

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Ohio Power Company to Adjust the)	Case No. 13-1739-EL-RDR
Economic Development Cost Recovery)	
Rider Rate)	

**MOTION OF GLOBE METALLURGICAL, INC. FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER AND
MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

Samuel C. Randazzo
Frank P. Darr (Counsel of Record)
Matthew R. Pritchard
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-4228
Telephone: (614) 469-8000
Telecopier: (614) 469-4653
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

SEPTEMBER 20, 2013

ATTORNEYS FOR GLOBE METALLURGICAL, INC.

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Ohio Power Company to Adjust the)	Case No. 13-1739-EL-RDR
Economic Development Cost Recovery)	
Rider Rate)	

MOTION OF GLOBE METALLURGICAL, INC. FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER

Pursuant to Rule 4901-1-24, Ohio Administrative Code ("O.A.C."), Globe Metallurgical, Inc. ("Globe") respectfully moves the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission") to issue a Protective Order to protect the confidentiality and prohibit the disclosure of the confidential information contained in the Application of Ohio Power Company ("AEP-Ohio") to adjust its Economic Development Cost Recovery Rider ("EDR") rates filed by AEP-Ohio under seal on August 1, 2013 in this proceeding. The confidential information is not subject to disclosure and includes competitively sensitive and highly proprietary business information comprising trade secrets. The grounds for this Motion are set forth in the attached Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Matthew R. Pritchard

Samuel C. Randazzo
Frank P. Darr (Counsel of Record)
Matthew R. Pritchard
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-4228
Telephone: (614) 469-8000
Telecopier: (614) 469-4653
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritichard@mwncmh.com

ATTORNEYS FOR GLOBE METALLURGICAL, INC.

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Ohio Power Company to Adjust the)	Case No. 13-1739-EL-RDR
Economic Development Cost Recovery)	
Rider Rate)	

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

I. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

On July 16, 2008, AEP-Ohio filed an application for approval of a special arrangement with Globe.¹ On November 12, 2010, the parties filed a stipulation for the Commission's approval, which was supplemented and modified on March 21, 2011. On April 5, 2011, the Commission approved the November 2010 stipulation as modified by the March 2011 filing.

In AEP-Ohio's initial electric security plan ("ESP") proceeding (Case Nos. 08-917-EL-SSO, *et al.*), the Commission authorized AEP-Ohio's EDR to recover economic development amounts authorized by the Commission in reasonable arrangement cases. In the ESP proceeding, the Commission also set the initial level of the rider at zero, to be updated quarterly.² The rider is calculated as a percentage of a customer's distribution charges. On August 1, 2013, AEP-Ohio initiated this semi-annual update case and filed an Application requesting that the Commission adjust AEP-Ohio's EDR. AEP-Ohio's August 1, 2013 Application contains Globe's customer-specific information that was clearly marked as confidential and was filed under seal,

¹ *In the Matter of the Application for Approval of a Contract for Electric Service Between Ohio Power Company and Globe Metallurgical, Inc.*, Case No. 08-884-EL-AEC, Application (July 16, 2008).

² *In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company for Approval of an Electric Security Plan; an Amendment to its Corporate Separation Plan; and the Sale or Transfer of Certain Generating Assets*, Case Nos. 08-917-EL-SSO, *et al.*, Opinion and Order at 47-48 (Mar. 18, 2009).

separate from the redacted public version of the Globe-specific schedule. On August 1, 2013, AEP-Ohio also filed a Motion for Protective Order regarding the Globe-specific information, but took no position as to whether the Globe-specific information should remain confidential.³ On September 18, 2013, the Commission approved AEP-Ohio's August 1, 2013 Application to adjust its EDR rates, and granted AEP-Ohio's August 1, 2013 Motion for Protective Order. Thus, the Commission granted protective status for the Globe-specific information contained in AEP-Ohio's August 1, 2013 Application. For the reasons stated below, Globe respectfully requests that the Commission confirm that the Globe-specific information contained in AEP-Ohio's August 1, 2013 Application is confidential and should retain protected status.

II. ARGUMENT

The billing information of the Globe reasonable arrangement schedule filed by AEP-Ohio contains competitively sensitive and highly proprietary business information that constitutes trade secrets under Ohio law and the Commission's rules. State law recognizes the need to protect information that is confidential in nature. Accordingly, the General Assembly granted the Commission statutory authority to exempt certain documents from disclosure.⁴ Pursuant to this statutory grant of authority, the Commission promulgated Rule 4901-1-24, O.A.C. Rule 4901-1-24(D), O.A.C., provides for the issuance of an order that is necessary to protect the confidentiality of information contained in documents filed at the Commission to the extent that state and federal law prohibit the release of such information and where non-disclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code.

³ AEP-Ohio Motion for Protective Order at 2 (Aug. 1, 2013).

⁴ See Sections 4901.12 and 4905.07, Revised Code.

Trade secrets protected by state law are not considered public records and are therefore exempt from public disclosure.⁵ A trade secret is defined by Section 1333.61(D), Revised Code, as follows:

"Trade secret" means information, including the whole or any portion or phase of any scientific or technical information, design, process, procedure, formula, pattern, compilation, program, device, method, technique, or improvement, or any **business information or plans, financial information**, or listing of names, addresses, or telephone numbers, that satisfies both of the following:

(1) It derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by, other persons who can obtain economic value from its disclosure or use.

(2) It is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.

Section 1333.61(D), Revised Code (emphasis added).

The Globe-related information contained within the Globe schedule is competitively sensitive and highly proprietary business and financial information falling within the statutory characterization of a trade secret.⁶ The information for which protective treatment is sought includes Globe's billings paid for electricity based upon its actual and estimated usage. Public disclosure of the pricing information would jeopardize Globe's business position and its ability to compete. The actual and projected billing information Globe seeks to protect derives independent economic value from not being generally known and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by Globe's competitors. Further, the efforts to protect the confidential pricing information are reasonable under the circumstances. Finally, actual customer usage and pricing

⁵ Section 149.43(A)(1)(v), Revised Code; *State ex rel. The Plain Dealer v. Ohio Dept. of Insurance*, 80 Ohio St. 3d 513, 530 (1997).

⁶ Section 1333.61(D), Revised Code.

terms are routinely accorded protected status by the Commission and the Commission accorded such treatment to Globe's information in AEP-Ohio's previous EDR update proceedings, and granted protective treatment of customer-specific information in this proceeding.⁷

The non-disclosure of the actual usage and pricing information will not impair the purposes of Title 49, as the Commission and its Staff will have full access to the confidential information in order to complete its review process. Because Globe's information constitutes a trade secret, it should be accorded protected status.

III. CONCLUSION

Globe respectfully requests that this Motion for Protective Order be granted for the reasons set forth herein.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Matthew R. Pritchard

Samuel C. Randazzo

Frank P. Darr (Counsel of Record)

Matthew R. Pritchard

MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC

21 East State Street, 17th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-4228

sam@mwncmh.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

ATTORNEYS FOR GLOBE METALLURGICAL, INC.

⁷ *In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company to Adjust Their Economic Development Cost Recovery Rider Pursuant to Rule 4901:1-38-08(A)(5), Ohio Administrative Code*, Case No. 11-4570-EL-RDR, Finding and Order at 4 (October 12, 2011); *In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company to Adjust Its Economic Development Cost Recovery Rider Pursuant to Rule 4901:1-38-08(A)(5), Ohio Administrative Code*, Case No. 12-688-EL-RDR, Finding and Order at 4-5 (Mar. 28, 2012); Finding and Order at 4 (Sept. 18, 2013).

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Motion of Globe Metallurgical, Inc. for Protective Order and Memorandum in Support* was served upon the following parties of record this 20th day of September 2013, via electronic transmission or first class mail, postage prepaid.

/s/ Matthew R. Pritchard

MATTHEW R. PRITCHARD

Steven T. Nourse
Matthew J. Satterwhite
American Electric Power Service
Corporation
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Telephone: (614) 716-1608
Facsimile: (614) 716-2950
stnourse@aep.com
mjsatterwhite@aep.com

Sarah Parrot
Jonathan Tauber
Attorney Examiners
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 East Broad Street, 12th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Sarah.Parrot@puc.state.oh.us
jonathan.tauber@puc.state.oh.us

ATTORNEY EXAMINERS

ON BEHALF OF OHIO POWER COMPANY

M. Howard Petricoff
Michael J. Settineri
VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE
LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008
Telephone: (614) 464-5462
Facsimile: (614) 719-5146
mhpeticoff@vorys.com
mjsettineri@vorys.com

ON BEHALF OF THE TIMKEN COMPANY

William Wright
Assistant Attorney General
Chief, Public Utilities Section
180 E. Broad Street, 6th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3793
william.wright@puc.state.oh.us

**COUNSEL FOR THE STAFF OF THE PUBLIC
UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

9/20/2013 11:11:10 AM

in

Case No(s). 13-1739-EL-RDR

Summary: Motion of Globe Metallurgical, Inc. for Protective Order and Memorandum in Support electronically filed by Mr. Matthew R. Pritchard on behalf of Globe Metallurgical, Inc.