Michelle

FES has recordings of all these conversations but they have not been made available to me or the PUCO. Through these conversations, I was accused of incorrectly entering names, zip codes, account numbers, ... on the online application for service. The facts show that all information was entered correctly, otherwise the incorrect information would have been included in the letter that FES mailed to me on May 28, 2013 but all information was correct on that letter. Eventually I spoke several times to Fred Maurer who is a senior customer service representative at FES. On August 31, 2013 Fred said he would try to get me the best rate he could and got back to me approximately 2 weeks later with an offer of \$.0594/KWh (same offer I declined on August 5th). I declined that offer and again asked Fred to listen to the May 31 recording where I recalled that FES agreed to the \$.0536/KWh rate for three years. Several days later I received a letter in the mail with notice that FES had signed me up for a \$.0594/KWh rate for three years without my consent. I called both DP&L and Fred to cancel the change of service request. I asked Fred why he had submitted the service change request without my consent and he replied that he thought he had my consent. I had previously asked Fred about reimbursement of the difference in charges between what I would have paid under the FES rate versus the rate I was actually paying and Fred informed that he would try to get

reimbursement but he couldn't guarantee anything. FES should also have this conversation recorded but I don't have a copy of that recording.

At this point FES assigned Becki Pastier (customer acquisition analyst) to work the issue and she called me in early September 2013. Becki said she had looked into my online application and she said the FES system cues on the zip code entered online to determine the service area (DP&L, Duke, ...). Becki said she noted that I had entered everything correctly online and she didn't know how I was allowed to complete the application for service at the \$.0536/KWh rate for three years with the zip code I had entered. Becki informed me that she could get me reimbursement for the difference in charges listed above if I sent her copies of my DP&L bills. Becki then asked if this would be sufficient to resolve the matter. I told her that I still believed that FES agreed to the \$.0536/KWh rate during the May 31, 2013 conversation knowing that I was a DP&L customer and that I wouldn't agree that the issue was resolved until the recording of that conversation was sent to the PUCO. Becki agreed to do that but then thought the matter was resolved even though the recording clearly showed that FES knew I was a DP&L customer and still offered me the \$.0536/KWh rate for three years. I don't know if FES recorded the conversation with Becki Pastier but I do have several email exchanges that support what I have stated above.

If FES subsequently realized they had made a mistake in making this offer to me, they had an obligation to inform me of this error in a timely manner so I could sign up for service with another company. FES didn't inform me until over two months later even though I had initiated two calls to FES in the intervening two plus months. I have been dealing with FES in good faith in trying to resolve this matter but FES has not been dealing in good faith in kind as demonstrated by their attempt to sign me up for service with their company at a higher rate and delaying resolution when FES has had all the data to resolve this (through recorded conversations) at any time. I believe a contract was in place between FES to provide electric energy service at \$.0536/KWh for three years as evidenced by the May 31, 2013 telephone conversation and FES is reneging on that contract. I just received my August — September electric bill but I have not forwarded any bills onto FES. I'm afraid that FES will construe this action as full settlement in this case and that is not acceptable.

I am seeking compensation for 1) lost savings over the three years that the \$.0536/KWh rate was offered to me 2) time spent trying to resolve this issue while FES was not dealing in good faith 3) additional time I must now spend to sign up for electric service over next three years 4) phone calls made to FES 5) copying/mailing costs to file this claim and provide evidence to PUCO 6) travel to hearings in Columbus 7) time off work to resolve this issue 8) compensation for breaking the contract for electric service without my consent. This comes out to be approximately \$15,000.

Bruce Snyder

From:

fescustomercare@fes.com

Sent:

Wednesday, May 22, 2013 12:22 PM

To:

snyderbd888@sbcglobal.net

Subject:

Your FirstEnergy Solutions Enrollment

Thank you for choosing FirstEnergy Solutions as your electric generation supplier! Please print this document and your <u>Terms and</u> Conditions as a record of your enrollment.

Confirmation number: bb4d0d82dfdafa465ae0 Selected Offer: 5.36 cents/kWh through June 2016

Your contract start date will begin at the earliest possible meter read date. When your contract ends, FirstEnergy Solutions will contact you and offer you a competitive renewal price.

As a reminder, you will receive a confirmation letter from Duke Energy when your enrollment is processed. You DO NOT need to respond to the letter from your utility in order to continue your enrollment with FirstEnergy Solutions.

We appreciate your business and the opportunity to serve you. If you have any questions regarding your account with FirstEnergy Solutions, please call us at 1-877-204-9520, Monday through Friday, 8 a.m. to 5 p.m.

Again, thank you for enrolling with FirstEnergy Solutions.

The information contained in this message is intended only for the personal and confidential use of the recipient(s) named above. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient or an agent responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you are bereby notified that you have received this document in error and that any review, dissemination, distribution, or copying of this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately, and delete the original message.

Solutions

5 days 8/4/13

Date: 05/28/2013

դեկլնվով։Անհությարդենի դրունայիներ

Bruce Snyder 4461 POWDER HORN DR BEAVERCREEK OH 45432-4029 Steve Steve 113
Steve all out correct

will refund may, don solg

Dear Bruce Snyder,

RE: Customer/Account Number: 3154719158

art 1446043 Soridworld by Jeken 1000

Thank you for choosing FirstEnergy Solutions (FES) as your electric generation supplier. Unfortunately, we are having difficulty enrolling your account. According to your local electric utility company, the customer/account number you provided to FES for enrollment is not valid.

Please call us at 1-888-254-6359 (Monday through Friday, 8 AM to 5 PM) at your earliest convenience, so that we can resolve any issues and sign you up as a customer.

When calling, please make sure you have your most recent electric bill on hand. We appreciate the opportunity to serve you and look foward to helping you save on your electric generation.

Sincerely,

Stephen C. Reifsnyder Manager, Customer Care FirstEnergy Solutions Toriguias SAUS

isa 9 Aug

Kim Kdollyesummit 9. Aug add.com

Terr: Supervisor 330 434 5880

modelle 8/20/13

Costones Service Servi

FESLH01F



Working For You Today and Tomorrow

08/01/2013



000001209 1 AT 0.384 T:006 ELIZABETH A SNYDER 4461 POWDER HORN DR BEAVERCREEK OH 45432-4029



ACCOUNT: 3154719158 SERVICE ADDRESS: 4461 POWDER-HORN DR

Dear Customer:

We have received a notification from DUKE ENERGY RETAIL SALES, LLC that they will no longer be providing your electric service effective 08/22/2013. You may either select a new supplier, or return to DP&L'S STANDARD OFFER. A new supplier must notify DP&L of its intent to supply your electric service a minimum of 12 days prior to a scheduled meter reading date.

It is important that DP&L obtain an actual meter reading prior to changing your supplier to ensure the change is based on an actual reading rather than estimated usage. A representative is scheduled to read the meter on 08/22/2013.

This change in your electric service will first be reflected on the DP&L bill mailed to you on 09/24/2013. Under DP&L'S STANDARD OFFER, your monthly DP&L bill will contain our electric, delivery service and generation service charges. We are pleased to once again be your supplier of choice. Please call 331-3500 or 1 (800) 929-8646 if you have any questions.

The Dayton Power and Light Company



08/16/2013

RE: Customer/Account Number 3154719158

Dear Elizabeth A. Snyder:

Thank you for choosing FirstEnergy Solutions as your electric generation supplier and securing a great low generation price!

Here are some important reference items you will need when reviewing your terms with FirstEnergy Solutions:

Electric U	tility	Price per kWh	Cancellation Fee (For early termination of this agreement)	Service Address	Contract Term
Dayton Powe Light Co		5.94¢/kWh through June 2016 meter read	\$25.00 for each account less than 99,999 annual kWh	4461 Powder Horn Dr Bruce, Beavercreek, OH 45432-4029	Through 4461 Powder Horn Dr Bruce meter read

When your current contract is coming to an end, FirstEnergy Solutions will provide a competitive renewal price because we want to keep you as a customer for years to come.

We've enclosed your post-enrollment materials, which include a copy of the terms and conditions under which we will provide electric generation service to you. These documents are for your files and for your reference – no further action is required on your part.

If your personal information above is incomplete or incorrect, or if you have any questions regarding your account with FirstEnergy Solutions, please call us at 888-254-6359, Monday through Friday, 8AM to 5PM. We appreciate your business and the opportunity to serve you.

Sincerely,

Stephen Reifsnyder Customer Care Manager FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.



Bruce Snyder

From: Sent:

Bruce Snyder <snyderbd888@sbcglobal.net> Wednesday, September 18, 2013 11:26 PM

To:

'rpastier@firstenergycorp.com'

Cc:

'ContactThePUCO@puc.state.oh.us'

Subject:

RE: Becki Pastier email

Becki.

If you agreed to the rate on 31 May, you agreed to the rate and you can't take it back at your choosing. You have a much bigger liability here and the fact that you have been trying to blame me for applying for a rate that you say wasn't extended to me makes this even worse. Even if the offer didn't apply to me when I applied online on 22 May, the offer was extended to me on 31 May. If you are unwilling to extend that rate to me now, according to the terms agreed to, then I will have to seek legal action since the evidence is overwhelmingly in my favor. I have been extremely patient with First Energy up to this point but that is about to change if you don't make this right.

Bruce Snyder PUCO Case # BSNY0812134U

From: rpastier@firstenergycorp.com [mailto:rpastier@firstenergycorp.com]

Sent: Wednesday, September 18, 2013 4:36 PM

To: Bruce Snyder

Subject: RE: Becki Pastier email

Hi, Bruce,

Please be advised that my offering to send the CD with the recorded calls to you was incorrect. Our company policy does not allow me to do that, however, I am sending it to the PUCO and if they chose to send that along to you, that is at their discretion.

On the May 31, 2013 call, there is reference and agreement from both parties, FES & you, that your utility is DPL.

On the August 5, 2013 call, there was discussion concerning the rejected enrollment, the amount of letters in the account number, clarification on the name on the account (Elizabeth), that the \$0.0536 offer for DPL had expired, and that the account enrolled was not eligible for that offer since the account was under the DPL utility.

I will wait on those 3 invoices for lost savings.

Thank you kindly,

Becki Pastier

Customer Acquisition Analyst | FirstEnergy Solutions Mobile: 330-697-8951 | Office: 330-436-1402 Fax: 330-315-9162

rpastier@fes.com | Web: fes.com



"Start by doing what's necessary, then what's possible; and suddenly you are doing the impossible."

Saint Francis of Assisi

From: "Bruce Snyder" < snyderbd888@sbcglobal.net>

To: cpastier@firstenergycorp.com>
Co: <ContactThePUCO@puc.state.oh.us>

Date: 09/17/2013 10:57 PM Subject: RE: Becki Pastier email

Becki.

Can you be more specific on the date of the calls that you have and what they say (or better yet send me the recordings in a format that I can listen to)? On the 31 May call I answered many specific questions about my current account and I confirmed the rate that was offered. Your statement below leads me to believe that First Energy was informed during the phone call that I was a DP&L customer and you were proceeding with the enrollment knowing that fact. Kelly at PUCO called today and said she received the recordings but they were not in a format she could listen to.

I was a Duke Energy customer from June to August at which time my account switched to DP&L for the August to September billing.

Bruce Snyder BSNY0812134U

From: rpastier@firstenergycorp.com [mailto:rpastier@firstenergycorp.com]

Sent: Tuesday, September 17, 2013 8:58 AM

To: Bruce Snyder

Subject: RE: Becki Pastier email

Good morning, Bruce,

I do have 2 of the phone recordings and I will forward them to the PUCO per your request. They indicate that you were advised that the enrollment was in process on the first phone call and that you would be contacted in a timely manner for you to enroll for August on the 2nd call.

As such, lost savings are being offered for the difference between the Dayton Power & Light price to compare and the price of \$0.0536 per kilowatt hour for the June to July, July to August, and August to September bill.

Please let me know how you will be forwarding the bills to me so that I know where to watch for them.

Feel free to reach out to me with any questions.

Thank you so much and have a super day!

Becki Pastier

Customer Acquisition Analyst | FirstEnergy Solutions Mobile: 330-697-8951 | Office: 330-436-1402

Fax: 330-315-9162

rpastier@fes.com | Web: fes.com



"Start by doing what's necessary, then what's possible; and suddenly you are doing the impossible."

From: "Bruce Snyder" < snyderbd888@sbcglobal.net>

To: <<u>rpastier@firstenergycorp.com</u>>
Date: 09/16/2013 11:15 PM
Subject: RE: Becki Pastier email

Becki,

I received your call today and have the June-July and July-August DP&L bills scanned in but I don't have the August-September bill yet and probably won't get it until October. You didn't say anything about the phone recordings that you should have access to by now. Do you have those recordings and if so, do they confirm what I've been telling First Energy for several months now? Have you sent those recordings off to the PUCO? That was our agreed to way forward so if you don't plan to do that I need to know why.

Bruce Snyder

From: rpastier@firstenergycorp.com [mailto:rpastier@firstenergycorp.com]

Sent: Monday, September 9, 2013 8:27 AM

To: snyderbd888@sbcglobal.net Subject: Becki Pastier email

Good morning, Bruce,

Fred Maurer forwarded your email to me. Please find my contact information attached.

I am in process of pulling all associated calls, per your request. I had hoped to have them Friday, but should have them in the next couple days.

Thanks for your patience!

Becki Pastier

Customer Acquisition Analyst | FirstEnergy Solutions

Office: 330-436-1402 Fax: 330-315-9162

rpastier@fes.com | Web: fes.com



Switch. Save. FES.com.

"Start by doing what's necessary, then what's possible; and suddenly you are doing the impossible."

Saint Francis of Assisi

and confidential use of the recipient(s) named above. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient or an agent responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that you have received this document in error and that any review, dissemination, distribution, or copying of this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately, and delete the original message.