

In the Matter of the Review of The )  
Alternative Energy Rider Contained in )  
The Tariffs of Ohio Edison Company, The ) Case No. 11-5201-EL-RDR  
Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company )  
and The Toledo Edison Company. )

The Environmental Law and Policy Center, Ohio Environmental Council and Sierra Club (“Environmental Intervenors”) hereby move<sup>1</sup> the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“PUCO”) for a protective order regarding information asserted to be confidential by FirstEnergy.<sup>2</sup> As part of discovery in this proceeding, FirstEnergy provided information to various parties, subject to various protective agreements, and FirstEnergy asserts that this information constitutes trade secret information under Ohio law.

The Environmental Intervenors hereby request that, in accordance with Ohio Adm. Code. 4901-1-02(E), the PUCO issue such order as is necessary to protect the undisclosed (redacted) portions of the Environmental Intervenors' *Memorandum Contra FirstEnergy Application for Rehearing* that are asserted to be confidential by FirstEnergy.<sup>3</sup> Subject to the Environmental Intervenors' rights under the protective

<sup>1</sup> This Motion is filed pursuant to Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-02(E), 4901-1-12 and 4901-1-24(D).

<sup>2</sup> “FirstEnergy” means the Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company.

<sup>3</sup> Some of this material is also the subject of the PUCO Opinion and Order in this case at 8-12 (August 7, 2013).

agreement, the Environmental Intervenors are filing their *Memorandum Contra FirstEnergy Application for Rehearing* under seal, and are also filing a public version that shows all information not claimed by FirstEnergy to be confidential.

By filing the instant Motion, the Environmental Intervenors do not concede that the information constitutes trade secret information. However, the Environmental Intervenors acknowledge that they have obtained this information pursuant to a protective agreement with FirstEnergy that provides for such information to be treated as confidential and protected (subject to the Environmental Intervenors' right under the protective agreement to initiate a process for the PUCO to rule whether the information deserves confidential treatment under Ohio law).

The grounds for this Motion are more fully described in the accompanying Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Nicholas McDaniel

Nicholas McDaniel

Environmental Law & Policy Center

1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201

Columbus, OH 43212

P: 614-488-3301

F: 614-487-7510

[NMcDaniel@elpc.org](mailto:NMcDaniel@elpc.org)

**Attorney for the Environmental Law and Policy Center**

/s/Nolan Moser

Nolan Moser

Trent A. Dougherty

Ohio Environmental Council

1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201

Columbus, OH 43212-3449

[nolan@theoec.org](mailto:nolan@theoec.org)

[trent@theoec.org](mailto:trent@theoec.org)

**Attorneys for the Ohio Environmental Council**

/s/Christopher J. Allwein

Christopher J. Allwein

*Williams, Allwein and Moser, LLC*

1500 West Third Ave., Suite 330

Columbus, Ohio 43212

Telephone: (614) 429-3092

Fax: (614) 670-8896

[callwein@wamenergylaw.com](mailto:callwein@wamenergylaw.com)

**Attorney for Sierra Club**

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Review of The )  
Alternative Energy Rider Contained in )  
The Tariffs of Ohio Edison Company, The ) Case No. 11-5201-EL-RDR  
Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company )  
and The Toledo Edison Company. )

---

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

---

The Environmental Intervenors file this Motion for Protective Order (“Motion”) contemporaneously with the filing of their *Memorandum Contra FirstEnergy Application for Rehearing*. In filing this Motion, the Environmental Intervenors do not concede that the information in their *Memorandum Contra FirstEnergy Application for Rehearing* is trade secret information pursuant to R.C. 1333.61(D) and do not concede that the information is deserving of protection from public revelation under Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-24(D).

The Environmental Intervenors understand that FirstEnergy considers the undisclosed (redacted) information to be confidential and deserving of the protection of trade secret information as defined in R.C. 1333.61(D).<sup>4</sup> The Environmental Intervenors’ understanding is based on claims by FirstEnergy that the information (1) derives economic value, actual or potential, from not being known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by others, and (2) is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy. *See* R.C. 1333.61(D). Under the assertions made by FirstEnergy, at this time, confidential treatment of the redacted

information in the Environmental Intervenors' *Memorandum Contra FirstEnergy Application for Rehearing* would be appropriate, subject to the Environmental Intervenors' rights under their protective agreements with FirstEnergy to initiate a process to determine whether the information should be protected.

In addition, the Environmental Law and Policy Center, Ohio Environmental Council and Sierra Club are filing a public version (redacted) of their *Memorandum Contra FirstEnergy Application for Rehearing* so that all information not claimed by FirstEnergy to be confidential is accessible for the public's review. The public version does not contain information that was asserted by FirstEnergy to be confidential.

For the foregoing reasons and subject to the foregoing reservations of rights, this Motion should be granted at this time.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Nicholas McDaniel

Nicholas McDaniel  
Environmental Law & Policy Center  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, OH 43212  
P: 614-488-3301  
F: 614-487-7510  
[NMcDaniel@elpc.org](mailto:NMcDaniel@elpc.org)

**Attorney for the Environmental Law and Policy Center**

---

<sup>4</sup> The Environmental Intervenors also acknowledge the ruling in the Opinion and Order as described in footnote 3.

/s/Nolan Moser

Nolan Moser

Trent A. Dougherty

Ohio Environmental Council

1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201

Columbus. OH 43212-3449

[nolan@theoec.org](mailto:nolan@theoec.org)

[trent@theoec.org](mailto:trent@theoec.org)

**Attorneys for the Ohio Environmental Council**

/s/Christopher J. Allwein

Christopher J. Allwein

*Williams, Allwein and Moser, LLC*

1373 Grandview Ave., Suite 212

Columbus, Ohio 43212

Telephone: (614) 429-3092

Fax: (614) 670-8896

[callwein@wamenergylaw.com](mailto:callwein@wamenergylaw.com)

**Attorney for Sierra Club**

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Motion for Protective Order* by the Environmental Intervenors has been served upon those persons listed below via electronic mail this 16th day of September 2013.

/s/ Christopher J. Allwein

Christopher J. Allwein  
Williams Allwein & Moser, LLC

## **SERVICE LIST**

william.wright@puc.state.oh.us  
Thomas.lindgren@puc.state.oh.us  
dboehm@BKLawfirm.com  
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com  
jkyler@BKLawfirm.com  
cdunn@firstenergycorp.com  
dakutik@jonesday.com  
burkj@firstenergycorp.com  
TDougherty@theOEC.org  
CLoucas@theOEC.org

mkl@bbrslaw.com  
tsiwo@bricker.com  
cathy@theoec.org  
trent@theoec.org  
robinson@citizenpower.com  
callwein@wamenergylaw.com  
mhpeticoff@vorys.com  
lkalepsclark@vorys.com  
mjsettineri@vorys.com

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**9/16/2013 5:07:07 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 11-5201-EL-RDR**

Summary: Motion for Protective Order electronically filed by Mr. Christopher J. Allwein on behalf of Ohio Environmental Council and THE SIERRA CLUB and Environmental Law and Policy Center